

11.3.1 Lesson 7

Introduction

In this lesson, students continue to read “Hope, Despair and Memory” by Elie Wiesel from “Let us remember Job who, having lost everything” to “peace is not God’s gift to his creatures, it is our gift to each other” (par. 27-29), in which Wiesel presents a final appeal to mankind to stand against injustice. Students engage in an evidence-based discussion as they explore how Wiesel crafts a persuasive and compelling lecture through the use of claims, counterclaims, evidence, and reasoning. Following this discussion, students work in groups to delineate Wiesel’s argument in the text. Student learning in this lesson is assessed via the Delineating Argument Tool, which students use to identify the components of Wiesel’s argument.

For homework, students briefly respond in writing to a prompt that asks them to reflect on how their analysis of Wiesel’s use of structure has deepened their understanding.

File: 11.3.1 Lesson 7 Date: 9/12/14 Classroom Use: Starting 9/2014

© 2014 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

Standards

Assessed Standard(s)	
CCRA.R.8	Delineate and evaluate the argument and specific claims in a text, including the validity of the reasoning as well as the relevance and sufficiency of the evidence.
Addressed Standard(s)	
SL. 11-12.1.c	<p>Initiate and participate effectively in a range of collaborative discussions (one-on-one, in groups, and teacher-led) with diverse partners on <i>grades 11-12 topics, texts, and issues</i>, building on others' ideas and expressing their own clearly and persuasively.</p> <p>c. Propel conversations by posing and responding to questions that probe reasoning and evidence; ensure a hearing for a full range of positions on a topic or issue; clarify, verify, or challenge ideas and conclusions; and promote divergent and creative perspectives.</p>

Assessment

File: 11.3.1 Lesson 7 Date: 9/12/14 Classroom Use: Starting 9/2014

© 2014 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a

Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

Assessment(s)

Student learning in this lesson is assessed via the Delineating Argument Tool, which students use to identify the components of Wiesel's argument.

High Performance Response(s)

A High Performance Response should:

- Identify the central claim of the text (e.g., Humanity must use the power of memory to stand up against injustice and war. "[M]ankind needs to remember more than ever. Mankind needs peace more than ever, for our entire planet, threatened by nuclear war, is in danger of total destruction" (par. 29).).
- Identify supporting claims (e.g., It is both right and essential to remember. "Remembering is a noble and necessary act" (par. 12).).
- Identify counterclaims (e.g., Wiesel presents the counterclaim that it is better for our daily lives if we forget. "And yet it is surely human to forget, even to want to forget" (par. 14).).
- Identify the evidence presented (e.g., Wiesel is using the Talmud to emphasize action, even on a small scale. It is worth the effort of remembering if you can save even one life. "The Talmud tells us that by saving a single human being, man can save the world" (par. 29).).
- Identify Wiesel's use of reasoning to connect claims and evidence (e.g., Standing up for oppressed people and taking action for peace is always worthwhile because man is the only solution to the problems of man. "A destruction only man can provoke, only man can prevent" (par. 29).).
- See the [Model Delineating Argument Tool at the end of this lesson.](#)

Vocabulary

Vocabulary to provide directly (will not include extended instruction)

- indict (v.) - charge with an offense or crime
- denounce (v.) - publicly state that someone or something is bad or wrong
- provoke (v.) - cause to act or behave in a certain manner; encourage
- contemporary (n.) - a person belonging to the same time or period with another or others

Vocabulary to teach (may include direct word work and/or questions)

- ordeal (n.) - a severe or trying experience

Additional vocabulary to support English Language Learners (to provide directly)

- appeal (n.) - an earnest request for aid, support, sympathy, mercy, etc.

