

## PART 1

# UNDERSTANDING THE NATURE OF AN ISSUE

**“We can’t have one hundred percent security  
and one hundred percent privacy.” – President Obama**

### OBJECTIVE:

Students apply their close reading skills to understand a societal issue as a context for various perspectives, positions, and arguments.



## ACTIVITIES

### 1- INTRODUCING THE UNIT

The teacher presents an overview of the unit and its societal issue.

### 2- EXPLORING THE ISSUE

Students read and analyze a background text to develop an initial understanding of the issue.

### 3- DEEPENING UNDERSTANDING OF THE ISSUE

Students read and analyze a second background text to expand and deepen their understanding of the issue.

### 4- QUESTIONING TO REFINE UNDERSTANDING

Students develop text-dependent questions and use them to refine their analysis.

### 5- WRITING AN EVIDENCE-BASED CLAIM ABOUT THE NATURE OF THE ISSUE

Students develop and write an evidence-based claim about the nature of the issue.

### MATERIALS:

Text Sets 1 and 2  
Guiding Questions Handout  
Forming EBC Tool  
TCD Checklist  
EBA Terms



## ALIGNMENT TO CCSS

### TARGETED STANDARDS:

**RI.9-10.1:** Cite strong and thorough textual evidence to support analysis of what the text says explicitly as well as inferences drawn from the text. **RI.9-10.2:** Determine a central idea of a text and analyze its development over the course of the text, including how it emerges and is shaped and refined by specific details; provide an objective summary of the text. **RI.9-10.3:** Analyze how the author unfolds an analysis or series of ideas or events, including the order in which the points are made, how they are introduced and developed, and the connections that are drawn between them. **W.9-10.2:** Write informative/explanatory texts to examine and convey complex ideas, concepts, and information clearly and accurately through the effective selection, organization, and analysis of content.

### SUPPORTING STANDARDS:

**SL.9-10.1:** Initiate and participate effectively in a range of collaborative discussions (one-on-one, in groups, and teacher-led) with diverse partners on grades 9–10 topics, texts, and issues, building on others’ ideas and expressing their own clearly and persuasively. **RI.9-10.4:** Determine the meaning of words and phrases as they are used in a text, including figurative, connotative, and technical meanings; analyze the cumulative impact of specific word choices on meaning and tone (e.g., how the language of a court opinion differs from that of a newspaper).



# ACTIVITY 1: INTRODUCING THE UNIT

The teacher presents an overview of the unit and its societal issue.

## INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES

### INTRODUCE ARGUMENTATION

Introduce the central purpose of the unit: to develop, practice, and apply the skills of argumentation in the context of a societal issue by:

- 1) Understanding the nature of a challenging *issue* for which there are various *perspectives* and *positions*.
- 2) Understanding and comparing *perspectives* and *arguments* on the issue.
- 3) Developing an evidence-based *position* on the issue.
- 4) Developing, sequencing and linking *claims* as *premises* in an evidence-based *argument* for one's position.
- 5) Supporting one's premises with logical *reasoning* and relevant *evidence*.
- 6) Developing an argumentative *essay* through a series of guided editorial processes.

Emphasize that in this unit, students will learn and think about a complex societal issue for which there are many explanations, perspectives, and opinions, not simply two sides of an argument to be debated. Let them know that they will read and research to better understand the issue and various perspectives on it *before* they form a position of their own and develop an argument in support of that position. Explain that the unit will culminate in a collaborative process for developing and strengthening an argumentative essay that each student will write on the unit's societal issue.

- Establish a clear definition of the term *issue* in general. An issue can be defined as *an important aspect of human society for which there are many differing opinions on an appropriate course of action*. Brainstorming a list of societal issues might be helpful.
- Using examples from various fields and topical areas, discuss the general question: *"How do strategic thinkers discuss and understand challenging issues or problems?"* Brainstorm a list of approaches and skills used by experts who regularly have to propose and support responses to issues or problems.

### PRIVACY/SECURITY

The topic area and text set for this unit focuses on the governance of upholding the 4<sup>th</sup> Amendment, and more specifically on the issues and controversies that surfaced when Eric Snowden blew the whistle on the National Security Agency's (NSA) domestic surveillance program. The tension that exists between the government's obligation to protect citizens' rights as upheld by the US Constitution and its obligation to ensure the same citizens' security is complex. The point where security and freedom are appropriately balanced is difficult to find and many possible perspectives and positions on this debate exist, which allows the teacher and students to approach and study the issue from many possible angles.

