

12.2.1 Lesson 4

Introduction

In this lesson, students begin an in-depth analysis of Henry David Thoreau’s essay, “Civil Disobedience.” Students read and analyze part 1, paragraph 1 (from “I heartily accept the motto, — ‘That government is best’” to “the people would not have consented to this measure”), in which Thoreau introduces and begins to support claims about government and the military. Students consider Thoreau’s point of view and the claims he makes about the relationship of the government to the people. Student learning is assessed via a Quick Write at the end of the lesson: How does Thoreau establish his point of view in the opening paragraph of “Civil Disobedience”?

For homework, students complete the Central Ideas Tracking Tool to trace the development of Thoreau’s ideas in part 1, paragraph 1. Students also conduct a brief search on Thoreau’s position on either the Mexican-American War or abolitionism and write a paragraph summarizing the results of their search.

File: 12.2.1 Lesson 4 Date: 2/13/15 Classroom Use: Starting 2/2015

© 2015 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a

Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

Standards

Assessed Standard(s)	
RI.11-12.6	Determine an author's point of view or purpose in a text in which the rhetoric is particularly effective, analyzing how style and content contribute to the power, persuasiveness, or beauty of the text.
Addressed Standard(s)	
CCRA.R.9	Analyze how two or more texts address similar themes or topics in order to build knowledge or to compare the approaches the authors take.
W. 11-12.9.b	Draw evidence from literary or informational texts to support analysis, reflection, and research. b. Apply <i>grades 11-12 Reading standards</i> to literary nonfiction (e.g., "Delineate and evaluate the reasoning in seminal U.S. texts, including the application of constitutional principles and use of legal reasoning [e.g., in U.S. Supreme Court Case majority opinions and dissents] and the premises, purposes, and arguments in works of public advocacy [e.g., <i>The Federalist</i> , presidential addresses]").
L. 11-12.4.a , b	Determine or clarify the meaning of unknown and multiple-meaning words and phrases based on <i>grades 11-12 reading and content</i> , choosing flexibly from a range of strategies. a. Use context (e.g., the overall meaning of a sentence, paragraph, or text; a word's position or function in a sentence) as a clue to the meaning of a word or phrase. b. Identify and correctly use patterns of word changes that indicate different meanings or parts of speech (e.g., <i>conceive</i> , <i>conception</i> , <i>conceivable</i>).

Assessment

Assessment(s)

Student learning is assessed via a Quick Write at the end of the lesson. Students respond to the following prompt, citing textual evidence to support analysis and inferences drawn from the text.

- How does Thoreau establish his point of view in the opening paragraph of “Civil Disobedience”?

High Performance Response(s)

A High Performance Response should:

- Describe Thoreau’s point of view (e.g., Thoreau believes that government does not represent the will of the people, so government should play less of a role in people’s lives).
- Analyze how Thoreau establishes his point of view (e.g., Thoreau asserts his belief in the motto, “[t]hat government is best which governs least” (part 1, par. 1). He supports his belief by explaining that government is “abused and perverted” for purposes like the Mexican-American War, a war the government started because of “a few individuals” (part 1, par. 1), even though most people did not agree with the war.).

Vocabulary

Vocabulary to provide directly (will not include extended instruction)

- expedient (n.) - an easy and quick way to solve a problem
- standing (adj.) - lasting or permanent
- liable (adj.) - likely to be affected or harmed by something

Vocabulary to teach (may include direct word work and/or questions)

- inexpedient (adj.) - not suitable, judicious, or advisable
- abused (v.) - used wrongly or improperly
- perverted (v.) - turned from what is right

Additional vocabulary to support English Language Learners (to provide directly)

- prevail (v.) - to defeat an opponent especially in a long or difficult contest
- execute (v.) - to do something that you have planned to do or been told to do
- outset (n.) - the start or beginning of something
- consented (v.) - agreed to do or allow something

