

11.3.1 Lesson 4

Introduction

In this lesson, students continue to read, “Hope, Despair and Memory” by Elie Wiesel from “Remembering is a noble and necessary act” to “then let it be inhabited by their deaths” (par. 12-17). In this portion of the Nobel Lecture, Wiesel continues to develop the central idea of memory, first through an illustration of the Jewish tradition’s historical perspective on war and the outcome of peace through wisdom and remembering. He continues to develop the central idea of memory by presenting the paradox of the importance of remembering events with the human capacity to forget.

Students continue to build their understanding of central ideas in this text, and how these ideas build on one another in the text. Students read and discuss the text in pairs and continue to surface issues in the text for the purposes of research. Student learning is assessed via a Quick Write at the end of the lesson: How do two or more central ideas build on one another and interact over the course of the text? Finally, students learn how to generate inquiry questions from research issues, a fundamental starting point in the research process in this module.

For homework, students begin informally researching to explore, build background knowledge, and generate interest around potential topics. Students will use the inquiry questions generated in class to guide them as they explore research topics.

Standards

Assessed Standard(s)	
RI.11-12.2	Determine two or more central ideas of a text and analyze their development over the course of the text, including how they interact and build on one another to provide a complex analysis; provide an objective summary of the text.
Addressed Standard(s)	
RI.11-12.1.a	Cite strong and thorough textual evidence to support analysis of what the text says explicitly as well as inferences drawn from the text, including determining where the text leaves matters uncertain. a. Develop factual, interpretive, and evaluative questions for further exploration of the topic(s).
W.11-12.9.b	Draw evidence from literary or informational texts to support analysis, reflection, and research. b. Apply <i>grades 11-12 Reading standards</i> to literary nonfiction (e.g., “Delineate and evaluate the reasoning in seminal U.S. texts, including the application of constitutional principles and use of legal reasoning [e.g., in U.S. Supreme Court Case majority opinions and dissents] and the premises, purposes, and arguments in works of public advocacy [e.g., <i>The Federalist</i> , presidential addresses]”).

Assessment

File: 11.3.1 Lesson 4 Date: 9/12/14 Classroom Use: Starting 9/2014

© 2014 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a

Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

Assessment(s)

Student learning is assessed via a Quick Write. Students respond to the following prompt, citing textual evidence to support analysis and inferences drawn from the text.

- How do two or more central ideas build on one another and interact over the course of the text?

High Performance Response(s)

A High Performance Response should:

- Identify two or more central ideas developed in the text (e.g., memory, hope, solidarity, suffering).
- Demonstrate how these ideas build on each other and interact using evidence from paragraphs 1-17 (e.g., Wiesel states that “it is memory that will save humanity” (par. 3) and develops this idea of memory by providing examples from the Jewish tradition such as Yom Hazikaron, when “man appeals to God to remember” (par. 12) so that man will not “repeat past disasters, past wars” (par. 12); the ideas of memory and solidarity build on each other as Wiesel recounts the stories of friendship and hope during the Holocaust, such as the “sick beggar” who “began to sing as an offering to his companions” (par. 16) as well as the girl who comforted her grandmother even during extreme suffering; Wiesel builds upon the ideas of solidarity and memory when he states that “Each one of us felt compelled to bear witness” (par. 17); the act of sharing the stories in paragraph 16 is a way of showing and maintaining solidarity through remembrance.).

Vocabulary

Vocabulary to provide directly (will not include extended instruction)

- incumbent (adj.) - morally binding or necessary; required to be done
- abhorrence (n.) - feeling of extreme objection or dislike
- paucity (n.) - smallness of quantity
- iniquity (n.) - well-known and extreme injustice or wickedness
- debases (v.) - lowers in rank, dignity, or significance
- reconcile (v.) - make (two apparently conflicting things) capable of existing together or consistent with each other
- bear witness (v.) - provide evidence for
- testament (n.) - proof or evidence that something exists or is true; a promise or agreement between God and the human race; an act by which a person determines the disposition of his or her property after death

Vocabulary to teach (may include direct word work and/or questions)

- None.