### FORMULATE A PROBLEM-BASED QUESTION

Formulate a problem-based question from which students can begin their discussions, reading, and development of an argumentative position. Choose or develop a general, though still focused, question that causes students to think about the problem with many directions for argumentation, and that connects to students' backgrounds and interests. An example/option for a problem-based question with a political context is:

*What is the appropriate balance between a US citizen's right to privacy and the government's responsibility to protect its citizens?*

### TEXT-BASED QUESTION

If this question is selected, or a similar one developed, provide an entry point into the debate with a text that students can relate to and presents the debate in a way that is accessible to all students. There are a few different videos that work well to help frame the issue for students. One is the cell phone surveillance scene from the movie *"Batman: Dark Knight"* where characters Batman and Lucius Fox debate about whether or not to use a mass spy tool on citizens in order to disrupt a terrorist plot. Another is from the movie *"Bourne Identity,"* where government agents are able to track down Bourne and his companion Marie, by instantly tapping into information online. A third option is to show Edward Snowden's Christmas 2013



## ACTIVITY 1: INTRODUCING THE UNIT (CONT'D)

### INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES (CONT'D)

message where he warns of a worldwide surveillance system that “a child born today will grow up with no conception of privacy at all.”

The following text-based questions about the Batman scene model provide a first opportunity for close analysis.

*What disagreement do Lucius and Batman have over the use of cell phone surveillance? How is the decision made to use the defense system despite Lucius’ objection? What implications does this decision have in the debate about what is more important – a citizen’s safety or privacy?*

Let students know that they will be returning to these types of questions often as they read texts related to the 4<sup>th</sup> Amendment which deals specifically with the right to privacy, and the NSA surveillance program which is similar to Batman’s surveillance program on

Gotham. Emphasize that they will be making connections between this clip and their learning throughout the unit and they will use it as a stimulus for reading and discussion. It will also support students as they create their own understanding of the debate and build an evidence-based argument based on their own informed position on the security vs. freedom debate.

### KWL

Teachers might choose to use an activity to help students access their prior knowledge of the subject while also making sure to be careful of erroneous prior conceptions of the topic (KWL, class brainstorm, image brainstorm, free write, etc.).



## ACTIVITY 2: EXPLORING THE ISSUE

Students read and analyze a background text to develop an initial understanding of an issue.

### INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES

#### READING

- Students read the text independently, annotating and making notes on how it relates to the unit’s problem-based question.
- The teacher introduces one or more text-based questions to drive a closer reading of the text. Students then follow along as the text is presented to them.
- In reading teams, students discuss the text-based questions and search for relevant details, highlighting and annotating them in their text (and might use a *Forming EBC* tool to record their thinking).

#### WRITING CLAIMS

- The teacher models the development and writing of an explanatory claim that addresses something the text has presented about the unit’s issue. The claim is explanatory not argumentative at this point.

- Students individually develop explanatory claims about the text’s presentation of the issue (a *Forming EBC* tool can be used).
- In reading teams, students compare claims and the evidence they have found to derive and support them.

Students write a short claim-based synopsis of the text and the information it presents about the nature of the issue or problem, citing specific details and evidence to support their explanatory claim. [NOTE: Emphasize that at this point in the process, student claims should focus on interpreting what the text says about the nature of the issue, not on the validity of the text’s perspective or position and *not* on articulating the student’s own, still-developing position. Those sorts of claims will come later.]



## ACTIVITY 2: EXPLORING THE ISSUE (CONT'D)

### INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES (CONT'D)

#### NOTE ON TEXT SETS

Instruction in this unit links to a sequence of *text sets*. Each text set provides multiple entry points into the issue, giving teachers and students flexibility with respect to the time and depth with which they wish to explore the topic.

Teachers may choose to use the text sets in a variety of ways:

- Select one of the three texts for all students to read, analyze, and discuss. Provide links to the other two so that students can do additional reading if desired.
- Have all students read, analyze, and discuss all three texts (or two of the three) in a more extended instructional time sequence.
- Place students in “expert groups” and have them read and analyze one of the three texts. Then have students “jigsaw” into cross-text discussion groups to share and compare what they have learned from the text each has read. [Note: students might be grouped by reading level and assigned texts based on their complexity/difficulty.]

#### TEXT SET #1: TEXTUAL NOTES

Text Set I includes three texts that can be used to provide initial background information about the 4<sup>th</sup> Amendment, a historical perspective of surveillance in the US, and more specifically, surveillance since 9/11.

