

12.2.1 Lesson 3

Introduction

In this lesson, students continue their analysis of Bhutto’s speech, “Ideas Live On,” paying particular attention to how Bhutto develops central ideas in paragraphs 24-28 (from “Pakistan faces enormous problems including those of poverty, terrorism, militancy and extremism” to “proud of our history and our heritage”), in which Bhutto calls on her audience to choose democracy in the upcoming elections. Students work in pairs to read paragraphs 24-28, analyzing how the conclusion develops central ideas that were introduced earlier in the speech. Student learning is assessed via a Quick Write at the end of the lesson: How do paragraphs 24-28 refine two central ideas introduced earlier in the text?

For homework, students reread Bhutto’s speech and respond to the following question: How do Bhutto’s choices about how to end her speech relate to the choices she made about how to begin her speech? Also for homework, students read the first three sentences of Henry David Thoreau’s essay, “Civil Disobedience,” and compare Bhutto’s and Thoreau’s attitudes toward government.

File: 12.2.1 Lesson 3 Date: 2/13/2015 Classroom Use: Starting 2/2015

© 2015 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a

Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

Standards

Assessed Standard(s)	
RI.11-12.2	Determine two or more central ideas of a text and analyze their development over the course of the text, including how they interact and build on one another to provide a complex analysis; provide an objective summary of the text.
Addressed Standard(s)	
W. 11-12.9.b	Draw evidence from literary or informational texts to support analysis, reflection, and research. b. Apply <i>grades 11-12 Reading standards</i> to literary nonfiction (e.g., “Delineate and evaluate the reasoning in seminal U.S. texts, including the application of constitutional principles and use of legal reasoning [e.g., in U.S. Supreme Court Case majority opinions and dissents] and the premises, purposes, and arguments in works of public advocacy [e.g., <i>The Federalist</i> , presidential addresses]”).
L. 11-12.5.a	Demonstrate understanding of figurative language, word relationships, and nuances in word meanings. a. Interpret figures of speech (e.g., hyperbole, paradox) in context and analyze their role in the text.

Assessment

File: 12.2.1 Lesson 3 Date: 2/13/2015 Classroom Use: Starting 2/2015

© 2015 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a

Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

Assessment(s)

Student learning is assessed via a Quick Write at the end of the lesson. Students respond to the following prompt, citing textual evidence to support analysis and inferences drawn from the text.

- How do paragraphs 24-28 refine two central ideas introduced earlier in the text?

High Performance Response(s)

A High Performance Response should:

- Identify two central ideas in Bhutto's speech (e.g., the exercise of power; the relationship between the individual and the state.).
- Identify how Bhutto uses paragraphs 24-28 to refine central ideas (e.g., Bhutto uses the final paragraphs of her speech to refine the central ideas of the exercise of power and the relationship between the individual and the state. In paragraph 24, Bhutto lists many of the problems facing Pakistan and states that they "cannot be solved through the model of a rentier military class." Bhutto's criticism of the military government refines the idea of the exercise of power that Bhutto introduces earlier in the speech. By pointing out the failure of the military government, Bhutto reinforces her statement in paragraph 2 that the exercise of power through military strength is "no longer critical in defining the greatness of a nation" and her proposal that a nation's greatness is determined by "the strength of the intellect" instead. In paragraph 26, Bhutto again rejects the exercise of power through the military and calls instead for the exercise of power by the people in order to establish "regional peace as well as internal stability." This rejection develops the idea that the exercise of military power profits from and encourages conflict. Bhutto's criticism of military power builds on her explanation in paragraph 18 of how and why the military government uses "a crisis or a threat" to gain power. Bhutto also uses the final paragraphs of her speech to refine the central idea of the relationship between the individual and the state. In paragraph 27, Bhutto calls Pakistan a "fractured, bleeding society" and suggests that democracy will support "the people's dreams, hopes and aspirations" (par. 27). Bhutto's view of democracy supports the idea that the relationship between the individual and the state should be one in which the state represents the individual and invests in the needs of the individual. This view is clear in Bhutto's earlier statement that the government should invest in its citizens' education so that it can provide "more opportunity for individuals trained to take advantage" of global economies (par. 8).).

Vocabulary

File: 12.2.1 Lesson 3 Date: 2/13/2015 Classroom Use: Starting 2/2015

© 2015 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a

Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-sa/3.0/>



Vocabulary to provide directly (will not include extended instruction)

- rentier (n.) - person whose income consists primarily of fixed unearned amounts, such as rent or bond interest
- enjoined (v.) - directed or ordered to do something
- consensus (n.) - general agreement or concord; harmony
- fractured (adj.) - broken
- revive (v.) - restore from a depressed, inactive, or unused state; bring back
- aspirations (n.) - goals or objectives desired

Vocabulary to teach (may include direct word work and/or questions)

- None.