Additional vocabulary to support English Language Learners (to provide directly)

- provokes (v.) - causes (a person or animal) to become angry, violent, etc.
- contradiction (n.) - a difference or disagreement between two things, which means that both cannot be true
- diminishes (v.) - makes or causes to seem smaller, less, less important, etc.
- compelled (v.) - forced or driven, especially to a course of action
- civilized (adj.) - marked by well-organized laws and rules about how people behave with each other

Lesson Agenda/Overview

File: 11.3.1 Lesson 4 Date: 9/12/14 Classroom Use: Starting 9/2014

© 2014 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a

Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

Student-Facing Agenda	% of Lesson
<p>Standards & Text:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Standards: RI.11-12.2, RI.11-12.1.a, W.11-12.9.b Text: “Hope, Despair and Memory” by Elie Wiesel, paragraphs 12-17 <p>Learning Sequence:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Introduction of Lesson Agenda 2. Homework Accountability 3. Reading and Discussion 4. Quick Write 5. Posing Inquiry Questions 6. Closing 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. 5% 2. 10% 3. 35% 4. 20% 5. 25% 6. 5%

Materials

- Student copies of the 11.3 Common Core Learning Standards Tool (refer to 11.3.1 Lesson 2)
- Student copies of the Surfacing Issues Tool (refer to 11.3.1 Lesson 2)
- Student copies of the Short Response Rubric and Checklist (refer to 11.3.1 Lesson 1)
- Copies of the Posing Inquiry Questions Handout for each student
- **Differentiation Consideration:** Student copies of the Central Ideas Tracking Tool (refer to 11.3.1 Lesson 1)

File: 11.3.1 Lesson 4 Date: 9/12/14 Classroom Use: Starting 9/2014

© 2014 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

Learning Sequence

How to Use the Learning Sequence	
Symbol	Type of Text & Interpretation of the Symbol
10%	Percentage indicates the percentage of lesson time each activity should take.
no symbol	Plain text indicates teacher action.
	Bold text indicates questions for the teacher to ask students.
	<i>Italicized text indicates a vocabulary word.</i>
►	Indicates student action(s).
☞	Indicates possible student response(s) to teacher questions.
❗	Indicates instructional notes for the teacher.

Activity 1: Introduction of Lesson Agenda

5%

Begin by reviewing the agenda and the assessed standard for this lesson: RI.11-12.2. In this lesson, students explore how central ideas continue to develop and interact in paragraphs 12-17. Through evidence-based discussion, students explore central ideas and continue to surface issues in the text that have potential for research. Students complete a Quick Write examining how two or more central ideas build on one another and interact over the course of the text so far. Finally, students learn how to pose inquiry questions from the surfaced issues for the purpose of research.

- Students look at the agenda.

Instruct students to take out their copies of the 11.3 Common Core Learning Standards Tool. Inform students that in this lesson they begin to work with a new substandard: RI.11-12.1.a. This standard is part of the 11.3.3 Rubric and Checklist. Instruct students to individually read this standard on their tools and assess their familiarity with and mastery of it.

- Students read and assess their familiarity with substandard: RI.11-12.1.a.

Instruct students to talk in pairs about what they think this standard means. Lead a brief discussion about the standard.

File: 11.3.1 Lesson 4 Date: 9/12/14 Classroom Use: Starting 9/2014

© 2014 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

- Student responses should include:
 - Develop a range of questions.
 - Further explore the topics that are surfaced in the text.
- In this lesson students begin to generate inquiry questions based on topics/issues surfaced in the text.

Activity 2: Homework Accountability

10%

Instruct students to take out their text and talk in pairs about the homework from the previous lesson. (Preview “Hope, Despair and Memory,” paragraphs 12-17, (from “Remembering is a noble and necessary act” to “then let it be inhabited by their deaths”) and annotate for central ideas.) Instruct student pairs to discuss, based on their annotation, where they identified central ideas in the text.

- Students briefly discuss their annotations in pairs.
- Student annotations may include:
 - CI beside the phrase “Remembering is a noble and necessary act” (par. 12)
 - CI beside the phrase “man appeals to God to remember: our salvation depends on it” (par. 12)
 - CI beside the phrase, “War dehumanizes, war diminishes, war debases all those who wage it” (par. 13)
 - CI beside “Perhaps, because wise men remember best” (par. 13)
 - CI beside the phrase “Indeed if memory helps us survive, forgetting allows us to go on living” (par. 14)
 - CI beside “Only God and God alone can and must remember everything” (par. 14)
 - CI beside the phrase “How are we to reconcile our supreme duty towards memory with the need to forget that is essential to life?” (par. 15)
 - CI beside “The survivors wanted to communicate everything to the living” (par. 15)

Activity 3: Reading and Discussion

35%

Instruct students to form pairs. Post or project each set of questions below for students to discuss.