Lesson Agenda/Overview

Student-Facing Agenda	% of Lesson
Standards & Text: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Standards: CCRA.R.8, SL.11-12.1.c • Text: “Hope, Despair and Memory” by Elie Wiesel, paragraphs 27-29 	
Learning Sequence: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Introduction of Lesson Agenda 2. Homework Accountability 3. Reading and Discussion 4. Delineating Argument Tool 5. Closing 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. 5% 2. 10% 3. 30% 4. 50% 5. 5%

Materials

- Copies of the Delineating Argument Tool for each student
- **Differentiation Consideration:** Student copies of Surfacing Issues Tool (refer to 11.3.1 Lesson 2)

File: 11.3.1 Lesson 7 Date: 9/12/14 Classroom Use: Starting 9/2014

© 2014 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

Learning Sequence

How to Use the Learning Sequence	
Symbol	Type of Text & Interpretation of the Symbol
10%	Percentage indicates the percentage of lesson time each activity should take.
no symbol	Plain text indicates teacher action.
	Bold text indicates questions for the teacher to ask students.
	<i>Italicized text indicates a vocabulary word.</i>
►	Indicates student action(s).
☞	Indicates possible student response(s) to teacher questions.
❗	Indicates instructional notes for the teacher.

Activity 1: Introduction of Lesson Agenda

5%

Begin by reviewing the agenda and the assessed standard for this lesson: CCRA.8. In this lesson, students consider paragraphs 27-29 of “Hope, Despair and Memory” by Elie Wiesel. Students begin by engaging in a close reading and discussion of the text, then use the Delineating Argument Tool to synthesize their understanding of Wiesel’s claims and reasoning.

- Students look at the agenda.

Activity 2: Homework Accountability

10%

Instruct students to form pairs and discuss their responses to the first section of 11.3.1 Lesson 6’s homework assignment. (Review the following argument terms referenced in this unit and in Module 11.2: *claims*, *evidence*, *reasoning*, *central claim*, *counterclaim*, and *supporting claims*.)

Project or display the following terms for students:

- **Central Claim:** An author or speaker’s main point about an issue in an argument.
- **Supporting Claim:** A smaller, related point that reinforces or advances the central claim.
- **Counterclaim:** A claim that is opposed to an author’s central claim.

File: 11.3.1 Lesson 7 Date: 9/12/14 Classroom Use: Starting 9/2014

© 2014 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a

Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

- Evidence: The topical and textual facts, events, and ideas from which the claims of an argument arise, and which are cited to support those claims.
- Reasoning: The logical relationships among ideas, including relationships among claims and relationships across evidence.

Lead a brief whole-class discussion about the review of argument terms.

Instruct student pairs to discuss the second section of 11.3.1 Lesson 6's homework assignment. (Also, begin to review the text and your annotations for Wiesel's central claim and supporting claims.)

Ask students:

What is the central claim in "Hope, Despair and Memory"?

- Student responses may include:
 - Memory is necessary for man to achieve peace.
 - Remembering the past will help prevent future atrocities.
 - Humanity must use memory to stop injustice and war.

What supporting claims does Wiesel make in "Hope, Despair and Memory?"

- Student responses may include:
 - "If anything can, it is memory that will save humanity" (par. 3).
 - "Forgetting was never an option" (par. 11).
 - "Remembering is a necessary and noble act" (par. 12).
 - "War dehumanizes, war diminishes, war debases all those who wage it" (par. 13).
 - "Forgetting allows us to go on living" (par. 14).
 - "We must exert pressure on all those in power to come to terms" (par. 25).
 - "We may be powerless to open all the jails and free all the prisoners, but by declaring our solidarity with one prisoner, we indict all jailers" (par. 29).
 - "Mankind needs peace more than ever, for our entire planet, threatened by nuclear war, is in danger of total destruction" (par. 29).

File: 11.3.1 Lesson 7 Date: 9/12/14 Classroom Use: Starting 9/2014

© 2014 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a
Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

Activity 3: Reading and Discussion

30%

Instruct students to form pairs. Post or project each set of questions below for students to discuss.

- If necessary to support comprehension and fluency, consider using a masterful reading of the focus excerpt for the lesson.

Instruct student pairs to read and annotate “Hope, Despair and Memory,” paragraphs 27-29 (from “Let us remember Job who, having lost everything - his children” to “it is our gift to each other”) and answer the following questions before sharing out with the class..

- **Differentiation Consideration:** Consider instructing students to use the Surfacing Issues Tool to continue surfacing issues from the text.

