12.2.1 Lesson 15

Introduction

In this lesson, students prepare for the 12.2.1 End-of-Unit Assessment by collecting evidence from throughout "Civil Disobedience" about Thoreau's opinion of "a better government" (part 1, par. 3). After independently collecting and organizing evidence on the Better Government Evidence Gathering Tool, students participate in a Round Robin Discussion of the following prompt: Choose one central idea and analyze how it relates to Thoreau's opinion of "a better government." Student learning is assessed via the Round Robin Discussion. Students also self-assess their own contributions to the discussion, and complete the 12.2.1 Lesson 15 Exit Slip in which they analyze how the analyses and evidence presented during discussion changed or confirmed their own thinking.

For homework, students complete the Better Government Evidence Gathering Tool by selecting a second central idea in "Civil Disobedience" and collecting evidence of how this idea relates to Thoreau's opinion of "a better government." Also for homework, students review and expand their notes and annotations in preparation for the 12.2.1 End-of-Unit Assessment.





Standards

Assessed S	tandard(s)
RI.11-12.2	Determine two or more central ideas of a text and analyze their development over the course of the text, including how they interact and build on one another to provide a complex analysis; provide an objective summary of the text.
RI.11-12.3	Analyze a complex set of ideas or sequence of events and explain how specific individuals, ideas, or events interact and develop over the course of the text.
SL. 11-12.1.a , c	 Initiate and participate effectively in a range of collaborative discussions (one-on-one, in groups, and teacher-led) with diverse partners on grades 11-12 topics, texts, and issues, building on others' ideas and expressing their own clearly and persuasively. a. Come to discussions prepared, having read and researched material under study; explicitly draw on that preparation by referring to evidence from texts and other research on the topic or issue to stimulate a thoughtful, well-reasoned exchange of ideas. c. Propel conversations by posing and responding to questions that probe reasoning and evidence; ensure a hearing for a full range of positions on a topic or issue; clarify, verify, or challenge ideas and conclusions; and promote divergent and creative perspectives.
Addressed	Standard(s)
W. 11-12.9.b	 Draw evidence from literary or informational texts to support analysis, reflection, and research. b. Apply grades 11-12 Reading standards to literary nonfiction (e.g., "Delineate and evaluate the reasoning in seminal U.S. texts, including the application of constitutional principles and use of legal reasoning [e.g., in U.S. Supreme Court Case majority opinions and dissents] and the premises, purposes, and arguments in works of public advocacy [e.g., The Federalist, presidential addresses]").

Assessment





Assessment(s)

Student learning is assessed via an Exit Slip following a Round Robin discussion at the end of the lesson. Students explain how the discussion confirmed or changed their response to the following prompt, citing textual evidence to support analysis and inferences drawn from the text.

• Choose one central idea and analyze how it relates to Thoreau's idea of "a better government."

High Performance Response(s)

A High Performance Response should:

- Identify a central idea in Thoreau's "Civil Disobedience" (e.g., ethics; the relationship between the individual and the state).
- Analyze how this central idea relates to Thoreau's opinion of "a better government."
- See Model Better Government Evidence Gathering Tool at the end of this lesson.

Vocabulary

Vocabulary to provide directly (will not include extended instruction)

None.*

Vocabulary to teach (may include direct word work and/or questions)

None.*

Additional vocabulary to support English Language Learners (to provide directly)

None.*

*Because this is not a close reading lesson, there is no specified vocabulary. However, in the process of returning to the text, students may uncover unfamiliar words. Teachers can guide students to make meaning of these words by following the protocols described in 1e of this document: http://www.engageny.org/sites/default/files/resource/attachments/9-12 ela prefatory material.pdf



Lesson Agenda/Overview

Student-Facing Agenda	% of Lesson
Standards & Text:	
• Standards: RI.11-12.2, RI.11-12.3, SL.11-12.1.a, c, W.11-12.9.b	
Text: "Civil Disobedience" by Henry David Thoreau	
Learning Sequence:	
1. Introduction of Lesson Agenda	1. 5%
2. Homework Accountability	2. 10%
3. Evidence Gathering Activity	3. 45%
4. Round Robin Discussion	4. 30%
5. 12.2.1 Lesson 15 Exit Slip and Assessment	5. 5%
6. Closing	6. 5%

