

12.3.1 Lesson 12

Introduction

In this lesson, the Mid-Unit Assessment, students use textual evidence from Jared Diamond's *Guns, Germs, and Steel* and the Evaluating Evidence and Reasoning Tool from 12.3.1 Lesson 11 to craft a formal, multi-paragraph response to the following prompt: Choose an excerpt from *Guns, Germs, and Steel*. Identify one of Diamond's supporting claims; evaluate whether the evidence is relevant and sufficient and the reasoning is valid to support that claim.

Students review their annotated texts, lesson Quick Writes, discussion notes, homework notes, and tools to organize their ideas. Students then develop their responses to convey complex ideas, concepts, and information clearly and accurately through the effective selection, organization, and analysis of the content. The Mid-Unit Assessment is assessed using the 12.3.1 Mid-Unit Text Analysis Rubric.

For homework, students complete another multimedia journal entry, reflecting on their 2-3 selected areas of investigation and their work with pre-searches. Students' multimedia entries should respond to the following prompt: Describe what you have learned from your pre-searches. What area of investigation looks most promising for further research?

Standards

| Assessed Standard(s) | |
|-----------------------|---|
| CCRA.8 | Delineate and evaluate the argument and specific claims in a text, including the validity of the reasoning as well as the relevance and sufficiency of the evidence. |
| W.11-12.2.a-f | <p>Write informative/explanatory texts to examine and convey complex ideas, concepts, and information clearly and accurately through the effective selection, organization, and analysis of content.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Introduce a topic; organize complex ideas, concepts, and information so that each new element builds on that which precedes it to create a unified whole; include formatting (e.g., headings), graphics (e.g., figures, tables), and multimedia when useful to aiding comprehension. b. Develop the topic thoroughly by selecting the most significant and relevant facts, extended definitions, concrete details, quotations, or other information and examples appropriate to the audience's knowledge of the topic. c. Use appropriate and varied transitions and syntax to link the major sections of the text, create cohesion, and clarify the relationships among complex ideas and concepts. d. Use precise language, domain-specific vocabulary, and techniques such as metaphor, simile, and analogy to manage the complexity of the topic. e. Establish and maintain a formal style and objective tone while attending to the norms and conventions of the discipline in which they are writing. f. Provide a concluding statement or section that follows from and supports the information or explanation presented (e.g., articulating implications or the significance of the topic). |
| Addressed Standard(s) | |
| W.11-12.4 | Produce clear and coherent writing in which the development, organization, and style are appropriate to task, purpose, and audience. |
| L.11-12.1 | Demonstrate command of the conventions of standard English grammar and usage when writing or speaking. |
| L.11-12.2 | Demonstrate command of the conventions of standard English capitalization, punctuation, and spelling when writing. |

File: 12.3.1 Lesson 12 Date: 4/3/15 Classroom Use: Starting 4/2015

© 2015 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a

Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

Assessment

File: 12.3.1 Lesson 12 Date: 4/3/15 Classroom Use: Starting 4/2015
© 2015 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a
Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-sa/3.0/>



Assessment(s)

Student learning in the first part of 12.3.1 is assessed via a formal, multi-paragraph response. Students respond to the following prompt, citing textual evidence to support analysis and inferences drawn from the text.

- Choose an excerpt from *Guns, Germs, and Steel*. Identify one of Diamond's supporting claims; evaluate whether the evidence is relevant and sufficient and the reasoning is valid to support that claim
- Student responses are assessed using the 12.3.1 Mid-Unit Text Analysis Rubric.