Lesson Agenda/Overview

Student-Facing Agenda	% of Lesson
Standards & Text: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Standards: RI.11-12.6, CCRA.R.9, W.11-12.9.b, L.11-12.4.a, b Text: “Civil Disobedience” by Henry David Thoreau, Part 1, paragraph 1 (http://thoreau.eserver.org/civil1.html) The link provided includes explanatory notes, which may support student analysis of “Civil Disobedience.” 	
Learning Sequence: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Introduction of Lesson Agenda Homework Accountability Masterful Reading Reading and Discussion Quick Write Closing 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 5% 15% 10% 50% 10% 10%

Materials

- Copies of the 12.2 Common Core Learning Standards Tool for each student (optional)
- Student copies of the Short Response Rubric and Checklist (refer to 12.2.1 Lesson 1) (optional)
- Copies of the Central Ideas Tracking Tool for each student

File: 12.2.1 Lesson 4 Date: 2/13/15 Classroom Use: Starting 2/2015

© 2015 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a

Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

Learning Sequence

How to Use the Learning Sequence	
Symbol	Type of Text & Interpretation of the Symbol
10%	Percentage indicates the percentage of lesson time each activity should take.
no symbol	Plain text indicates teacher action.
	Bold text indicates questions for the teacher to ask students.
	<i>Italicized text indicates a vocabulary word.</i>
►	Indicates student action(s).
☞	Indicates possible student response(s) to teacher questions.
ⓘ	Indicates instructional notes for the teacher.

Activity 1: Introduction of Lesson Agenda

5%

Begin by reviewing the agenda and the assessed standard for this lesson: RI.11-12.6. In this lesson, students read the first paragraph of Henry David Thoreau's essay "Civil Disobedience" (from "I heartily accept the motto, — 'That government is best' — to "the people would not have consented to this measure"), and begin to determine how the text establishes Thoreau's point of view and introduces his claims about government and the military.

- Students look at the agenda.

Activity 2: Homework Accountability

15%

Instruct students to take out their responses to first part of the previous lesson's homework assignment. (Reread Bhutto's speech and respond to the following question: How do Bhutto's choices about how to end her speech relate to the choices she made about how to begin her speech?) Instruct students to discuss their responses in pairs.

- Student responses may include:
 - Bhutto ends her speech with a call to "revive the democratic system" (par. 28), which relates to her claim that democracy "survived tyranny over centuries" (par.

File: 12.2.1 Lesson 4 Date: 2/13/15 Classroom Use: Starting 2/2015

© 2015 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a

Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

- 1). Both references emphasize the central idea that democracy—the exercise of power by the people—is the best means of governing Pakistan.
- Bhutto’s statement “It is through the dignity, respect and service of our people that we as a Federation can once again regain the high ground” (par. 28) recalls her statement at the beginning of the speech that “the investment in an individual ... will determine the quality of our society” (par. 3). Both statements support the central idea that the relationship between the individual and the state should be one in which the state invests in the individual. Both statements also support the central idea of the exercise of power by suggesting that in the future power will be exercised more through “the strength of the intellect” than “military strength” (par. 2).
-
- **Differentiation Consideration:** Consider introducing students to standard CCRA.R.9 to support their cross-textual analysis of Bhutto’s “Ideas Live On” and Thoreau’s “Civil Disobedience.” Distribute a copy of the 12.2 Common Core Learning Standards Tool to those students who would benefit from the support of a tool.
- Post or project standard CCRA.R.9. Instruct students to talk in pairs about what they think the standard means. Lead a brief discussion about the standard.
- Student responses may include:
 - The standard requires students to read more than one text about the same theme or topic.
 - The standard requires students to compare how different authors or texts address the same theme or topic.

Instruct students to take out their responses to the second part of the previous lesson’s homework assignment. (Read the first three sentences of “Civil Disobedience,” part 1, paragraph 1 (from “I heartily accept the motto, — ‘That government is best which governs least’” to “and all governments are sometimes, inexpedient”), and compare Bhutto’s and Thoreau’s attitudes towards government.) Instruct students to discuss their responses in pairs.

