



EXPEDITIONARY
LEARNING

Grade 8: Module 2: Unit 2B: Lesson 13

Writing an Argument Essay: Peer Critique



This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License.

Exempt third-party content is indicated by the footer: © (name of copyright holder). Used by permission and not subject to Creative Commons license.



Long-Term Targets Addressed (Based on NYSP12 ELA CCLS)

- I can write arguments to support claims with clear reasons and relevant evidence. (W.8.1)
- I can produce clear and coherent writing that is appropriate to task, purpose, and audience. (W.8.4)
- With support from peers and adults, I can use a writing process to ensure that purpose and audience have been addressed. (W.8.5)
- I can select evidence from literary or informational texts to support analysis, reflection, and research. (W.8.9)
- I can use correct capitalization, punctuation, and spelling to send a clear message to my reader. (L.8.2)

Supporting Learning Targets

- I can critique my partner's use of evidence using criteria from *A Midsummer Night's Dream* Argument Rubric.
- I can revise my work by incorporating helpful feedback from my partner.
- I can write an organized argument essay about *A Midsummer Night's Dream*.
- I can use correct punctuation in my Quote Sandwich.

Ongoing Assessment

- Supporting Evidence-Based Claims graphic organizer (from homework)
- Quote Sandwich for Peer Critique
- Exit ticket



Agenda	Teaching Notes
<ol style="list-style-type: none">1. Opening<ol style="list-style-type: none">A. Engaging the Writer and Reviewing Learning Targets (5 minutes)2. Work Time<ol style="list-style-type: none">A. Incorporating Evidence in an Argument Essay (20 minutes)B. Peer Critique Protocol (15 minutes)3. Closing and Assessment<ol style="list-style-type: none">A. Previewing Homework (5 minutes)4. Homework<ol style="list-style-type: none">A. Plan Body Paragraphs 1 and 2 in the essay planner.	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• This lesson students review the rubric, which will be used to score their essay. This Argument Rubric is based on the NYS Expository Rubric, and has been adapted to more precisely reflect the skills in the W.8.1 standard.• In this lesson, the Quote Sandwich is introduced; this is a way to help students understand that when they use evidence in an argument essay, they should always:<ul style="list-style-type: none">– Introduce the quote with context so the reader is not confused about what is happening in the novel– Include the quote– Analyze the quote• This is where students show their thinking about how the quote develops the reasons and claim. This is often where students struggle the most. The Quote Sandwich guide includes helpful language to support them, such as “this shows ...” Since students are learning this skill, the language is meant to be easy for students to imitate. When they have mastered the analysis (the thinking in the writing), then they can begin to use more sophisticated transitions (the craft in the writing).• This lesson includes the Peer Critique protocol. Critiques simulate the experiences students will have in the workplace and thus help build a culture of achievement, collaboration, and open-mindedness in your classroom. Students engaged in a different peer critique structure in Module 1 when the provided Stars and Steps for the “Inside Out” poems.• This Peer Critique protocol is similar to the Praise-Question-Suggest protocol (see Appendix). That is done intentionally to build student capacity.• In advance: Consider creating a peer critique packet for each student that includes the Quote Sandwich guide, Quote Sandwich for Peer Critique, Peer Critique Expectations and Directions, and Peer Critique recording form to make distributing papers more efficient.• Students are introduced to the essay planner at the end of this lesson. Each space for planning the body paragraphs features room for three Quote Sandwiches, which reflects the space provided on the Supporting Evidence-Based Claims graphic organizer. You may wish to remind students that they may have two Quote Sandwiches instead of three in their body paragraphs since they should select the strongest evidence to support their reason.• Post: Learning targets.



