

PART 2

MAKING EVIDENCE-BASED CLAIMS

“We organized!”

OBJECTIVE:

Students develop the ability to make evidence-based claims through a close reading of the text.



ACTIVITIES

1- INDEPENDENT READING AND FINDING SUPPORTING EVIDENCE

Students independently read part of the text and use the Making EBC Tool to look for evidence to support a claim made by the teacher.

2- READ ALOUD AND CLASS DISCUSSION

Students follow along as they listen to the same part of the text being read aloud and discuss a series of text-dependent questions.

3- FIND SUPPORTING EVIDENCE IN PAIRS

In pairs, students use the Making EBC Tool to look for evidence to support additional claims about the text made by the teacher.

4- CLASS DISCUSSION OF EBCs

The class discusses evidence in support of claims found by student pairs.

5- FORMING EBCs IN PAIRS

In pairs, students use the Forming EBC Tool to make an evidence-based claim of their own and present it to the class.

ESTIMATED TIME: 1-3 days

MATERIALS:

Making EBC Tool
Forming EBC Handout
Forming EBC Tool
EBC Criteria Checklist I
TCD Checklist



ALIGNMENT TO CCSS

TARGETED STANDARD(S): RI.7.1

RI.7.1: Cite several pieces of textual evidence to support analysis of what the text says explicitly as well as inferences drawn from the text.

SUPPORTING STANDARD(S): RI.7.2 RI.7.3 SL.7.1

RI.7.2: Determine two or more central ideas in a text and analyze their development over the course of the text; provide an objective summary of the text.

RI.7.3: Analyze the interactions between individuals, events, and ideas in a text (e.g., how ideas influence individuals or events, or how individuals influence ideas or events).

SL.7.1: Engage effectively in a range of collaborative discussions (one-on-one, in groups, and teacher-led) with diverse partners on grade 7 topics, texts, and issues, building on others' ideas and expressing their own clearly.

ACTIVITY 1: INDEPENDENT READING AND FINDING SUPPORTING EVIDENCE

Students independently read part of the text and use the Making EBC Tool to look for evidence to support a claim made by the teacher.

INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES

Students independently work on paragraphs 6-19 of Chavez's Commonwealth Club Address. Depending on scheduling and student ability, students can be assigned to read and complete the tool for homework. Teachers should decide what works best for their students. It's essential that students have opportunity to read the text independently. All students must develop the habit of perseverance in reading. Assigning the reading as homework potentially gives them more time with the text. Either way, it might be a good idea to provide some time at

the beginning of class for students to read the section quietly by themselves. This ensures that all students have had at least some independent reading time.

Also depending on scheduling and student ability, some students might choose (or be encouraged) to read ahead. Instructional focus should follow the pacing outlined in the activities, but students will only benefit from reading and re-reading the text throughout the duration of the unit.

ACTIVITY 2: READ ALOUD AND CLASS DISCUSSION

Students follow along as they listen to the same part of the text being read aloud and discuss a series of text-dependent questions.

INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES

Students follow along as they listen to paragraphs 6-19 read aloud and discuss three text-dependent questions:

- 
- 1- Beginning in paragraph 6, Chavez describes how to overcome the unfair treatment of farm workers. What solution does Chavez discover to the problem the farm workers faced?
 - 2- Chavez introduces the United Farm Workers union in paragraph 9. What are some of the things the union did and how did it affect the Chicano society in general?
 - 3- After a long description of the successes of the UFW, Chavez discusses Governor George Deukmejian. What effect does Chavez say that Governor George Deukmejian had on the farm worker's movement?

Read the text aloud to the class while students follow along. Alternatively, students could be asked to read aloud to the class. Work through the text using the following three text-dependent questions.

ACTIVITY 2: READ ALOUD AND CLASS DISCUSSION (CONT'D)

INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES

1- Beginning in paragraph 6, Chavez describes how to overcome the unfair treatment of farm workers. What solution does Chavez discover to the problem the farm workers faced?

