

## PART 2

# MAKING EVIDENCE-BASED CLAIMS

## “An Audacious Faith”

### OBJECTIVE:

Students develop the ability to make evidence-based claims through a close reading of the text.



## ACTIVITIES

### 1- INDEPENDENT READING AND FINDING SUPPORTING EVIDENCE

Students independently read part of the text and use the Making EBC Tool to look for evidence to support a claim made by the teacher.

### 2- READ ALOUD AND CLASS DISCUSSION

Students follow along as they listen to the same part of the text being read aloud and discuss a series of text-dependent questions.

### 3- FIND SUPPORTING EVIDENCE IN PAIRS

In pairs, students use the Making EBC Tool to look for evidence to support additional claims about the text made by the teacher.

### 4- CLASS DISCUSSION OF EBCs

The class discusses evidence in support of claims found by student pairs.

### 5- FORMING EBCs IN PAIRS

In pairs, students use the Forming EBC Tool to make an evidence-based claim of their own and present it to the class.

**ESTIMATED TIME:** 1-3 days

### MATERIALS:

Making EBC Tool  
Forming EBC Handout  
Forming EBC Tool  
EBC Criteria Checklist I  
TCD Checklist



## ALIGNMENT TO CCSS

### TARGETED STANDARD(S): RI.9-10.1

RI.9-10.1: Cite strong and thorough textual evidence to support analysis of what the text says explicitly as well as inferences drawn from the text.

### SUPPORTING STANDARD(S): RI.9-10.3      RI.9-10.6      RI.9-10.9      SL.9-10.1

RI.9-10.3: Analyze how the author unfolds an analysis or series of ideas or events, including the order in which the points are made, how they are introduced and developed, and the connections that are drawn between them.

RI.9-10.6: Determine an author's point of view or purpose in a text and analyze how an author uses rhetoric to advance that point of view or purpose.

RI.9-10.9: Analyze seminal U.S. documents of historical and literary significance (e.g., Washington's Farewell Address, the Gettysburg Address, Roosevelt's Four Freedoms speech, King's "Letter from Birmingham Jail"), including how they address related themes and concepts.

SL.9-10.1: Initiate and participate effectively in a range of collaborative discussions (one-on-one, in groups, and teacher-led) with diverse partners on grades 9-10 topics, texts, and issues, building on others' ideas and expressing their own clearly and persuasively.

## ≡ ACTIVITY 1: INDEPENDENT READING AND ≡ FINDING SUPPORTING EVIDENCE

Students independently read part of the text and use the Making EBC Tool to look for evidence to support a claim made by the teacher.

### INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES

Students independently work on paragraphs 6-12 of Martin Luther King's speech. Depending on scheduling and student ability, students can be assigned to read and complete the tool for homework. Teachers should decide what works best for their students. It's essential that students have opportunity to read the text independently. All students must develop the habit of perseverance in reading. Assigning the reading as homework potentially gives them more time with the text. Either way, it might be a good idea to provide some time at

the beginning of class for students to read the section quietly by themselves. This ensures that all students have had at least some independent reading time.

Also depending on scheduling and student ability, some students might choose (or be encouraged) to read ahead. Instructional focus should follow the pacing outlined in the activities, but students will only benefit from reading and re-reading the text throughout the duration of the unit.

## ≡ ACTIVITY 2: READ ALOUD AND ≡ CLASS DISCUSSION

Students follow along as they listen to the same part of the text being read aloud and discuss a series of text-dependent questions.

### INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES



Students follow along as they listen to paragraphs 6-12 of King's speech being read aloud and discuss four text-dependent questions:

- 1- What does King mean by the "'isness' of humanity's present nature?"
- 2- Where does King use a religious tone in his speech?
- 3- What is the "genuine civilization" King has the audacity to believe in?
- 4- How does King use rhetoric to evoke emotion in his speech?

Read the text aloud to the class while students follow along. Alternatively, students could be asked to read aloud to the class. Work through the text using the following three text-dependent questions.

## ≡ ACTIVITY 2: READ ALOUD AND ≡ CLASS DISCUSSION (CONT'D)

### INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES

1- What does King mean by the “‘isness’ of humanity’s present nature?”

In this part of the speech, King uses more morally driven language as he juxtaposes two different worlds of humanity: our “isness” vs. “oughtness.” Here, students can identify the qualities of these two different worlds. On the one hand, King talks of the “ambiguities of history” and the seemingly impossibility of changing the course of that history. On the other, King expresses his faith in humanity’s ability and moral obligation to act. Draw on King’s use of metaphor in these next sections, beginning with rich phrases like “flotsam and jetsam” and “starless midnight.” What effect does King’s word choice have on his speech?

2- Where does King use a religious tone in his speech?

King infuses religious and moral language into his speech at this point. Ask students to identify which words and phrases are religious or have a moral tone. Some of these include:

- reign supreme (line 49)
- altars (line 53)
- redemptive (line 54)
- “And the lion and the lamb shall lie down together and every man shall sit under his own vine and fig tree and none shall be afraid” (lines 55-56)

Ask students why King invokes moral and religious tones in his speech, and the relationship King makes between religion and the nonviolence method. The teacher can point out that King’s argument for nonviolence is laden with moral values to prove what is wrong and right.


3- What is the “genuine civilization” King has the audacity to believe in?

By this point, students should have a good understanding that King is talking about two sides in a moral and political debate. He clearly describes two sides of a conflict and imagines a better society at the end of the struggle. Ask the students what this society looks like or does not look like. Draw on the text for evidence by guiding the students to such phrases as “militaristic stairway into the hell of thermonuclear destruction,” “grinding poverty afflicts my people and chains them to the lowest rung of the economic ladder,” and “peoples everywhere can have three meals a day.” Discuss why King labels the movement and his belief in a “genuine civilization” as audacious.

