

# 12.3.1 Lesson 10

## Introduction

In this lesson, students read and analyze pages 439-446 of *Guns, Germs, and Steel* by Jared Diamond (from “The third recent extension of GGS’s message” to “a ripe area for study in the modern world”). In this excerpt, Diamond extends several of the principles he has observed over the course of the book to present-day questions of business productivity and innovation. Students consider how Diamond further develops ideas previously explored in the text and apply their analysis independently in a written response at the beginning of the lesson. This response informs students’ participation in a whole-class discussion that follows. Student learning is assessed via a Quick Write at the end of the lesson: In this excerpt, how does the author further develop ideas introduced earlier in the text?

For homework, students continue with their pre-searches. Students find three more potential sources for at least one area of investigation and record the following information: author’s name, topic, source, location, publication date, and general content/key ideas.

## Standards

File: 12.3.1 Lesson 10 Date: 4/3/15 Classroom Use: Starting 4/2015  
© 2015 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a  
Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-sa/3.0/>



Assessed Standard(s)	
RI.11-12.3	Analyze a complex set of ideas or sequence of events and explain how specific individuals, ideas, or events interact and develop over the course of the text.
Addressed Standard(s)	
W. 11-12.9.b	<p>Draw evidence from literary or informational texts to support analysis, reflection, and research.</p> <p>a. Apply <i>grades 11-12 Reading standards</i> to literary nonfiction (e.g., "Delineate and evaluate the reasoning in seminal U.S. texts, including the application of constitutional principles and use of legal reasoning [e.g., in U.S. Supreme Court Case majority opinions and dissents] and the premises, purposes, and arguments in works of public advocacy [e.g., <i>The Federalist</i>, presidential addresses]").</p>
SL. 11-12.1.a, c,d	<p>Initiate and participate effectively in a range of collaborative discussions (one-on-one, in groups, and teacher-led) with diverse partners on <i>grades 11-12 topics, texts, and issues</i>, building on others' ideas and expressing their own clearly and persuasively.</p> <p>a. Come to discussions prepared, having read and researched material under study; explicitly draw on that preparation by referring to evidence from texts and other research on the topic or issue to stimulate a thoughtful, well-reasoned exchange of ideas.</p> <p>c. Propel conversations by posing and responding to questions that probe reasoning and evidence; ensure a hearing for a full range of positions on a topic or issue; clarify, verify, or challenge ideas and conclusions; and promote divergent and creative perspectives.</p> <p>d. Respond thoughtfully to diverse perspectives; synthesize comments, claims, and evidence made on all sides of an issue; resolve contradictions when possible; and determine what additional information or research is required to deepen the investigation or complete the task.</p>
L.11-12.4.c	<p>Determine or clarify the meaning of unknown and multiple-meaning words and phrases based on <i>grades 11-12 reading and content</i>, choosing flexibly from a range of strategies.</p> <p>c. Consult general and specialized reference materials (e.g., dictionaries, glossaries, thesauruses), both print and digital, to find the pronunciation of a word or determine or clarify its precise meaning, its part of speech, its etymology, or its standard usage.</p>

## Assessment

### Assessment(s)

Student learning is assessed via a Quick Write at the end of the lesson. Students respond to the following prompt, citing textual evidence to support analysis and inferences drawn from the text.

- In this excerpt, how does the author further develop ideas introduced earlier in the text?

### High Performance Response(s)

A High Performance Response should:

- Identify ideas that were introduced earlier in the text (e.g., proximate vs. ultimate causation, diffusion).
- Explain how those ideas are further developed in this excerpt (e.g., Diamond further develops the idea of diffusion in his analysis of Route 128 and Silicon Valley. Diamond claims that the “industrial belts” of Route 128 and the Silicon Valley are “quite different in terms of corporate ethos” (p. 444). Silicon Valley companies are “fiercely competitive with one another” but “there is much collaboration—a free flow of ideas, people and information” (p. 444). Diamond writes that on Route 128, on the other hand, “businesses ... are much more secretive and insulated from one another” (p. 444), which results in far lower productivity and innovation. These ideas parallel and further develop Diamond’s claim about “diffusion” on page 246: “In these societies technology developed most rapidly, because they accumulated not only their own inventions but also those of other societies” (p. 246). As Diamond points out, isolated nations developed less technology because “[w]ithout diffusion, fewer technologies are acquired, and more existing technologies are lost” (p. 247). Diamond applies the same ideas of diffusion and isolation to the business world when discussing theories about Route 128’s industrial decline due to lack of communication, and Silicon Valley’s success due to “collaboration” (p. 444).).

