

# 12.2.1 Lesson 1

## Introduction

In this first lesson of the unit and module, students begin their analysis of Benazir Bhutto's 2007 speech, "Ideas Live On." Bhutto's speech serves as an introduction to Module 12.2, in which students explore central ideas including the exercise of power and the relationship between the individual and the state. After Bhutto's speech, students analyze Henry David Thoreau's "Civil Disobedience" and William Shakespeare's *Julius Caesar*. These three texts offer students the opportunity to consider the issue of power in different time periods and from the diverse perspectives of these authors. Module 12.2 reinforces and refines many of the foundational skills, practices, and routines introduced in Module 12.1. In the context of increasingly complex texts and ideas, students focus on reading closely, annotating text, and engaging in evidence-based writing and discussion.

This first lesson begins with a masterful reading of the full text of Bhutto's speech. Students then analyze the first 10 paragraphs of the speech (from "I recall that President John F. Kennedy once said" to "the past is giving way to the speed of the future"). In this passage, Bhutto presents her view of the issues confronting modern society, offering a historical and social context for the political and economic landscape of Pakistan. Student learning is assessed via a Quick Write at the end of the lesson: How does Bhutto use rhetoric to establish her point of view in the opening of her speech?

For homework, students conduct a brief search into Bhutto and Pakistan and choose three significant facts to share with the class that deepen their understanding of Bhutto's speech. Also, students continue reading their Accountable Independent Reading (AIR) text through the lens of a focus standard of their choice and prepare for a 3-5 minute discussion of their text based on that standard.

File: 12.2.1 Lesson 1 Date: 2/13/2015 Classroom Use: Starting 2/2015

© 2015 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a

Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

## Standards

Assessed Standard(s)	
RI.11-12.6	Determine an author's point of view or purpose in a text in which the rhetoric is particularly effective, analyzing how style and content contribute to the power, persuasiveness, or beauty of the text.
Addressed Standard(s)	
W.11-12.9.b	<p>Draw evidence from literary or informational texts to support analysis, reflection, and research.</p> <p>b. Apply <i>grades 11-12 Reading standards</i> to literary nonfiction (e.g., "Delineate and evaluate the reasoning in seminal U.S. texts, including the application of constitutional principles and use of legal reasoning [e.g., in U.S. Supreme Court Case majority opinions and dissents] and the premises, purposes, and arguments in works of public advocacy [e.g., <i>The Federalist</i>, presidential addresses]").</p>

## Assessment

File: 12.2.1 Lesson 1 Date: 2/13/2015 Classroom Use: Starting 2/2015

© 2015 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a

Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

**Assessment(s)**

Student learning is assessed via a Quick Write at the end of the lesson. Students respond to the following prompt, citing textual evidence to support analysis and inferences drawn from the text.

- How does Bhutto use rhetoric to establish her point of view in the opening of her speech?
- Throughout this unit, Quick Writes will be assessed using the Short Response Rubric.

**High Performance Response(s)**

A High Performance Response should:

- Identify Bhutto's point of view (e.g., Bhutto believes that the government should invest in individuals and create wealth by developing educated citizens; Bhutto believes the government should not exercise its power through its military strength).
- Explain how Bhutto uses rhetoric to establish her point of view (e.g., Bhutto makes appeals to ethos and uses a rhetorical question to support her point of view that the government should exercise its power through the promotion of ideas and education rather than military strength. By quoting Kennedy and Churchill, Bhutto makes an appeal to ethos, identifying herself with respected world leaders to suggest that the democratic values that these leaders symbolize should shape her audience's response to the problems confronting modern society. In addition to an appeal to ethos, Bhutto uses a rhetorical question to advance her point of view. After stating in paragraph 2 that nations now rely on "the strength of the intellect," Bhutto asks in paragraph 7, "Can we cope if we continue to stress the values of the past in seeking greatness while ignoring the demands of a new century?" Bhutto has already established that the "values of the past" relied on "the might of armies" and that "the demands of a new century" will rely on "the strength of the intellect," so it is clear that Bhutto does not expect an answer to this question (par. 2). Instead, Bhutto's rhetorical question prompts her audience to consider her view that nations should demonstrate their power by developing educated citizens rather than powerful armies.).

## Vocabulary

**Vocabulary to provide directly (will not include extended instruction)**

- tyranny (n.) - oppressive power exerted by government
- Information Revolution (n.) - explosion of availability of information due to the use of computers, the Internet, and other electronic devices
- transcends (v.) - rises above or goes beyond the limits of
- crest (n.) - the highest point or level
- penicillin (n.) - medicine that is used to kill harmful bacteria
- civic (adj.) - relating to citizenship

**Vocabulary to teach (may include direct word work and/or questions)**

- None.