Additional vocabulary to support English Language Learners (to provide directly)

- None.

Lesson Agenda/Overview

Student-Facing Agenda	% of Lesson
Standards & Text: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Standards: RI.11-12.2, W11-12.9.b, L.11-12.5.a • Text: “Ideas Live On” by Benazir Bhutto, paragraphs 24-28 	
Learning Sequence: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Introduction of Lesson Agenda 2. Homework Accountability 3. Reading and Discussion 4. Quick Write 5. Closing 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. 15% 2. 10% 3. 35% 4. 35% 5. 5%

Materials

- Student copies of the Short Response Rubric and Checklist (refer to 12.2.1 Lesson 1) (optional)

File: 12.2.1 Lesson 3 Date: 2/13/2015 Classroom Use: Starting 2/2015

© 2015 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a

Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

- Copies of “Civil Disobedience” for each student. The paragraphs in this version of “Civil Disobedience” are already numbered.

Learning Sequence

How to Use the Learning Sequence	
Symbol	Type of Text & Interpretation of the Symbol
10%	Percentage indicates the percentage of lesson time each activity should take.
no symbol	Plain text indicates teacher action.
	Bold text indicates questions for the teacher to ask students.
	<i>Italicized text indicates a vocabulary word.</i>
▶	Indicates student action(s).
☞	Indicates possible student response(s) to teacher questions.
ⓘ	Indicates instructional notes for the teacher.

Activity 1: Introduction of Lesson Agenda

15%

Begin by reviewing the agenda and the assessed standard for this lesson: RI.11-12.2. In this lesson, students read and analyze paragraphs 24-28 (from “Pakistan faces enormous problems including those of poverty, terrorism, militancy and extremism” to “proud of our history and our heritage”), noticing how Bhutto uses the conclusion of her speech to support central ideas in the text. Students engage in evidence-based discussions in pairs and as a class before completing a writing assignment that requires them to consider how paragraphs 24-28 refine two central ideas introduced earlier in the text.

- Students look at the agenda.

Activity 2: Homework Accountability

10%

Instruct students to talk in pairs about how they applied a focus standard to their Accountable Independent Reading (AIR) texts. Lead a brief share out on the previous lesson’s AIR homework assignment. Select several students (or student pairs) to explain how they applied a focus standard to their AIR texts.

File: 12.2.1 Lesson 3 Date: 2/13/2015 Classroom Use: Starting 2/2015

© 2015 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a

Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

- Students (or student pairs) discuss and share how they applied a focus standard to their AIR texts from the previous lesson's homework.

Instruct students to take out their responses to the previous lesson's homework assignment. (Select a central idea from paragraphs 1-3 other than the one you wrote about in class, and explain how Bhutto develops this idea in paragraphs 11-23.) Instruct students to share their responses in pairs.

- Student responses may include:
 - Bhutto develops the idea of the exercise of power by demonstrating the negative effects that have resulted from Pakistan not making the shift from exercising power through the military to exercising power through intellectual strength. She explains that the future of Pakistan depends on “the nature of our political system, the strength of our judiciary and the use of our economic resources” (par. 11) and goes on to describe how military rule has damaged each of these systems. Bhutto states the military rulers have “little incentive to build peace ... restore security ... or allow the empowerment of the people” (par. 18). She says that “justice has systematically been undermined by the military rule” (par. 16) and that the military rule has resulted in an economic system “addicted to aid” (par. 21). Bhutto's examples show that the exercise of power through “military strength” has damaged Pakistan and that the country should shift to the exercise of power through “the strength of the intellect” (par. 2).
 - Bhutto develops the idea of the relationship between the individual and the state by expanding on the statement that “the investment in an individual, through education and health, will determine the quality of our society and the future of our people” (par. 3). In paragraph 11, Bhutto asserts that the “future” of Pakistan “depends on the nature of our political system, the strength of our judiciary and the use of our economic resources.” She goes on to explain how building systems that support individuals will benefit the state. Bhutto provides a critique of the military government, explaining that Pakistan's problems, including an “increase in poverty, are directly related to the prolonged period of military domination of our society” (par. 14). In paragraph 18, Bhutto points out that Pakistan's economic system prevents “the empowerment of the people” and instead requires “subjugating [the people] through militias or abuse of state power.” Noting the large amounts of money that foreign countries give Pakistan, Bhutto protests that the funds have “not improved the lives of our people” and says, “We have a right to ask why this money has not translated into poverty eradication” (par. 22). Bhutto's critique of the military government in paragraphs 11-23 demonstrates her

File: 12.2.1 Lesson 3 Date: 2/13/2015 Classroom Use: Starting 2/2015

© 2015 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a

Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

belief that the state should invest in individuals rather than exploit and subjugate them.