## Vocabulary

**Vocabulary to provide directly (will not include extended instruction)**

- anarchy (n.) - a state or society without government or law
- entities (n.) - being or existence, especially when considered as distinct, independent, or self-contained
- optimal (adj.) - best or most effective
- per-capita (adj.) - of or for each person

**Vocabulary to teach (may include direct word work and/or questions)**

- None.

**Additional vocabulary to support English Language Learners (to provide directly)**

- fragmented (adj.) - broken into parts or pieces
- insulated (v.) - prevented from dealing with or experiencing
- gross (adj.) - including everything; total

## Lesson Agenda/Overview

File: 12.3.1 Lesson 10 Date: 4/3/15 Classroom Use: Starting 4/2015  
© 2015 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a  
Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-sa/3.0/>



Student-Facing Agenda	% of Lesson
<b>Standards &amp; Text:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Standards: RI.11-12.3, W.11-12.9.b, SL.11-12.1.a,c,d, L.11-12.4.c</li> <li>Text: <i>Guns, Germs, and Steel</i> by Jared Diamond, pages 439-446</li> </ul>	
<b>Learning Sequence:</b> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Introduction of Lesson Agenda</li> <li>Homework Accountability</li> <li>Pre-Discussion Quick Write</li> <li>Whole-Class Discussion</li> <li>Quick Write</li> <li>Closing</li> </ol>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>5%</li> <li>15%</li> <li>15%</li> <li>45%</li> <li>15%</li> <li>5%</li> </ol>

## Materials

- Student copies of the 12.3 Speaking and Listening Rubric and Checklist (refer to 12.3.1 Lesson 3) (optional)
- Student copies of the Short Response Rubric and Checklist (refer to 12.3.1 Lesson 1) (optional)

## Learning Sequence

How to Use the Learning Sequence	
Symbol	Type of Text & Interpretation of the Symbol
10%	Percentage indicates the percentage of lesson time each activity should take.
no symbol	Plain text indicates teacher action.
	<b>Bold text indicates questions for the teacher to ask students.</b>
	<i>Italicized text indicates a vocabulary word.</i>
►	Indicates student action(s).
☞	Indicates possible student response(s) to teacher questions.
ⓘ	Indicates instructional notes for the teacher.

### Activity 1: Introduction of Lesson Agenda

5%

Begin by reviewing the agenda and the assessed standard for this lesson: RI.11-12.3. In this lesson, students consider how the author expands on ideas introduced earlier in the text. Students respond briefly in writing before participating in a whole-class discussion. Students then have the opportunity to review or expand their Quick Write responses after the discussion.

- Students look at the agenda.

### Activity 2: Homework Accountability

15%

Instruct students to take out their responses to the first part of the previous lesson's homework assignment. (Reflect on your research process completed during the lesson and complete a multimedia journal entry in response to the following prompt: Explain why the 2-3-areas of investigation you crafted interest you.) Instruct students to talk in pairs about their responses to their multimedia journal entry prompt.

- Student responses vary according to students' areas of investigation.
- Consider checking in with students on an individual basis during their research discussion to formatively assess their application of research skills and offer targeted feedback.

File: 12.3.1 Lesson 10 Date: 4/3/15 Classroom Use: Starting 4/2015

© 2015 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a

Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License



---

Instruct students to take out their responses to the second part of the previous lesson's homework assignment. (Read and annotate pages 439-446 of *Guns, Germs, and Steel*. (W.11-12.9.b)) Instruct student pairs to discuss their annotations.

- Student annotations may include:
    - Star next to the question “Should your group have a centralized direction ... or should there be diffuse leadership or even anarchy?” (p. 439), because this question is essential to what follows in this excerpt.
    - Star beside the paragraph that begins “My comparison of the histories of China, the Indian subcontinent” (p. 440), because this paragraph ultimately defines what Diamond calls the “Optimal Fragmentation Principle” (p. 441), which he then applies to companies.
    - Exclamation mark beside the sentence “The efficiency of the Japanese food-processing industry is a miserable 32 percent that of ours” (p. 442), because this is surprising since Japan has many successful industries including the car industry.
- 

Instruct student pairs to share and discuss the vocabulary words they identified and defined in the previous lesson's homework (L.11-12.4.c).