**Additional vocabulary to support English Language Learners (to provide directly)**

- dawned (v.) - started or began
- seeds (n.) - the beginning of something which continues to develop or grow
- planted (v.) - established
- investment (n.) - act of spending on something that is valuable or expected to be useful or helpful
- citizen (n.) - person who legally belongs to a country and has the rights and protection of that country
- stress (v.) - give special attention to

## Lesson Agenda/Overview

File: 12.2.1 Lesson 1 Date: 2/13/2015 Classroom Use: Starting 2/2015

© 2015 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a

Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

Student-Facing Agenda	% of Lesson
<b>Standards &amp; Text:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Standards: RI.11-12.6, W.11-12.9.b</li> <li>Text: “Ideas Live On” by Benazir Bhutto, paragraphs 1-10 (<a href="http://benazir.bhutto.org/">http://benazir.bhutto.org/</a>)</li> </ul>	
<b>Learning Sequence:</b> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Introduction of Module and Lesson Agenda</li> <li>2. Masterful Reading</li> <li>3. Reading and Discussion</li> <li>4. Quick Write</li> <li>5. Closing</li> </ol>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. 10%</li> <li>2. 15%</li> <li>3. 50%</li> <li>4. 15%</li> <li>5. 10%</li> </ol>

## Materials

- Copies of “Ideas Live On” for each student
- Copies of the Short Response Rubric and Checklist for each student (optional)
- Consider numbering the paragraphs of “Ideas Live On” before the lesson.
- To locate “Ideas Live on” from the homepage (<http://benazir.bhutto.org/>), go to “Speeches” in the navigation panel on the left side of the page, and then click the “Ideas Live On” link.

File: 12.2.1 Lesson 1 Date: 2/13/2015 Classroom Use: Starting 2/2015

© 2015 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a

Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

## Learning Sequence

How to Use the Learning Sequence	
Symbol	Type of Text & Interpretation of the Symbol
10%	Percentage indicates the percentage of lesson time each activity should take.
no symbol	Plain text indicates teacher action.
	<b>Bold text indicates questions for the teacher to ask students.</b>
	<i>Italicized text indicates a vocabulary word.</i>
►	Indicates student action(s).
☞	Indicates possible student response(s) to teacher questions.
ⓘ	Indicates instructional notes for the teacher.

### Activity 1: Introduction of Module and Lesson Agenda

10%

Begin by reviewing the goals for Module 12.2 and 12.2.1. Explain that in this module, students analyze two nonfiction texts and a drama as they reinforce the close reading skills, the use of evidence to support analysis, and the writing and discussion skills they developed in previous modules. In this first unit of Module 12.2, students consider how authors construct arguments and use rhetoric to persuade their audiences. In this unit, students also examine how authors from different geographic and historical contexts treat similar central ideas as they read a speech by Benazir Bhutto and an essay by Henry David Thoreau.

- Students listen.
- Consider reminding students that *rhetoric* refers to the specific techniques that writers or speakers use to create meaning in a text, enhance a text or a speech, and, often, persuade readers or listeners. Students were introduced to *rhetoric* in 12.1.1 Lesson 5.

Review the agenda and the assessed standard for this lesson: RI.11-12.6. In this lesson, students listen to a masterful reading of Benazir Bhutto's 2007 speech, "Ideas Live On." Students then work in groups or pairs to read and discuss paragraphs 1-10 of the speech, noting Bhutto's beliefs about effective government and how she begins to establish her point of view. Students complete a brief writing assignment to close the lesson.

- Students look at the agenda.

File: 12.2.1 Lesson 1 Date: 2/13/2015 Classroom Use: Starting 2/2015

© 2015 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a

Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

## Activity 2: Masterful Reading

15%

Have students listen to a masterful reading of “Ideas Live On” by Benazir Bhutto. Ask students to focus on Bhutto’s ideas about effective government.

- Students follow along, reading silently.
- **Differentiation Consideration:** Consider posting or projecting the following guiding question to support students in their reading throughout this lesson:

According to Bhutto, what makes a government effective?

- Consider leading a whole-class discussion to ensure comprehension of the masterful reading.

## Activity 3: Reading and Discussion

50%

Instruct students to form pairs. Post or project each set of questions below for students to discuss. Instruct students to continue to annotate the text as they read and discuss (W.11-12.9.b).

Instruct student pairs to read paragraphs 1-3 of “Ideas Live On” (from “I recall that President John F. Kennedy once said” to “our society and the future of our people”) and answer the following questions before sharing out with the class.