Materials

- Student copies of their Central Ideas Tracking Tools from 12.2.1
- Copies of the Better Government Evidence Gathering Tool for each student
- Copies of the 12.2.1 Speaking and Listening Rubric and Checklist for standard SL.
 11-12.1.a, c for each student
- Copies of the 12.2.1 Lesson 15 Exit Slip for each student



Learning Sequence





How to Use the Learning Sequence					
Symbo l	Type of Text & Interpretation of the Symbol				
10%	Percentage indicates the percentage of lesson time each activity should take.				
	Plain text indicates teacher action.				
no symbol	Bold text indicates questions for the teacher to ask students.				
	Italicized text indicates a vocabulary word.				
•	Indicates student action(s).				
•	Indicates possible student response(s) to teacher questions.				
(i)	Indicates instructional notes for the teacher.				

Activity 1: Introduction of Lesson Agenda

5%

Begin by reviewing the agenda and the assessed standards for this lesson: RI.11-12.2, RI. 11-12.3, and SL.11-12.1.a, c. In this lesson, students gather evidence about how a central idea relates to Thoreau's idea of "a better government" (part 1, par. 3) in preparation for the End-of-Unit Assessment. Students engage in an assessed Round Robin discussion and complete an Exit Slip to close the lesson.

• Students look at the agenda.

Activity 2: Homework Accountability

10%

Instruct students to take out their responses to the first part of the previous lesson's homework assignment. (Add at least two ideas to your Central Ideas Tracking Tool.) Instruct students to Turn-and-Talk in pairs about their responses to the homework assignment.

See Model Central Ideas Tracking Tool at the end of this lesson.

Lead a brief whole-class discussion of student responses.

Instruct students to take out their responses to the second part of the previous lesson's homework assignment. (Reread part 3, paragraphs 17-19 of "Civil Disobedience" and answer the following question: Which sentence of paragraphs 17-19 is most critical to your





understanding of "Civil Disobedience" and why?) Instruct students to Turn-and-Talk in pairs about their responses.

- Student responses may include:
 - The sentence "The progress from an absolute to a limited monarchy, from a limited monarchy to a democracy, is a progress toward a true respect for the individual" (part 3, par. 19) is critical to understanding "Civil Disobedience." This sentence demonstrates that Thoreau understands history as a linear progression towards a more enlightened state, and sees a direct correlation between this political progress and increased respect for the individual.
 - The sentence "There will never be a really free and enlightened State until the State comes to recognize the individual as a higher and independent power, from which all its own power and authority are derived, and treats him accordingly" (part 3, par. 19) is critical to understanding "Civil Disobedience" because it explains why Thoreau believes that political progress must go hand in had with respect for the individual. The state has power only because individuals grant the state power, so a truly free state must recognize this dependence and treat the individual with respect.

Lead a brief whole-class discussion of student responses.

Activity 3: Evidence Gathering Activity

45%

Introduce the 12.2.1 End-of-Unit Assessment prompt:

What does Thoreau mean by "a better government"?

- Display the prompt for students to see, or provide the prompt in hard copy.
 - Students independently read the End-of-Unit Assessment prompt.

Distribute the Better Government Evidence Gathering Tool. Instruct students to complete the tool by selecting one central idea and gathering evidence from the text as a whole that demonstrates how this central idea relates to Thoreau's opinion of "a better government."

Explain to students that they should use their Central Ideas Tracking Tools from throughout the module to guide this evidence collection activity.

• Students complete the tool for homework by gathering evidence about how a second central idea relates to Thoreau's idea of "a better government."





- Students use the Better Government Evidence Gathering Tool to collect and organize evidence.
- See Model Better Government Evidence Gathering Tool at the end of this lesson.

Activity 4: Round Robin Discussion

30%

Explain to students that they will present the evidence and analysis from their Better Government Evidence Collection Tools in a Round Robin Discussion on the following prompt:

Choose one central idea and analyze how it relates to Thoreau's idea of "a better government."

Distribute the 12.2.1 Speaking and Listening Rubric and Checklist for SL.11-12.1.a, c. Explain to students that this lesson requires students to come to discussions prepared, build on others' ideas and express their own clearly, and synthesize comments, claims, and evidence. Explain that at the end of the Round Robin Discussion, students self-assess their mastery of these skills.

