

12.2.1 Lesson 2

Introduction

In this lesson, students continue their analysis of Benazir Bhutto’s speech, “Ideas Live On,” paying particular attention to how Bhutto develops a complex set of ideas in paragraphs 11-23 (from “What kind of future we the people of Pakistan build” to “and 25% (\$3.4 Billion) to civilian governments over 19 years”). In this excerpt, Bhutto describes the political, judiciary, and economic conditions of Pakistan. Before participating in a whole-class discussion, students work in small groups to analyze Bhutto’s claims and how she supports them. Student learning is assessed via a Quick Write at the end of the lesson: How do the ideas and events Bhutto discusses in paragraphs 11-23 develop a central idea from paragraphs 1-3? The closing of the lesson includes an option to introduce students to the practice of Accountable Independent Writing (AIW) in preparation for an alternative End-of-Unit Assessment prompt focusing on the concept of citizenship.

For homework, students continue reading their Accountable Independent Reading (AIR) texts through the lens of a focus standard of their choice. Also for homework, students select a central idea from paragraphs 1-3 other than the one they wrote about in class and explain how Bhutto develops this idea in paragraphs 11-23.

File: 12.2.1 Lesson 2 Date: 2/13/2015 Classroom Use: Starting 2/2015

© 2015 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a

Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

Standards

Assessed Standard(s)	
RI.11-12.2	Determine two or more central ideas of a text and analyze their development over the course of the text, including how they interact and build on one another to provide a complex analysis; provide an objective summary of the text.
Addressed Standard(s)	
W. 11-12.9.b	<p>Draw evidence from literary or informational texts to support analysis, reflection, and research.</p> <p>b. Apply <i>grades 11-12 Reading standards</i> to literary nonfiction (e.g., “Delineate and evaluate the reasoning in seminal U.S. texts, including the application of constitutional principles and use of legal reasoning [e.g., in U.S. Supreme Court Case majority opinions and dissents] and the premises, purposes, and arguments in works of public advocacy [e.g., <i>The Federalist</i>, presidential addresses]”).</p>
L. 11-12.4.a	<p>Determine or clarify the meaning of unknown and multiple-meaning words and phrases based on <i>grades 11-12 reading and content</i>, choosing flexibly from a range of strategies.</p> <p>a. Use context (e.g., the overall meaning of a sentence, paragraph, or text; a word’s position or function in a sentence) as a clue to the meaning of a word or phrase.</p>

Assessment

File: 12.2.1 Lesson 2 Date: 2/13/2015 Classroom Use: Starting 2/2015

© 2015 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a

Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

Assessment(s)

Student learning is assessed via a Quick Write at the end of the lesson. Students respond to the following prompt, citing textual evidence to support analysis and inferences drawn from the text.

- How do the ideas and events Bhutto discusses in paragraphs 11-23 develop a central idea from paragraphs 1-3?

High Performance Response(s)

A High Performance Response should:

- Identify a central idea from paragraphs 1-3 (e.g., the exercise of power; the relationship between the individual and the state).
- Explain how ideas or events Bhutto presents in paragraphs 11-23 develop this central idea (e.g., In paragraphs 11-23, Bhutto develops her ideas about the exercise of power by demonstrating the negative effects on Pakistan that have resulted from it not making the shift from exercising power through the military to exercising power through intellectual strength. She explains that the future of Pakistan depends on “the nature of our political system, the strength of our judiciary and the use of our economic resources” (par. 11) and goes on to describe how military rule has damaged each of these systems. Bhutto states that the military rulers have “little incentive to build peace ... restore security ... or allow the empowerment of the people” (par. 18). She says that “justice has systematically been undermined by the military rule” (par. 16) and that the military rule has resulted in an economic system “addicted to aid” (par. 21). Bhutto’s examples show that the exercise of power through “military strength” has damaged Pakistan and that the country should shift to the exercise of power through “the strength of the intellect” (par. 2).).