Lesson Vocabulary	Materials
critique, incorporate feedback	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Supporting Evidence-Based Claims graphic organizers (from homework)• <i>A Midsummer Night's Dream</i> Argument Rubric (one per student and one to display)• Document camera• Quote Sandwich guide (one per student)• <i>A Midsummer Night's Dream</i> model essay (from Lesson 11)• Quote Sandwich for Peer Critique (one per student)• Peer Critique Expectations and Directions (on chart paper or white board)• Peer Critique recording form (one per student)• Essay planner (one per student)

Opening	Meeting Students' Needs
<p>A. Engaging the Writer and Reviewing Learning Targets (5 minutes)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Ask students to find their Albany Discussion Appointment, and have them share one of their reasons and the piece of evidence that supports it. Remind them to use their Supporting Evidence-Based Claims graphic organizers (from homework)• Direct students' attention to the posted learning targets. Cold call a student to read the learning targets. Ask students what it means to <i>critique</i> work. Cold call for answers. Listen for: "When we critique we are giving feedback based on a rubric." Then ask students what it means to revise. Cold call for answers and listen for: "Revision means that we make changes to our work based on feedback we have gotten from others."	



Work Time	Meeting Students' Needs
<p>A. Analyzing Evidence in an Argument Essay (20 minutes)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Distribute and display <i>A Midsummer Night's Dream</i> Argument Rubric using the document camera. Tell students that it is based on the same rubric used to assess their essays in Module 1. Ask them to notice things that might be different from what they did in Module 1. Cold call students to share their ideas. Listen for: "The first row is focused on claim and reasons," "The word <i>argument</i> comes up a lot in the first two rows," "You have to explain how evidence supports your argument," "You have to acknowledge and respond to a counterclaim," and "The argument needs to be logical." Point out that the Coherence, Style, and Organization Row and the Control of Conventions Row are exactly the same. Distribute and display the Quote Sandwich guide on the document camera. Read it aloud and invite students to follow along silently. Point out that they did some analysis of the evidence in the model essay in the previous lesson, so this builds from that. Explain that all three parts of the Quote Sandwich are very important for the reader to understand the evidence and how it develops the reasons and the claim in the essay. Ask students to get out their copies of the <i>A Midsummer Night's Dream</i> model essay, reread the body paragraphs, and circle at least one other example of a Quote Sandwich. Invite them to turn and talk to a partner about what they circled and how it supports the reason in the body paragraph. Cold call one or two pairs to share with the class. Listen for: "I found another Quote Sandwich in the first body paragraph. It is about how Oberon uses the magic flower potion on Demetrius in an attempt to fix Puck's mistake of anointing Lysander with the potion," or "In the second body paragraph, the author uses a Quote Sandwich to show how Puck's control of Bottom was temporary, because Oberon made him restore Bottom's head." Point out to students that using Quote Sandwiches helps the author logically develop her claim and reasons so the thinking is clear to the reader. Draw students' attention to the first quote in the counterclaim paragraph: "<i>Lord, what fools these mortals be!... And those things do best please me/That befall prepost'rously</i>" (3.2.117, 122–123). Puck thinks he is in control, and he enjoys the results. Ask students if anyone knows what the three dots in the middle of the quote are called. Be sure students know these dots are called an ellipsis, which is used when omitting part of a quote. In this case, lines 118–121 were omitted from the quote. Draw students' attention to the example quote on the Quote Sandwich guide: "<i>Thou speakest aright. I am that merry wanderer of the night, I jest to Oberon and make him smile ...</i>" (2.1.44–46) and note this other use of the ellipsis at the end of the quote. Explain that in this case the ellipsis shows that there were more words in this line, but they were not necessary to include in the quote. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Consider pairing students who need extra support together. Then, during peer critique time, work with those pairs. If students need more support forming their claims and reasons based on the exit ticket from Lesson 12, pull a small group during this time.