- If necessary to support comprehension and fluency, consider using a masterful reading of the focus excerpt for the lesson.

Instruct students to revise or add to their annotation as they analyze the text. Remind students to record topics/issues for research on their Surfacing Issues Tool as they read.

- This focused annotation supports students' engagement with W.11-12.9.b, which addresses the use of textual evidence in writing.
- For potential student issues surfaced see the Model Surfacing Issues Tool at the end of this lesson.
- **Differentiation Consideration:** Instruct students to track central ideas in paragraphs 12-17 using the Central Ideas Tracking Tool.

Instruct student pairs to reread paragraphs 12-13 (from “Remembering is a noble and necessary action” to “who will bring about peace. Perhaps, because wise men remember best”) and answer the following questions before sharing out with the class.

Provide students with the following definitions: *incumbent* means “morally binding or necessary; required to be done,” *abhorrence* means “feeling of extreme objection or dislike,” *paucity* means “smallness of quantity,” *iniquity* means “well-known and extreme injustice or wickedness,” *debases* means “lowers in rank, dignity, or significance.”

- Students write the definitions of *incumbent*, *abhorrence*, *paucity*, *iniquity*, and *debases* on their copy of the text or in a vocabulary journal.
- **Differentiation Consideration:** Consider providing students with the following definitions: *provokes* means “causes (a person or animal) to become angry, violent, etc.,” *contradiction* means “a difference or disagreement between two things, which means that both cannot be true,” *diminishes* means “makes or causes to seem smaller, less, less important, etc.”
 - Students write the definitions of *provokes*, *contradiction*, and *diminishes* on their copy of the text or in a vocabulary journal.
- **Differentiation Consideration:** Consider posting the following guiding question to support students during this rereading:

How does Wiesel describe memory and forgetting in this portion of text?

File: 11.3.1 Lesson 4 Date: 9/12/14 Classroom Use: Starting 9/2014

© 2014 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

- **Differentiation Consideration:** Consider providing students some brief background knowledge on the Bible, the Jewish Tradition, and some of the holy texts of the Jewish religion.

How does Wiesel support his claim that “[r]emembering is a necessary and noble act” (par. 12)?

- Wiesel supports this claim by saying that the need for humanity to remember has been around since “the very dawn of history” (par. 12). Wiesel also references writings in the Bible, “[n]o commandment figures so frequently” (par. 12) and Jewish traditions such as “*Yom Hazikaron*” (par. 12), a day dedicated to the act of memory. This tradition calls for everyone to remember the good things as well as the “evil we have suffered” (par. 12).
- Consider reminding students of their work with argument terms such as claims and evidence in Module 11.2.
- **Differentiation Consideration:** Consider asking the following question to scaffold student understanding of the previous question:

Why is the call to memory so important in the Bible and during *Yom Hazikaron*?

- Wiesel writes that “our salvation depends” on memory because if God “refuses” to remember our suffering, we will “repeat past disasters, past wars” (par. 12).

Why might the “rejection of memory” be considered a “divine curse” (par. 12)?

- If God rejects memory, man is doomed to “repeat past disasters, past wars” (par. 12); this becomes a curse because man will continue to kill and destroy and never achieve peace, and “all will be lost” (par. 12).
- **Differentiation Consideration:** Consider asking the following question to scaffold student understanding of the previous question:

What happens if God does not remember our suffering?

- If God forgets our suffering we will “repeat past disasters, past wars” (par. 12).

What is the perspective of the Jewish tradition on war? Explain how Wiesel uses historical figures to support this perspective.

- The Jewish tradition has an “abhorrence of war” (par. 13), which is demonstrated by the lack of warriors or celebration of war in important texts such as the Talmud. Wiesel supports this perspective by referencing some Jewish historical figures who

were not celebrated because of their acts of war, such as David who “is not permitted to build the Temple,” which is “God’s dwelling place” (par. 13).

- **Differentiation Consideration:** Consider asking the following questions to scaffold student understanding of the previous question:

Why was David “not permitted to build the Temple” (par. 13)?

- David was not allowed to build the Temple because he was a “great warrior and conqueror” (par. 13).

Why was David’s son Solomon allowed to build the Temple?