Vocabulary

Vocabulary to provide directly (will not include extended instruction)

- judiciary (n.) - the system of courts of justice in a country
- elusive (adj.) - hard to find
- empowerment (n.) - the giving of an ability; enablement or permission
- subjugating (v.) - defeating and gaining control of (someone or something) by the use of force
- Imams (n.) - Muslim religious leaders
- madrassas (n.) - Muslim schools, colleges, or universities that are often part of a mosque

Vocabulary to teach (may include direct word work and/or questions)

- None.

Additional vocabulary to support English Language Learners (to provide directly)

- incentive (n.) - something that encourages a person to do something or to work harder

Lesson Agenda/Overview

Student-Facing Agenda	% of Lesson
Standards & Text: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Standards: RI.11-12.2, W.11-12.9.b, L.11-12.4.a • Text: “Ideas Live On” by Benazir Bhutto, paragraphs 11-23 	
Learning Sequence: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Introduction of Lesson Agenda 2. Homework Accountability 3. Reading and Discussion 4. Quick Write 5. Closing 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. 10% 2. 10% 3. 60% 4. 10% 5. 10%

Materials

- Student copies of the Short Response Rubric and Checklist (refer to 12.2.1 Lesson 1) (optional)

File: 12.2.1 Lesson 2 Date: 2/13/2015 Classroom Use: Starting 2/2015

© 2015 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a

Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

Learning Sequence

How to Use the Learning Sequence	
Symbol	Type of Text & Interpretation of the Symbol
10%	Percentage indicates the percentage of lesson time each activity should take.
no symbol	Plain text indicates teacher action.
	Bold text indicates questions for the teacher to ask students.
	<i>Italicized text indicates a vocabulary word.</i>
►	Indicates student action(s).
☞	Indicates possible student response(s) to teacher questions.
ⓘ	Indicates instructional notes for the teacher.

Activity 1: Introduction of Lesson Agenda

10%

Begin by reviewing the agenda and the assessed standard for this lesson: RI.11-12.2. In this lesson, students read and analyze paragraphs 11-23 (from “What kind of future we the people of Pakistan build” to “and 25% (\$3.4 Billion) to civilian governments over 19 years”), paying particular attention to Bhutto’s claims and how she supports them. Students work in groups and participate in a whole-class discussion. The lesson concludes with a Quick Write.

- Students look at the agenda.

Activity 2: Homework Accountability

10%

Instruct students to talk in pairs about how they applied a focus standard to their AIR texts. Lead a brief share out on the previous lesson’s AIR homework assignment. Select several students (or student pairs) to explain how they applied a focus standard to their AIR texts.

- Students (or student pairs) discuss and share how they applied a focus standard to their AIR texts from the previous lesson’s homework.
- Although AIR remains an expectation of students throughout the year, accountability check-ins occur less frequently in Module 12.2 as students assume greater responsibility for their own reading.

File: 12.2.1 Lesson 2 Date: 2/13/2015 Classroom Use: Starting 2/2015

© 2015 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a

Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

Instruct students to take out their responses to the previous lesson's homework assignment. (Conduct a brief search into Benazir Bhutto and Pakistan and select three significant facts that deepen your understanding of Bhutto's speech to share with the class.) Instruct students to talk in pairs about the facts they found about Bhutto and Pakistan and their ideas about how these facts provide context for Bhutto's speech.

- Student responses may include:
 - Pakistan has the world's second largest Muslim population (after Indonesia) and Bhutto herself is Muslim, so Bhutto's appeals to Islamic values will be important to her audience's sense of what is right and wrong.
 - Bhutto comes from a political family in Pakistan: Her father was executed as a result of a military coup and she herself served twice as prime minister of Pakistan, so she is a respected political figure.
 - In 1999, Pervez Musharraf led a bloodless coup and became head of state from 1999 to 2008, so Bhutto was not in power at the time of this speech.
 - Pakistan continued to suffer from political unrest and Benazir Bhutto was assassinated in a military coup in December 2007 during a campaign tour. Bhutto's concerns about the role of the military in Pakistan therefore seem justified.
 - Pakistan has been considered a partner in the U.S. government's war on terror; Bhutto's references to the war on terror may also reflect her concerns about the country's relationship with the United States.

Lead a brief whole-class discussion of student responses.