##### TEXT 1.1: “THE 4TH AMENDMENT, US CONSTITUTION”

**Author:** George Mason, James Madison, (there were several authors, however, these two are credited the most); **Source/Publisher:** Cornell Law; **Date:** 1789

**Complexity Level:** Measures at 1970L and is also considered a complex text due language and syntax typical of law documents.

**Text Notes:** As part of the Bill of Rights, the 4<sup>th</sup> Amendment is a seminal text and serves as a wonderful introduction to this unit’s focus. While brief in words, the amendment’s language and syntax may make the 4<sup>th</sup> Amendment initially difficult to access for some students. Specifically, teachers may need to cover words such as “persons, effects, warrants, and probable cause” for students to fully appreciate the text. Have students read through the text twice, noting important details or words that stand out to them.

**Sample Text-Dependent Questions** (to drive closer reading and discussion):

1. What specific rights does the 4<sup>th</sup> Amendment protect?
2. What actions does the 4<sup>th</sup> Amendment say would be illegal? What actions does the 4<sup>th</sup> Amendment say would be legal? How do you know?
3. How does the evidence provided in this text influence your understanding of the issue of government surveillance and personal privacy?



## ACTIVITY 2: EXPLORING THE ISSUE (CONT'D)

### TEXT SET #1: TEXTUAL NOTES

#### TEXT 1.2: "YOUR DIGITAL TRAIL: DOES THE 4<sup>TH</sup> AMENDMENT PROTECT US?"

**Author:** Daniel Zwerling; **Source/Publisher:** National Public Radio; **Date:** October 2, 2013

**Complexity Level:** At 1160L, this text is less complex than the amendment itself so students can more easily understand the amendment and how it applies to the modern day world.

**Text Notes:** This text should be used to build a greater understanding of the 4<sup>th</sup> Amendment. The author uses a familiar movie, *The Bourne Identity*, as a backdrop to discuss the implications technology has on government's ability to conduct surveillance and the resulting privacy concerns. Perhaps of greatest interest, the author states, "since the 1960s and 1970s, the Supreme Court and other courts have issued a series of rulings declaring that the government does not need a search warrant to obtain your personal documents if you have already shared them with somebody else." The effects of these decisions in the digital age are tremendous, as the author points out. The article does a great job bridging the gap between the difficult language of the amendment to the digital medium most students are more familiar with today.

**Sample Text-Dependent Questions** (to drive closer reading and discussion):

1. What line from the 4<sup>th</sup> Amendment does the author specifically quote in his article?
2. What evidence does the author use to support the legal analysts' claim that "the world of computers has weakened the Fourth Amendment?"
3. What details from the article best describe the words "persons, houses, papers, and effects" as used in the 4<sup>th</sup> Amendment?
4. At the end of the 13<sup>th</sup> paragraph the author writes, "It's the legal version of the lesson you learned when you were 12 years old: If you don't want anybody else to read your diary then don't show it to anybody." According to the author, how have older laws, when combined with new technology, aided the government in conducting surveillance programs?
5. How does the evidence provided in this text influence your understanding of the issue of government surveillance and personal privacy?

#### TEXT 1.3: "HOW HAS SURVEILLANCE EVOLVED IN THE UNITED STATES"

**Author:** Joey Carmichael; **Source/Publisher:** Popular Science; **Date:** June 19, 2013

**Complexity Level:** The timeline format chunks text into small sections, making it very accessible for students, particularly if they only focus on reading a few sections of the timeline closely.

**Text Notes:** This timeline provides students with an introduction and overview of the role surveillance has played throughout American history. The timeline is also meant to communicate to students that Americans conducting surveillance on other Americans is not a new idea. It also shows how specific events and developments throughout history have changed what kinds of surveillance are allowed and not allowed. This text further strengthens the ideas proposed in the previous text about the changing interpretation of the 4<sup>th</sup> Amendment over time.



## ACTIVITY 2: EXPLORING THE ISSUE (CONT'D)

### TEXT SET #1: TEXTUAL NOTES

**Sample Text-Dependent Questions** (to drive closer reading and discussion):

1. What do you notice about how this timeline is structured? Be specific about the details you notice.
2. Using details from the timeline explain what is meant by the word “surveillance” in the title?
3. Why did the author use the adoption of the 4<sup>th</sup> Amendment as the starting point of this timeline? How do the subsequent examples relate to the amendment?
4. How does the *Katz v United States* slide clarify what “search and seizure” means?
5. How are the events that have caused the government to expand its surveillance on Americans connected? What patterns do you see?
6. How does the evidence provided in this text influence your understanding of the issue of government surveillance and personal privacy?

