

# 12.2.1 Lesson 6

## Introduction

In this lesson, students read part 1, paragraphs 3-4 of Henry David Thoreau's essay "Civil Disobedience" (from "But, to speak practically and as a citizen" to "O'er the grave where our hero we buried."). In these paragraphs, Thoreau introduces and develops his ideas about the need for a better government. Students identify central ideas that emerge in the first 4 paragraphs of the essay and analyze how these ideas interact and build on one another. Students also discuss how Bhutto and Thoreau develop a similar central idea in both "Ideas Live On" and "Civil Disobedience." Student learning is assessed via a Quick Write at the end of the lesson: How does Thoreau develop a central idea in part 1, paragraphs 3-4?

For homework, students reread part 1, paragraphs 1-4 and write a brief response to the following prompt: Which sentence of part 1, paragraphs 3-4 is most critical to your understanding of this excerpt of "Civil Disobedience" and why? Students also continue their Accountable Independent Reading (AIR).

## Standards

Assessed Standard(s)	
RI.11-12.2	Determine two or more central ideas of a text and analyze their development over the course of the text, including how they interact and build on one another to provide a complex analysis; provide an objective summary of the text.
Addressed Standard(s)	
W. 11-12.9.b	<p>Draw evidence from literary or informational texts to support analysis, reflection, and research.</p> <p>b. Apply <i>grades 11-12 Reading standards</i> to literary nonfiction (e.g., “Delineate and evaluate the reasoning in seminal U.S. texts, including the application of constitutional principles and use of legal reasoning [e.g., in U.S. Supreme Court Case majority opinions and dissents] and the premises, purposes, and arguments in works of public advocacy [e.g., <i>The Federalist</i>, presidential addresses]”).</p>
L. 11-12.4.c	<p>Determine or clarify the meaning of unknown and multiple-meaning words and phrases based on <i>grades 11-12 reading and content</i>, choosing flexibly from a range of strategies.</p> <p>c. Consult general and specialized reference materials (e.g., dictionaries, glossaries, thesauruses), both print and digital, to find the pronunciation of a word or determine or clarify its precise meaning, its part of speech, its etymology, or its standard usage.</p>

## Assessment

File: 12.2.1 Lesson 6 Date: 2/13/15 Classroom Use: Starting 2/2015

© 2015 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a

Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

**Assessment(s)**

Student learning is assessed via a Quick Write at the end of the lesson. Students respond to the following prompt, citing textual evidence to support analysis and inferences drawn from the text.

- How does Thoreau develop a central idea in part 1, paragraphs 3-4?
- **Differentiation Consideration:** Consider posing the following alternative prompt as an optional extension for some students:
  - How do two central ideas interact and build on one another in part 1, paragraphs 3-4?

**High Performance Response(s)**

A High Performance Response should:

- Identify a central idea from part 1, paragraphs 3-4 (e.g., ethics, exercise of power, or the relationship between the individual and the state).
- Analyze how Thoreau develops a central idea in part 1, paragraphs 3-4 (e.g., Thoreau develops the central idea of ethics by explaining why individual conscience is necessary for creating a better government. Thoreau argues that a better government is one in which “majorities do not virtually decide right and wrong, but conscience” (part 1, par. 4). Thoreau distinguishes the contrast between right and wrong as determined by the majority, and right and wrong as determined by each individual’s conscience. Thoreau further develops the central idea of ethics as he describes the devastating effect the military can have on citizens. He says that the American government can make men in the military “a mere shadow and reminiscence of humanity” (part 1, par. 4). In other words, he suggests that people in the military no longer make decisions according to their personal ethics.).
- **Differentiation Consideration:** A High Performance Response to the optional extension prompt should:
  - Determine two central ideas developed in part 1, paragraphs 3-4 (e.g., ethics, exercise of power, or the relationship between the individual and the state).
  - Analyze how two central ideas interact or build on one another in paragraphs 3-4 (e.g., The central idea of the relationship between the individual and the state builds on the central idea of the exercise of power in paragraphs 3-4 where Thoreau contrasts how government currently functions with how he believes government should function. In the existing government, Thoreau claims, the majority is in control “not because they are most likely to be in the right, nor because this seems fairest to the minority, but because they are physically the strongest” (part 1, par. 4). This develops the central idea of the exercise of power by identifying physical strength as the source of authority in a system like the American government. Thoreau builds on this idea when he points out the problems with majority rule. Unlike the existing government, the “better government” (part 1, par. 3) that Thoreau proposes is one in which “majorities do not virtually decide right and wrong, but conscience” (part 1, par. 4). Thoreau’s vision of government develops the idea of the relationship between the individual and the state, by proposing a new relationship between the two, in which government respects not only the will of the majority but the “conscience” of the individual (part 1, par. 4) people outside of the majority.).