Provide students with the definition of *tyranny*.

- Students may be familiar with this word. Consider asking students to volunteer a definition before providing it to the group.
  - Students write the definition of *tyranny* on their copies of the text or in a vocabulary journal.
- **Differentiation Consideration:** Consider providing students with the definitions of *dawned*, *seeds*, *planted*, and *investment*.
  - Students write the definitions of *dawned*, *seeds*, *planted*, and *investment* on their copies of the text or in a vocabulary journal.

What point of view does Bhutto establish in paragraphs 1-3?

- Student responses may include:

- Bhutto establishes the point of view that democracy is an enduring ideal. She says, “The idea of democracy has survived tyranny over centuries since it was first practiced in ancient Greece” (par. 1).
- Bhutto establishes the point of view that a nation’s success depends on the power of the intellect and the success of individuals rather than the strength of a nation’s military power. She states that in the 21st century, “Power began to shift from the might of armies to the strength of the intellect” and that “military strength ... was no longer critical in defining the greatness of a nation” (par. 2). Bhutto also states, “In our times an individual’s education, intelligence and wisdom creates cumulatively the wealth of a nation” and “the investment in an individual ... will determine the quality of our society” (par. 3).
- Consider reminding students of their work with *point of view* in 12.1.1 Lesson 5. If necessary, provide students with the following definition: *point of view* means “an author’s opinion, attitude, or judgment.”

**What is the impact of Bhutto’s use of quotes in the first two paragraphs on the meaning of her speech?**

- Student responses should include:
  - Bhutto quotes U.S. President John F. Kennedy’s statement, “Men die, nations may rise and fall, but an idea lives on” (par. 1). This quote establishes her point of view that democracy is a form of government that continues to be important.
  - Bhutto quotes British Prime Minister Winston Churchill, who claims, “The empires of the future, will be the empires of the mind” (par. 2). Churchill’s quote emphasizes Bhutto’s point of view that in the future, nations will rely on intellectual strength rather than military strength.
  - Using the words of Kennedy and Churchill allows Bhutto to demonstrate that she shares the values of respected leaders of Western democracy. The quotes remind the audience that the values these leaders express are important and should shape the audience’s response to current problems.
- Consider explaining to students that Bhutto’s use of quotes in paragraphs 1 and 2 are examples of *appeals to ethos*. Inform students that an *appeal to ethos* is a rhetorical device that may appeal to a listener’s or reader’s conscience or sense of what is right or ethical.
- Consider leading a brief discussion of the roles of Winston Churchill and John F. Kennedy as leaders of Western democracies in the 20th century.

**Lead a brief whole-class discussion of student responses.**

File: 12.2.1 Lesson 1 Date: 2/13/2015 Classroom Use: Starting 2/2015

© 2015 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a

Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License



Instruct student pairs to read paragraphs 4-10 (from “The Information Revolution has created, ‘the death of distance’” to “the past is giving way to the speed of the future”), underline the ideas that Bhutto uses to support her point of view, and answer the following questions before sharing out with the class.

Provide students with the definitions of *Information Revolution*, *transcends*, *crest*, *penicillin*, and *civic*.

- Students may be familiar with some of these words. Consider asking students to volunteer definitions before providing them to the group.
  - Students write the definitions of *Information Revolution*, *transcends*, *crest*, *penicillin*, and *civic* on their copies of the text or in a vocabulary journal.
- **Differentiation Consideration:** Consider providing students with the definitions of *citizen* and *stress*.
  - Students write the definitions of *citizen* and *stress* on their copies of the text or in a vocabulary journal.

**How do the ideas that you have underlined support Bhutto’s point of view?**

- Student responses may include:
  - “Communication costs are down helping to create a global community.” (par. 4)
    - This statement suggests that Bhutto believes citizens will need to be able to use technology in order to participate in the new community, so the government should invest in the education of the individual in order to improve “the quality of our society and the future of our people” (par. 3).
  - “[R]ide the crest of the new order by learning global values.” (par. 5)
    - This phrase suggests that Bhutto believes acquiring new ideas will be important to future success, so the government will have to invest in the education of the individual in order to improve “the quality of our society and the future of our people” (par. 3).
  - “Scientists today are discovering the secrets of the human gene.” (par. 6)
    - This statement suggests that Bhutto believes that advances in science and medicine are making important contributions to modern healthcare and that the government should invest in health programs to improve “the quality of our society and the future of our people” (par. 3).