### TEXT 1.4: “ELECTRONIC SURVEILLANCE UNDER PRESIDENT BUSH AND OBAMA”

**Author:** Masuma Ahuja; **Source/Publisher:** The Washington Post; **Date:** June 2013

**Complexity Level:** The timeline format chunks text into small sections, making it very accessible for students, particularly if they only focus on reading a few sections of the timeline closely.

**Text Notes:** This timeline provides students with a focused look at how the government has conducted surveillance under Presidents Bush and Obama, as well as the direct connection that is made between surveillance of Americans and the threat of terrorism. The timeline strengthens students’ background knowledge of the tension that exists between security and privacy.

**Sample Text-Dependent Questions** (to drive closer reading and discussion):

1. In what way does the author connect the September 11th attacks to the government’s role in conducting surveillance on American citizens?
2. According to the timeline, what piece of legislation plays the most significant role in government surveillance history?
3. Which events on the timeline represent the shrinking or expanding of government surveillance on US Citizens? What caused the government to shrink or expand their role in conducting surveillance on US citizens?
4. On June 6, 2013, President Obama said, “nobody is listening to your calls.” What then, according to the President, is the government actually looking for?
5. How does the evidence provided in this text influence your understanding of the issue of government surveillance and personal privacy?

## ACTIVITY 3: DEEPENING UNDERSTANDING OF THE ISSUE

Students read and analyze a second background text to expand and deepen their understanding of the issue.

### INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES

#### READING

- Students read the text independently, annotating and making notes on how it relates to the unit's problem-based question.
- The teacher introduces one or more text-based questions to drive a closer reading of the text. Students then follow along as the text is presented to them.
- In reading teams, students discuss the text-based questions and search for relevant details, highlighting and annotating them in their text (and might use a *Forming EBC* tool to record their thinking).

#### WRITING CLAIMS

- The teacher models the development and writing of an explanatory claim that addresses something the

text has presented about the unit's issue. The claim is explanatory not argumentative at this point.

- Students individually develop explanatory claims about the text's presentation of the issue (a *Forming EBC* tool can be used).
- In reading teams, students compare claims and the evidence they have found to derive and support them.

Students write a short claim-based synopsis of the text and the information it presents about the nature of the issue or problem, citing specific details and evidence to support their explanatory claim. [NOTE: Emphasize that at this point in the process, student claims should focus on interpreting what the text says about the nature of the issue, not on the validity of the text's perspective or position and *not* on articulating the student's own, still-developing position. Those sorts of claims will come later.]

### TEXT SET #2: TEXTUAL NOTES

Text Set #2 includes three texts that can be used to provide additional background information about the security vs. privacy debate including the enactment of the Patriot Act, and the current case involving "whistle-blower" Eric Snowden.

#### TEXT 2.1: "U.S., BRITISH INTELLIGENCE MINING DATA FROM NINE U.S. INTERNET COMPANIES IN BROAD SECRET PROGRAM"

**Author:** Barton Gellman and Laura Poitras; **Source/Publisher:** The Washington Post; **Date:** June 6, 2013

**Complexity Level:** At 1460L, this text measures high due to formal nouns and several acronyms. The text is a newspaper article and is suitable for most 10th grade students. Viewing the video embedded in the article will help support comprehension of the key ideas.

**Text Notes:** This newspaper article mostly focuses on the secretive, surveillance program run by the National Security Agency and the FBI called PRISM, as well as its equivalent in Britain. As the authors point out, these government agencies obtain digital information directly from well-known companies such as Facebook, Google and Apple. After reading the article, students can watch the video, which is an interview with Barton Gellman, one of the article's authors. The interview provides a good opportunity to review key information presented in the article and to access the information in a different medium.



## ACTIVITY 3: DEEPENING UNDERSTANDING OF THE ISSUE (CONT'D)

### TEXT SET #2: TEXTUAL NOTES

**Sample Text-Dependent Questions** (to drive closer reading and discussion):

1. The authors point out that in the past the NSA has used relationships with corporate entities in order to conduct its operations [paragraph 2]. How do the authors suggest that the PRISM program is different from these past relationships?
2. The authors make the claim that the government has shifted from individual to mass surveillance. What supporting evidence do they provide to substantiate their claim?
3. According to the article, how have most private companies (Apple, Twitter, etc.) responded to questions over their relationship with government agencies?
4. In the video, Gillman discusses the role of the “source” in providing the authors access to secret information. What explanation does Gellman give for withholding certain information from the public? According to Gellman, why did the source give up this information?
5. How does the evidence provided in this text influence your understanding of the issue of government surveillance and personal privacy?