• Consider reminding students that the group activity is an opportunity to apply standards SL.11-12.1.a, c by participating effectively in a collaborative discussion. Students may focus on drawing effectively on their preparation for the discussion and propelling discussions by posing and answering questions. Students were introduced to SL.11-12.1.a, c in 12.1.1 Lesson 13.

Review the 12.2.1 Speaking and Listening Rubric and Checklist with students, pausing to allow students to pose any questions they may have.

- Consider asking students to read the 12.2.1 Speaking and Listening Rubric and Checklist independently or in groups.
 - Students review the 12.2.1 Speaking and Listening Rubric and Checklist.

Instruct students to review their Better Government Evidence Gathering Tool and refer to the evidence they have collected on their tools to inform the following discussion (W.11-12.9.b).

Instruct students to arrange themselves in two concentric circles.

• Each circle should contain the same number of students, creating pairs between the two circles. Student pairs should face each other.

Explain to students that the Round Robin Discussion begins with each student in the inner circle discussing their answer to the prompt for one minute. Students in the outer circle first listen and then respond with their own answer to the prompt for one minute.





After one minute, instruct students in the outer circle to rotate one place to the right and repeat the established protocols with a new classmate.

- This Round Robin Discussion includes two rotations so that each student presents their ideas to three peers.
 - See the High Performance Response at the beginning of this lesson.

Instruct students to briefly self-assess their application of standard SL.11-12.1.a, c during the Round Robin Discussion using the 12.2.1 Speaking and Listening Rubric and Checklist.

• Students self-assess their application of SL.11-12.1.a, c using the 12.2.1 Speaking and Listening Rubric and Checklist.

Collect student self-assessments for accountability.

Lead a brief whole-class discussion of student responses.

Activity 5: 12.2.1 Lesson 15 Exit Slip and Assessment

5%

Distribute the 12.2.1 Lesson 15 Exit Slip. Instruct students to complete the Exit Slip independently.

• See the Model 12.2.1 Lesson 15 Exit Slip at the end of this lesson.

Collect student Exit Slips.

Activity 6: Closing

5%

Display and distribute the homework assignment. For homework, instruct students to complete their Better Government Evidence Gathering Tool by selecting a second central idea in "Civil Disobedience" and collecting evidence of how this idea relates to Thoreau's opinion of "a better government."

Additionally, instruct students to review and expand their notes and annotations in preparation for the 12.2.1 End-of-Unit Assessment.

• Students follow along.





Homework

Complete your Better Government Evidence Gathering Tool by selecting a second central idea in "Civil Disobedience" and collecting evidence of how this idea relates to Thoreau's opinion of "a better government."

Review and expand your notes and annotations in preparation for the 12.2.1 End-of-Unit Assessment.





Model Central Ideas Tracking Tool

Name	Class	Date	
:	:	:	

Directions: Identify the ideas that you encounter throughout the text. Trace the development of these ideas by noting how the author introduces, develops, or refines these ideas in the text. Cite textual evidence to support your work.

Text : "Civil Disobedience" by Henry David Thoreau

Part and Paragraph #	Central Ideas	Notes and Connections
Part 3, par. 17	Ethics	Thoreau distinguishes between those "who know of no purer sources of truth" than the Bible and the Constitution and those who seek a higher source of truth, and undertake a "pilgrimage toward [truth's] fountain-head," suggesting that Thoreau believes that the traditional authorities of the Bible and the Constitution are not necessarily the only sources of authority and that it is up to individuals to seek their own truth.
Part 3, par. 18	The exercise of power	Thoreau criticizes legislators because they rely too much on the exercise of power through language and rhetoric, and do not have enough practical understanding of the important problems facing the people: "[Legislators] have no genius or talent for comparatively humble questions of taxation and finance, commerce and manufacturers and agriculture." He suggests that the exercise of power through language is insufficient, because, if government were left to the "wordy wit" of legislators" who are eloquent but ineffective at resolving practical issues, "America would not long retain her rank among the nations."





Part 3, par. 19 The relationship between the individual and the state	Thoreau suggests that the basis of a "just" state is the respect of the state for the individual: democracy is part of, but not the endpoint of "a progress toward a true respect for the individual." Thoreau imagines a "still more perfect and glorious state" which would "treat the individual with respect as a neighbor; which even would not think it inconsistent with its own repose if a few were to live aloof from it, not meddling with it, nor embraced by it, who fulfilled all the duties of neighbors and fellow-men." In other words, Thoreau proposes as an ideal a state that allows the individual to flourish, and does not feel threatened when people choose not to interact with the state, provided that they do not harm those around them.
---	---





Better Government Evidence Gathering Tool

Name	Class	Date	
:	:	:	

Directions: Explain how a central idea in "Civil Disobedience" relates to Thoreau's idea of "a better government." Review your Central Ideas Tracking Tools, notes, and annotations from throughout the unit, and provide textual evidence to support your response.