Lead a brief whole-class discussion of student responses.

Activity 3: Reading and Discussion

35%

Instruct students to form pairs. Post or project each set of questions below for students to discuss. Instruct students to continue to annotate the text as they read and discuss (W.11-12.9.b).

- If necessary to support comprehension and fluency, consider using a masterful reading of the focus excerpt for the lesson.
- **Differentiation Consideration:** Consider posting or projecting the following guiding question to support students in their reading throughout this lesson:

What are the important ideas in this passage?

Instruct student pairs to read paragraphs 24-28 (from “Pakistan faces enormous problems including those of poverty, terrorism, militancy and extremism” to “proud of our history and our heritage”) and answer the following questions before sharing out with the class.

Provide students with the definitions of *rentier*, *enjoined*, *consensus*, *fractured*, *revive*, and *aspirations*.

- Students may be familiar with some of these words. Consider asking students to volunteer definitions before providing them to the group.
 - Students write the definitions of *rentier*, *enjoined*, *consensus*, *fractured*, *revive*, and *aspirations* on their copies of the text or in a vocabulary journal.

How does Bhutto use figurative language to develop a central idea in paragraphs 24-27? (L.11-12.5.a)

- Student responses should include:
 - In paragraph 25, Bhutto says that to achieve progress Pakistan should ensure “that the light of justice spreads throughout the dark corners of the country.” Her metaphor compares justice to a light and suggests that just as light dispels darkness, so justice will dispel inequity in Pakistan. Bhutto’s words recall her claim that justice under Pakistan’s military government is “elusive” (par. 15). The

File: 12.2.1 Lesson 3 Date: 2/13/2015 Classroom Use: Starting 2/2015

© 2015 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a

Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

metaphor supports the central idea of the exercise of power by advancing Bhutto's belief that Pakistan should abandon military rule in order to restore democracy.

- In paragraph 27, Bhutto refers to the efforts of earlier leaders “to save our people and our land from the dark shadow of military rule which has blotted out the sun of the people's dreams, hopes and aspirations.” This develops both the central idea of the exercise of power and the central idea of the relationship between the individual and the state. Bhutto describes the exercise of power through military strength as “the dark shadow of military rule” (par. 18). She develops the idea of the relationship between the individual and the state by describing the goals of the individual in terms of “the sun of the people's dreams, hopes and aspirations” (par. 18), emphasizing their value as something that the state should support rather than destroy.

How does Bhutto's claim in the first sentence of paragraph 26 relate to a central idea in the speech?

- Student responses may include:
 - Bhutto's claim, “It is restoration of democracy that can lead to regional peace as well as internal stability,” develops the central idea of the exercise of power. Her claim suggests that Pakistan should reject the exercise of power by the military and choose democracy, the exercise of power by the people, instead. Bhutto points out that military rule, “an army operation in Baluchistan,” is threatening peace in the nation and she advises “disbanding militias” in order to “save our people.” Bhutto's observation about the army's activity in Baluchistan further supports her earlier critiques of military rule.
 - Bhutto's claim supports the central idea of the relationship between the individual and the state by reminding her audience that the state has a responsibility to foster “internal stability,” which would include providing health and education for its individuals.

How does Bhutto use rhetoric to develop a central idea in paragraph 27?

- Student responses may include:
 - Bhutto makes an appeal to ethos by alluding to the work of historical figures when she asks her audience “to revive the spirit of Quaid e Azam and Quaid e Awam's struggle to save our people and our land.” Bhutto's reference to past leaders recalls their efforts to establish democracy and presents Bhutto as a politician who shares their values and continues their work. The references support the central idea of the exercise of power by suggesting that the people should support

Bhutto's efforts to create a government that exercises power through democracy rather than through military rule because this is what Quaid e Azan and Quaid e Awam, well-respected political heroes, would have done.

- Bhutto appeals to her audience's emotions in order to develop the central idea of the exercise of power by showing how the exercise of power through military strength, in the form of the military government, is harming Pakistan. She uses vivid descriptive language, referring to Pakistan as a "fractured, bleeding society." Later, when she describes Pakistan's citizens as "all its sons and daughters," she uses the metaphor of family to make her audience feel emotionally connected to Pakistan.

Explain that Bhutto's vivid description and use of metaphor are examples of *appeals to pathos*. Explain to students that an *appeal to pathos* is a rhetorical device that can be defined as an effort to sway the opinion of readers or listeners by appealing to their emotions.

