

PART 1

UNDERSTANDING EVIDENCE-BASED CLAIMS

"I'll have a gimlet too. I need something."

OBJECTIVE:

Students learn the importance and elements of making evidence-based claims through a close reading of part of the text.



ACTIVITIES

1- INTRODUCTION TO UNIT

The teacher presents the purpose of the unit and explains the proficiency of making EBCs.

2- INDEPENDENT READING

Students independently read part of the text with a text-dependent question to guide them.

3- READ ALOUD AND CLASS DISCUSSION

Students follow along as they listen to the text being read aloud, and the teacher leads a discussion guided by a series of text-dependent questions that are related to the original guiding question.

4- MODEL FORMING EBCs

The teacher models a critical reading and thinking process for forming EBCs about texts.

ESTIMATED TIME: 2-3 days

MATERIALS:

Forming EBC Lit Handout
Forming EBC Tool
EBC Criteria Checklist I
Making EBC Tool



ALIGNMENT TO CCSS

TARGETED STANDARD(S): RL.9-10.1

RL.9-10.1: Cite strong and thorough textual evidence to support analysis of what the text says explicitly as well as inferences drawn from the text.

SUPPORTING STANDARD(S): RL.9-10.3 RL.9-10.5 RL.6 SL.9-10.1

RL.9-10.3: Analyze how complex characters (e.g., those with multiple or conflicting motivations) develop over the course of a text, interact with other characters, and advance the plot or develop the theme.

RL.9-10.5: Analyze how an author's choices concerning how to structure a text, order events within it (e.g., parallel plots), and manipulate time (e.g., pacing, flashbacks) create such effects as mystery, tension, or surprise.

RL.6: Assess how point of view or purpose shapes the content and style of a text.

SL.9-10.1: Initiate and participate effectively in a range of collaborative discussions (one-on-one, in groups, and teacher-led) with diverse partners on grades 9–10 topics, texts, and issues, building on others' ideas and expressing their own clearly and persuasively.



ACTIVITY 1: INTRODUCTION TO UNIT

The teacher presents the purpose of the unit and explains the proficiency of making evidence-based claims, making reference to the first five criteria from the EBC Checklist I.

INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES

Introduce the central purpose of the unit and the idea of a “claim” someone might make. The following is a possible approach:

Introduce the first characteristic of an evidence-based claim: “States a conclusion you have come to... and that you want others to think about.” Pick a subject that is familiar to students, such as “school lunches” and ask them to brainstorm some claim statements they might make about the subject. Introduce the fourth characteristic: “All parts of the claim are supported by specific evidence you can point to” and distinguish claims that can be supported by evidence from those that are unsupported opinions, using the students’ brainstorm list as a reference.

Move from experience-based claims to claims in a field like science. Start with more familiar, fact-based claims (For example, the claim “It is cold outside” is supported by evidence like “The outside thermometer reads 13 degrees F” but is not supported with statements like “It feels that way to me”). Then discuss a claim such as “Smoking has been shown to be hazardous to your health” and talk about how this claim was once considered to be an opinion, until a weight of scientific evidence over time led us to accept this claim as fact. Introduce the third characteristic/criterion: “Demonstrates knowledge of and sound thinking about a topic” and with it the idea that a claim becomes stronger as we expand our knowledge about a subject and find more and better evidence to support the claim.

Discuss other fields and areas in which making claims supported by evidence is central to what practitioners do (e.g., lawyers, historians, movie critics, etc.). Then transition and focus discussion into the realm of claims made about literary works

and the close reading skills of literary analysis - the domain of scholars and critics, but also that of active and skillful readers who intuitively sense and appreciate the multi-dimensional aspects of writing craft when they read a poem, short story, novel, play, or essay. Let students know that in this unit they will be focusing and applying their skills of reading closely for textual details and making evidence-based claims in the realm of literary analysis. Use an example text read recently by most students to suggest what it means to read a literary work for meaning while also attending to its craft.

Discuss with students that when reading and analyzing a literary work (as with any text), a reader attends to details that are related to comprehending the text, finding meaning, and understanding the author’s perspective. But a skillful reader of a literary work also pays attention to what authors do – the language, elements, devices, and techniques they use, and the choices they make that influence a reader’s experience with and understanding of the literary work - the craft of writing. Explain that literary scholars classify, name and discuss the elements, devices, and techniques characteristic of a literary genre to help us analyze and think about texts. Students should already be familiar with some of these techniques (i.e. plot, characterization, imagery, rhyme). Throughout this unit, they will discuss specific techniques, develop their ability to identify and analyze the use of those techniques, and make evidence-based claims about the effects of those techniques on textual meaning.