High Performance Response(s)

A High Performance Response should:

- Identify a specific excerpt from the text (e.g., *Guns, Germs, and Steel*, pages 71-78).
- Identify a claim in this excerpt (e.g., “Pizarro’s capture of Atahualpa illustrates the set of proximate factors that resulted in Europeans’ colonizing the New World” (p. 78)).
- Identify evidence and reasoning in the text (e.g., Evidence in the text includes: the use of horses at Cajamarca, which “exemplifies a military weapon that remained potent for 6,000 years, until the early 20th century, and that was eventually applied on all the continents” (p. 74); the fact that “Pizarro came to Cajamarca by means of European maritime technology” (p. 75); and the fact that the “Spaniards’ steel swords and other weapons, steel armor, guns, and horses” (p. 72), gave them a military advantage over Pizarro. Diamond reasons that these factors amounted to “imbalances of equipment [which] were decisive in innumerable other confrontations of Europeans with Native Americans and other peoples” (p. 72). He explains that there were times when “a few dozen European horsemen routed thousands of Indians with great slaughter” (pp. 72-73) and reasons that the same set of factors played the deciding role in other conflicts between colonizers and natives.).
- Evaluate whether the evidence is relevant and sufficient (e.g., Each example of evidence is relevant to the claim because it provides a specific example of one of “the set of proximate factors” (p. 78) that led to Atahualpa’s defeat and was instrumental in many other conflicts between European colonizers and New World natives. The evidence selected is sufficient to support the claim because it shows how several combined factors ensured Atahualpa’s capture and the Spaniards’ victory at Cajamarca. Diamond provides further evidence to indicate that these same factors were instrumental in the “Europeans’ colonizing of the New World” (p. 78).).
- Evaluate whether the reasoning is valid (e.g., The reasoning is valid because Diamond uses sound logic to demonstrate that the factors of military disparity and “equipment” (p. 72) made the difference between victory and defeat at Cajamarca and many other times in history between colonizers and natives.).

OR

- Identify a specific excerpt from the text (e.g., *Guns, Germs, and Steel*, pages 439-446).
- Identify a supporting claim in the selected excerpt (e.g., The Optimal Fragmentation Principle is that “innovation proceeds most rapidly in a society with some optimal intermediate degree of fragmentation: a too-unified society is at a disadvantage, and so is a too-fragmented society” (p. 441)).
- Identify evidence and reasoning in the text (e.g., Diamond supports his claim by providing the example of Germany: “[t]here are a thousand tiny beer companies in Germany, shielded from competition with one another because each German brewery has virtually a local monopoly, and they are also shielded from competition with

File: 12.3.1 Lesson 12 Date: 4/3/15 Classroom Use: Starting 4/2015

© 2015 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a

Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

Vocabulary

| Vocabulary to provide directly (will not include extended instruction) |
|--|
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> None.* |
| Vocabulary to teach (may include direct word work and/or questions) |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> None.* |
| Additional vocabulary to support English Language Learners (to provide directly) |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> None.* |

*Because this is not a close reading lesson, there is no specified vocabulary. However, in the process of returning to the text, students may uncover unfamiliar words. Teachers can guide students to make meaning of these words using the strategies outlined in L.11-12.4.a-d.

Lesson Agenda/Overview

| Student-Facing Agenda | % of Lesson |
|--|--|
| Standards & Text: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Standards: CCRA.8, W.11-12.2.a-f, W.11-12.4, L.11-12.1, L.11-12.2 Text: <i>Guns, Germs, and Steel</i> by Jared Diamond, pages 13-25, 65-78, 229-249, and 439-446 | |
| Learning Sequence: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Introduction of Lesson Agenda Homework Accountability 12.3.1 Mid-Unit Assessment Closing | <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 5% 10% 80% 5% |

Materials

- Copies of the 12.3.1 Mid-Unit Assessment for each student
- Copies of the 12.3.1 Mid-Unit Text Analysis Rubric and Checklist for each student

File: 12.3.1 Lesson 12 Date: 4/3/15 Classroom Use: Starting 4/2015
 © 2015 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a
 Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

Learning Sequence

| How to Use the Learning Sequence | |
|----------------------------------|---|
| Symbol | Type of Text & Interpretation of the Symbol |
| 10% | Percentage indicates the percentage of lesson time each activity should take. |
| no symbol | Plain text indicates teacher action. |
| | Bold text indicates questions for the teacher to ask students. |
| | <i>Italicized text indicates a vocabulary word.</i> |
| ► | Indicates student action(s). |
| ☞ | Indicates possible student response(s) to teacher questions. |
| ⓘ | Indicates instructional notes for the teacher. |

Activity 1: Introduction of Lesson Agenda

5%

Begin by reviewing the agenda and the assessed standards for this lesson: CCRA.8 and W.11-12.2 a-f. In this lesson, students complete the 12.3.1 Mid-Unit Assessment in which they identify one of Diamond's supporting claims and evaluate his reasoning and evidence.