- Students may identify the following words: *anarchy*, *entities*, *optimal*, and *per-capita*
  - **Differentiation Consideration:** Students may also identify the following words: *fragmented*, *insulated*, and *gross*.
  - Definitions are provided in the Vocabulary box in this lesson.
- 

Instruct students to take out their responses to the third part of the previous lesson's homework assignment. (Continue your pre-searches and come to the next lesson prepared to discuss one potential source you found.) Instruct student pairs to discuss the potential source they found for homework.

- Student responses vary according to the research conducted.

### Activity 3: Pre-Discussion Quick Write

**15%**

File: 12.3.1 Lesson 10 Date: 4/3/15 Classroom Use: Starting 4/2015  
© 2015 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a  
Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

Inform students that their analysis in this lesson begins with a Quick Write in response to the prompt below. Students then use their independently generated responses to inform the following discussion and have the opportunity to review or expand their Quick Write responses after the discussion.

- **Differentiation Consideration:** If necessary, consider providing time for students to reread the lesson's excerpt before they respond in writing to the following prompt.
- **Differentiation Consideration:** Encourage students to reference their previous Quick Writes from 12.3.1 as resources when completing this Pre-Discussion Quick Write.
- This activity differs from previous lessons' Reading and Discussion activities by allowing students more independence in analyzing the text before the lesson assessment. For the reading and text analysis in this lesson, students first work independently to respond to a text-based prompt regarding how the author further develops ideas introduced earlier in the text. Students then discuss their independent responses in small groups. Later, they evaluate their initial responses and consider how their original opinions were challenged or verified through discussion, and whether they made new connections in light of the evidence and reasoning presented.

Instruct students to read the following prompt:

**In this excerpt, how does the author further develop ideas introduced earlier in the text?**

- Students listen and read the Quick Write prompt.
- Consider posting or projecting the following guiding question to support students in their reading throughout the lesson:

**What connections does the author make between ideas in this excerpt and ideas in the previous parts of the text?**

- Display the prompt for students to see, or provide the prompt in hard copy.

Transition to the independent Quick Write.

- Students independently answer the prompt using evidence from the text.
- See the High Performance Response at the beginning of this lesson.
- This initial Quick Write is intended to demonstrate students' first thoughts and observations in response to the prompt. Students will have additional time to develop their analysis in this lesson, and return to this Quick Write after a whole-class discussion.

## Activity 4: Whole-Class Discussion

45%

File: 12.3.1 Lesson 10 Date: 4/3/15 Classroom Use: Starting 4/2015  
© 2015 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a  
Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

Facilitate a whole-class discussion of student responses to and observations of the Pre-Discussion Quick Write. Encourage students to consider points of agreement or disagreement with other students and consider how the evidence and reasoning presented by other students can help qualify or justify the observations they generated independently.

Instruct students to use the relevant portions of the 12.3 Speaking and Listening Rubric and Checklist to guide their discussion.

- **Differentiation Consideration:** If students require further support with this excerpt, consider discussing the following economic terms including: *free competition, industrial belt, monopolies, imports, economies of scale, and exports.*
- Consider reminding students of their previous work with SL.11-12.1.a, which requires that students have come to class having read the material and asks them to explicitly draw on evidence from the text to support their discussion.
- Consider reminding students of their previous work with SL.11-12.1.c, which requires that students pose and respond to questions and qualify or justify their own points of agreement and disagreement with other students.
- Consider reminding students of their previous work with SL.11-12.1.d, which requires that students seek to understand and respond thoughtfully to diverse perspectives in order to deepen the investigation of their position and observations.
- Consider assessing students speaking and listening skills as outlined in SL.11-12.1.a, c, d using the 12.3 Speaking and Listening Rubric.
  - Students share their observations and evidence generated during the Pre-Discussion Quick Write with the whole class.
  - Student responses may include:
    - Diamond builds on his initial ideas regarding “proximate” and “ultimate” (p. 78) causation by indirectly applying the concepts to a business context, illustrating that proximate factors may contribute to a business’s growth, but may not be fully responsible for its ultimate success. For example, Diamond acknowledges that a proximate or immediate factor like “the idiosyncrasies of individuals” (page 440) can be “partly” (p. 440) responsible for a given company’s success. With a specific reference to Microsoft’s Bill Gates, Diamond explains “[e]ven with a superior corporate organization, Microsoft would not be successful with an ineffectual leader” (p. 440). Yet, Diamond continues to press for root or “ultimate” (p. 78) causes that create the most effective “form of organization of human groups” (p. 440). He finally determines that the organization of Microsoft, which includes “lots of units,” “free communication,” and “a great deal of freedom” for individuals to “pursu[e] their own ideas” (p. 444) is the best organization in which businesses

File: 12.3.1 Lesson 10 Date: 4/3/15 Classroom Use: Starting 4/2015

© 2015 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a

Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

may grow. Diamond illustrates that “ultimate causation” (p. 78) in business can affect its “competitive ability” (p. 444) by showing that Microsoft’s organization reflects and arises from successful organizations and governments across a span of millennia.