It is important for students to come to understand that in a great literary work, the many aspects of its craft are interdependent, creating what Cleanth Brooks and Robert Penn Warren have described as the “organic unity” of a work, where all aspects “are significant and have some bearing on the total significance” of the work. However, students will



ACTIVITY 1: INTRODUCTION TO UNIT (CONT'D)

INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES

also need to practice and develop the skills of examining specific aspects of a work, and the relationship of those aspects to other aspects – and to the overall meaning of the work. Thus, this unit will focus on specific elements, devices, or techniques that seem particularly relevant and students will initially make claims related to those targeted aspects of craft. The text notes and text-dependent questions are designed to emphasize these targeted techniques, but teachers and students are also encouraged to extend beyond or outside of the unit's models, into the study of other literary techniques, themes, and meanings that transcend what is suggested here. No matter what approach is emphasized during reading, discussion, and analysis, the close reading process should be guided by these broad questions:

1. What specific aspect(s) of the author's craft am I attending to? (Through what lense(s) will I focus my reading?)
2. What choices do I notice the author making, and what techniques do I see the author using? What textual details do I find as evidence of those choices and techniques?
3. How do the author's choices and techniques influence my reading of the work and the meaning that emerges for me? How can I ground my claims about meaning in specific textual evidence?

In this unit, reading, discussion, and literary analysis will focus on the short story genre, using Ernest Hemingway's "The Short Happy Life of Francis Macomber." Students will read this text closely, search for evidence of techniques used by Hemingway, and develop claims about specific passages, eventually forming and writing more global claims about how the techniques and

choices they have identified contribute to the story's overall meaning and unity. Broad guiding questions, specific textual notes, and text-dependent questions will guide teachers and students as they examine how Hemingway has evidenced the following targeted elements and devices of the short story:

Character development (exposition, description, internal conflict, evolution):

Whose story is it? How do we come to know its characters (exposition)? What internal conflicts do they seem to face? What details suggest how/why they change (or don't)? How does characterization influence our reading and understanding of the story?

Focus of narration (narrative point of view, narrator's voice):

Who tells the story? What do details and language reveal about the point of view of its narrator? How might we characterize the narrator's "voice"? How does the focus of the narration influence our reading and understanding of the narrative? How does narrative point of view shift in third person omniscient and what are the effects of those shifts?

Narrative structure (use of time, flashback, foreshadowing):

How is the narrative structured? How does it unfold in time – chronologically or not? What details stand out in the sequence of the plot? What effects do those details - and the order and ways in which they are presented - have on our reading and understanding of the narrative?



ACTIVITY 2: INDEPENDENT READING

Students independently read part of the text with a text-dependent question to guide them.

INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES



Briefly introduce students to "The Short Happy Life of Francis Macomber" by Ernest Hemingway. The introduction should be kept to naming the author, the title, and the year it was published. While any unabridged version of the story can be used, the pagination referenced in these notes correspond to *The Short Stories of Ernest Hemingway*, Charles Scribner's Sons.

Students independently read the first sentence of the story guided by the question: What information/ideas are presented at the beginning of the text?

Students should be allowed to approach the text freshly and to make their own inferences based on textual content. Students should also be encouraged to move from the more general guiding question to their own text-specific

questions. The questions are intended to help orient students to the text and begin the focus on searching for textual evidence, rather than to be answered with a "right or wrong" response.



ACTIVITY 3: READ ALOUD AND CLASS DISCUSSION

Students follow along as they listen to the text being read aloud, and the teacher leads a discussion guided by a series of text-dependent questions.

INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES



Students follow along as they listen the teacher read aloud the first sentence of "The Short Happy Life of Francis Macomber".

The teacher leads a discussion guided by the question: What information/ideas are presented at the beginning of the text?

The close reading serves three primary purposes: to ensure comprehension of an important part of the text, to orient students to the practice of close reading, and to guide students in using questions to search for textual evidence.

Use the discussions about both the guiding and text-specific questions to help students learn the essential skills of selecting interesting and

significant textual details and connecting them inferentially. Also encourage students to develop and use their own text-specific questions related to the guiding and modeled questions. This process links directly to the close reading skills they may have practiced in the Reading Closely for Textual Details unit or a previous EBC unit, and to the forming of evidence-based claims they will do in Activity Four.