### TEXT 2.2: “THE USA PATRIOT ACT: PRESERVING LIFE AND LIBERTY”

**Author/Source/Publisher:** Department of Justice; **Date:** NA

**Complexity Level:** The government website measures at 1450L mostly due to its linguistic style. However, this text is made accessible due to its clear organization, bolded lettering and numbered paragraphs.

**Text Notes:** This text, published by the Department of Justice, provides students background knowledge on the Patriot Act. They will have already seen some information on this piece of legislation from reading prior articles and timelines in the set, however, this is their first chance to learn about the Act in more depth. In the post 9/11 scenario, the Patriot Act was and continues to be one of the most crucial and controversial pieces of government legislation in history. As the website claims, this Act greatly enhances the government’s ability to fight terrorism, describing specifically how specific components improves counter-terrorism efforts.

**Sample Text-Dependent Questions** (to drive closer reading and discussion):

1. In the first paragraph, what effect does the quote from Senator Joe Biden have on the text’s message?
2. Point number 3 claims, “the Patriot Act updated the law to reflect new technologies and new threats.” What evidence is given to back up the claim? How does this evidence relate to what you have learned about the 4th Amendment?
3. How does the evidence provided in this text influence your understanding of the issue of government surveillance and personal privacy?



## ACTIVITY 3: DEEPENING UNDERSTANDING OF THE ISSUE (CONT'D)

### TEXT SET #2: TEXTUAL NOTES

#### TEXT 2.3: "NSA WHISTLEBLOWER EDWARD SNOWDEN: 'I DON'T WANT TO LIVE IN A SOCIETY THAT DOES THESE SORTS OF THINGS' "

**Authors:** Glenn Greenwald (interviewer) and Laura Poitras (filmmaker);

**Source/Publisher:** Posted by Kevin Gallagher on YouTube.com, 12:35 minutes; **Date:** June 6, 2013

**Complexity Level:** NA. This is the video of an interview with whistleblower Edward Snowden. The question-answer style makes the content easy to follow and both Greenwald and Snowden's slow speech should make this video accessible to 10<sup>th</sup> graders.

**Text Notes:** In his first interview with a reporter in Hong Kong, former NSA analyst discusses his decision to reveal top-secret information about the government agency's surveillance programs. As a whistleblower, Edward Snowden was forced to evade capture by US forces or friendly countries and promptly relocated to Russia after making this video. As of January 2014, the video has received over 2,600,000 "hits," as it clearly represents an important event in government surveillance and privacy debate.

**Sample Text-Dependent Questions** (to drive closer reading and discussion):

1. Throughout the interview, Snowden comes back to the public's right to decide on what is right for them. What does he mean by this? How does this run counter to the government's efforts?
2. In the interview, Snowden claims, "I, sitting at my desk, certainly had the authority to target anyone." If true, how would this run counter to the 4<sup>th</sup> Amendment?
3. According to Snowden, where does "probable cause," as stated in the 4<sup>th</sup> Amendment, figure in the government's surveillance program?
4. How does the evidence provided in this text influence your understanding of the issue of government surveillance and personal privacy?

#### TEXT 2.4: "BUSH'S REMARKS AT THE SIGNING CEREMONY FOR THE ANTI-TERRORISM PATRIOT ACT OF 2001"

**Author:** George Bush; **Source/Publisher:** Washington Post; **Date:** October 25, 2001

**Complexity Level:** This text measures at 1040L and should be accessible for 10<sup>th</sup> graders.

**Text Notes:** In his speech upon signing the Patriot Act into Law after 9/11, President Bush comments on the efficacy with which the government will now be able to run counter-terrorism efforts. While not as detailed as the text by the Department of Justice, this highly accessible speech will give students further understanding of the urgency and implications under which the Patriot Act was made law. The country had just experienced one of the most horrendous attacks since Pearl Harbor and the government acted swiftly in order to equip the justice and intelligence community with what it considered the necessary "tools" to stop attacks like those that occurred on 9/11. The teacher should be sure to point out the date of this speech – October 25, 2001, a mere 6 weeks after the attacks.