- Student responses may include:
 - Bhutto believes that the best government is a democracy that invests in individuals. In paragraph 3, she states, “Therefore the investment in an individual, through education and health, will determine the quality of our society and the future of our people.” In paragraph 28, she states that the keys to Pakistan’s success in the 21st century are “dignity, respect and service of [its] people.” In other words, Bhutto suggests that the government should be active in improving

people's lives. Thoreau, on the other hand, believes that the government should be less involved with people's lives; he suggests that the best government is one "which governs not at all" (part 1, par. 1).

- Both Thoreau and Bhutto are critical of the existing form of government. Referring to the motto that government should govern less, Thoreau writes, "I should like to see it acted up to more rapidly and systematically" (part 1, par. 1). This implies that Thoreau wants to see change. Bhutto also wants the government of Pakistan to change. She writes, "For too long our Federation has remained under the shadow of military rule" (par. 14).

Lead a brief whole-class discussion of student responses.

Activity 3: Masterful Reading

10%

Have students listen to a masterful reading of paragraph 1 from Henry David Thoreau's "Civil Disobedience" (from "I heartily accept the motto, — 'That government is best' — to 'the people would not have consented to this measure'"). Instruct students to focus on Thoreau's view of government.

- Students follow along, reading silently.
- **Differentiation Consideration:** Consider posting or projecting the following guiding question to support students in their reading throughout the lesson:

What is Thoreau's point of view of government?

- Consider leading a brief whole-class discussion to ensure comprehension of the masterful reading.

Activity 4: Reading and Discussion

50%

Instruct students to form small groups. Post or project each set of questions below for students to discuss. Instruct students to continue to annotate the text as they read and discuss (W.11-12.9.b).

Instruct student groups to read the first two sentences of part 1, paragraph 1 of "Civil Disobedience" (from "I heartily accept the motto, — 'That government is best' — to "that will be the kind of government which they will have") and answer the following questions in small groups before sharing out with the class.

- **Differentiation Consideration:** To support comprehension, consider asking student pairs to paraphrase the first two sentences of paragraph 1 before discussing the related questions.
- The government should play a limited role in people's lives, and should begin to limit its role quickly and deliberately. This way, people will become more independent from the government and cease to need government to tell them what to do.

What belief does Thoreau present in the first sentence of the essay?

- Thoreau presents his belief that government should be limited. He believes in the motto, "[t]hat government is best which governs least," (part 1, par. 1) meaning that the government should not have strong influence or power.

How does the statement about a government "which governs not at all" develop an idea introduced in the first sentence of the essay (part 1, par. 1)?

- The statement "[t]hat government is best which governs not at all" shows that Thoreau actually believes that even a government with limited power has too much control. Rather than a government that "governs least," Thoreau prefers a government that "governs not at all."

Lead a brief whole-class discussion of student responses.

Instruct student groups to read the third sentence of part 1, paragraph 1 of "Civil Disobedience" ("Government is at best but an expedient; but most governments are usually, and all governments are sometimes, inexpedient") and answer the following question before sharing out with the class.

Provide students with the definition for *expedient*.

- Students may be familiar with this word. Consider asking students to volunteer a definition before providing it to the group.
- Students write the definition of *expedient* on their copies of the text or in a vocabulary journal.
- **Differentiation Consideration:** To support comprehension, consider asking student groups to paraphrase the third sentence of paragraph 1 before discussing the related questions.
- Government can provide a way to solve a problem or achieve a result. However, more often, government is not good for people. Most governments are not good for people most of the time, and every government is bad for the people sometimes.

How does the use of *expedient* and *inexpedient* develop Thoreau's beliefs about government?

