

PART 2

MAKING EVIDENCE-BASED CLAIMS

“The Exemplar of Freedom”

OBJECTIVE:

Students develop the ability to make evidence-based claims through a close reading of the text.



ACTIVITIES

1- INDEPENDENT READING AND FINDING SUPPORTING EVIDENCE

Students independently read part of the text and use the Making EBC Tool to look for evidence to support a claim made by the teacher.

2- READ ALOUD AND CLASS DISCUSSION

Students follow along as they listen to the same part of the text being read aloud and discuss a series of text-dependent questions.

3- FIND SUPPORTING EVIDENCE IN PAIRS

In pairs, students use the Making EBC Tool to look for evidence to support additional claims about the text made by the teacher.

4- CLASS DISCUSSION OF EBCs

The class discusses evidence in support of claims found by student pairs.

5- FORMING EBCs IN PAIRS

In pairs, students use the Forming EBC Tool to make an evidence-based claim of their own and present it to the class.

ESTIMATED TIME: 1-3 days

MATERIALS:

Making EBC Tool
Forming EBC Handout
Forming EBC Tool
EBC Criteria Checklist I
TCD Checklist



ALIGNMENT TO CCSS

TARGETED STANDARD(S): RI.11-12.1

RI.11-12.1: Cite strong and thorough textual evidence to support analysis of what the text says explicitly as well as inferences drawn from the text, including determining where the text leaves matters uncertain.

SUPPORTING STANDARD(S): RI.11-12.2 RI.11-12.3 SL.11-12.1

RI.11-12.2 : Determine two or more central ideas of a text and analyze their development over the course of the text, including how they interact and build on one another to provide a complex analysis; provide an objective summary of the text.

RI.11-12.3: Analyze a complex set of ideas or sequence of events and explain how specific individuals, ideas, or events interact and develop over the course of the text.

SL.11-12.1: Initiate and participate effectively in a range of collaborative discussions (one-on-one, in groups, and teacher-led) with diverse partners on grades 11–12 topics, texts, and issues, building on others’ ideas and expressing their own clearly and persuasively.

≡ ACTIVITY 1: INDEPENDENT READING AND ≡ FINDING SUPPORTING EVIDENCE

Students independently read part of the text and use the Making EBC Tool to look for evidence to support a claim made by the teacher.

INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES

Students independently work on paragraphs 12-39 of Reagan's First Inaugural Address. Depending on scheduling and student ability, students can be assigned to read and complete the tool for homework. Teachers should decide what works best for their students. It's essential that students have opportunity to read the text independently. All students must develop the habit of perseverance in reading. Assigning the reading as homework potentially gives them more time with the text. Either way, it might be a good idea to provide some time at


the beginning of class for students to read the section quietly by themselves. This ensures that all students have had at least some independent reading time.

Also depending on scheduling and student ability, some students might choose (or be encouraged) to read ahead. Instructional focus should follow the pacing outlined in the activities, but students will only benefit from reading and re-reading the text throughout the duration of the unit.

≡ ACTIVITY 2: READ ALOUD AND ≡ CLASS DISCUSSION

Students follow along as they listen to the same part of the text being read aloud and discuss a series of text-dependent questions.

INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES



Students follow along as they listen to paragraphs 12-39 of Reagan's First Inaugural Address being read aloud and discuss four text-dependent questions:

- 1- What is heroism according to Reagan?
- 2- What point is Reagan trying to make with the Dr. Joseph Warren quote?
- 3- What does Reagan mean by American being a "beacon of hope"?
- 4- What point does Reagan make when he claims that "we are a nation that has a government –not the other way around"?

Read the text aloud to the class while students follow along. Alternatively, students could be asked to read aloud to the class. Work through the text using the following three text-dependent questions.

ACTIVITY 2: READ ALOUD AND CLASS DISCUSSION (CONT'D)

INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES

1- What is heroism according to Reagan?

Reagan uses figures from the country's founding and those who have fought in more recent wars as well as citizens as his examples of heroes. In all of his examples, the twin notions of love for country and sacrifice are present. Through his examples, Reagan builds the idea that heroism is personal sacrifice for one's country. Direct the students to P18 in order to begin a discussion about who heroes are. The heroes Reagan describes here are the citizens, the individuals, of the U.S. Ask the students if they see any similarity in language between parts I and II. Reagan also refers to prior historical heroes and focuses on the soldier Martin Treptow. What does Treptow's journal say? What connection does Reagan make between these national heroes? Review the names of the places Reagan mentions in P35. The theme of individual sacrifice should come up. Ask the students to identify the words Reagan uses to invoke sacrifice (price, sacrifice, endure, paid, etc.). This use of military sacrifice ties into Reagan's use in Part 1 of the individual economic sacrifice (P6-P8) needed to get America back on the right track. Just as the government must "tighten its purse strings," individuals must work hard and sacrifice in order to achieve economic growth. This reference to sacrifice is subtle and inferred in Part 1. Ask the students what they think Reagan is calling for Americans to do in order to stop the deficit. At this point, the teacher can guide the discussion to the relationship between heroism and individualism.

2- What point is Reagan trying to make with the Dr. Joseph Warren quote?

As he did earlier and continues to do so, Reagan uses this quote to drive home the point that it is American citizens and not the government who run the country. Because the health of the country is dependent on normal citizens, the responsibility is great. Because the responsibility lies with individuals, to "act worthy of yourselves" means that the citizenry must act in a way that lives up to the heavy responsibility laid at their feet. Students should turn their attention to the next paragraph where Reagan expands on Warren's point. Reagan, here, believes that Americans are ready to carry this burden and act in a way that makes sure that liberty and happiness will be values that our children can enjoy.