## Vocabulary

File: 12.2.1 Lesson 6 Date: 2/13/15 Classroom Use: Starting 2/2015

© 2015 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a

Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

**Vocabulary to provide directly (will not include extended instruction)**

- resign (v.) - give up or relinquish
- cultivate (v.) - promote the growth or development of
- palpitation (n.) - an unusually or abnormally rapid or violent beating of the heart.
- reminiscence (n.) - a mental impression retained and revived
- corse (n.) - corpse
- rampart (n.) - a protective barrier

**Vocabulary to teach (may include direct word work and/or questions)**

- None.

**Additional vocabulary to support English Language Learners (to provide directly)**

- practical (adj.) - relating to what is real rather than to what is possible or imagined
- majority (n.) - the group or party that is the greater part of a large group
- minority (n.) - the group that is the smaller part of a larger group
- virtually (adv.) - very nearly; almost entirely
- legislator (n.) - a person who makes laws
- subjects (n.) - people who live in a country that is ruled by a king or queen

## Lesson Agenda/Overview

Student-Facing Agenda	% of Lesson
<b>Standards &amp; Text:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Standards: RI.11-12.2, W.11-12.9.b, L.11-12.4.c</li> <li>• Text: “Civil Disobedience” by Henry David Thoreau, Part 1, paragraphs 3-4</li> </ul>	
<b>Learning Sequence:</b> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Introduction of Lesson Agenda</li> <li>2. Homework Accountability</li> <li>3. Masterful Reading</li> <li>4. Reading and Discussion</li> <li>5. Quick Write</li> <li>6. Closing</li> </ol>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. 5%</li> <li>2. 10%</li> <li>3. 10%</li> <li>4. 60%</li> <li>5. 10%</li> <li>6. 5%</li> </ol>

File: 12.2.1 Lesson 6 Date: 2/13/15 Classroom Use: Starting 2/2015

© 2015 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a

Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

## Materials

- Student copies of the Central Ideas Tracking Tool (refer to 12.2.1 Lesson 4)—students may need additional blank copies
- Student copies of the Short Response Rubric and Checklist (refer to 12.2.1 Lesson 1) (optional)

## Learning Sequence

How to Use the Learning Sequence	
Symbol	Type of Text & Interpretation of the Symbol
10%	Percentage indicates the percentage of lesson time each activity should take.
no symbol	Plain text indicates teacher action.
	<b>Bold text indicates questions for the teacher to ask students.</b>
	<i>Italicized text indicates a vocabulary word.</i>
►	Indicates student action(s).
☞	Indicates possible student response(s) to teacher questions.
❗	Indicates instructional notes for the teacher.

### Activity 1: Introduction of Lesson Agenda

5%

Begin by reviewing the agenda and the assessed standard for this lesson: RI.11-12.2. In this lesson, students read paragraphs 3-4 of “Civil Disobedience” (from “But, to speak practically and as a citizen” to “O’er the grave where our hero we buried”) and analyze the development of central ideas.

- Students look at the agenda.

### Activity 2: Homework Accountability

10%

Instruct students to form groups to share and discuss the vocabulary words they identified and defined in the previous lesson's homework. Instruct students to explain how these words contribute to the meaning of the text (L.11-12.4.c).