- Thoreau's use of *expedient* and *inexpedient* suggests that he is skeptical and critical of government. He says government is "at best but an expedient" (part 1, par. 1), which means that government can solve a problem or achieve a goal in certain cases, but it cannot do anything more. Thoreau also says that "most governments are usually, and all governments are sometimes, inexpedient" (part 1, par. 1). This means that, for the most part, governments are not suitable or advisable.
- **Differentiation Consideration:** If students struggle, consider posing the following scaffolding questions:

What is the meaning of the sentence "Government is at best but an expedient" (part 1, par. 1)? How does the word *but* clarify the meaning of the sentence?

- The word *but* in this context means "only," so "Government is at best but an expedient" means that the only good a government can do is provide a convenient way to solve a problem or accomplish a goal.

How does your understanding of *expedient* help you make meaning of *inexpedient*? What is the meaning of *inexpedient*? (L.11-12.4.b)

- If an *expedient* is a quick and easy way to solve a problem or accomplish a goal, then *inexpedient* likely describes an action or idea that does not effectively solve a problem or accomplish a goal.

Lead a brief whole-class discussion of student responses.

Instruct student groups to read the fourth and fifth sentences of part 1, paragraph 1 of "Civil Disobedience" (from "The objections which have been brought against a standing army" to "The standing army is only an arm of the standing government") and answer the following question before sharing out with the class.

Provide students with the definition of *standing*.

- Students may be familiar with this word. Consider asking students to volunteer a definition before providing it to the group.
 - Students write the definition of *standing* on their copies of the text or in a vocabulary journal.
- **Differentiation Consideration:** Consider providing students with the definition of *prevail*.

- Students write the definition of *prevail* on their copies of the text or in a vocabulary journal.
- **Differentiation Consideration:** To support comprehension, consider asking student groups to paraphrase the fourth and fifth sentences of part 1, paragraph 1 before discussing the related questions.
- People have made many significant criticisms of the army. These same complaints can be applied to the permanent, continuous government because the army is a part of the government.

What can you infer about Thoreau’s point of view regarding the military?

- Thoreau believes the military deserves to be criticized. He says that the “many and weighty” objections to a “standing army ... deserve to prevail” (part 1, par. 1). This means that the many serious criticisms of the military are, in Thoreau’s opinion, justified.

Lead a brief whole-class discussion of student responses.

Instruct student groups to read the sixth and seventh sentences of part 1, paragraph 1 of “Civil Disobedience” (from “The government itself, which is only the mode” to “the people would not have consented to this measure”) and answer the following questions before sharing out with the class.

Provide students with the definition of *liable*.

- Students may be familiar with this word. Consider asking students to volunteer a definition before providing it to the group.
 - Students write the definition of *liable* on their copies of the text or in a vocabulary journal.
- **Differentiation Consideration:** Consider providing students with the definitions of *execute*, *outset*, and *consented*.
 - Students write the definitions of *execute*, *outset*, and *consented* on their copies of the text or in a vocabulary journal.
- **Differentiation Consideration:** To support comprehension, consider asking student pairs to paraphrase the sixth and seventh sentences of part 1, paragraph 1 before discussing the related questions.

- The government is the institution people have chosen to act on their behalf. But, the government is just as likely as the military to be misused in a way that does not represent what the people want. The Mexican-American War is an example of the government being misused and manipulated. The war shows how a few people took advantage of the government to achieve their own personal goals, even though most of the citizens would not have agreed to start the war.

How does the final sentence of paragraph 1 clarify the meaning of “abused and perverted” in the preceding sentence? (L.11-12.4.a)

- Student responses should include:
 - The final sentence of the paragraph introduces the Mexican-American War as an example of the government being “abused and perverted.” A “few individuals” are able to use the government as a “tool” for the war, which suggests that *abused* means “used wrongly” (part 1, par.1).
 - The final sentence also explains that the people would not have agreed to the war “in the outset” (part 1, par. 1), or in the beginning. Because Thoreau says the government is “perverted before the people can act through it” (part 1, par. 1), which confirms that *perverted* means “changed or turned from what is right.”
- **Differentiation Consideration:** If students struggle, consider posing the following scaffolding question:

How does the reference to the Mexican-American War provide context about the time period during which Thoreau wrote “Civil Disobedience”? Refer to part 1, paragraph 1 and the text’s footnotes.