Provide students with the following definitions: *indict* means “charge with an offense or crime,” *denounce* means “publicly state that someone or something is bad or wrong,” *provoke* means “cause to act or behave in a certain manner; encourage,” and *contemporary* means “a person belonging to the same time or period with another or others.”

- Students write the definitions of *indict*, *denounce*, *provoke*, and *contemporary* on their copy of the text or in a vocabulary journal.

How did Job respond to his ordeal?

- Job responded to his ordeal, in which he “lost everything” (par. 27), by rebuilding his life and taking care of the creation God had “entrusted to him” (par. 27).
- Consider offering students a brief account of the biblical story of Job in the Old Testament, a man who had a large family and a lot of wealth but God allowed all of these things to be taken away. Job’s family died, his fortune was ruined, and his house was destroyed. In spite of his losses, Job never blamed or rejected God and was rewarded by having his status and family restored to him and his wealth increased, all for demonstrating trust and faith in God.
- **Differentiation Consideration:** Consider asking students the following questions to scaffold understanding to the previous question:

What happened to Job?

- Job “lost everything” (par. 27): his family and friends, his things, and “an argument with God” (par. 27). Job did not reject everything God had provided him in spite of all these terrible things. Job was able to find his faith again “within his rebellion” (par. 28).

File: 11.3.1 Lesson 7 Date: 9/12/14 Classroom Use: Starting 9/2014

© 2014 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

What might *ordeal* mean in this context?

- Ordeal might mean a difficult situation, since Job “lost everything” (par. 27) he cared about in the world.

How does Wiesel use the story of Job to further his purpose?

- Wiesel uses the story of Job to illustrate that “hope is possible beyond despair” (par. 28) and claims that the hope Job possessed was rooted in memory. Using the example of Job, who rediscovered his faith through “rebellion,” humanity must struggle like Wiesel to “invent a thousand and one reasons to hope” (par. 28). The use of the story of Job supports Wiesel’s claim about memory and also connects to the story of the Besht at the beginning of the lecture.
- Based on previous knowledge of the story of Job, students may have differing understandings of the message illustrated by this story. Consider providing additional context around the story of Job if necessary.

How does Wiesel define peace in paragraph 29? How may humanity achieve peace?

- Wiesel defines peace as something man must achieve; it is “our gift to each other” (par. 29). In order to make peace a reality, “mankind needs to remember more than ever” (par. 29). Wiesel connects peace to memory by referencing the story of the Besht again, which represents the power of memory because it saved the Besht, and Wiesel says it is “memory that will save humanity” (par. 3). In order to achieve peace, all of mankind needs to work together.

To whom does Wiesel appeal in paragraphs 27-29?

- Wiesel appeals to all of mankind. He expands his focus to include all of the oppressed peoples in paragraphs 25 and 26. He uses language like “[l]et us remember” (par. 27) and “[n]one of us” (par. 29.) He concludes by outlining what mankind must do to preserve the earth: “Mankind must remember” (par. 29).
- **Differentiation Consideration:** Consider providing the following definition to support students: *appeal* means “an earnest request for aid, support, sympathy, mercy, etc.”

What does Wiesel mean by “A destruction only man can provoke, only man can prevent” (par. 29)?

- Wiesel means that mankind must solve the problems that they have created. Through hope and memory we can fulfill “our obligation to denounce” (par. 29) the horrors of war. Wiesel implores us to “remember that peace is not God’s gift to his creatures, it

is our gift to each other” (par. 29), meaning we must work towards peace because it will not be handed to us by God.

- **Differentiation Consideration:** If students struggle with the previous question consider asking the following question to scaffold student understanding:

Why does mankind need to “remember more than ever” (par. 29)?

- Wiesel writes about the possibility of “nuclear war” and that we are in “danger of total destruction” (par. 29). Mankind needs to remember past violence so they can prevent this destruction.

Lead a brief whole-class discussion of student responses.

Activity 4: Delineating Argument Tool

50%

Distribute copies of the Delineating Argument Tool.