Work Time (continued)	Meeting Students' Needs
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Tell students that when they practice their Quote Sandwiches they should include at least one quote with an ellipsis and that you will be looking for that as part of the essay's criteria. • Share with students that they may find it helpful to use the ellipsis when they quote from the play. • Distribute and display the Quote Sandwich for Peer Critique. • Tell students that they will practice crafting a Quote Sandwich; then they will engage in a Peer Critique protocol today to get feedback on their Quote Sandwich. • Ask students to focus again on their Supporting Evidence-Based Claims graphic organizer (from homework). Prompt them to choose one reason to focus on, then one piece of evidence that supports the reason. Ask them to craft a Quote Sandwich. 	
<p>B. Peer Critique Protocol (15 minutes)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • When students have crafted their Quote Sandwiches, ask them to work with their seat partner for the Peer Critique protocol. • Remind students that peer critique reflects what people often do in their lives outside of school. In their work, people get feedback to improve. Also, giving feedback can often provide new ideas for one's own work. • Invite students to look at the Peer Critique Expectations and Directions. Review the expectations. Let students know that these four points are crucial for success: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> – Be kind: Always treat others with dignity and respect. This means we never use words that are hurtful, including sarcasm. – Be specific: Focus on particular strengths and weaknesses, rather than making general comments such as "It's good" or "I like it." Provide insight into <i>why</i> it is good or what, specifically, you like about it. – Be helpful: The goal is to contribute positively to the individual, not simply to be heard. Be sure your comments contribute to improving your partner's essay plan. – Participate: Peer critique is a process to support each other, and your feedback is valued! • Explain the steps for the Peer Critique. Emphasize that this is focused on their Quote Sandwiches. • Ask students to give you a thumbs-up if they understand the directions or a thumbs-down if they aren't sure. Call on a student with a thumbs-up to explain again. Listen for the student to paraphrase directions/expectations. Clarify as needed. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • During Work Time B, you may want to pull a small group of students to support in finding evidence from the novel. Some students will need more guided practice before they are ready for independent work.



Work Time (continued)	Meeting Students' Needs
<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Distribute the Peer Critique recording form. Tell students that they will focus their feedback using criteria from the <i>A Midsummer Night's Dream</i> Argument Rubric that focuses on claim, reasons, and evidence. Review the criteria and remind students that, for this feedback to be helpful, they should focus only on this specific area and should give lots of feedback. Pointing out misspelled words or incorrect punctuation will not be helpful at this point in the writing process.• As students give each other feedback, circulate to make sure they focus on the criteria of the rubric as well as on claim, reasons, and evidence. Consider using this time to address questions or support students who need it.• Refocus the whole group. Acknowledge any students who demonstrated positive traits, such as accepting feedback openly, asking good questions, or giving thoughtful feedback in a kind manner.• Invite students to revise their Quote Sandwich by <i>incorporating feedback</i>. Point out that feedback may not always be helpful. It is up to the author to decide what feedback will help improve his/her work. Informally look over students' work to make sure they are using the feedback well and focusing on annotating the boxes where they need to make changes.	

Closing and Assessment	Meeting Students' Needs
<p>A. Previewing Homework (5 minutes)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Distribute the essay planner. Point out that there is space for students to plan the five paragraphs of their essay: the introduction, the body paragraphs, and the conclusion. For homework tonight, explain that students should take home the Quote Sandwich guide and create the Quote Sandwiches for Body Paragraphs 1 and 2.	
Homework	Meeting Students' Needs
<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Plan Body Paragraphs 1 and 2 in the essay planner.	



EXPEDITIONARY
LEARNING

Grade 8: Module 2B: Unit 2: Lesson 13

Supporting Materials



This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License.

Exempt third-party content is indicated by the footer: © (name of copyright holder). Used by permission and not subject to Creative Commons license.



A Midsummer Night's Dream Argument Rubric

Name: _____

Date: _____

Argumentative Essay: In *A Midsummer Night's Dream*, does Shakespeare make the case that it is possible to control another person's actions, or not?