- In this excerpt, Diamond also further develops the idea of “ultimate causation” (p. 78) from earlier in the text when discussing a nation’s progress in innovation and economics. Diamond claims the ultimate causes for a nation’s progress regarding innovation are tied to its political organization. For example, Diamond notes that areas with some (but not an extreme) amount of “political fragmentation” (p. 440), like Europe, tend to be more successful with innovation than areas with complete unification, like China. Also, Diamond claims that “countries in regions with long histories of state societies or agriculture have higher per-capita GNP than countries with short histories” (p. 446). This claim further exemplifies how ultimate causation contributes to a nation’s economic success, as it highlights the importance of how root causes such as the growth of agriculture and the evolution of organized societies influence even modern-day economics.
- Diamond claims that the “industrial belts” of Route 128 and the Silicon Valley are “quite different in terms of corporate ethos” (p. 444). Silicon Valley companies are “fiercely competitive with one another” but “there is much collaboration—a free flow of ideas, people and information” (p. 444). Diamond writes that on Route 128, on the other hand, “businesses ... are much more secretive and insulated from one another” (p. 444) which results in far lower productivity and innovation. These ideas parallel and further develop Diamond’s claim about “diffusion” on page 246: “In these societies technology developed most rapidly, because they accumulated not only their own inventions but also those of other societies.” As Diamond points out, isolated nations developed less technology because “[w]ithout diffusion, fewer technologies are acquired, and more existing technologies are lost” (p. 247). Diamond applies the same ideas of diffusion and isolation to the business world when discussing theories about Route 128’s industrial decline due to lack of communication and Silicon Valley’s success due to “collaboration” (p. 444).
- **Differentiation Consideration:** If students struggle, consider asking the following scaffolding questions:

**What are the advantages of “political fragmentation” (p. 440)?**

**How does Diamond describe the ways that “good institutions ... ar[i]se” (p. 445)?**

**In what ways does Diamond imply that businesses can be usefully compared to countries?**

How do “proximate causation” and “ultimate causation” (p. 78) interact with business organizations in this excerpt?

- Consider instructing students to form small groups and having each group elect a spokesperson to share their observations, or allowing students to volunteer to discuss the observations and evidence generated during their Quick Writes.

Instruct students to form pairs and briefly discuss how their opinions were challenged or verified through discussion, or whether they made new connections in light of the evidence and reasoning presented during the discussions.

- Student pairs discuss how their opinions were challenged or verified through discussion, and identify any new connections made.

Lead a brief whole-class discussion of student observations.

### Activity 5: Quick Write

**15%**

Instruct students to return to their Pre-Discussion Quick Write. Instruct students to independently revise or expand their Quick Write response in light of the whole-class discussion, adding any new connections, and strengthening or revising any verified or challenged opinions.

**In this excerpt, how does the author further develop ideas introduced earlier in the text?**

Instruct students to look at their annotations to find evidence. Ask students to use this lesson’s vocabulary wherever possible in their written responses.

- Students listen and read the Quick Write prompt.
- Display the prompt for students to see, or provide the prompt in hard copy.

Transition to the independent Quick Write.

- Students revise or expand their Pre-Discussion Quick Write responses.
- See the High Performance Response at the beginning of this lesson.
- Consider using the Short Response Rubric to assess students’ writing. Students may use the Short Response Rubric and Checklist to guide their written responses.

### Activity 6: Closing

**5%**

Display and distribute the homework assignment. For homework, instruct students to continue their pre-searches and find three more potential sources for at least one area of investigation and record the following information: author's name, topic, source, location, publication date, and general content/key ideas.

- Students follow along.

## Homework

Continue with your pre-searches. Find three more potential sources for at least one area of investigation and record the following information: author's name, topic, source, location, publication date, and general content/key ideas.