- Students may identify the following words: *resign, cultivate, palpitation, reminiscence, corse, and rampart.*
- **Differentiation Consideration:** Students may also identify the following words: *practical, majority, minority, virtually, legislator, and subjects.*
- Definitions are provided in the Vocabulary box in this lesson.

Lead a brief whole-class discussion of student responses.

---

Instruct students to take out their responses the previous lesson's homework assignment. (Complete the Central Ideas Tracking Tool based on part 1, paragraph 2 of "Civil Disobedience.") Instruct students to form pairs and share their responses.

- See the Model Central Ideas Tracking Tool for sample student responses.

Lead a brief whole-class discussion of student responses.

### Activity 3: Masterful Reading

**10%**

Have students listen to a masterful reading of part 1, paragraphs 3-4 of "Civil Disobedience" (from "But, to speak practically and as a citizen" to "O'er the grave where our hero we buried"). Ask students to listen for Thoreau's ideas about law and power.

- Students follow along, reading silently.
- **Differentiation Consideration:** Consider posting or projecting the following guiding question to support students in their reading throughout the lesson:

**What does Thoreau say about government in America?**

- Consider leading a whole-class discussion to ensure comprehension of the masterful reading.

### Activity 4: Reading and Discussion

**60%**

Instruct students to form small groups. Post or project each set of questions below for students to discuss. Instruct students to continue to annotate the text as they read and discuss (W.11-12.9.b).

Instruct student groups to read part 1, paragraph 3 of “Civil Disobedience” (from “But, to speak practically and as a citizen” to “and that will be one step toward obtaining it”) and answer the following questions before sharing out with the class.

**How does Thoreau’s statement, “I ask for, not at once no government, but *at once* a better government” (part 1, par. 3) relate to his earlier idea that “government is best which governs least” (part 1, par. 1)?**

- Based on Thoreau’s statement that “government is best which governs least” (part 1, par. 1), the “better” government (part 1, par. 3) Thoreau aspires to is a government that interferes less in people’s lives.

**What distinction does Thoreau draw in paragraph 3 and how does it support his point of view?**

- Thoreau makes a distinction between himself and the “no-government men” (part 1, par. 3). Rather than no government, Thoreau asks for “a better government” (part 1, par. 3), which establishes that Thoreau is not in favor of anarchy or the absence of government. Rather, he wants an improved government.

**What does Thoreau recommend as a step toward establishing a better government?**

- Thoreau wants each man to make known “what kind of government would command his respect” (part 1, par. 3). He wants each man to ponder and talk about what kind of government he wants to see.

Lead a brief whole-class discussion of student responses.

---

Instruct student groups to reread and paraphrase the first two sentences from paragraph 4 of “Civil Disobedience” (from “After all, the practical reason why, when the power” to “cannot be based on justice, even as far as men understand it”).

- The majority obtains and keeps power because they are physically stronger than other groups, not because they are necessarily right or fair. A government determined by the majority does not treat all people justly.
- Consider reminding students that an “exercise of power,” which they discussed in 12.2.1 Lesson 2 in relation to Bhutto’s “Ideas Live On,” is “the means by which an individual or



institution controls others.” The phrase “exercise of power” can be used to describe a similar idea in Thoreau’s “Civil Disobedience.”

Lead a brief whole-class discussion of student responses.

---

Instruct student groups to finish reading part 1, paragraph 4 of “Civil Disobedience” (from “Can there not be a government in which majorities do not virtually decide” to “O’er the grave where our hero we buried”) and answer the following questions before sharing out with the class.