Activity 3: Reading and Discussion

60%

Instruct students to form small groups. Post or project each set of questions below for students to discuss. Instruct students to continue to annotate the text as they read and discuss (W.11-12.9.b).

- If necessary to support comprehension and fluency, consider using a masterful reading of the focus excerpt for the lesson.
- **Differentiation Consideration:** Consider posting or projecting the following guiding question to support students in their reading throughout this lesson:

File: 12.2.1 Lesson 2 Date: 2/13/2015 Classroom Use: Starting 2/2015

© 2015 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a

Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

What important ideas does Bhutto discuss in these paragraphs?

Instruct student pairs to read paragraphs 11-23 of “Ideas Live On” (from “What kind of future we the people of Pakistan build” to “and 25% (\$3.4 Billion) to civilian governments over 19 years”) and answer the following questions before sharing out with the class.

Provide students with the definitions of *judiciary*, *elusive*, *empowerment*, *subjugating*, *Imams*, and *madrassas*.

- Students may be familiar with some of these words. Consider asking students to volunteer definitions before providing them to the group.
 - Students write the definitions of *judiciary*, *elusive*, *empowerment*, *subjugating*, *Imams*, and *madrassas* on their copies of the text or in a vocabulary journal.
- **Differentiation Consideration:** Consider providing students with the definition of *incentive*.
 - Students write the definition of *incentive* on their copies of the text or in a vocabulary journal.
- **Differentiation Consideration:** Consider identifying Pakistan and Afghanistan on a map or globe to familiarize students with the countries’ locations.

Identify an idea that is common to both paragraphs 3 and 11.

- Both paragraphs 3 and 11 suggest that the role of the government is critical in providing citizens with the tools and resources they need to succeed in modern society. For example, in paragraph 3, Bhutto claims that the “the quality of our society and the future of our people” depends on “the investment in an individual, through education and health,” suggesting that Pakistan’s government should support health and education services for its citizens. In paragraph 11, Bhutto claims, “What kind of future we ... build depends on the nature of our political system, the strength of our judiciary and the use of our economic resources.” This claim suggests that Pakistan should improve its government structures to improve the lives of its citizens.

Which areas does Bhutto identify as key to Pakistan’s future in paragraph 11?

- Bhutto claims that the political, judiciary, and economic systems are key to Pakistan’s future. She says, “What kind of future we build depends on the nature of our political system, the strength of our judiciary and the use of our economic resources.”

How does Bhutto support her criticism of the military in paragraphs 12-23?

- Student responses should include:

File: 12.2.1 Lesson 2 Date: 2/13/2015 Classroom Use: Starting 2/2015

© 2015 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a

Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

- In paragraphs 12-23, Bhutto demonstrates how the military has failed each of the systems she named in paragraph 11: political, judiciary, and economic.
 - In paragraphs 12-14, Bhutto suggests that Pakistan must use the upcoming elections to choose a form of government other than the military dictatorship in order to invest in individuals, arguing in paragraph 14 that many of Pakistan's problems "are directly related to the prolonged period of military domination of our society."
 - In paragraphs 15 and 16, Bhutto explains how the military has interfered with Pakistan's judiciary system, claiming that "justice in our country is elusive" (par. 15) and that "justice has systematically been undermined by the military rule" (par. 16). Bhutto points to the way in which military rule has influenced the court system by removing Chief Justices, including the removal of the Chief Justice Yaqub in 1977 and another removal of a Chief Justice in 2007 (par. 16).
 - In paragraphs 17-23, Bhutto explains how the military government has mismanaged the economy by relying on external aid in return for "Western support for military rulers" (par. 17). This, according to Bhutto, has created a society "addicted to aid" (par. 21), noting, however, that the money "has not improved the lives of our people" (par. 22). In paragraph 22, Bhutto uses statistics, reporting that the military government received "nearly \$5 Billion in aid" over the last six years and that "[a]n extra \$100 Million are given monthly in coalition funds" (par. 22). She also reports, in paragraph 23, that only 25% (\$3.4 Billion) of the aid that the U.S. gave to Pakistan between 1954 and 2002 went to civilian governments over 19 years; the rest went to military rulers.
- **Differentiation Consideration:** If students struggle, consider posing the following scaffolding questions:

How does Bhutto develop her criticism of the political system in paragraph 14?