## ACTIVITY 2: READ ALOUD AND CLASS DISCUSSION (CONT'D)

### INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES

4- How does King use rhetoric to evoke emotion in his speech?



Halfway through his speech, King changes the rhythm of his language. He repeats the phrases “I refuse” and “I believe” numerous times in the two middle paragraphs using a rhetorical device called anaphora; he repeats a phrase to gather emotional momentum in his speech. Ask the students for examples of King’s repetitive style and how it changes the tone of the speech. Viewing the speech will largely help them grasp the difference. (Note: You might also show an excerpt of the “I have a dream” speech where the same tool is used.) Guide students through the beginning of the speech where King focuses on a seemingly dismal outlook of the movement, to his use of the phrases “I refuse” and “I believe” to develop an emotionally charged climax. Where else in his speech does he use this device? (“I am mindful...”).

## ACTIVITY 3: FIND SUPPORTING EVIDENCE

In pairs, students use the Making EBC Tool to look for evidence to support additional claims about the text made by the teacher.

### INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES

Once the class has reached a solid understanding of the text, connect it to the skill of making claims and supporting them with evidence by presenting a few main claims. Pass out the tools and have students work in pairs to find evidence to support the claims.

Collect each student’s Making EBC Tool with the evidence they found for the first claim. These should be evaluated to get an assessment of where each student is in the skill development. Students should use their tools for their work in pairs—repeating the first claim and refining their evidence based on the read aloud and class discussion. Even though students are not finding the evidence independently, they should each fill in the tools to reinforce their acquisition of the logical structure among the ideas. Students should get into the habit of using quotation marks when recording direct quotes and including the line numbers of the evidence.

The instructional focus here is developing familiarity with claims about texts and the use of textual evidence to support them. Students should still not be expected to develop complete sentences to express supporting evidence. The pieces of evidence should be as focused as possible. The idea is for students to identify the precise points in the text that support the claim. This focus is lost if the pieces of evidence become too large. The tools are constructed to elicit a type of “pointing” at the evidence.

One approach for ensuring a close examination of claims and evidence is to provide erroneous claims that contradict textual evidence and ask students to find the places that disprove the claim. Students could then be asked to modify it to account for the evidence.



## ACTIVITY 4: CLASS DISCUSSION OF EBCs

The class discusses evidence in support of claims found by student pairs.

### INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES

After students have finished their work in pairs, regroup for a class discussion. Have pairs volunteer to present their evidence to the rest of the class. Discuss the evidence, evaluating how each piece supports the claims. Begin by modeling the evaluation, referring to the checklist, and then call on students to evaluate the evidence shared by the other pairs.

They can offer their own evidence to expand the discussion. Carefully guide the exchanges, explicitly asking students to support their evaluations with reference to the text.

These constructive discussions are essential for the skill development. Listening to and evaluating the evidence of others and providing text-based criticism expands students' capacity

to reason through the relationship between claims and evidence. Paying close attention to and providing instructional guidance on the student comments is as important to the process as evaluating the tools and creates a class culture of supporting all claims (including oral critiques) with evidence.

Using the Text-Centered Discussion Checklist is one way of talking about and supporting student participation in class and pair discussions, especially if students are already familiar with the TCD checklist from previous units. If not, time can be taken (if desired) to introduce them to some or all of the criteria of effective text-centered discussions.



## ACTIVITY 5: FORMING EBCs IN PAIRS

In pairs, students use the Forming EBC Tool to make an evidence-based claim of their own and present it to the class.

### INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES

Once the claims and evidence have been discussed, students return to the pairs and use the tool to make an evidence-based claim of their own. Pairs should make a single claim, but each student should fill in his or her own tool. Regroup and discuss the claims and evidence as a class. Pairs can use their tool to present their claims and evidence orally.

Talk through the process modeled in the tool, including the nature of the details that stood out to students, the reasoning they used to group and relate them, and the claim they developed from the textual evidence.

Draw upon the Forming EBC Handout and EBC Criteria Checklist I to help guide discussion.



## INDEPENDENT READING ACTIVITY

Students read paragraphs 1-17 of Obama’s speech and use the Forming EBC Tool to make a claim and support it with evidence. This activity overlaps with the first activity of Part 3 and can be given as homework or done at the beginning of the next class.



## ASSESSMENT OPPORTUNITIES

The Making EBC Tools should be evaluated to assess the development of the student’s grasp of the relationship between claims and textual evidence. They should show progress in the relevance and focus of the evidence. The Forming EBC Tools are students’ first attempts at making their own claims with the help of a peer. Basic claims are fine at this point. Use the EBC Criteria Checklist to structure the evaluation and feedback to students. Evaluation should focus on the validity and clarity of the claim and the relevance of the evidence. Recording the “thinking” part of the tool is important in order to strengthen the student’s reasoning skills as well as provide them with the academic vocabulary to talk about them.

Evidence should be in quotation marks and the reference recorded. Using quotation marks helps students make the distinction between quotes and paraphrases. It also helps them to eventually incorporate quotes properly into their writing. Recording references is critical not only for proper incorporation in writing, but also because it helps students return to text for re-evaluating evidence and making appropriate selections.

The Text-Centered Discussion Checklist can be used to evaluate student participation in discussions for formative and diagnostic information. Teachers and students can get a sense of areas where development in speaking and listening skills are needed.