Prompt: Choose one central idea and analyze how it relates to Thoreau's idea of "a better government."						
Central Idea	How does this central idea relate to Thoreau's idea of "a better government?" Provide textual evidence to support your response.					





Prompt: Choose one central idea and analyze how it relates to Thoreau's idea of "a better government."						
Central Idea How does this central idea relate to Thoreau's idea of "a better government?" Provide textual evidence to support your response.						





Model Better Government Evidence Gathering Tool

Name	Class	Date	
:	:	:	

Directions: Explain how a central idea in "Civil Disobedience" relates to Thoreau's idea of a "better government." Review your Central Ideas Tracking Tools, notes, and annotations from throughout the unit, and provide textual evidence to support your response.

Prompt: Choose one central idea and analyze how it relates to Thoreau's idea of "a better government."						
Central Idea	How does this central idea relate to Thoreau's idea of "a better government?" Provide textual evidence to support your response.					
The relationship between the individual and the state	Thoreau's "better government" (part 1, par. 3) is one in which the state has a "true respect" for the individual (part 3, par. 19). In part 3, paragraph 19, Thoreau states that the authority of the government is "just" only if it has "the sanction and consent of the governed. It can have no pure right over my person and property but what I concede to it." This means that Thoreau believes that "a better government" (part 1, par. 3) will recognize the individual as independent from and more powerful than itself, because all the power and authority of the state come from the individual. Because the state is dependent upon the individual, it must "treat[] him accordingly" and "recognize the individual as a higher and independent power" (part 3, par. 19). Therefore, the basis of the "better government" that Thoreau advocates for is a relationship between the individual and the state in which the state respects the individual.					





Ethics

In the "better government" for which Thoreau advocates (part 1, par. 3), authority does not come from the will of the majority, as it does in a democracy. Instead, it comes from the individual's belief in what is right or wrong, or the conscience of the individual. Thoreau argues that men "should be men first, and subjects afterward" (part 1, par. 4). In other words, they should act on their consciences rather than according to the law determined by the will of the majority. Thoreau develops this idea in part 2, paragraph 2 when he states that, "[a]ction from principle the perception and the performance of right—changes things and relations; it is essentially revolutionary." Thoreau's explanation of action from principle suggests that when men disagree with the actions of the state, they have a duty to act on their conscience by withdrawing their support from it. Thoreau tells the story of his own night in jail after refusing to pay his taxes in part 3, paragraphs 1-8 as an example of "action from principle" that will ultimately lead to a "peaceable revolution" (part 2, par. 9).





12.2.1 Lesson 15 Exit Slip

Name	Class	Date	
:	:	:	

Directions: Explain how the discussion confirmed or changed your ideas about the prompt.

Text: "Civil Disobedience" by Henry David Thoreau

Prompt: Choose one central idea and analyze how it relates to Thoreau's idea of "a better government."

Provide evidence of how the discussion changed or confirmed your ideas on the Better Government Evidence Collection Tool.





Model 12.2.1 Lesson 15 Exit Slip

Name	Class	Date	
:	:	:	

Directions: Explain how the discussion confirmed or changed your ideas about the prompt.

Text: "Civil Disobedience" by Henry David Thoreau

Prompt: Choose one central idea and analyze how it relates to Thoreau's idea of "a better government."

Provide evidence of how the discussion changed or confirmed your ideas on the Better Government Evidence Collection Tool.

The Round Robin Discussion supported my analysis that Thoreau's idea of "a better government" (part 1, par. 3) is one in which the individual is independent of and superior to the state, because it provided me with more supporting evidence of what recognizing and respecting the independence of the individual looks like. In part 1, paragraph 1, Thoreau states that "[t]hat government is best which governs not at all," and that "when men are prepared for [no government], that will be the kind of government which they will have." This suggests that Thoreau's idea of "a better government" is for there to be no government, or a situation in which the individual has total independence from the state because the state no longer exists. In part 1, paragraph 2, Thoreau develops this idea by arguing that "government never of itself furthered any enterprise, but by the alacrity with which it got out of its way" (part 1, par. 2), suggesting that government hinders rather than helps with the progress achieved by individuals. Thoreau's "better government" is one that grants the individual independence and power by not interfering with those whom it governs.