- Solomon was “a man of peace” (par. 13) and because the Jewish tradition does not celebrate war, he was allowed to build the Temple.

How will wise men “bring about peace” (par. 13)?

- Wiesel says that the “wise men remember best” (par. 13), and it is the act of remembering that will allow man to avoid repeating the same mistakes, “past disasters, past wars” (par. 12).

Lead a brief whole-class discussion of student responses.

Instruct student pairs to reread paragraph 14 (from “And yet it is surely human to forget” to “God alone can and must remember everything”) and answer the following questions before sharing out with the class.

How does Wiesel support the claim that “forgetting allows us to go on living” (par. 14)?

- Student responses may include:
 - Wiesel provides evidence from the Talmud, which states that, without our ability to forget information, we would not be able to learn anything new. Our ability to learn depends on “the ability to forget” (par. 14); otherwise our brains would not be able to store new knowledge.
 - Wiesel supports this claim by stating that if people were unable to forget, the “paralyzing fear of death” (par. 14) would prevent us from being able to function.
 - Wiesel supports this claim by stating that our whole lives would be lived out in fear if we could not forget anything, and “man would live in a permanent paralyzing fear of death” (par. 14).

- Consider drawing students' attention to Wiesel's use of evidence and reasoning in paragraph 14, in preparation for their work with argument writing later in this module. Consider reminding students of their work in Module 11.2 with argument terms such as *reasoning to support claims*. If necessary, remind students that *reasoning* means "The logical relationships among ideas, including relationships among claims and relationships across evidence."
- Differentiation Consideration:** If students struggle, consider posing the following scaffolding question:

What would mankind want to forget?

- Wiesel writes "forgetting allows us to go on living" (par. 14). If we could not forget we would "live in permanent, paralyzing fear of death" (par. 14).

How does Wiesel's comparison of God and man develop the idea of memory in paragraphs 12-14?

- Wiesel's comparison of God and man develops the idea of the importance of memory. Wiesel says, "man appeals to God to remember" (par. 12) because if God wishes to remember, "all will be well" (par. 12). Wiesel goes on to state that it is "human to forget" (par. 14), and contrasts humanity's "need to forget that is essential to life" (par. 15) with God's ability to "remember everything" (par. 14), which is not something man is capable of doing.

Lead a brief whole-class discussion of student responses.

Instruct student pairs to reread paragraphs 15-17 (from "How are we to reconcile our supreme duty towards memory" to "then let it be inhabited by their deaths") and answer the following questions before sharing out with the class.

Provide students with the following definitions: *reconcile* means "to make (two apparently conflicting things) capable of existing together or consistent with each other," *bear witness* means "provide evidence for," *testament* means "proof or evidence that something exists or is true; a promise or agreement between God and the human race; an act by which a person determines the disposition of his or her property after death."

- Students write the definitions of *reconcile*, *bear witness*, and *testament* on their copy of the text or in a vocabulary journal.
- Differentiation Consideration:** Consider providing students with the following definitions: *compelled* means "forced or driven, especially to a course of action;" and *civilized* means

File: 11.3.1 Lesson 4 Date: 9/12/14 Classroom Use: Starting 9/2014

© 2014 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

“marked by well-organized laws and rules about how people behave with each other.” To support student understanding, consider providing this definition together with its opposite, *uncivilized*, which means “showing no concern for the well-being of people or for the proper way to behave toward people.”

- Students record the definitions of *compelled* and *civilized* on their copy of the text or in a vocabulary journal.

What is the paradox the survivors had to confront?

- Wiesel presents the challenge to reconcile the “duty towards memory with the need to forget” (par. 15). Wiesel describes the conflict between the need to remember in order to avoid the mistakes of the past, and the need to forget in order to avoid the pain of the past.

How do the stories and encounters Wiesel describes in paragraph 16 develop a central idea in this portion of text?

- The stories and encounters Wiesel shares in these paragraphs are specific and deeply moving, and demonstrate the “supreme duty towards memory” (par. 15) that the survivors are trying to uphold. The stories develop the importance of memory by giving accounts not just of what happened but how the victims and survivors reacted to their circumstances. The child who was able to offer comfort to her grandmother who “went to her death without fear, without regret” (par. 16) is an inspiring story of the hope that was present even in the face of such deplorable circumstances. Even the weak and sick beggar offered friendship when he “began to sing as an offering to his companions” (par. 16).
- **Differentiation Consideration:** If students struggle with this question consider posing the following question to support understanding:

What did the survivors want to communicate to the living?

