



EXPEDITIONARY  
LEARNING

# **Grade 4: Module 3A: Unit 3: Lesson 10**

## **Peer Critique: Scientific Accuracy of Ideas and Vocabulary**



This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License.  
Exempt third-party content is indicated by the footer: © (name of copyright holder). Used by permission and not subject to Creative Commons license.



**Long-Term Targets Addressed (Based on NYSP12 ELA CCLS)**

- I can write an opinion piece that supports a point of view with reasons and information. (W.4.1)  
I can use the writing process to produce clear and coherent writing (with support). (W.4.5)  
I can effectively engage in discussions with diverse partners about fourth-grade topics and texts. (SL.4.1)

**Supporting Learning Targets**

- I can give kind, helpful, and specific feedback to my writing partner.
- I can critique the ideas of my writing partner's editorial for scientific accuracy.

**Ongoing Assessment**

- Feedback and reflection notes



Agenda	Teaching Notes
<ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>Opening<ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>Review Learning Targets (5 minutes)</li></ol></li><li>Work Time<ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>Reviewing Simple Critique Protocol (10 minutes)</li><li>Peer Critique of Drafts for Ideas (25 minutes)</li><li>Annotating Drafts for Revision (15 minutes)</li></ol></li><li>Closing and Assessment<ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>Exit Ticket (5 minutes)</li></ol></li><li>Homework<ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>Continue reading in your independent reading book for this unit at home.</li></ol></li></ol>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>Beginning with Lesson 8, students have been revising their work using different-colored pencils for each focus. In the current lesson, students use green pencils.</li><li>Review: Peer Critique protocol (Appendix 1), Critique Protocol anchor chart (from Lesson 7), and Review Peer Critique Norms (Module 2A, Unit 3, Lesson 7)</li></ul>

Lesson Vocabulary	Materials
specific, revision, critique, feedback	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>Equity sticks</li><li>Critique Protocol Norms anchor chart (from Lesson 7)</li><li>Simple Machines Editorial rubric chart (from Lesson 9)</li><li>Editorial Feedback recording form (one per student)</li><li>Green pencils (one per student)</li><li>Steps for Revising My Editorial anchor chart</li><li>Index card (one per student)</li></ul>



Opening	Meeting Students' Needs
<p><b>A. Review Learning Targets (5 minutes)</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Post and read aloud the following learning targets: “I can give kind, helpful, and specific feedback to my critique partner,” and “I can critique the ideas of my writing partner’s editorial for scientific accuracy.”</li><li>• Ask students what they know already about these targets. Give them a chance to talk with a partner about their thinking, then cold call students using the <b>equity sticks</b>. Students may recall the critique process from Modules 1 and 2. Have them share what they recall.</li><li>• Then ask students to identify parts of the learning targets that are unfamiliar or confusing. Pay particular attention to the words <i>specific</i>, <i>critique</i>, and <i>scientific accuracy</i> (scientifically accurate ideas and vocabulary based on evidence from text and observations) as you clarify the meaning of the targets with students.</li></ul>	



Work Time	Meeting Students' Needs
<p><b>A. Reviewing Simple Critique Protocol (10 minutes)</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>Review the main components of a successful critique on the <b>Critique Protocol Norms anchor chart</b> (see teaching notes and supporting materials of this lesson for preparing this anchor chart). Remind students that they created the same anchor chart in Module 2, Unit 3 when they were writing their historical fiction narratives.</li><li>Remind the students of the non-negotiables before they begin this process. The following four points are crucial for success:<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li><u>Be kind</u>: Always treat others with dignity and respect. This means we never use words that are hurtful, including sarcasm.</li><li><u>Be specific</u>: Focus on particular strengths and weaknesses, rather than making general comments such as “It’s good” or “I like it.” Provide insight into why it is good or what, specifically, you like about it.</li><li><u>Be helpful</u>: The goal is to contribute positively to the individual or the group, not simply to be heard. Echoing the thoughts of others or cleverly pointing out irrelevant details wastes time.</li><li><u>Participate</u>: Peer critique is a process to support one another, and your feedback is valued!</li></ul></li><li>Tell students that today they are going to listen to their partners read their editorial drafts. Tell them they will focus their feedback using the <b>Simple Machines Editorial rubric chart</b> (added to in Lesson 9).</li><li>Explain that for today their feedback will focus only on the Ideas and Word Choice portions of the rubric. Review the criteria for Meets on the rubric. Students will focus mainly on the scientific accuracy of scientific concepts as well as scientific vocabulary as they describe their simple machine and how it’s used to help make people’s lives better.</li><li>Remind students that in order for this feedback to be helpful they should only focus on this specific area. Pointing out misspelled words or incorrect punctuation will not be helpful at this point. That will be saved for the final editing.</li></ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>Critiques simulate the experiences students will have in the workplace and help build a culture of achievement in your classroom.</li><li>If you feel that your students need more practice with peer critique before working with a partner, consider using the model paragraph from the wedge editorial.</li></ul>