Explain to students that they should draw upon their collective exploration of the text to delineate Wiesel’s argument using the Delineating Argument Tool to map the text’s claims, counterclaims, evidence, and reasoning, based on anchor standard CCRA.R.8. Inform students that their work to delineate Wiesel’s argument will support their own work with argument writing in this module, by offering an example of the ways in which claims, evidence, and reasoning work together to create an effective argument.

- Students do not evaluate the extent to which Wiesel’s evidence is relevant or sufficient or the validity of his reasoning in this lesson, as the focus of this activity is to support students’ understanding of the ways claims, evidence, and reasoning work together in an argument.
- If necessary, consider modeling the Delineating Argument Tool for students.

Instruct students to work in small groups to answer the following questions and annotate the text for supporting claims, evidence, and reasoning before using the Delineating Argument Tool to trace Wiesel’s argument. Students should draw on their previous work with argument in Module 11.2 to complete this activity and tool.

- This discussion and delineation supports student engagement with SL.11-12.1.c, which addresses the use of discussion to probe evidence and reasoning as well as developing and responding to ideas and conclusions.
 - Students listen.

Post or project the following questions for students to answer in groups.

File: 11.3.1 Lesson 7 Date: 9/12/14 Classroom Use: Starting 9/2014

© 2014 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a

Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

What kinds of evidence does Wiesel present throughout the text?

- Student responses may include:
 - The Hasidic legend of the Besht.
 - A personal experience of his time in Paris after the war.
 - The shared cultural experience of the Jewish people during the Holocaust.
 - The story of Job.
 - Modern instances of oppression and systemic violence against ethnic groups.

How do these various kinds of evidence support Wiesel's argument?

- Student responses may include:
 - He gradually shifts his focus from “[a] Hasidic legend” (par. 1) to his real experience, “[a] recollection” (par. 5), then to the shared experience of the Jewish people, “the prisoners” (par. 7), and finally he relates all of the suffering of the world to the responsibility of mankind, “The source of his hope was memory, as it must be ours” (par. 28).
 - Wiesel's use of different kinds of evidence allows him to build up momentum in the text by talking about increasingly large and more relevant groups of people. The statement “A destruction only man can provoke, only man can prevent” (par. 29) is more powerful because of the weight of all of his evidence of oppressed people on the list that seems “endless” (par. 26).
 - Varied evidence also provides a vehicle for Wiesel to connect ideas across time and space by relating the experiences of hope, despair, and memory between the Besht, himself, the Jewish people, and finally all humanity.

What evidence does Wiesel present in paragraphs 24-26?

- Student responses may include:
 - Individuals who were persecuted by their government (e.g., Lech Walesa, Nelson Mandela, Andrei Sakharov, Ida Nudel, Josef Biegun).
 - Oppressed groups of people who have been killed in large numbers (e.g., the Ethiopians, the Cambodians, the Mesquite Indians, the Desaparecidos).

How does this evidence support Wiesel's claims in paragraphs 24-29?

- Wiesel presents these as examples of a “defeat of memory” (par. 24). The oppression and violence is evidence “that racism and fanaticism” (par. 24) are still very much present in our world. Because these people are still suffering, “[w]e must remember the suffering” (par. 26)

How do paragraphs 24-29 support Wiesel’s central claim?

- Wiesel makes an argument for humanitarian action. He builds a list of examples of human rights violations in current events, connects those events with the ideas of hope, despair, and memory and then uses two allegorical stories, that of the Besht and of Job, to emphasize the necessity for humankind to remember our past, hope for the future, and stand up for the oppressed. These paragraphs solidify the idea of using “memory” to fight injustice, which is essential to Wiesel’s central claim.

Instruct students to work in groups to identify the central claim, supporting claims, evidence, and reasoning present in “Hope, Despair and Memory.”

- The goal of this work is to provide an example of argument writing to better prepare students for their own argument work in 11.3.2 and 11.3.3. Because students engage in deeper exploration of argument norms and conventions in 11.3.2, the Delineating Argument Tool only requires them to delineate the central claim and identify its components; it does not ask students to evaluate the effectiveness of the argument.

Instruct student groups to complete their Delineating Argument Tools. Remind students that they should spend significant time gathering textual examples of the reasoning and evidence that contributes to the central claim of the lecture.