≡ ACTIVITY 3: READ ALOUD AND ≡ CLASS DISCUSSION (CONT'D)

INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES

Have students discuss all the information they find in the first sentence. In your discussion, draw out what can already be learned from the various phrases:

"It was now lunch time" establishes the time and the organizing activity--lunch, while also indicating through "It was *now*" that the shared experience of those having lunch preceded this moment into the morning.

"they were all" establishes a group. The story seems to have a "they," and "they" are all present for lunch.

"sitting under the double green fly of the dining tent" establishes a physical setting.

A "dining tent" suggests at least an outdoor and possibly a camping or expedition context for the story. Students will probably need some help with the word "fly". Direct instruction on its meaning should be given if necessary, but first see if any students are familiar with this usage.

"pretending that nothing had happened" confirms that something has happened prior to lunchtime in which "they" were all involved. It also further brings the "they" together, as they are all involved in the same cognitive-physical activity of "pretending." This shared intention of "pretending" also suggests that they all wish that whatever happened before lunch hadn't happened.

Remind students of the focus on literary techniques, explain that one technique is called *in medias res*--when authors choose to start telling a story in the middle of the action instead of at the beginning. Point out that Hemingway uses this technique in this story.

Now have students follow along as you read from the beginning of the story to the end of paragraph 9 ("...very publicly, to be a coward.")

Tell students that another literary technique is called "characterization." Explain that "characterization" can be defined as the various ways authors develop characters. Throughout the unit, they will be learning strategies for analyzing those ways, but for now, a simple definition will suffice.

Ask students to annotate their texts in response to the questions:

Who does "they" refer to in the first sentence and what details from the text give clues about each of their personalities/dispositions/natures?

Students should be able to identify Francis Macomber, Mrs. Macomber and Robert Wilson as "they." Students will likely begin by pointing out traits directly provided by the narrator. Have them be specific and directly reference the details they pick. As the discussion progresses, push students to make a few basic inferences about the characters based on the traits provided by the author, as well as the things they say and what they do. For example, explore what the differences in the quite similar attire worn by Wilson and Macomber reveal about each man. Explore, too, what Wilson and Macomber's stating/questioning/ and teaching/learning modes of communicating suggest about them and their relationship.



ACTIVITY 4: MODEL FORMING EBCs

The teacher models a critical reading and thinking process for forming EBCs about texts.

INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES

Based on the class discussion of the text, the teacher models a critical reading and thinking process for forming EBCs: from comprehension of textual details that stand out, to an inference that arises from examining the details, to a basic EBC that is supported by specific references back to the text.

Once the class has reached an understanding of the text, use the Forming EBC Lit Handout to introduce a three-step process for making a claim that arises from the text.

Exemplify the process by making a claim with the Forming EBC Tool. The tool is organized so that students first take note of “interesting” details that they also see as “related” to each other. The second section asks them to think about and explain a connection they have made among those details. Such “text-to-text” connections should be distinguished from “text-to-self” connections readers make between what they have read and their own experiences. These “text-to-text” connections can then lead them to a “claim” they can make and record in the third section of the tool – a conclusion they have drawn about the text that

can be referenced back to textual details and text-to-text connections. Have students follow along as you talk through the process with your claim.

To provide structured practice for the first two steps, you might give students a textual detail on a blank tool. In pairs, have students use the tool to find other details/quotations that could be related to the one you have provided, and then make/ explain connections among those details. Use the EBC Checklist 1 to discuss the claim, asking students to explain how it meets (or doesn't yet meet) the criteria.

[Note: Here and throughout the entire unit, you are encouraged to develop claims based on your own analysis and class discussion. The provided models are possibilities meant more to illustrate the process than to shape textual analysis. Instruction will be most effective if the claims used in modeling flow naturally from the textual ideas and details you and the students find significant and interesting. Also, while the tools have three or four places for supporting evidence, students should know that not all claims require three pieces of evidence. Places on the tools can be left blank.]



INDEPENDENT READING ACTIVITY

Students read from pages 5 to the middle of page 11 (“Anyone could be upset by his first lion. That's all over.”) and use the Making EBC Tool to find evidence to support the teacher-provided claim. This activity overlaps with the first activity of Part 2 and can be given as homework or done at the beginning of the next class.



ASSESSMENT OPPORTUNITIES

The Forming EBC Tool should be evaluated to get an initial assessment of students’ grasp of the relationship between claims and textual evidence. Even though the work was done together with the class, filling in the tool helps them get a sense of the critical reading and thinking process and the relationships among the ideas. Also make sure that students are developing the habit of using quotation marks and recording the reference.