**How does Thoreau develop the relationship between conscience and government?**

- Thoreau asks a series of rhetorical questions to imply that a government based on conscience would create a system that is fairest to members of the minority group. For example, he asks, “[c]an there not be a government in which majorities do not virtually decide right and wrong, but conscience?” (part 1, par. 4). This question supports the idea that in the current system of government, right and wrong are defined by the majority. On the other hand, conscience is personal and individual. Thoreau believes that individual conscience, rather than the government or majority opinion, should determine right and wrong.
- Consider leading a brief, whole-class discussion of the role of conscience in Thoreau’s “Civil Disobedience,” and providing students with the term *ethics* as a tool for discussing ideas about conscience and decisions about right and wrong throughout Module 12.2. Define *ethics* in this context as “moral principles of an individual.”

**What distinction does Thoreau establish between “law” and “the right”?**

- Thoreau explains that it is more desirable to develop “a respect ... for the right” than it is “to cultivate a respect for the law” (part 1, par. 4). He believes men should not necessarily follow the law in every situation, but rather should follow their own consciences and do what they believe is right.

**How does Thoreau’s description of the “undue respect for law” (part 1, par. 4) develop a central idea?**

- Thoreau describes how an “undue respect for the law” (part 1, par. 4) leads people to go to war “against their wills” (par. 4) and “against their common sense and consciences” (part 1, par. 4). In this way, Thoreau develops the central idea of the relationship between the individual and the state by describing a relationship in which individual conscience is overridden by loyalty to the government, leading people to act

unethically against their will. Thoreau's description of such a relationship develops his earlier call for "a government in which majorities do not virtually decide right and wrong, but conscience," a government that respects the individual and his/her conscience.

- **Differentiation Consideration:** If students struggle, consider asking the following scaffolding question:

**What is the "undue respect for law" Thoreau describes in part 1, paragraph 4?**

- Thoreau uses the phrase "undue respect for law" in part 1, paragraph 4 to describe how "well-disposed [people] are daily made the agents of injustice," meaning that that good people do what is legally required, instead of doing what is right.

**How does Thoreau use the example of the military in part 1, paragraph 4 to develop his ideas about conscience?**

- In part 1, paragraph 4, Thoreau establishes that he views the military as a force that makes people act against their conscience and destroys their individuality. He says that the American government can make men in the military "a mere shadow and reminiscence of humanity" (part 1, par. 4), meaning that the military can destroy the qualities that make people human because it makes men act unethically, against their consciences.

Lead a brief whole-class discussion of student responses.

---

Instruct students to take out their Central Ideas Tracking Tools and add the ideas they analyzed during this lesson.

- See Model Central Ideas Tracking Tool for example student responses.

Instruct student groups to discuss their Central Ideas Tracking Tools and analyze how similar central ideas are developed in Bhutto's "Ideas Live On" and in part 1, paragraphs 1-4 of "Civil Disobedience."

- Student responses may include:
  - Ethics
  - Exercise of power
  - The relationship between the individual and the state
- Students may use varied language to describe the text's central ideas.

- Consider asking students which passages they found difficult or problematic.

Lead a brief whole-class discussion of student responses.

---

**Consider Bhutto’s “Ideas Live On” and Thoreau’s ideas in part 1, paragraphs 3-4. Compare how each author develops a similar central idea.**

- Student responses may include:
  - Thoreau develops the central idea of the relationship between the individual and the state when he asks for “*at once* a better government” (part 1, par. 3). Thoreau believes that a better government is one in which “majorities do not virtually decide right and wrong, but conscience” (part 1, par. 4). Thoreau believes that American citizens are responsible for America’s accomplishments, so he believes that a better government will occur when men begin to challenge and question the law. For Thoreau, the individual and his/her conscience are more important in deciding right and wrong than the will of the majority.
  - Bhutto also calls for a change in the relationship between the individual and the state. She believes that Pakistan must remove itself from “under the shadow of military rule” (par. 14) and “revive [its] democratic system” (par. 28) to create a better government for the people. Like Thoreau, Bhutto calls for greater respect for the individual, remarking that “an individual’s education, intelligence and wisdom creates cumulatively the wealth of a nation” (par. 3), but, unlike Thoreau, she calls for the state to intervene more in the life of an individual, claiming that “investment in an individual, through education and health, will determine the quality of our society and the future of our people” (par. 3).