- Bhutto claims Pakistan's political system is manipulated by the military government. Bhutto says military rule is responsible for many of the problems in Pakistan. She notes that Pakistan has been under military rule for 30 years and says military rule is to blame for "the problems of terrorism, sectarianism, militancy, extremism, intolerance and increase in poverty."

What criticism does Bhutto make of military rule in relation to the justice system?

- Bhutto says military rule has made justice "elusive" (par. 15) because the military government controls the judges. She says "justice has systematically been undermined" and points to how military rule has influenced the court system by

File: 12.2.1 Lesson 2 Date: 2/13/2015 Classroom Use: Starting 2/2015

© 2015 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a

Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

removing Chief Justices, including the removal of the Chief Justice Yaqub in 1977 and another removal of a Chief Justice in 2007 (par. 16).

What criticisms does Bhutto make of the military dictatorship's economic approach in paragraphs 18-23?

- Student responses should include:
 - Bhutto criticizes the military government's economic approach because the government relies on "rent[ing] out" the army's services for foreign causes, including communism and terrorism (par. 18).
 - Bhutto criticizes the military government's economic approach because the government gets covert funds and military and economic assistance for supporting policies that promote conflict. She says, "Since a crisis or a threat brings with it political power for the Generals ... there is little incentive to build peace in place of conflict, restore security in place of crisis or allow the empowerment of the people in place of subjugating them through militias or abuse of state power" (par. 18).
 - Bhutto criticizes the military government's economic approach because it has resulted in Pakistan's becoming "addicted to aid," in the words of a former Pakistan Air Force Chief (par. 21). Bhutto claims that the government depends on money from foreign governments in exchange for support from the military and that this has become the main source of income for the country.
 - Bhutto criticizes the military government's economic approach by citing statistics to demonstrate that the military government, not the people, benefit from the large amount of money Pakistan receives in foreign aid. She says of the \$12.6 Billion Washington provided in economic and military aid over the last 25 years, "75% (\$9.19 Billion) went to military rulers" while only "25% (\$3.4 Billion) [went] to civilian governments" (par. 23).

In paragraph 18, how does Bhutto suggest that the military government maintains its position?

- Student responses should include:
 - The government maintains its position by accepting money in exchange for supporting foreign military efforts. Bhutto states that Pakistan rents the "army's services for fighting various causes like Communism or Terrorism."
 - The government maintains its position by controlling the people with military strength and an unfair political system. Bhutto claims the government refuses to

File: 12.2.1 Lesson 2 Date: 2/13/2015 Classroom Use: Starting 2/2015

© 2015 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a

Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

“allow the empowerment of the people in place of subjugating them through militias or abuse of state power.”

Explain that the term *exercise of power* refers to the means by which an individual or institution controls others.

In paragraph 18, what kind of relationship does Bhutto suggest that the military government has with its citizens?

- Bhutto suggests that the military has a negative relationship with its citizens, and represses individuals rather than developing them. She claims that the government prevents “empowerment of the people” and instead “subjugate[s] them through militias or abuse of state power.” According to Bhutto, the military government makes policy decisions designed to benefit the leadership rather than the people, because exploiting “a crisis or a threat brings with it political power for the Generals” with the result that the military government does not “build peace ... restore security ... or allow the empowerment of the people.”
- Consider explaining to students that the phrase “the relationship between the individual and the state” expresses the complex links between a government and its citizens, including the responsibilities a government has toward its citizens and the responsibilities a citizen has toward his or her government.
- **Differentiation Consideration:** If students struggle, consider posing the following scaffolding question:

What can you infer about the meaning of the word *state* from Bhutto’s criticism of the government’s “abuse of state power” in paragraph 18? (L.11-12.4.a)

- The phrase “abuse of state power” refers to the government’s misuse of its power. This suggests that the word *state* means “a government or politically organized society having a particular character.”

How does Bhutto’s criticism of military rule develop a central idea?