- Consider providing students with the following translations: *Quaid e Azam* is Urdu for "Great Leader" and refers to Muhammad Ali Jinnah, Pakistan's first political leader, and *Quaid e Awam* is Urdu for "People's Leader" and refers to Zulfikar Ali Bhutto, a former prime minister of Pakistan who resisted military rule and was Benazir Bhutto's father.
- Consider reminding students of their work with *appeals to ethos* in 12.2.1 Lesson 1. An *appeal to ethos* is a rhetorical device in which an author or speaker appeals to a listener or reader's conscience or sense of what is right or ethical.
- **Differentiation Consideration:** If students struggle, consider posing the following scaffolding questions:

How do the words Bhutto uses to describe the society and citizens of Pakistan impact the tone of paragraph 27?

- Student responses should include:
 - Bhutto refers to Pakistan as a "fractured, bleeding society" and to the citizens as "all its sons and daughters."
 - Bhutto's description of Pakistan as "fractured" and "bleeding" establishes a tone of pity and compassion that will prompt the audience to take action.
 - Bhutto's description of the citizens of Pakistan as "sons and daughters" creates a tone of empathy by suggesting that Pakistan is like a large family and that the people and the government should have a relationship of love and respect. This image emphasizes Bhutto's idea that the exercise of power through military rule in Pakistan is inappropriate for the country and that the need for change is urgent.

The image also emphasizes the need for the citizens to respond to the needs of the state, just as children respond to the needs of their parents.

What is the effect on Bhutto’s audience of her reference to historical figures in paragraph 27?

- By referring to the historical figures of Quaid e Azam and Quaid e Awam, Bhutto prompts the audience to recall their efforts to establish democracy and suggests that the audience should support her position because it is similar to those of respected leaders whose values the people share.

What is Bhutto’s call to action in paragraph 28 and how does it develop central ideas from her speech?

- Student responses should include:
 - Bhutto calls her audience to “revive the democratic system” instead of continuing with Pakistan’s military rule. In so doing, she develops the central idea of the exercise of power by calling on the audience to revive “the idea of democracy” (par. 1) and to reject the exercise of power through military rule. Bhutto says that in the 21st century, power is shifting “from the might of armies to the strength of the intellect” and that military strength is “no longer critical in defining the greatness of a nation” (par. 2). Instead of promoting the exercise of power by the military, voters should support a democratic system.
 - Bhutto’s call to “revive the democratic system” develops the central idea of the relationship between the individual and the state by emphasizing the idea that the state should invest in the individual: “the investment in an individual ... will determine the quality of our society” (par. 3). According to Bhutto, the democratic system will result in a state that recognizes the “dignity, respect and service of our people” (par. 28) and allows individuals to flourish by participating in the “global community” (par. 4).

Lead a brief whole-class discussion of student responses.

Activity 4: Quick Write

35%

Instruct students to respond briefly in writing to the following prompt:

How do paragraphs 24-28 refine two central ideas introduced earlier in the text?

Instruct students to look at their annotations to find evidence. Ask students to use this lesson’s vocabulary wherever possible in their written responses.

File: 12.2.1 Lesson 3 Date: 2/13/2015 Classroom Use: Starting 2/2015

© 2015 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a

Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

- Students listen and read the Quick Write prompt.
- Display the prompt for students to see, or provide the prompt in hard copy.

Transition to the independent Quick Write.

- Students independently answer the prompt using evidence from the text.
- See the High Performance Response at the beginning of this lesson.
- Consider using the Short Response Rubric to assess students' writing. Students may use the Short Response Rubric and Checklist to guide their written responses.

Activity 5: Closing

5%

Display and distribute the homework assignment. For homework, instruct students to reread Bhutto's speech and respond to the following question:

How do Bhutto's choices about how to end her speech relate to the choices she made about how to begin her speech?

Additionally, distribute copies of "Civil Disobedience" by Henry David Thoreau. Inform students that this essay is the next text in Module 12.2, also on the topic of government, and is by American author Henry David Thoreau.

Instruct students to read the first three sentences of "Civil Disobedience" (from "I heartily accept the motto, — 'That government is best which governs least'" to "and all governments are sometimes, inexpedient") and compare Bhutto's and Thoreau's attitudes toward government.

- Consider reminding students of the alternative End-of-Unit Assessment prompt. Provide the following scaffolding question as an optional Accountable Independent Writing (AIW) assignment:

How does Bhutto explain the role of a citizen?

- Students follow along.

Homework

Reread Bhutto's speech and respond to the following question:

File: 12.2.1 Lesson 3 Date: 2/13/2015 Classroom Use: Starting 2/2015

© 2015 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a

Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

How do Bhutto’s choices about how to end her speech relate to the choices she made about how to begin her speech?

Read the first three sentences of “Civil Disobedience,” part 1, paragraph 1 (from “I heartily accept the motto, — ‘That government is best which governs least’” to “and all governments are sometimes, inexpedient”) and compare Bhutto’s and Thoreau’s attitudes toward government.

File: 12.2.1 Lesson 3 Date: 2/13/2015 Classroom Use: Starting 2/2015

© 2015 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a

Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License