Work Time (continued)	Meeting Students' Needs
<p><b>B. Peer Critique of Drafts for Ideas (25 minutes)</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Partner students with others who have written about the same simple machine if possible.</li><li>• Distribute the students' editorial drafts and the <b>Editorial Feedback recording form</b>. Remind students that this is where they will record their partner's feedback on their work and their next steps.</li><li>• Have students read the directions then restate in their own words to a partner:<ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>1. Author and listener: Review area of critique focus from rubric</li><li>2. Author: Reads his or her piece</li><li>3. Listener: Gives feedback based on rubric criteria: "I like how you _____. You might consider _____."</li><li>4. Author: Records feedback</li><li>5. Author: Says, "Thank you for _____. My next step will be _____."</li><li>6. Switch roles and repeat</li></ol></li><li>• Address any clarifying questions, and then have students begin.</li><li>• Circulate to support students with the critique process, helping them to follow the protocol and focus their feedback using the rubric's Ideas and Word Choice sections.</li></ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• If students are using a computer, they will still make revisions on a printout of their drafts until they are ready to complete a second draft.</li><li>• For each revision of students' drafts, a different colored pencil will be used to annotate in this unit. This will allow students to keep track of the focus of each revision. A different color will be used in subsequent lessons for each type of revision (e.g., ideas, organization).</li><li>• To support visual learners, consider using a document camera with a few sentences written double-spaced to demonstrate this note-taking technique.</li></ul>



Work Time (continued)	Meeting Students' Needs
<p><b>C. Annotating Drafts for Revision (15 minutes)</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Have students thank their partners and move to their workspace. Be sure that every student has a <b>green pencil</b>. Post the <b>Steps for Revising My Editorial anchor chart</b>:<ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>1. Choose the correct colored pencil. Today's color is _____.</li><li>2. Decide where you will add a revision note based on feedback or new learning.</li><li>3. Write your revision note in the space above the sentence you want to change.</li><li>4. Read through your entire editorial and continue to record your revision notes.</li><li>5. Review your revision notes to be sure they make sense.</li></ol></li><li>• Tell them that you would like them to add notes to their drafts using the green pencils today. (This step in the anchor chart will vary from day to day depending on the color used for revisions. See the teaching notes of each subsequent lesson.)</li><li>• Explain to students that since they skipped lines when they wrote the drafts, you would like them to write notes telling what they will add or change in a given part of their editorial on these blank lines. When they have a sentence they would like to add to or change, they can make a note on the above blank line. Remind them that this will allow them to read and easily reread their drafts and note changes at the same time without erasing or crossing things out.</li><li>• Give students 15 minutes to add revision notes to their drafts. Circulate to confer and support as needed.</li><li>• Once students have recorded their revisions, have them organize their writing materials. Explain that they will use these and need to keep them with their draft and recording form as they continue to move through the writing process through the following week.</li></ul>	



Closing and Assessment	Meeting Students' Needs
<p><b>A. Exit Ticket (5 minutes)</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Gather students. Ask them to assess themselves on the learning targets: "I can give kind, helpful, and specific feedback to my critique partner," and "I can critique the ideas of my writing partner's editorial for scientific accuracy."</li><li>• Distribute an <b>index card</b> and have them record their name and respond to the following:<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>* (Front) "Did you meet the learning targets? What is your evidence?"</li><li>* (Back) "How did critique help you to improve your writing? What is your evidence?"</li></ul></li></ul>	
Homework	Meeting Students' Needs
<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Continue reading in your independent reading book for this unit at home.</li></ul>	





EXPEDITIONARY  
LEARNING

# Grade 4: Module 3A: Unit 3: Lesson 10

## Supporting Materials



This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License.

Exempt third-party content is indicated by the footer: © (name of copyright holder). Used by permission and not subject to Creative Commons license.



## Critique Protocol Norms Anchor Chart

**(Teacher directions:** *Copy the following text onto a large piece of chart paper for all students to see.*)

### Critique Protocol Norms

**Be kind:** Treat others with dignity and respect.

**Be specific:** Focus on *why* something is good or what, particularly, needs improvement.

**Be helpful:** The goal is to help everyone improve their work.

**Participate:** Support each other. Your feedback is valued!

### Directions:

1. Author and listener: Review area of critique focus from rubric
2. Author: Reads his or her piece
3. Listener: Gives feedback based on rubric criteria: "I like how you \_\_\_\_\_. You might consider \_\_\_\_\_."
4. Author: Records feedback
5. Author: Says, "Thank you for \_\_\_\_\_. My next step will be \_\_\_\_\_."
6. Switch roles and repeat



Editorial Feedback Recording Form (front)

Name: \_\_\_\_\_

<b>Date:</b>	<b>Partner:</b>
<b>Focus of Critique:</b>	
<b>My partner liked...</b>	
<b>My partner suggested...</b>	
<b>My next step(s)...</b>	



Editorial Feedback Recording Form (back)

<b>Date:</b>	<b>Partner:</b>
<b>Focus of Critique:</b>	
<b>My partner liked...</b>	
<b>My partner suggested...</b>	
<b>My next step(s)...</b>	



### Steps for Revising My Editorial Anchor Chart

**(Teacher directions:** Copy the text below onto a large chart paper for all students to see.)

#### **Steps for Revising My Editorial:**

1. Choose the correct colored pencil. Today's color is \_\_\_\_\_.
2. Decide where you will add a revision note based on feedback or new learning.
3. Write your revision note in the space above the sentence you want to change.
4. Read through your entire editorial and continue to record your revision notes.
5. Review your revision notes to be sure they make sense.