Criteria	CCLS	4	3	2	1	0
CLAIM AND REASONS: the extent to which the essay conveys complex ideas and information clearly and accurately in order to logically support the author's argument	RI.8.2, W.8.1a, W.8.9a	<p>—clearly introduces the text and the claim in a manner that is compelling and follows logically from the task and purpose</p> <p>—claim and reasons demonstrate insightful analysis of the text(s)</p> <p>—acknowledges and responds to counterclaim(s) skillfully and smoothly</p>	<p>—clearly introduces the text and the claim in a manner that follows from the task and purpose</p> <p>—claim and reasons demonstrate grade-appropriate analysis of the text(s)</p> <p>—acknowledges and responds to counterclaim(s) appropriately and clearly</p>	<p>—introduces the text and the claim in a manner that follows generally from the task and purpose</p> <p>—claim and reasons demonstrate a literal comprehension of the text(s)</p> <p>—acknowledges and responds to counterclaim(s), but the thinking isn't clear and/or logical</p>	<p>—introduces the text and the claim in a manner that does not logically follow from the task and purpose</p> <p>—claim and reasons demonstrate little understanding of the text(s)</p> <p>—does not acknowledge and/or respond to counterclaim(s)</p>	<p>—claim and reasons demonstrate a lack of comprehension of the text(s) or task</p>



A Midsummer Night's Dream Argument Rubric

Criteria	CCLS	4	3	2	1	0
COMMAND OF EVIDENCE: the extent to which the essay presents evidence from the provided texts to support argument	W.8.1b	<p>—develops the argument (claim and reasons) with relevant, well-chosen facts, definitions, concrete details, quotations, or other information and examples from the text(s)</p> <p>—sustains the use of varied, relevant evidence</p> <p>—skillfully and logically explains how evidence supports the claim and reasons</p>	<p>—develops the argument (claim and reasons) with relevant facts, definitions, details, quotations, or other information and examples from the text(s)</p> <p>—sustains the use of relevant evidence, with some lack of variety</p> <p>—logically explains how evidence supports the claim and reasons</p>	<p>—partially develops the argument (claim and reasons) of the essay with the use of some textual evidence, some of which may be irrelevant</p> <p>—uses relevant evidence inconsistently</p> <p>—sometimes logically explains how evidence supports the claim and reasons</p>	<p>—demonstrates an attempt to use evidence, but only develop ideas with minimal, occasional evidence which is generally invalid or irrelevant</p> <p>—attempts to explain how evidence supports the claim and reasons</p>	<p>—provides no evidence or provide evidence that is completely irrelevant</p> <p>—does not explain how evidence supports the claim and reasons</p>



A Midsummer Night's Dream Argument Rubric

Criteria	CCLS	4	3	2	1	0
COHERENCE, ORGANIZATION, AND STYLE: the extent to which the essay logically organizes complex ideas, concepts, and information using formal style and precise language	W.8.1c, W.8.1d, W.8.1e	<p>—exhibits clear organization, with the skillful use of appropriate and varied transitions to create a unified whole and enhance meaning</p> <p>—establishes and maintains a formal style, using grade-appropriate, stylistically sophisticated language and domain-specific vocabulary with a notable sense of voice</p> <p>—provides a concluding statement or section that is compelling and follows clearly from the claim and reasons presented</p>	<p>—exhibits clear organization, with the use of appropriate transitions to create a unified whole</p> <p>—establishes and maintains a formal style using precise language and domain-specific vocabulary</p> <p>—provides a concluding statement or section that follows from the claim and reasons presented</p>	<p>—exhibits some attempt at organization, with inconsistent use of transitions</p> <p>—establishes but fails to maintain a formal style, with inconsistent use of language and domain-specific vocabulary</p> <p>—provides a concluding statement or section that follows generally the claim and reasons presented</p>	<p>—exhibits little attempt at organization, or attempts to organize are irrelevant to the task</p> <p>—lacks a formal style, using language that is imprecise or inappropriate for the text(s) and task</p> <p>—provides a concluding statement or section that is illogical or unrelated to the claim and reasons presented</p>	<p>—exhibits no evidence of organization</p> <p>—uses language that is predominantly incoherent or copied directly from the text(s)</p> <p>—does not provide a concluding statement or section</p>