- Thoreau references the “present Mexican war” (part 1, par. 1), so the text was written during the time of the Mexican-American War. The footnotes explain that the war took place from 1846-1848. They also explain, “abolitionists considered [the war] an effort to extend slavery into former Mexican territory” (part 1, note 2). This shows that Thoreau wrote the essay in the 1840s when the United States was debating the end of slavery.

How does Thoreau develop the relationship between “the people” and the “government” in part 1, paragraph 1?

- Thoreau uses the term “the people” multiple times in part 1, paragraph 1. In each instance, he places “the people” in contrast with the government. For example, “the people” choose the government to execute their will, but instead a few individuals are able to misuse the government for their own reasons. Thoreau also suggests that

File: 12.2.1 Lesson 4 Date: 2/13/15 Classroom Use: Starting 2/2015

© 2015 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a

Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

people have many valid reasons to complain about the government when he says, “The objections which have been brought against a standing army, and they are many and weighty ... may also at last be brought against a standing government” (part 1, par. 1).

Lead a brief whole-class discussion of student responses.

- Consider asking students which passages they found difficult or problematic. Lead a brief, whole-class discussion of student responses.

Activity 5: Quick Write

10%

Instruct students to respond briefly in writing to the following prompt:

How does Thoreau establish his point of view in the opening paragraph of “Civil Disobedience”?

Instruct students to look at their annotations to find evidence. Ask students to use this lesson’s vocabulary wherever possible in their written responses.

- Students listen and read the Quick Write prompt.
- Display the prompt for students to see, or provide the prompt in hard copy.

Transition to the independent Quick Write.

- Students independently answer the prompt using evidence from the text.
- See the High Performance Response at the beginning of this lesson.
- Consider using the Short Response Rubric to assess students’ writing. Students may use the Short Response Rubric and Checklist to guide their written responses.

Activity 6: Closing

10%

Distribute a copy of the Central Ideas Tracking Tool to each student. Read the directions on the tool aloud and explain that the “Notes and Connections” column should be used to record supporting quotes and explain how the quotes contribute to the development of a central idea.

- Because students have not yet begun to identify central ideas in “Civil Disobedience,” they should use the Central Ideas Tracking Tool to note important ideas. In 12.2.1 Lesson 6, students will identify those ideas that have emerged as central.

File: 12.2.1 Lesson 4 Date: 2/13/15 Classroom Use: Starting 2/2015

© 2015 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a

Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

- **Differentiation Consideration:** If necessary, consider modeling for students how to complete an entry on the Central Ideas Tracking Tool.

Display and distribute the homework assignment. For homework, instruct students to complete the Central Ideas Tracking Tool to trace the development of Thoreau's ideas in part 1, paragraph 1 of "Civil Disobedience" (from "I heartily accept the motto, — 'That government is best'" to "the people would not have consented to this measure").

Also for homework, instruct students to conduct a brief search into Thoreau's position on either the Mexican-American War or abolitionism. Assign half of the students to research Thoreau's position on the Mexican-American War and the other half of the class to research Thoreau's position on abolitionism. Instruct students to write a paragraph summarizing the results of their search.

- Students follow along.

Homework

Complete the Central Ideas Tracking Tool to trace the development of Thoreau's ideas in part 1, paragraph 1 of "Civil Disobedience" (from "I heartily accept the motto, — 'That government is best'" to "the people would not have consented to this measure").

Also for homework, conduct a brief search into Thoreau's position on either the Mexican-American War or abolitionism. Write one paragraph summarizing the results of your search.

12.2 Common Core Learning Standards Tool

College and Career Readiness Anchor Standards—Reading		I know what this is asking and I can do this.	This standard has familiar language, but I haven't mastered it.	I am not familiar with this standard.
CCRA.R.6	Assess how point of view or purpose shapes the content and style of a text.			
CCRA.R.8	Delineate and evaluate the argument and specific claims in a text, including the validity of the reasoning as well as the relevance and sufficiency of the evidence.			
CCRA.R.9	Analyze how two or more texts address similar themes or topics in order to build knowledge or to compare the approaches the authors take.			

