

## PART 2

# MAKING EVIDENCE-BASED CLAIMS

"still drinking their whiskey"

### OBJECTIVE:

Students develop the ability to make evidence-based claims through a close reading of the text.



## ACTIVITIES

### 1- INDEPENDENT READING AND FINDING SUPPORTING EVIDENCE

Students independently read part of the text and use the Making EBC Tool to look for evidence to support a claim made by the teacher.

### 2- READ ALOUD AND CLASS DISCUSSION

Students follow along as they listen to the text being read aloud and discuss a series of text-dependent questions.

### 3- FIND SUPPORTING EVIDENCE IN PAIRS

In pairs, students use the Making EBC Tool to look for evidence to support additional claims about the text made by the teacher.

### 4- CLASS DISCUSSION OF EBCs

The class discusses evidence in support of claims found by student pairs.

### 5- FORMING EBCs IN PAIRS

In pairs, students use the Forming EBC Tool to make an evidence-based claim of their own and present it to the class.

**ESTIMATED TIME:** 1-3 days

### MATERIALS:

Making EBC Tool  
Forming EBC Lit Handout  
Forming EBC Tool  
EBC Criteria Checklist I  
TCD Checklist



## ALIGNMENT TO CCSS

### TARGETED STANDARD(S): RI.9-10.1

RI.9-10.1: Cite strong and thorough textual evidence to support analysis of what the text says explicitly as well as inferences drawn from the text.

### SUPPORTING STANDARD(S): RL.9-10.3 RL.9-10.5 RL.6 SL.9-10.1

RL.9-10.3: Analyze how complex characters (e.g., those with multiple or conflicting motivations) develop over the course of a text, interact with other characters, and advance the plot or develop the theme.

RL.9-10.5: Analyze how an author's choices concerning how to structure a text, order events within it (e.g., parallel plots), and manipulate time (e.g., pacing, flashbacks) create such effects as mystery, tension, or surprise.

RL.6: Assess how point of view or purpose shapes the content and style of a text.

SL.9-10.1: Initiate and participate effectively in a range of collaborative discussions (one-on-one, in groups, and teacher-led) with diverse partners on grades 9–10 topics, texts, and issues, building on others' ideas and expressing their own clearly and persuasively.

## ACTIVITY 1: INDEPENDENT READING AND FINDING SUPPORTING EVIDENCE

Students independently read part of the text and use the Making EBC Tool to look for evidence to support a claim made by the teacher.

### INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES

Students independently read pages 5 to page 11 ("Anyone could be upset by his first lion. That's all over.").

Depending on scheduling and student ability, students can be assigned to read and complete the tool for homework. Teachers should decide what works best for their students. It's essential that students have opportunity to read the text independently. All students must develop the habit of perseverance in reading. Assigning the reading as homework potentially gives them more time with the text. Either way, it might be a

good idea to provide some time at the beginning of class for students to read the section quietly by themselves. This ensures that all students have had at least some independent reading time.

Also depending on scheduling and student ability, some students might choose (or be encouraged) to read ahead. Instructional focus should follow the pacing outlined in the activities, but students will only benefit from reading and re-reading the text throughout the duration of the unit.

## ACTIVITY 2: READ ALOUD AND CLASS DISCUSSION

Students follow along as they listen to the same part of the text being read aloud and discuss a series of text-dependent questions.

### INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES

*Why does Margaret begin to cry? What specific details provide clues? How do these details develop the characterization of Francis and Margaret Macomber?*



The initial exchanges about the lion provide a good context to explore how Hemingway develops the characterization of the three through their conversation and action. It is also a good place to discuss the impact that beginning the story "in medias res" has on emphasis and tension. Beginning with lunch emphasizes the meaning of the "lion business" for the characters and their relationships with each other over the incident itself. As that meaning is developed through their conversation--including Margaret's crying--we begin to get a sense of each character and the interpersonal dynamics that preceded the incident and which it serves to compound.

## ≡ ACTIVITY 2: READ ALOUD AND ≡ CLASS DISCUSSION (CONT'D)

### INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES

*Why does Wilson think it is "bad form" for Macomber to ask if anyone will hear about "the lion business?" What specific details provide clues? How do these details develop the characterization of Macomber and Wilson? How does the use of point of view in this section affect the characterization of Wilson and Macomber?*

→ This story is excellent for teaching the effects of point of view in general and especially with respect to characterization. Discuss Hemingway's use of the third person omniscient. Help students become attuned to when Hemingway shifts the perspective from character to character (including the lion) and to an impersonal view. Having students annotate the text when reported thoughts, feelings, and judgments shift is a good strategy for developing their sense of point of view and engaging them deeply in the story. Starting with "So they sat there" on page 6 and continuing to "Anyone could be upset by his first lion. That's all over." on page 11, the perspective is that of Wilson. This frames this early characterization of Macomber and Margaret through Wilson's perspective, giving the reader an assessment of the couple from someone who is extremely knowledgeable about their current context--a "professional"--as well as giving the reader a good sense of Wilson himself. In this exchange, we learn about Macomber's insecurity, pride and naiveté. We also learn about Wilson's knowledge, experience, "codes" of behavior, pride, and his fluctuating opinion of Macomber. And we learn about the dynamic between the two men.