Organization, as a word, and as a concept, makes frequent appearances early in Chavez's address, which serves as a build-up to the climactic moment when Chavez proclaims that organization was the farm workers' response to exploitation by the farm owners: "We organized!" (64). Chavez suggests early in his address that organizing will play a role in the farm workers' response to exploitation when he says that his dream of overthrowing the farm labor system was developed in his early days of organizing (P4). Chavez links his success with organizing the farm workers to the experience of learning how to use organization as a tool of empowerment for the community of Mexican American people in San Jose against the oppression by the non-Hispanic, Anglo majority: "I began to realize what other minority people had discovered: That the only answer—the only hope—was in organizing [...] and people like me had to develop the skills it would take to organize, to educate, to help empower the Chicano people" (P6). Track how Chavez's skill of organization developed, helping students identify the instances of when "organization" is used in the address before Chavez's climactic exclamation in line 64. Discuss how the story of its development in Chavez's life, as well as the repetition of the word, serve to lead up to and increase the memorability of one of Chavez's most critical points, i.e., organization as the way for minorities to resist oppression.



2- Chavez introduces the United Farm Workers union in paragraph 9. What are some of the things the union did and how did it affect the Chicano society in general?

The United Farm Workers union, or UFW, had a positive effect on the Hispanic population in general. Chavez says that the very fact the union existed at all was a message to Hispanics everywhere that "we were challenging and overcoming injustice" (74-76). By ceasing to continue allowing themselves to be victims, Chavez asserts, the farm workers "created confidence and pride and hope in an entire people's ability to create the future" (65-66, 68- 70). Chavez enables the listener/reader to anticipate that this positive effect would be felt by Hispanic people at large in a slightly earlier portion of the text when he states that farm workers were symbolic reminders to the Hispanic people of their history in the United States: "All Hispanics—urban and rural, young and old—are connected to the farm worker's experience [...] We shared that common humiliation" (47-49). Guide students in connecting the positive effect the UFW had for Hispanics in general back to Chavez's implicit reasoning for why it would have this effect, helping students trace the progression of Chavez's thought with evidence from the text. Help students discuss the effect this has on the reader/listener, how it helps the reader/listener to (implicitly) make connections across different parts of the text, which prepares the reader/ listener to understand (by drawing an inference) why non-farm working Hispanics also benefitted by the creation and existence of the UFW without Chavez explicitly repeating this information.

ACTIVITY 2: READ ALOUD AND CLASS DISCUSSION (CONT'D)

INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES

3- After a long description of the successes of the UFW, Chavez discusses Governor George Deukmejian. What effect does Chavez say that Governor George Deukmejian had on the farm worker's movement?



Chavez describes how after 1975, the conditions of the farm workers dramatically improved under the passage of the Agricultural Labor Relations Act, which, Chavez says, “helped farm workers make progress in overcoming poverty and injustice [...] in overcoming child labor, in overcoming miserable wages and working conditions, in overcoming sexual harassment of women worker” (114-121). The UFW, consequently, shifted its focus from using boycotts to further improve farm workers’ conditions to winning elections in the political arena. These improved working conditions for the farm workers, however, were undermined in 1982, when George Deukmejian was elected governor of California. According to Chavez, Deukmejian, instead of enforcing the law, invited farm owners who broke the law “to seek relief from the governor’s appointees” (128-129). Thus, because it was not enforced, the law that guaranteed the rights of farm workers to organize was rendered impotent and no longer protected farm workers (122-123). Guide students in tracking the cause and effect relationship of these events, i.e.: the passage of Agricultural Labor Relations Act => improved working conditions; election of Governor Deukmejian => undermining of Agricultural Labor Relations Act => loss of improved working conditions. Ask students to specifically identify how conditions worsened for the workers under Deukmejian’s governorship, including, for example, how workers lost protection from threats and intimidation by growers, how they were cheated out of back pay, and how child labor continued (P18). Help students understand the connection between these worsening conditions and the undermining of Chavez’s central strategy for minorities to resist exploitation—organization.

ACTIVITY 3: FIND SUPPORTING EVIDENCE

In pairs, students use the Making EBC Tool to look for evidence to support additional claims about the text made by the teacher.

INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES

Once the class has reached a solid understanding of the text, connect it to the skill of making claims and supporting them with evidence by presenting a few main claims. Pass out the tools and have students work in pairs to find evidence to support the claims.