A Midsummer Night's Dream Argument Rubric

Criteria	CCLS	4	3	2	1	0
CONTROL OF CONVENTIONS		<p>Use of capitalization, spelling, and punctuation is grade-appropriate with few errors.</p> <p>Essay skillfully includes punctuation (a comma, ellipsis, or dash) to indicate a pause or break.</p> <p>Essay skillfully includes an ellipsis to indicate omission.</p>	<p>Occasional capitalization, spelling, and punctuation errors do not hinder comprehension.</p> <p>Essay includes punctuation (a comma, ellipsis, or dash) to indicate a pause or break.</p> <p>Essay includes an ellipsis to indicate omission.</p>	<p>Some capitalization, spelling, and punctuation errors may hinder comprehension.</p> <p>Essay includes punctuation (a comma, ellipsis, or dash) to indicate a pause or break, but may not be correct.</p> <p>Essay includes an ellipsis to indicate omission, but may not be done correctly.</p>	<p>Frequent capitalization, spelling, and punctuation errors hinder comprehension.</p> <p>Essay includes punctuation (a comma, ellipsis, or dash) to indicate a pause or break, but is done incorrectly and impedes comprehension.</p> <p>Essay includes an ellipses to indicate omission, but is don incorrectly and impedes comprehension.</p>	<p>Capitalization, spelling, and punctuation errors prevent the reader from understanding the narrative.</p> <p>Essay does not include punctuation (a comma, ellipsis, or dash) to indicate a pause or break.</p> <p>Essay does not include an ellipses to indicate omission.</p>

Quote Sandwich Guide

Name:

Date:

A Quote Sandwich is made up of three parts:

- Introduce the quote
- Include the quote
- Analyze the quote

Read this example of using a quote in an argument essay, then take a look at the organizer below:

In Act 2, Scene 1 we first meet Robin when he is talking to another fairy that recognizes him. Their conversation demonstrates who Robin is and what his motivations are. He says, “Thou speakest aright. I am that merry wanderer of the night, I jest to Oberon and make him smile ...” (2.1.44–46). This shows that Robin likes to have fun and deceive people for his entertainment and for Oberon’s entertainment.



Quote Sandwich Guide

Introduce the quote.

This includes the “who” and “when” of the quote.

Sample sentence starters for introducing a quote:

In act/scene, _____.

When Robin is _____.

After _____ Robin _____.

_____.

Include the quote.

Make sure to punctuate the quotes correctly using quotation marks. Remember to cite the page number in parentheses after the quote.

Example: Their conversation demonstrates who Robin is and what his motivations are. He says, “Thou speakest aright. I am that merry wanderer of the night, I jest to Oberon and make him smile ...” (2.1.44–46).

Analyze the quote.

This is where you explain how the quote supports your idea.

Example: This shows that Robin likes to have fun and deceive people for his entertainment and for Oberon’s entertainment.

Sample sentence starters for quote analysis:

This means that _____.

This shows that _____.

This demonstrates that _____.



Quote Sandwich for Peer Critique

Name:

Date:

Directions: For today's peer critique, look at your Supporting Evidence-Based Claims graphic organizer and choose the reason in one of your body paragraphs to focus on. Then choose one piece of evidence from that paragraph to turn into a Quote Sandwich. Make sure you introduce the quote, include the quote, and explain how the quote supports the reason in that paragraph. Remember that you have practiced Quote Sandwiches orally and found them in the model essay.

Reason in the body paragraph

Quote Sandwich

For the peer critique, you will share your Quote Sandwich with a partner. Ask your partner to focus on giving you feedback on one of the four following questions:

Feedback questions

Do I use the best evidence to support the reason in my body paragraph?

Does the introduction of the quote give enough background information to understand it?

Did I punctuate and cite the quote correctly?

Does the explanation of the quote make sense?



Peer Critique Expectations and Directions

Expectations

Be kind: Treat others with dignity and respect.

Be specific: Focus on *why* something is good or what, particularly, needs improvement.

Be helpful: The goal is to help everyone improve their work.

Participate: Support each other. Your feedback is valued!

Directions for Peer Critique partners

1. Review Claim and Evidence Criteria from Rows 1 and 2 of *A Midsummer Night's Dream* Argument Rubric.
2. Give your partner your Quote Sandwich and point out the feedback question you would most like suggestions about.
3. Read over your partner's Quote Sandwich.
4. One person shares his/her feedback using phrases like:
 - a. I really liked how you ...
 - b. I wonder ...
 - c. Maybe you could change ...
5. Author writes it on his/her Peer Critique recording form.
6. Author says: "Thank you for _____. My next step will be _____."
7. Switch roles and repeat.