- Students look at the agenda.

Activity 2: Homework Accountability

10%

Instruct students to take out their responses to the first part of the previous lesson's homework assignment. (Review and expand your notes, tools, and annotations in preparation for the following lesson's Mid-Unit Assessment.) Instruct students to form pairs and share how they reviewed and expanded their materials for the Mid-Unit Assessment.

- Students discuss how they reviewed and organized their materials for the Mid-Unit Assessment.

Instruct students to take out their responses to the second part of the previous lesson's homework assignment. (Continue to conduct pre-searches to gather potential sources for

research. Find three more potential sources for at least one area of investigation and record the following information: author's name, issue, source, location, publication date, and general content/key ideas.) Instruct student pairs to share 2-3 potential sources they found during their pre-searches.

- Student responses vary according to the research conducted.

Activity 3: 12.3.1 Mid-Unit Assessment

80%

Explain to students that because it is a formal writing task, the Mid-Unit Assessment should include an introductory statement, well-organized ideas supported by the most significant and relevant evidence, and a concluding statement or section. Students should use appropriate and varied transitions and syntax to clarify relationships among complex ideas, and manage the complexity of the topic by using precise language and domain-specific vocabulary. Remind students to use proper grammar, capitalization, punctuation, and spelling in their responses to establish a formal style and objective tone.

Instruct students to use their annotated texts, lesson Quick Writes, discussion notes, homework notes, and tools to write their response. Remind students to use the Evaluating Evidence and Reasoning Tool from 12.3.1 Lesson 11. Distribute and review the 12.3.1 Mid-Unit Text Analysis Rubric.

- Students examine the 12.3.1 Mid-Unit Text Analysis Rubric.

Instruct students to write a multi-paragraph response to the following prompt:

Choose an excerpt from *Guns, Germs, and Steel*. Identify one of Diamond's supporting claims; evaluate whether the evidence is relevant and sufficient and the reasoning is valid to support that claim.

Remind students to use the 12.3.1 Mid-Unit Text Analysis Rubric to guide their written responses. Ask students to use this unit's vocabulary wherever possible in their written responses.

- Consider reminding students that demonstrating command of the conventions of standard English grammar and usage when writing or speaking demonstrates their application of L.11-12.1.
- Consider reminding students that demonstrating command of the conventions of standard English capitalization, punctuation, and spelling when writing demonstrates their application of L.11-12.2.

- If necessary, consider reviewing the components of W.11-12.4, which include producing clear, coherent writing that employs organization and style appropriate to the task, purpose, and audience.
- Display the prompt for students to see, or provide the prompt in hard copy.
 - Students independently answer the prompt using evidence from the text.
 - See the High Performance Response at the beginning of the lesson.
- Consider encouraging students who finish early to reread and revise their responses.

Activity 4: Closing

5%

Display and distribute the homework assignment. For homework, instruct students to complete another multimedia journal entry, reflecting on their 2-3 selected areas of investigation and their work with pre-searches. Instruct students that their multimedia entry should respond to the following prompt: Describe what you have learned from your pre-searches. What area of investigation looks most promising for further research?

- Students follow along.

Homework

Complete another multimedia journal entry, reflecting on your selected 2-3 areas of investigation and your work with pre-searches. Your multimedia entry should respond to the following prompt: Describe what you have learned from your pre-searches. What area of investigation looks most promising for further research?