- Student responses may include:
 - The “victim’s solitude and sorrow” (par. 15)
 - The “tears of the mother driven to madness” (par. 15)
 - The “prayers of the doomed” (par. 15)
 - The story of the child who asked, “can I cry now?” (par. 16)
 - The story of the beggar who sang as “an offering to his companions” (par. 16)

- They wanted to communicate the story of the girl who “went to her death without fear, without regret” (par. 16)

How do the multiple meanings of the word *testament* impact Wiesel’s phrase “the testament of the dead” (par. 17)?

- The multiple definitions of the word testament provide a nuanced understanding of the necessity and importance of communicating “every story, every encounter” (par. 17). Not only are these stories to fulfill the “wishes of the dying” (par. 17), but these stories also provide evidence of the atrocities that were committed and upholding “our supreme duty towards memory” (par. 15). The meaning of *testament* as an agreement or promise between God and mankind reinforces the importance of man’s appeal “to God to remember” (par. 12); in the case of the Holocaust it is even more important to call upon God to remember the suffering of the dead and the survivors so “past disasters” (par. 12) will not be repeated in the future.

Reread paragraph 5. How does Wiesel develop the idea that “the memory of death will serve as a shield against death” in paragraphs 12-17?

- Student responses may include:
 - Wiesel writes that “the rejection memory” means being doomed to repeat “past disasters” (par. 12). Therefore, memory functions to “bring about peace” (par. 13).
 - Wiesel writes about the seven-year-old girl who “went to her death without fear” (par. 16) and the need to “record every story” (par. 17) as a means of communicating to the living (par. 15) so the stories could serve as testaments that these disasters happened. Through remembering, retelling and leaving written and verbal records, the atrocities and suffering of the past might be avoided in the future.
- **Differentiation Consideration:** Consider asking the following question to scaffold student understanding of the previous question:

Why did the survivors attempt to “communicate everything” (par. 15)?

- The survivors wanted to “record every story,” because it followed “the wishes of the dying” and it would be a way for them not to be forgotten by the “civilized world” (par. 17).

Lead a brief whole-class discussion of student responses.

Activity 4: Quick Write

20%

File: 11.3.1 Lesson 4 Date: 9/12/14 Classroom Use: Starting 9/2014

© 2014 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a

Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

Instruct students to respond briefly in writing to the following prompt:

How do two or more central ideas build on one another and interact over the course of the text?

Instruct students to look at their annotations to find evidence. Ask students to use this lesson's vocabulary wherever possible in their written responses and to practice using specific language and domain-specific vocabulary. Remind students to use the Short Response Rubric and Checklist to guide their written responses.

- **Differentiation Consideration:** Instruct students to refer to their Central Ideas Tracking Tools for evidence.
 - Students listen and read the Quick Write prompt.
- Display the prompt for students to see, or provide the prompt in hard copy.

Transition to the independent Quick Write.

- Students independently answer the prompt, using evidence from the text.
- See the High Performance Response at the beginning of this lesson.

Activity 5: Posing Inquiry Questions

25%

Instruct students to take out the Surfacing Issues Tools they completed earlier in the lesson. Inform students that in this lesson, they will use these topics to generate inquiry questions as they begin the process of building evidence-based arguments for research. Explain that inquiry questions guide the research and analysis during this research process. Tell students that this inquiry question process is iterative; students will continue to surface new questions as they acquire information about their research issues.

Inform students that they will use the lecture, “Hope, Despair and Memory” to generate sample issues for research in this module. Explain that their research topics should be issues that comprise multiple perspectives and claims, and Wiesel touches on many issues that are good avenues for inquiry-based research.

- Students listen.
- Remind students of the following definition introduced in 11.3.1 Lesson 2: *issue* means an important aspect of human society for which there are many different opinions about what to think or do. Many issues can be framed as a problem-based question. (“Odell Education Building Evidence-Based Arguments Unit Plan,” p. 9)

Distribute the Posing Inquiry Questions Handout to students. Explain that this handout offers instructions and tips for generating inquiry questions. Students will refine these questions in later lessons, but at this stage students will pose questions to guide an initial exploration of an issue they surfaced from the text. Instruct students to read the Generating Questions portion of the handout.

- Students read the Generating Questions portion of the handout.