Directions for Revising My Quote Sandwich

1. Decide where you are going to make changes based on feedback.
2. Revise your Quote Sandwich in the space provided.
3. Be sure to include changes when planning an essay and apply feedback to other Quote Sandwiches as appropriate.



Peer Critique Recording Form (Side A)

Name:

Date:

Claim and Evidence Criteria from A Midsummer Night's Dream Argument Rubric

4	3	2	1	0
<p>—claim and reasons demonstrate insightful analysis of the text(s)</p> <p>—acknowledges and responds to counterclaim(s) skillfully and smoothly</p>	<p>— claim and reasons demonstrate grade-appropriate analysis of the text(s)</p> <p>—acknowledges and responds to counterclaim(s) appropriately and clearly</p>	<p>— claim and reasons demonstrate a literal comprehension of the text(s)</p> <p>—acknowledges and responds to counterclaim(s), but the thinking isn't clear</p>	<p>— claim and reasons demonstrate little understanding of the text(s)</p> <p>—does not acknowledge and/or respond to counterclaim(s)</p>	<p>—claim and reasons demonstrate a lack of comprehension of the text(s) or task</p>
<p>—develops the argument (claim and reasons) with relevant, well-chosen facts, definitions, concrete details, quotations, or other information and examples from the text(s)</p> <p>—sustains the use of varied, relevant evidence</p> <p>—skillfully and logically explains how evidence supports the claim and reasons</p>	<p>—develops the argument (claim and reasons) with relevant facts, definitions, details, quotations, or other information and examples from the text(s)</p> <p>—sustains the use of relevant evidence, with some lack of variety</p> <p>—logically explains how evidence supports the claim and reasons</p>	<p>—partially develops the argument (claim and reasons) of the essay with the use of some textual evidence, some of which may be irrelevant</p> <p>—uses relevant evidence inconsistently</p> <p>—sometimes logically explains how evidence supports the claim and reasons</p>	<p>—demonstrates an attempt to use evidence, but only develops ideas with minimal, occasional evidence which is generally invalid or irrelevant</p> <p>—attempts to explain how evidence supports the claim and reasons</p>	<p>—provides no evidence or provide evidence that is completely irrelevant</p> <p>—does not explain how evidence supports the claim and reasons</p>



Peer Critique Recording Form (Side B)

Date:

Partner:

Focus of Critique: Quote Sandwich

My partner thinks the best thing about my Quote Sandwich is ...

My partner wondered about ...

My partner suggested I ...

My next step(s) ...



Essay Planner

Focus question: In *A Midsummer Night's Dream*, does Shakespeare make the case that it is possible to control another person's actions, or not? Choose two characters from the list below and give evidence from the text to support your thinking. Be sure to take into account what people who disagree might say.

a. Demetrius b. Egeus c. Hermia	d. Lysander e. Bottom f. Oberon
---------------------------------------	---------------------------------------

I. Introduction	
A. Hook to capture the reader's interest and attention	
B. Name the main text	
C. Give brief background information to the reader about the play (characters, plot, etc.)	
D. Claim	



Essay Planner

II. Body Paragraph 1	
First reason to support your claim	
A. Topic sentence	
B. Quote Sandwich 1	
C. Quote Sandwich 2	
E. Concluding sentence	



Essay Planner

III. Body Paragraph 2	
Second reason to support your claim	
A. Topic sentence	
B. Quote Sandwich 1	
C. Quote Sandwich 2	
D. Concluding sentence	



Essay Planner

IV. Body Paragraph 3	
Counterclaim	
A. Topic sentence	
B. Reason to support counterclaim	
C. Quote Sandwich 1	
D. Quote Sandwich 2	
E. Response to counterclaim	
F. Explanation of response to counterclaim	
G. Concluding sentence	



Essay Planner

V. Conclusion	
A. Restate claim	
B. Summarize reasons	
C. Explain why your view is worth consideration by the reader	