**Sample Text-Dependent Questions** (to drive closer reading and discussion):

1. How does the President describe the terrorists? What specific details does he use to characterize them?
2. According to the speech, in what ways does the Patriot Act improve the government's counter-terrorism efforts?
3. How does the evidence provided in this text influence your understanding of the issue of government surveillance and personal privacy?

# ACTIVITY 4: QUESTIONING TO REFINE UNDERSTANDING

Students develop text-dependent questions and use them to find additional evidence and further refine their claims.

## INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES

### QUESTIONING TEXTS

Students now apply skills they have developed in a *Reading Closely for Textual Details* unit to frame their own, more focused questions about the issue and texts. They use these questions to drive a deeper reading of the previous texts, or of additional texts providing background and perspectives on the topic.

- Starting from the unit's problem-based question, students work in reading teams to develop a set of more focused, text-based questions to drive further inquiry into the issue. (Students can use the *Reading Closely for Details: Guiding Questions* handout to help them develop their questions.)
- Individually, students use these new questions to re-read one of the two background texts, find additional details, and further refine their explanatory claim.
- If additional background information is necessary or desired, students then use their question sets to drive close reading and analysis of one or more additional texts. (Note: Suggested texts are listed in the Instructional Notes or may be identified by the teacher or found by the students. Students might work in teams to become "experts" and develop explanatory claims about one or more of these additional texts, then "jigsaw" into new groups and share what they have learned. In this way, all students can become familiar with a wider range of background texts.)
- Students write or revise one or more explanatory claim(s) based on additional evidence they have found through further or deeper reading.

## TEXTUAL NOTES

### ADDITIONAL BACKGROUND TEXTS

To expand their understanding of the topic, students might be assigned any of the texts from Text Sets #1 and #2 that have not been read by the class. They might also access other sources found by the teacher (or by students themselves) or the additional source texts listed in the unit plan.

Those five listed source texts provide additional, and different, information about security vs. privacy debate in the US, and can be used to expand students' understanding and/or as independent reading/research assignments. "Everything you need to know about the NSA's phone records scandal" provides information about what the NSA can obtain about citizens from their phone records as well as identifies different perspectives on the issue. "Public Opinion Shifts on Security-Liberty Balance" compares a July 2013 poll to a January 2010 poll which shows there has been a shift in public opinion indicating more Americans now believe the government has gone too far in restricting civil liberties regarding privacy. The CNN article provides multiple op-eds on the issue of privacy vs. security. Finally, the text of the Verizon Court order from the Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Court provides students with a primary source document that directly relates to information they read in the Gellman article. Specifically, the document shows exactly what kind of information the government asks Verizon to release about its customers and the kind of secrecy under which the order was given.

## ACTIVITY 5: WRITING AN EBC ABOUT THE NATURE OF THE ISSUE

Students develop and write an evidence-based claim about the nature of the issue.

### INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES

In the culminating activity for Part 1, students now develop a synthesis claim about the nature of the issue that they will expand and revise when drafting their final argument. Before they can take a position and make their case for a response, they must be able to use evidence to explain their understanding of the issue or problem.

- The teacher models the development of an evidence-based claim that synthesizes information from multiple sources and presents the writer's understanding the unit's issue.
- In reading teams, students go back to the background texts to find additional evidence/details that support this synthesis claim. (An *Organizing EBC* tool can be used).
- In reading teams, students review the explanatory claims they wrote about each text.
- In reading teams, students brainstorm alternative ways of viewing or understanding the problem, based on evidence from the background texts.
- Individually, students develop a multi-part claim that synthesizes how they have come (so far) to view and understand the nature of the issue and its components. (An *Organizing EBC* tool can be used).
- In reading teams, students compare their synthesis claims and the evidence that supports them.
- If teachers and students are familiar with the *Evidence-Based Claims Criteria Checklist* and the *Text-Centered Discussion Checklist* from work in previous units, students can use them as criteria for evaluating their claims and reflecting on their discussions and participation in their reading teams.
- As a class, return to the unit's problem-based question to consider revising it based on the emerging understanding of the issue.

## ASSESSMENT OPPORTUNITIES

As a formative assessment, and a building block for their final argument, in Activity 5, students draft a written, multi-part claim that:

1. Synthesizes what they have learned about the nature of the unit's issue.
2. Presents their current way of understanding the issue and its components.
3. Cites evidence from multiple sources that explains and substantiates their perspective.
4. Represents their best thinking and clearest writing.

Teachers can use an *EBC Criteria Checklist* to evaluate student writing as well as each student's initial comprehension of the background texts and understanding of the issue.