## Activity 5: Quick Write

10%

Instruct students to respond briefly in writing to the following prompt:

**How does Thoreau develop a central idea in part 1, paragraphs 3-4?**

- **Differentiation Consideration:** Consider posing the following alternative prompt as an optional extension for some students:

**How do two central ideas interact and build on one another in part 1, paragraphs 3-4?**

Instruct students to look at their annotations to find evidence. Ask students to use this lesson’s vocabulary wherever possible in their written responses.

- Students listen and read the Quick Write prompt.
- Display the prompt for students to see, or provide the prompt in hard copy.

Transition to the independent Quick Write.

- Students independently answer the prompt using evidence from the text.
- See the High Performance Response at the beginning of this lesson.
- Consider using the Short Response Rubric to assess students' writing. Students may use the Short Response Rubric and Checklist to guide their written responses.

## Activity 6: Closing

5%

Display and distribute the homework assignment. For homework, instruct students to reread paragraphs 3-4 and write a brief response to the following prompt:

**Which sentence of part 1, paragraphs 3-4 is most critical to your understanding of this excerpt of “Civil Disobedience” and why?**

Instruct students to look at their annotations to find evidence. Ask students to use this lesson's vocabulary wherever possible in their written responses.

Additionally, students should continue to read their AIR texts through the lens of a focus standard of their choice and prepare for a 3-5 minute discussion of their texts based on that standard.

## Homework

Reread paragraphs 3-4 and write a brief response to the following prompt:

**Which sentence of part 1, paragraphs 3-4 is most critical to your understanding of this excerpt of “Civil Disobedience” and why?**

Look at your annotations to find evidence. Use this lesson's vocabulary whenever possible in your written responses.

Also, continue reading your Accountable Independent Reading text through the lens of a focus standard of your choice and prepare for a 3-5 minute discussion of your text based on that standard.

## Model Central Ideas Tracking Tool

- This model tool includes examples from the 12.2.1 Lesson 5 homework and the 12.2.1 Lesson 6 Reading and Discussion activity.

<b>Name</b> :		<b>Class</b> :		<b>Date</b> :	
------------------	--	-------------------	--	------------------	--

**Directions:** Identify the ideas that you encounter throughout the text. Trace the development of those ideas by noting how the author introduces, develops, or refines these ideas in the text. Cite textual evidence to support your work.

<b>Text</b> :	“Civil Disobedience” by Henry David Thoreau
------------------	---

Part and Paragraph #	Central Ideas	Notes and Connections
Part 1, par. 2	Exercise of power	The American government is changing and becoming corrupt, “each instant losing some of its integrity.”
Part 1, par. 2	The relationship between the individual and the state	Individuals can control the government. “[A] single man can bend [government] to his will.”
Part 1, par. 2	The relationship between the individual and the state	People allow themselves to be controlled by government. “Governments show thus how successfully men can be imposed on, even impose on themselves, for their own advantage.”
Part 1, par. 2	The relationship between the individual and the state	“[G]overnment never of itself furthered any enterprise.”  The American people are responsible for all of the nation’s accomplishments and they “would have done somewhat more, if the government had not sometimes got in its way.”

File: 12.2.1 Lesson 6 Date: 2/13/15 Classroom Use: Starting 2/2015

© 2015 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a

Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

Part 1, par. 4	Exercise of power	Thoreau says that, “majority rule in all cases cannot be based on justice,” because the majority is not the “most likely to be in the right,” but, because they are “physically the strongest,” they can exercise their power to ignore the minority voice.
Part 1, par. 4	Ethics of honor	Thoreau asks, “Can there not be a government in which majorities do not virtually decide right and wrong, but conscience?” He further explains that corporations have conscience if they are made up of “conscientious men.”
Part 1, par. 4	The relationship between the individual and the state	Thoreau describes people who go to war “against their wills” and “against their common sense and consciences.” This develops the central idea of individual versus government by showing how the government imposes on its citizens and does not execute the will of the people.