File: 12.2.1 Lesson 4 Date: 2/13/15 Classroom Use: Starting 2/2015

© 2015 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a

Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

CCS Standards: Reading— Literature		I know what this is asking and I can do this.	This standard has familiar language, but I haven't mastered it.	I am not familiar with this standard.
RL. 11-12.2	Determine two or more themes or central ideas of a text and analyze their development over the course of the text, including how they interact and build on one another to produce a complex account; provide an objective summary of the text.			
RL. 11-12.3	Analyze the impact of the author's choices regarding how to develop and relate elements of a story or drama (e.g., where a story is set, how the action is ordered, how the characters are introduced and developed).			

File: 12.2.1 Lesson 4 Date: 2/13/15 Classroom Use: Starting 2/2015

© 2015 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a

Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

CCS Standards: Reading—Literature		I know what this is asking and I can do this.	This standard has familiar language, but I haven't mastered it.	I am not familiar with this standard.
RL. 11-12.4	Determine the meaning of words and phrases as they are used in the text, including figurative and connotative meanings; analyze the impact of specific word choices on meaning and tone, including words with multiple meanings or language that is particularly fresh, engaging, or beautiful. (Include Shakespeare as well as other authors.)			
RL. 11-12.5	Analyze how an author's choices concerning how to structure specific parts of a text (e.g., the choice of where to begin or end a story, the choice to provide a comedic or tragic resolution) contribute to its overall structure and meaning as well as its aesthetic impact.			

File: 12.2.1 Lesson 4 Date: 2/13/15 Classroom Use: Starting 2/2015

© 2015 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a

Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

CCS Standards: Reading—Literature		I know what this is asking and I can do this.	This standard has familiar language, but I haven't mastered it.	I am not familiar with this standard.
RL.11-12.6	Analyze a case in which grasping point of view requires distinguishing what is directly stated in a text from what is really meant (e.g., satire, sarcasm, irony, or understatement).			

File: 12.2.1 Lesson 4 Date: 2/13/15 Classroom Use: Starting 2/2015

© 2015 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a

Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

CCS Standards: Writing		I know what this is asking and I can do this.	This standard has familiar language, but I haven't mastered it.	I am not familiar with this standard.
W.11-12.9.a	<p>Draw evidence from literary or informational texts to support analysis, reflection, and research.</p> <p>Apply <i>grades 11-12 Reading standards</i> to literature (e.g., “Demonstrate knowledge of eighteenth-, nineteenth- and early-twentieth-century foundational works of American literature, including how two or more texts from the same period treat similar themes or topics”).</p>			

CCS Standards: Language		I know what this is asking and I can do this.	This standard has familiar language, but I haven't mastered it.	I am not familiar with this standard.
L. 11-12.5. b	<p>Demonstrate understanding of figurative language, word relationships, and nuances in word meanings.</p> <p>Analyze nuances in the meaning of words with similar denotations.</p>			

File: 12.2.1 Lesson 4 Date: 2/13/15 Classroom Use: Starting 2/2015

© 2015 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a

Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

Central Ideas Tracking Tool

Name :		Class :		Date :	
------------------	--	-------------------	--	------------------	--

Directions: Identify the ideas that you encounter throughout the text. Trace the development of those ideas by noting how the author introduces, develops, or refines these ideas in the text. Cite textual evidence to support your work.

Text :	“Civil Disobedience” by Henry David Thoreau
------------------	---

Part and Paragraph #	Central Ideas	Notes and Connections

File: 12.2.1 Lesson 4 Date: 2/13/15 Classroom Use: Starting 2/2015

© 2015 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a

Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

--	--	--

File: 12.2.1 Lesson 4 Date: 2/13/15 Classroom Use: Starting 2/2015
© 2015 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a
Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License