3- What does Reagan mean by American being a "beacon of hope"?

Reagan's "beacon" metaphor is a good phrase to focus on for discussing Reagan's view of the U.S. with the rest of the world. Discuss the connotations of "beacon" and how Reagan is illustrating his view of the role U.S. plays in the world. What "hope" is Reagan talking about? Ask the students to look for the ways Reagan believes Americans can be an "exemplar."

ACTIVITY 2: READ ALOUD AND CLASS DISCUSSION (CONT'D)

INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES

4- What point does Reagan make when he claims that “we are a nation that has a government –not the other way around”?



Reagan largely contrasts two different sides of a national argument in his speech: big government vs. individual and states’ rights. In paragraphs 13-16, Reagan largely emphasizes that the government is made up of its people and states; the people give the government power and the “States created the Federal Government”(P14). Ask students to identify the conflict (between big vs. small federal government) and identify on which side Reagan stands. Guide students to make connections with this idea about government with the larger discussion about the individual.

ACTIVITY 3: FIND SUPPORTING EVIDENCE

In pairs, students use the Making EBC Tool to look for evidence to support additional claims about the text made by the teacher.

INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES

Once the class has reached a solid understanding of the text, connect it to the skill of making claims and supporting them with evidence by presenting a few main claims. Pass out the tools and have students work in pairs to find evidence to support the claims.

Collect each student’s Making EBC Tool with the evidence they found for the first claim. These should be evaluated to get an assessment of where each student is in the skill development. Students should use their tools for their work in pairs—repeating the first claim and refining their evidence based on the read aloud and class discussion. Even though students are not finding the evidence independently, they should each fill in the tools to reinforce their acquisition of the logical structure among the ideas. Students should get into the habit of using quotation marks when recording direct quotes and including the line numbers of the evidence.

The instructional focus here is developing familiarity with claims about texts and the use of textual evidence to support them. Students should still not be expected to develop complete sentences to express supporting evidence. The pieces of evidence should be as focused as possible. The idea is for students to identify the precise points in the text that support the claim. This focus is lost if the pieces of evidence become too large. The tools are constructed to elicit a type of “pointing” at the evidence.

One approach for ensuring a close examination of claims and evidence is to provide erroneous claims that contradict textual evidence and ask students to find the places that disprove the claim. Students could then be asked to modify it to account for the evidence.



ACTIVITY 4: CLASS DISCUSSION OF EBCs

The class discusses evidence in support of claims found by student pairs.

INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES

After students have finished their work in pairs, regroup for a class discussion. Have pairs volunteer to present their evidence to the rest of the class. Discuss the evidence, evaluating how each piece supports the claims. Begin by modeling the evaluation, referring to the checklist, and then call on students to evaluate the evidence shared by the other pairs.

They can offer their own evidence to expand the discussion. Carefully guide the exchanges, explicitly asking students to support their evaluations with reference to the text.

These constructive discussions are essential for the skill development. Listening to and evaluating the evidence of others and providing text-based criticism expands students' capacity

to reason through the relationship between claims and evidence. Paying close attention to and providing instructional guidance on the student comments is as important to the process as evaluating the tools and creates a class culture of supporting all claims (including oral critiques) with evidence.

Using the Text-Centered Discussion Checklist is one way of talking about and supporting student participation in class and pair discussions, especially if students are already familiar with the TCD checklist from previous units. If not, time can be taken (if desired) to introduce them to some or all of the criteria of effective text-centered discussions.



ACTIVITY 5: FORMING EBCs IN PAIRS

In pairs, students use the Forming EBC Tool to make an evidence-based claim of their own and present it to the class.

INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES

Once the claims and evidence have been discussed, students return to the pairs and use the tool to make an evidence-based claim of their own. Pairs should make a single claim, but each student should fill in his or her own tool. Regroup and discuss the claims and evidence as a class. Pairs can use their tool to present their claims and evidence orally.

Talk through the process modeled in the tool, including the nature of the details that stood out to students, the reasoning they used to group and relate them, and the claim they developed from the textual evidence.

Draw upon the Forming EBC Handout and EBC Criteria Checklist I to help guide discussion.



INDEPENDENT READING ACTIVITY

Students read paragraphs 1-20 of Secretary Hillary Clinton’s speech and use the Forming EBC Tools to make a claim and support it with evidence. This activity overlaps with the first activity of Part 3 and can be given as homework or done at the beginning of the next class.



ASSESSMENT OPPORTUNITIES

The Making EBC Tools should be evaluated to assess the development of the student’s grasp of the relationship between claims and textual evidence. They should show progress in the relevance and focus of the evidence. The Forming EBC Tools are students’ first attempts at making their own claims with the help of a peer. Basic claims are fine at this point. Use the EBC Criteria Checklist to structure the evaluation and feedback to students. Evaluation should focus on the validity and clarity of the claim and the relevance of the evidence. Recording the “thinking” part of the tool is important in order to strengthen the student’s reasoning skills as well as provide them with the academic vocabulary to talk about them.

Evidence should be in quotation marks and the reference recorded. Using quotation marks helps students make the distinction between quotes and paraphrases. It also helps them to eventually incorporate quotes properly into their writing. Recording references is critical not only for proper incorporation in writing, but also because it helps students return to text for re-evaluating evidence and making appropriate selections.

The Text-Centered Discussion Checklist can be used to evaluate student participation in discussions for formative and diagnostic information. Teachers and students can get a sense of areas where development in speaking and listening skills are needed.