File: 12.2.1 Lesson 1 Date: 2/13/2015 Classroom Use: Starting 2/2015

© 2015 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a

Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

- “As life span increases, so do the demands on our social services and civic structure.”  
(par. 7)
  - This statement demonstrates that Bhutto believes the government must invest in programs that support people as they age in order to improve “the quality of our society and the future of our people” (par. 3).

**How does Bhutto’s question in paragraph 7 develop the point of view Bhutto establishes in paragraphs 1-3?**

- In paragraphs 1-3, Bhutto establishes her point of view that the government must invest in individuals if a nation is to compete in the new world. The question prompts the audience to think about the need for the government to change its strategies by investing in individuals, including their health and education.

Explain to students that the question Bhutto poses is an example of a *rhetorical question*, which is a “question that a speaker or writer asks but does not necessarily expect the reader or listener to answer directly.” Rhetorical questions are meant to cause the reader or listener to think.

**How does Bhutto further develop her point of view when she states, “The reflection and thought of the past is giving way to the speed of the future” (par. 10)?**

- Bhutto’s statement reminds her listeners that they are living through a period of rapid change. Bhutto has already suggested that democracy and investment in the individual will be important elements of a successful society in the future; this statement further develops her point of view by demonstrating how quickly the future is approaching and adds urgency to her speech.

Lead a brief whole-class discussion of student responses.

## Activity 4: Quick Write

15%

Instruct students to respond briefly in writing to the following prompt:

**How does Bhutto use rhetoric to establish her point of view in the opening of her speech?**

Instruct students to look at their annotations to find evidence. Ask students to use this lesson’s vocabulary wherever possible in their written responses.

- Students listen and read the Quick Write prompt.
- Display the prompt for students to see, or provide the prompt in hard copy.

File: 12.2.1 Lesson 1 Date: 2/13/2015 Classroom Use: Starting 2/2015

© 2015 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a

Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

Transition to the independent Quick Write.

- Students independently answer the prompt using evidence from the text.
- See the High Performance Response at the beginning of this lesson.
- Consider using the Short Response Rubric to assess students' writing. Students may use the Short Response Rubric and Checklist to guide their written responses.

## Activity 5: Closing

**10%**

Display and distribute the homework assignment. For homework, instruct students to conduct a brief search into Benazir Bhutto and Pakistan and select three significant facts to share with the class that deepen their understanding of Bhutto's speech. Also for homework, students should continue to read their AIR texts through the lens of a focus standard of their choice and prepare for a 3-5 minute discussion of their texts based on that standard.

- Students follow along.

## Homework

Conduct a brief search into Benazir Bhutto and Pakistan and select three significant facts that deepen your understanding of Bhutto's speech to share with the class.

Also, continue reading your Accountable Independent Reading text through the lens of a focus standard of your choice and prepare for a 3-5 minute discussion of your text based on that standard.

## Short Response Rubric

Assessed Standard(s): \_\_\_\_\_

	2-Point Response	1-Point Response	0-Point Response
<b>Inference s/ Claims</b>	Includes valid inferences or claims from the text. Fully and directly responds to the prompt.	Includes inferences or claims that are loosely based on the text. Responds partially to the prompt or does not address all elements of the prompt.	Does not address any of the requirements of the prompt or is totally inaccurate.
<b>Analysis</b>	Includes evidence of reflection and analysis of the text.	A mostly literal recounting of events or details from the text(s).	The response is blank.
<b>Evidence</b>	Includes relevant and sufficient textual evidence to develop response according to the requirements of the Quick Write.	Includes some relevant facts, definitions, concrete details, or other information from the text(s) to develop an analysis of the text according to the requirements of the Quick Write.	The response includes no evidence from the text.
<b>Conventions</b>	Uses complete sentences where errors do not impact readability.	Includes incomplete sentences or bullets.	The response is unintelligible or indecipherable.

## Short Response Checklist

Assessed Standard(s): \_\_\_\_\_

Does my writing...	Did I...	✓
Include valid inferences and/or claims from the text(s)?	Closely read the prompt and address the whole prompt in my response?	
	Clearly state a text-based claim I want the reader to consider?	
	Confirm that my claim is directly supported by what I read in the text?	
Develop an analysis of the text(s)?	Consider the author's choices, the impact of word choices, the text's central ideas, etc.?	
Include evidence from the text(s)?	Directly quote or paraphrase evidence from the text?	
	Arrange my evidence in an order that makes sense and supports my claim?	
	Reflect on the text to ensure the evidence I used is the best evidence to support my claim?	
Use complete sentences, correct punctuation, and spelling?	Reread my writing to ensure it means exactly what I want it to mean?	
	Review my writing for correct grammar, spelling, and punctuation?	