Explain to students that they will come up with a wide variety of inquiry questions by applying the questions on the handout to the issue they surfaced. Encourage students to consider what they find interesting and would like to know more about when they are generating inquiry questions. Explain that at this stage it is best to brainstorm as many questions as possible.

- Students listen.

Explain that students will now see this process modeled using “the nature of war” as a sample issue. Display for students the topic “nature of war” (taken from the Model Surfacing Issues Tool), and the example inquiry question: What are the causes and implications of war?

Explain to students that this inquiry question is an open-ended question, and therefore satisfies one of the suggestions from the handout (“Questions that can be answered with a simple YES or NO generally do not make effective inquiry questions”). Ask students:

File: 11.3.1 Lesson 4 Date: 9/12/14 Classroom Use: Starting 9/2014

© 2014 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

What are some other potential inquiry questions for the issue “the nature of war”?

- Student responses may include:
 - How do we define war?
 - When was the first recorded war? Why was it fought?
 - Who are important people that do not support war?
 - What is war connected to or associated with?
 - Why do human beings engage in wars?
 - What are the effects (historical/contemporary) of war on society?
- This model uses potential inquiry questions based on a specific issue surfaced in this lesson.

Instruct students to form pairs. Instruct student pairs to choose a topic from their Surfacing Issues Tool and generate five inquiry questions for that issue.

- The process of developing inquiry question supports student engagement with RI. 11-12.1.a, which addresses the process of developing factual and interpretive questions for further exploration of topics.
- Student responses will vary depending on the potential research issue, but should follow the guidance on the Posing Inquiry Questions Handout. Student responses may include:
 - Topic/Issue: The importance of remembering
 - Inquiry Questions:
 - What are the physical processes that cause memory?
 - What are the scientific aspects of memory?
 - When did humans first define the importance of memory?
 - Who are important people associated with the importance of remembering?
 - What are the psychological effects of remembering too much?
 - Is there anyone who has been able to remember everything that’s happened?

Activity 6: Closing

5%

Display and distribute the homework assignment. For homework, instruct students to use their inquiry questions to guide their research and begin exploring an issue. Consult other teachers, media specialists, librarians, books, the Internet, or any other available resources. Instruct students to identify areas of interest within their research topic and write one or two sentences identifying their area of interest. Students should be prepared to discuss one area of interest in the following lesson.

- Students follow along.

Homework

Use your inquiry questions to guide your research and begin exploring an issue. Consult other teachers, media specialists, librarians, books, the Internet, or any other available resources. Identify areas of interest within your research topic and write one or two sentences identifying your area of interest. Be prepared to discuss one area of interest in the following lesson.

Model Surfacing Issues Tool

Name :		Class :		Date :	
------------------	--	-------------------	--	------------------	--

Directions: As you read, look for issues that are suggested in the text. Remember that an issue is an important aspect of human society for which there are many different opinions about what to think or do. Many issues can be framed as a problem-based question. Summarize the issue succinctly, and note the paragraph number and what the text says about the issue in the correct columns.

Issue	Paragraph(s)	Key Information about the Issue from the Text
The importance of remembering	12	Wiesel notes that the Bible and Talmud emphasize the importance of remembering, and that the Jewish holiday Rosh Hashana, or “Yom Hazikaron” is devoted to remembering.
The nature of war	13	Wiesel writes, “war dehumanizes” and the in the Talmud “[w]arriors fare poorly.” War is looked down upon in the Jewish culture.
The need to forget	14	In paragraph 14 Wiesel states that “without the ability to forget, man would soon cease to learn.” This reinforces the physical importance of the act of forgetting.
The stories of the Holocaust survivors	17	Wiesel writes that the Jewish people “felt compelled to record every story.” They kept details about their own experience during the Holocaust.

File: 11.3.1 Lesson 4 Date: 9/12/14 Classroom Use: Starting 9/2014

© 2014 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a

Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

From Odell Education's Research To Deepen Understanding Framework, by Odell Education, www.odelleducation.com. Copyright (2012-2013) by Odell Education. Adapted with permission under an Attribution-NonCommercial 3.0 Unported license: <http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/3.0/>.