12.3.1 Mid-Unit Assessment

Text-Based Response

Your task: Rely on your reading and analysis of excerpts from *Guns, Germs, and Steel* to write a well-crafted, multi-paragraph response to the following prompt:

*Choose an excerpt from *Guns, Germs, and Steel*. Identify one of Diamond's supporting claims; evaluate whether the evidence is relevant and sufficient and the reasoning is valid to support that claim.*

Your response will be assessed using the 12.3.1 Mid-Unit Text Analysis Rubric.

Guidelines

Be sure to:

- Read the prompt closely.
- Address all elements of the prompt in your response.
- Paraphrase, quote, and reference relevant evidence to support your claim.
- Organize your ideas in a cohesive and coherent manner.
- Maintain a formal style of writing.
- Follow the conventions of standard written English.

CCSS: CCRA.8, W.11-12.2 a-f

Commentary on the task:

This task measures CCRA.8 because it demands that students:

- Delineate and evaluate the argument and specific claims in a text, including the validity of the reasoning as well as the relevance and sufficiency of the evidence.

This task measures W.11-12.2.a-f because it demands that students:

- Write informative/explanatory texts to examine and convey complex ideas, concepts, and information clearly and accurately through the effective selection, organization, and analysis of content.
 - Introduce a topic; organize complex ideas, concepts, and information so that each new element builds on that which precedes it to create a unified whole; include formatting (e.g., headings), graphics (e.g., figures, tables), and multimedia when useful to aiding comprehension.
 - Develop the topic thoroughly by selecting the most significant and relevant facts, extended definitions, concrete details, quotations, or other information and examples appropriate to the audience's knowledge of the topic.
 - Use appropriate and varied transitions and syntax to link the major sections of the text, create cohesion, and clarify the relationships among complex ideas and concepts.
 - Use precise language, domain-specific vocabulary, and techniques such as metaphor, simile, and analogy to manage the complexity of the topic.
 - Establish and maintain a formal style and objective tone while attending to the norms and conventions of the discipline in which they are writing.
 - Provide a concluding statement or section that follows from and supports the information or explanation presented (e.g., articulating implications or the significance of the topic).

12.3.1 Mid-Unit Text Analysis Rubric

____ / ____ (Total points)

| Criteria | 4 - Responses at this Level: | 3 - Responses at this Level: | 2 - Responses at this Level: | 1 - Responses at this Level: |
|--|---|---|--|--|
| Content and Analysis The extent to which the response delineates and evaluates the argument and specific claims in a text, including the validity of the reasoning as well as the relevance and sufficiency of the evidence. CCSS.ELA-Literacy.CCRA.R.8 Delineate and evaluate the argument and specific claims in a text, including the validity of the reasoning as well as the relevance and sufficiency of the evidence. | Skillfully delineate and evaluate the argument and specific claims in a text, including the validity of the reasoning as well as the relevance and sufficiency of the evidence. | Accurately delineate and evaluate the argument and specific claims in a text, including the validity of the reasoning as well as the relevance and sufficiency of the evidence. | With partial accuracy delineate and partially evaluate the argument and specific claims in a text, including the validity of the reasoning as well as the relevance and sufficiency of the evidence. | Inaccurately delineate or minimally evaluate the argument and specific claims in a text, including the validity of the reasoning as well as the relevance and sufficiency of the evidence. |