*Who does Wilson like more, Francis or Margaret? What details provide clues? How do these details develop the characterization of the Wilson, Francis and Margaret?*

There may be no answer to this question--at least at this point in the story. Discussing Wilson's view of the pair (and having students look for evidence of those views while they read) is a good way to engage students in analysis of characterization, point of view, as well as the issues of gender present in the story. Have students defend their answers with direct textual evidence. Use "like" as a mechanism for moving to precise analysis of textual detail. Encourage students to probe whether the evidence suggests "liking" or more subtle judgments. Explore too, according to the evidence, why Wilson would have those judgments.



## ACTIVITY 3: FIND SUPPORTING EVIDENCE

In pairs, students use the Making EBC Tool to look for evidence to support additional claims about the text made by the teacher.

### INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES

Once the class has reached a solid understanding of the text, connect it to the skill of making claims and supporting them with evidence by presenting a few main claims. Pass out the tools and have students work in pairs to find evidence to support the claims.

Collect each student's Making EBC Tool with the evidence they found for the first claim. These should be evaluated to get an assessment of where each student is in the skill development. Students should use their tools for their work in pairs—repeating the first claim and refining their evidence based on the read aloud and class discussion. Even though students are not finding the evidence independently, they should each fill in the tools to reinforce their acquisition of the logical structure among the ideas. Students should get into the habit of using quotation marks when recording direct quotes and including the line numbers of the evidence.

The instructional focus here is developing familiarity with claims about texts and the use of textual evidence to support them. Students should still not be expected to develop complete sentences to express supporting evidence. The pieces of evidence should be as focused as possible. The idea is for students to identify the precise points in the text that support the claim. This focus is lost if the pieces of evidence become too large. The tools are constructed to elicit a type of “pointing” at the evidence.

One approach for ensuring a close examination of claims and evidence is to provide erroneous claims that contradict textual evidence and ask students to find the places that disprove the claim. Students could then be asked to modify it to account for the evidence.



## ACTIVITY 4: CLASS DISCUSSION OF EBCs

The class discusses evidence in support of claims found by student pairs.

### INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES

After students have finished their work in pairs, regroup for a class discussion. Have pairs volunteer to present their evidence to the rest of the class. Discuss the evidence, evaluating how each piece supports the claims. Begin by modeling the evaluation, referring to the checklist, and then call on students to evaluate the evidence shared by the other pairs.

They can offer their own evidence to expand the discussion. Carefully guide the exchanges, explicitly asking students to support their evaluations with reference to the text.

These constructive discussions are essential for the skill development. Listening to and evaluating the evidence of others and providing text-based criticism expands students' capacity

to reason through the relationship between claims and evidence. Paying close attention to and providing instructional guidance on the student comments is as important to the process as evaluating the tools, and creates a class culture of supporting all claims (including oral critiques) with evidence.

Using the Text-Centered Discussion Checklist is one way of talking about and supporting student participation in class and pair discussions, especially if students are already familiar with the TCD checklist from previous units. If not, time can be taken (if desired) to introduce them to some or all of the criteria of effective text-centered discussions.



## ACTIVITY 5: FORMING EBCs IN PAIRS

In pairs, students use the Forming EBC Tool to make an evidence-based claim of their own and present it to the class.

### INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES

Once the claims and evidence have been discussed, students return to the pairs and use the tool to make an evidence-based claim of their own. Pairs should make a single claim, but each student should fill in his or her own tool. Regroup and discuss the claims and evidence as a class. Pairs can use their tool to present their claims and evidence orally.

Talk through the process modeled in the tool, including the nature of the details that stood out to students, the reasoning they used to group and relate them, and the claim they developed from the textual evidence.

Draw upon the Forming EBC Lit Handout and EBC Criteria Checklist I to help guide discussion.



## INDEPENDENT READING ACTIVITY

Students read pages 11-21 "No one had said anything more until they were back at camp." and use the Forming EBC Tool to make a claim and support it with evidence. Students also annotate the text when the reported thoughts and feelings shift among the characters. This activity overlaps with the first activity of Part 3 and can be given as homework or done at the beginning of the next class.



## ASSESSMENT OPPORTUNITIES

The Making EBC Tools should be evaluated to assess the development of the student's grasp of the relationship between claims and textual evidence. They should show progress in the relevance and focus of the evidence. The Forming EBC Tools are students' first attempts at making their own claims with the help of a peer. Basic claims are fine at this point. Use the EBC Criteria Checklist to structure the evaluation and feedback to students. Evaluation should focus on the validity and clarity of the claim and the relevance of the evidence. Recording the "thinking" part of the tool is important in order to strengthen the student's reasoning skills as well as provide them with the academic vocabulary to talk about them.

Evidence should be in quotation marks and the reference recorded. Using quotation marks helps students make the distinction between quotes and paraphrases. It also helps them to eventually incorporate quotes properly into their writing. Recording references is critical not only for proper incorporation in writing, but also because it helps students return to text for re-evaluating evidence and making appropriate selections.

The Text-Centered Discussion Checklist can be used to evaluate student participation in discussions for formative and diagnostic information. Teachers and students can get a sense of areas where development in speaking and listening skills is needed.