File: 11.3.1 Lesson 4 **Date:** 9/12/14 **Classroom Use:** Starting 9/2014
© 2014 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a
Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-sa/3.0/>



Posing Inquiry Questions Handout

Name :		Class :		Date :	
------------------	--	-------------------	--	------------------	--

Generating Questions

In this module, “Hope, Despair and Memory” is a starter or “seed text” that helps generate potential topics and issues that drive the research process. Issues and topics that are surfaced in the text will be used to pose inquiry questions. These inquiry questions help illuminate different potential areas of investigation within a research topic. When generating inquiry questions, it is often a good idea to brainstorm as many as possible before selecting and refining the richest ones. Here are several guiding questions to help you get started:

- How is the topic defined?
- What are its major aspects?
- Where did it originate?
- What are its causes and implications?
- What is its history?
- What other topics/issues is it connected to or associated with?
- What are its important places, things, people, and experts?

Selecting and Refining Questions

Once the brainstorming process is completed, it is important to review and select the strongest questions generated. Use these questions to assist with selecting and refining the strongest inquiry questions:

Are you genuinely interested in answering your question?

There is a lot of work involved in research, and genuine interest motivates the research process. The most effective questions are about issues and topics that are interesting to individual researchers and what they consider to be valuable information.

Can your question truly be answered through your research?

Some questions are unanswerable (Are there aliens on Jupiter?) or take years to answer (What is the meaning of life?). An effective inquiry question must be realistic and researchable.

Is your question clear? Can you pose your question in a way that you and others understand what you are asking?

Clear inquiry questions are straightforward and not confusing. If the question has two parts it may be better to separate the parts to form two new questions.

What sort of answers does your question require?

Questions that can be answered with a simple YES or NO generally do not make effective inquiry questions. Effective inquiry questions should support deep investigation that may even lead to multiple answers, and more questions. For example, the question “What are the causes of war?” could lead to questions about how these causes are defined and research about different reasons for going to war throughout history.

Do you already know what the answer is?

Effective inquiry questions are questions that cannot be answered immediately. The research process involves inquiry, finding more information about a question, and developing a perspective based on the evidence discovered and this cannot happen if the question is already answered or too simplistic. For example there is a big difference between the questions, “Has the United States participated in any wars?” (an easily answered question that requires little research) and, “What has been the impact of war on the United States?” (a question that would require a lot of research).

From Posing Inquiry Questions Handout, by Odell Education, www.odelleducation.com. Copyright (2012-2013) by Odell Education. Modified in partnership with permission under an Attribution-NonCommercial 3.0 Unported license: <http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/3.0/>.

Model Central Ideas Tracking Tool

Name :		Class :		Date :	
------------------	--	-------------------	--	------------------	--

Directions: Identify the central ideas that you encounter throughout the text. Trace the development of those ideas by noting how the author introduces, develops, or refines these ideas in the texts. Cite textual evidence to support your work.

Text: “Hope, Despair and Memory” by Elie Wiesel

Paragraph #	Central Ideas	Notes and Connections
12	Memory and suffering	Wiesel writes about “ <i>Yom Hazikaron</i> , the day of memory” (par. 12) in the Jewish tradition. He talks about the importance on memory and its relation to suffering: if God chooses to “remember our suffering, all will be well; if He refuses, all will be lost” (par. 12). Therefore, it is extremely important to remember and call upon God to remember in order to end the cycle of “past disasters, past wars” (par. 12).

Paragraph #	Central Ideas	Notes and Connections
13-15	Memory/forgetting	<p>Wiesel writes that war is not favored in the Jewish tradition and that the Talmud says “It is the wise men who will bring about peace” (par. 13). Wiesel believes it is through remembering that the wise men would accomplish the triumph of peace.</p> <p>Wiesel contrasts memory with the human tendency to forget, “without the ability to forget, man would soon cease to learn” (par. 14). Wiesel contrasts the human need to forget with an appeal to God to remember, stating, “God alone can and must remember everything” (par. 14).</p> <p>Wiesel further develops the idea of memory by presenting the survivors who “wanted to communicate everything to the living” (par. 15). Wiesel presents the paradox of “the supreme duty towards memory” (to avoid past atrocities) with the need to forget (to avoid painful memories and paralyzing fear of death) which is “essential to life” (par. 15).</p>
16	Solidarity	<p>Wiesel introduces the idea of solidarity through the stories of the survivors. These stories reflect instances of solidarity during the Holocaust: the “sick beggar” who “began to sing as an offering to his companions” (par. 16) as well as the girl who comforted her grandmother even during extreme suffering.</p>