File: 12.3.1 Lesson 12 Date: 4/3/15 Classroom Use: Starting 4/2015

© 2015 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a

Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

| Criteria | 4 - Responses at this Level: | 3 - Responses at this Level: | 2 - Responses at this Level: | 1 - Responses at this Level: |
|--|--|---|--|---|
| <p>Command of Evidence and Reasoning</p> <p>The extent to which the response thoroughly develops the topic through the effective selection and analysis of the most significant and relevant facts, extended definitions, concrete details, quotations, or other information and examples appropriate to the audience's knowledge of the topic.</p> <p>CCSS.ELA-Literacy.W.11-12.2</p> <p>Write informative/explanatory texts to examine and convey complex ideas, concepts, and information clearly and accurately through the effective selection, organization, and analysis of content.</p> <p>CCSS.ELA-Literacy.W.11-12.2.b</p> <p>Develop the topic thoroughly by selecting the most significant and relevant facts, extended definitions, concrete details, quotations, or other information and examples appropriate to the audience's knowledge of the</p> | <p>Thoroughly and skillfully develop the topic with the most significant and relevant facts, extended definitions, concrete details, quotations, or other information and examples appropriate to the audience's knowledge of the topic. (W.11-12.2.b)</p> | <p>Develop the topic with significant and relevant facts, extended definitions, concrete details, quotations, or other information and examples appropriate to the audience's knowledge of the topic. (W.11-12.2.b)</p> | <p>Partially develop the topic with weak facts, extended definitions, details, quotations, or other information and examples appropriate to the audience's knowledge of the topic. (W.11-12.2.b)</p> | <p>Minimally develop the topic, providing few or irrelevant facts, extended definitions, details, quotations, or other information and examples appropriate to the audience's knowledge of the topic. (W.11-12.2.b)</p> |

File: 12.3.1 Lesson 12 Date: 4/3/15 Classroom Use: Starting 4/2015

© 2015 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a

Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

| Criteria | 4 - Responses at this Level: | 3 - Responses at this Level: | 2 - Responses at this Level: | 1 - Responses at this Level: |
|--|---|--|---|---|
| <p>Coherence, Organization, and Style</p> <p>The extent to which the response introduces a topic and organizes complex ideas, concepts, and information so that each new element builds on that which precedes it to create a unified whole; when useful to aiding comprehension, includes formatting, graphics, and multimedia.</p> <p>CCSS.ELA-Literacy.W.11-12.2</p> <p>Write informative/explanatory texts to examine and convey complex ideas, concepts, and information clearly and accurately through the effective selection, organization, and analysis of content.</p> <p>CCSS.ELA-Literacy.W.11-12.2.a</p> <p>Introduce a topic; organize complex ideas, concepts, and information so that each new element builds on that which precedes it to create a unified whole; include formatting (e.g., headings), graphics (e.g., figures, tables), and multimedia when useful to aiding comprehension.</p> | <p>Skillfully introduce a topic; effectively organize complex ideas, concepts, and information so that each new element clearly builds on that which precedes it to create a unified whole; when useful to aiding comprehension, skillfully include formatting, graphics, and multimedia. (W.11-12.2.a)</p> <p>Skillfully use appropriate and varied transitions and syntax to link the major sections of the text, create cohesion, and clarify the relationships among complex ideas and concepts. (W.11-12.2.c)</p> <p>Skillfully use precise language, domain-specific vocabulary, and techniques such as metaphor, simile, and analogy to manage the complexity of the topic. (W.11-12.2.d)</p> <p>Skillfully establish and maintain a formal style and objective tone that is appropriate for the norms and conventions of the discipline. (W.11-12.2.e)</p> <p>Provide a concluding statement or section that clearly follows from and skillfully supports the information or explanation presented. (W.11-12.2.f)</p> | <p>Introduce a topic; organize complex ideas, concepts, and information so that each new element builds on that which precedes it to create a unified whole; when useful to aiding comprehension, include formatting, graphics, and multimedia. (W.11-12.2.a)</p> <p>Effectively use appropriate and varied transitions and syntax to link the major sections of the text, create cohesion, and clarify the relationships among complex ideas and concepts. (W.11-12.2.c)</p> <p>Use precise language, domain-specific vocabulary, and techniques such as metaphor, simile, and analogy to manage the complexity of the topic. (W.11-12.2.d)</p> <p>Establish a formal style and objective tone that is appropriate for the norms and conventions of the discipline. (W.11-12.2.e)</p> <p>Provide a concluding statement or section that follows from and supports the information or explanation presented. (W.11-12.2.f)</p> | <p>Ineffectively introduce a topic; organize complex ideas, concepts, and information so that each new element partially builds on that which precedes it to create a loosely unified whole; when useful to aiding comprehension, somewhat effectively include formatting, graphics, and multimedia. (W.11-12.2.a)</p> <p>Somewhat effectively use transitions or use unvaried transitions and syntax to link the major sections of the text, creating limited cohesion or clarity in the relationships among complex ideas and concepts. (W.11-12.2.c)</p> <p>Inconsistently use precise language, domain-specific vocabulary, and techniques such as metaphor, simile, and analogy to manage the complexity of the topic. (W.11-12.2.d)</p> <p>Establish but fail to maintain a formal style and objective tone that is appropriate for the norms and conventions of the discipline. (W.11-12.2.e)</p> <p>Provide a concluding statement or section that loosely follows from and so ineffectively supports the information or explanation presented. (W.11-12.2.f)</p> | <p>Lack a clear a topic; illogically arrange ideas, concepts, and information, failing to create a unified whole; when useful to aiding comprehension, ineffectively include formatting, graphics, and multimedia. (W.11-12.2.a)</p> <p>Ineffectively use transitions and syntax to link the major sections of the text, creating incoherent or unclear relationships among complex ideas and concepts. (W.11-12.2.c)</p> <p>Rarely or inaccurately use precise language, domain-specific vocabulary, or any techniques such as metaphor, simile, and analogy to manage the complexity of the topic. (W.11-12.2.d)</p> <p>Lack a formal style and objective tone that adheres to the norms and conventions of the discipline. (W.11-12.2.e)</p> <p>Provide a concluding statement or section that does not follow from or support the information or explanation presented. (W.11-12.2.f)</p> |