12.2.1	Speaking	and	Listening	Rubric
--------	----------	-----	-----------	--------

_____ /___ (Total points)





4 - Responses at this 3 - Responses at this 2 - Responses at this 1 - Responses at this Criteria Level: Level: Level: Level: Command of Demonstrate thorough Demonstrate Demonstrate partial Demonstrate a lack of Evidence and preparation for the preparation for the preparation for the preparation for the Reasoning discussion by explicitly discussion by explicitly discussion by discussion by rarely drawing on precise and inconsistently drawing drawing on relevant or drawing on relevant The extent to which sufficient evidence and sufficient evidence on relevant or sufficient evidence the speaker from texts and other from texts and other sufficient evidence from texts or other demonstrates research on the topic or research on the topic or from texts and other research on the topic or preparation for the issue to stimulate a issue to stimulate a research on the topic or issue, rarely stimulating discussion by thoughtful, wellthoughtful, wellissue, occasionally a thoughtful or wellexplicitly drawing on reasoned exchange of reasoned exchange of stimulating a reasoned exchange of evidence from texts ideas. (SL.11-12.1.a) ideas. (SL.11-12.1.a) thoughtful, wellideas. (SL.11-12.1.a) and other research reasoned exchange of on the topic or issue Skillfully propel Propel conversations by Ineffectively propel ideas. (SL.11-12.1.a) to stimulate a conversations by rarely conversations by posing and responding thoughtful, wellconsistently posing and to questions that probe Somewhat effectively posing or responding to reasoned exchange responding to questions reasoning and propel conversations by questions that probe of ideas. that probe reasoning evidence; ensure a inconsistently posing reasoning and and evidence; actively hearing for a full range and responding to evidence; rarely ensure CCSS.ELAa hearing for a full ensure a hearing for a of positions on a topic questions that probe Literacy.SL.11-12.1 full range of positions or issue; clarify, verify, reasoning and range of positions on a on a topic or issue; or challenge ideas and evidence; occasionally topic or issue; rarely Initiate and consistently clarify, conclusions; and ensure a hearing for a clarify, verify, or participate verify, or challenge promote divergent and full range of positions challenge ideas and effectively in a range ideas and conclusions; creative perspectives. on a topic or issue; conclusions; and of collaborative and actively promote (SL.11-12.1.c) inconsistently clarify, prevent divergent and discussions (one-ondivergent and creative verify, or challenge creative perspectives. one, in groups, and perspectives. (SL. ideas and conclusions; (SL.11-12.1.c) teacher-led) with and occasionally diverse partners on 11-12.1.c) promote divergent and grades 11-12 topics, creative perspectives. texts, and issues, (SL.11-12.1.c) building on others' ideas and expressing their own clearly and persuasively. CCSS.ELA-Literacy.SL. 11-12.1.a Come to discussions prepared, having read and researched material under study; explicitly draw on that preparation by referring to evidence from texts and other research on the topic or issue to stimulate a thoughtful, wellreasoned exchange of ideas. The extent to which the speaker propels File: 12.2.1 Lesson 15 Date: 2/13/15 Classroom Use: Starting 2/2015 © 2015 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a

Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License





- A response that is a personal response and makes little or no reference to the task or text can be scored no higher than a 1.
- A response that is totally copied from the text with no original writing must be given a 0.
- A response that is totally unrelated to the task, illegible, incoherent, blank, or unrecognizable as English must be scored as
 a 0.





12.2.1 Speaking and Listening Checklist

Assessed Standards:

	Does my response	~
Command of Evidence and Reasoning	Explicitly draw on evidence from texts and other research on the topic or issue? (SL.11-12.1.a)	
	Pose and respond to questions that probe reasoning and evidence? (SL.11-12.1.c)	
	Ensure a hearing for a full range of positions on a topic or issue? (SL.11-12.1.c)	
	Clarify, verify, or challenge ideas and conclusions? (SL.11-12.1.c)	
	Promote divergent and creative perspectives? (SL. 11-12.1.c)	