Collect each student’s Making EBC Tool with the evidence they found for the first claim. These should be evaluated to get an assessment of where each student is in the skill development. Students should use their tools for their work in pairs—repeating the first claim and refining their evidence based on the read aloud and class discussion. Even though students are not finding the evidence independently, they should each fill in the tools to reinforce their acquisition of the logical structure among the ideas. Students should get into the habit of using quotation marks when recording direct quotes and including the line numbers of the evidence.

The instructional focus here is developing familiarity with claims about texts and the use of textual evidence to support them. Students should still not be expected to develop complete sentences to express supporting evidence. The pieces of evidence should be as focused as possible. The idea is for students to identify the precise points in the text that support the claim. This focus is lost if the pieces of evidence become too large. The tools are constructed to elicit a type of “pointing” at the evidence.

One approach for ensuring a close examination of claims and evidence is to provide erroneous claims that contradict textual evidence and ask students to find the places that disprove the claim. Students could then be asked to modify it to account for the evidence.



ACTIVITY 4: CLASS DISCUSSION OF EBCs

The class discusses evidence in support of claims found by student pairs.

INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES

After students have finished their work in pairs, regroup for a class discussion. Have pairs volunteer to present their evidence to the rest of the class. Discuss the evidence, evaluating how each piece supports the claims. Begin by modeling the evaluation, referring to the checklist, and then call on students to evaluate the evidence shared by the other pairs.

They can offer their own evidence to expand the discussion. Carefully guide the exchanges, explicitly asking students to support their evaluations with reference to the text.

These constructive discussions are essential for the skill development. Listening to and evaluating the evidence of others and providing text-based criticism expands students' capacity

to reason through the relationship between claims and evidence. Paying close attention to and providing instructional guidance on the student comments is as important to the process as evaluating the tools and creates a class culture of supporting all claims (including oral critiques) with evidence.

Using the Text-Centered Discussion Checklist is one way of talking about and supporting student participation in class and pair discussions, especially if students are already familiar with the TCD checklist from previous units. If not, time can be taken (if desired) to introduce them to some or all of the criteria of effective text-centered discussions.



ACTIVITY 5: FORMING EBCs IN PAIRS

In pairs, students use the Forming EBC Tool to make an evidence-based claim of their own and present it to the class.

INSTRUCTIONAL NOTES

Once the claims and evidence have been discussed, students return to the pairs and use the tool to make an evidence-based claim of their own. Pairs should make a single claim, but each student should fill in his or her own tool. Regroup and discuss the claims and evidence as a class. Pairs can use their tool to present their claims and evidence orally.

Talk through the process modeled in the tool, including the nature of the details that stood out to students, the reasoning they used to group and relate them, and the claim they developed from the textual evidence.

Draw upon the Forming EBC Handout and EBC Criteria Checklist I to help guide discussion.



INDEPENDENT READING ACTIVITY

Students read paragraphs 20-29 of the speech and use the Forming EBC Tool to make a claim and support it with evidence. This activity overlaps with the first activity of Part 3 and can be given as homework or done at the beginning of the next class.



ASSESSMENT OPPORTUNITIES

The Making EBC Tools should be evaluated to assess the development of the student's grasp of the relationship between claims and textual evidence. They should show progress in the relevance and focus of the evidence. The Forming EBC Tools are students' first attempts at making their own claims with the help of a peer. Basic claims are fine at this point. Use the EBC Criteria Checklist to structure the evaluation and feedback to students. Evaluation should focus on the validity and clarity of the claim and the relevance of the evidence. Recording the "thinking" part of the tool is important in order to strengthen the student's reasoning skills as well as provide them with the academic vocabulary to talk about them.

Evidence should be in quotation marks and the reference recorded. Using quotation marks helps students make the distinction between quotes and paraphrases. It also helps them to eventually incorporate quotes properly into their writing. Recording references is critical not only for proper incorporation in writing, but also because it helps students return to text for re-evaluating evidence and making appropriate selections.

The Text-Centered Discussion Checklist can be used to evaluate student participation in discussions for formative and diagnostic information. Teachers and students can get a sense of areas where development in speaking and listening skills are needed.