File: 12.3.1 Lesson 12 Date: 4/3/15 Classroom Use: Starting 4/2015

© 2015 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a

Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

- A response that is a personal response and makes little or no reference to the task or text can be scored no higher than a 1.
- A response that is totally copied from the text with no original writing must be given a 0.
- A response that is totally unrelated to the task, illegible, incoherent, blank, or unrecognizable as English must be scored as a 0.

File: 12.3.1 Lesson 12 Date: 4/3/15 Classroom Use: Starting 4/2015

© 2015 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a

Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License



12.3.1 Mid-Unit Text Analysis Checklist

Assessed Standards: _____

| | Does my response... | ✓ |
|---|--|--------------------------|
| Content and Analysis | Delineate and evaluate the argument and specific claims in a text? (CCRA.R.8) | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| | Evaluate the validity of the reasoning as well as the relevance and sufficiency of the evidence? (CCRA.R.8) | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Command of Evidence and Reasoning | Develop the topic with the most significant and relevant textual evidence? (W.11-12.2.b) | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Coherence, Organization, and Style | Introduce a topic? (W.11-12.2.a) | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| | Organize complex ideas, concepts, and information so that each new element builds on that which precedes it to create a unified whole? (W.11-12.2.a) | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| | When useful to aiding comprehension, include formatting, graphics, and multimedia? (W.11-12.2.a) | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| | Use appropriate and varied transitions and syntax to link the major sections of the text, create cohesion, and clarify the relationships among complex ideas and concepts? (W.11-12.2.c) | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| | Use precise language, domain-specific vocabulary, and techniques such as metaphor, simile, and analogy to manage the complexity of the topic? (W.11-12.2.d) | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| | Establish a formal style and objective tone that is appropriate for the norms and conventions of the discipline? (W.11-12.2.e) | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| | Provide a concluding statement or section that follows from and supports the explanation or analysis? (W.11-12.2.f) | <input type="checkbox"/> |

File: 12.3.1 Lesson 12 Date: 4/3/15 Classroom Use: Starting 4/2015

© 2015 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a

Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

File: 12.3.1 Lesson 12 Date: 4/3/15 Classroom Use: Starting 4/2015
© 2015 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a
Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-sa/3.0/>