- Student responses may include:
 - Bhutto’s criticism of military rule develops the central idea of the relationship between the individual and the state. Bhutto’s observation that Pakistan’s military government brings “political power for the Generals” suggests that Pakistan’s policies disregard the good of the people in order to benefit the military leaders (par. 18). These policies contrast with the ideals Bhutto set forth in paragraphs 1-3, where Bhutto explains the need to invest “in an individual, through education and health” (par. 3) in order to provide a secure future. Bhutto’s criticism of

military rule suggests that a state in which the individual is not important will benefit only the military leadership, not the ordinary citizens of a nation.

- Bhutto’s criticism of military rule develops the central idea of the exercise of power by demonstrating the dangers of exercising power through military strength. In paragraph 2, Bhutto claims that “[w]hile military strength continued to be important, it was no longer critical in defining the greatness of a nation” at the beginning of the 21st century. Bhutto’s criticism of military rule develops this idea by showing that the military government is responsible for “the problems of terrorism, sectarianism, militancy, extremism, intolerance and increase in poverty” (par. 14) and that “[i]t has not improved the lives of our people” (par. 22). Bhutto’s criticism suggests that Pakistan should choose a government that exercises power by investing in individuals rather than in the military.

Based on Bhutto’s statement in paragraph 13, what can you infer about the purpose of her speech?

- In paragraph 13, Bhutto says that Pakistan is heading “towards parliamentary and possibly presidential elections,” so her purpose for this speech may be to gain support for a campaign in these elections.

Lead a brief whole-class discussion of student responses.

Activity 4: Quick Write

10%

Instruct students to respond briefly in writing to the following prompt:

How do the ideas and events Bhutto discusses in paragraphs 11-23 develop a central idea from paragraphs 1-3?

Instruct students to look at their annotations to find evidence. Ask students to use this lesson’s vocabulary wherever possible in their written responses.

- Students listen and read the Quick Write prompt.
- Display the prompt for students to see, or provide the prompt in hard copy.

Transition to the independent Quick Write.

- Students independently answer the prompt using evidence from the text.
- See the High Performance Response at the beginning of this lesson.

- Consider using the Short Response Rubric to assess students' writing. Students may use the Short Response Rubric and Checklist to guide their written responses.

Activity 5: Closing

10%

Display and distribute the homework assignment. For homework, students should continue to read their AIR texts through the lens of a focus standard of their choice and prepare for a 3-5 minute discussion of their texts based on that standard. Remind students that they should continue reading their AIR texts throughout the year, even though accountability check-ins occur less frequently.

Also for homework, instruct students to identify a central idea from paragraphs 1-3 other than the one they wrote about in class and explain how Bhutto develops this idea in paragraphs 11-23.

- Explain that in 12.2.1, students continue to build on the writing skills they developed in Module 12.1. In this unit, written responses to AIW prompts prepare students for an alternative End-of-Unit assessment prompt focusing on the concept of citizenship.

Consider introducing the following alternative End-of-Unit Assessment prompt:

How does the work of Bhutto and Thoreau shape your understanding of what it means to be a citizen?

Explain that students will have opportunities throughout 12.2.1 to consider various aspects of this question in AIW assignments and that their responses to these writing assignments can be used as resources for the alternative End-of-Unit Assessment.

Instruct students to write a brief response to the following question:

How does Bhutto's statement, "We are witnessing a new divide between the advantaged global citizen and the disadvantaged local citizen" (par. 5) shape your understanding of what it means to be a citizen?

- Students follow along.

Homework

Continue reading your Accountable Independent Reading text through the lens of a focus standard of your choice and prepare for a 3-5 minute discussion of your text based on that standard.

File: 12.2.1 Lesson 2 Date: 2/13/2015 Classroom Use: Starting 2/2015

© 2015 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a

Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

In addition, select a central idea from paragraphs 1-3 other than the one you wrote about in class, and explain how Bhutto develops this idea in paragraphs 11-23.

File: 12.2.1 Lesson 2 Date: 2/13/2015 Classroom Use: Starting 2/2015

© 2015 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a

Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License