- Student groups complete the Delineating Argument Tool.

Transition students out of small groups and instruct students to independently review and evaluate their Delineating Argument Tools.

- Students independently review their Delineating Argument Tools.
- See the High Performance Response at the beginning of this lesson.

Activity 5: Closing

5%

Display and distribute the homework assignment. For homework, instruct students to use annotation to track a rhetorical technique in “Hope, Despair and Memory” and then respond briefly in writing to the following prompt:

File: 11.3.1 Lesson 7 Date: 9/12/14 Classroom Use: Starting 9/2014

© 2014 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a

Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

How does Wiesel’s use of this rhetorical device support his purpose?

Instruct students to use this lesson’s vocabulary wherever possible in their written responses.

- Remind students to consult their Rhetorical Impact Tracking Tools introduced in 11.3.1 Lesson 2 to support their tracking of Wiesel’s use of rhetoric in this lecture.
- Students follow along.

Homework

Use annotation to track a rhetorical technique in “Hope, Despair and Memory” and then respond briefly in writing to the following prompt:

How does Wiesel’s use of this rhetorical device support his purpose?

Use this lesson’s vocabulary wherever possible in your written response.

Delineating Argument Tool

Name :		Class :		Date :	
------------------	--	-------------------	--	------------------	--

Directions: Identify and record each of the following elements of the author's argument in the text (or portion of text): central claim, supporting claims, evidence, and reasoning. Remember that evidence supports claims and reasoning connects evidence to a claim. Reasoning also may explain the relationship among claims or across evidence.

Text:

Central Claim:

Supporting Claim:

Evidence:

Reasoning:

Supporting Claim:

Evidence:

File: 11.3.1 Lesson 7 Date: 9/12/14 Classroom Use: Starting 9/2014

© 2014 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

Reasoning:
Counterclaim:
Evidence:
Reasoning:

File: 11.3.1 Lesson 7 Date: 9/12/14 Classroom Use: Starting 9/2014

© 2014 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a

Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

Model Delineating Argument Tool

Name :		Class :		Date :	
------------------	--	-------------------	--	------------------	--

Directions: Identify and record each of the following elements of the author’s argument in the text (or portion of text): central claim, supporting claims, evidence, and reasoning. Remember that evidence supports claims and reasoning connects evidence to a claim. Reasoning also may explain the relationship among claims or across evidence.

Text: “Hope, Despair and Memory,” by Elie Wiesel

Central Claim:

Wiesel is claiming that humanity must use the power of memory to stand up against injustice and war. “[M]ankind needs to remember more than ever. Mankind needs peace more than ever, for our entire planet, threatened by nuclear war, is in danger of total destruction” (par. 29).

Supporting Claim:

Wiesel makes the claim that it is both right and essential to remember. “Remembering is a noble and necessary act” (par. 12).

Evidence:

Memory is essential to communicating the horror of war and preventing future atrocity. “The survivors wanted to communicate everything to the living: the victim’s solitude and sorrow, the tears of mothers driven to madness, the prayers of the doomed beneath a fiery sky” (par. 15).

Reasoning:

Remembering is a noble act because it requires people to endure the suffering of remembering great trauma. It is necessary because it ensures we won’t forget these terrible things that have happened. “[T]he rejection of memory becomes a divine curse, one that would doom us to repeat past disasters, past wars” (par. 12). “And here we come back to memory. We must remember the suffering of my people” (par. 26).

Supporting Claim:

“We may be powerless to open all the jails and free all the prisoners, but by declaring our solidarity with one prisoner, we indict all jailers” (par. 29).

Evidence:

File: 11.3.1 Lesson 7 Date: 9/12/14 Classroom Use: Starting 9/2014

© 2014 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a

Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

Wiesel uses the Talmud to emphasize action, even on a small scale. It is worth the effort of remembering if you can save even one life. “The Talmud tells us that by saving a single human being, man can save the world” (par. 29).

Reasoning:

Standing up for oppressed people and taking action for peace is always worthwhile because man is the only solution to the problems of man. “A destruction only man can provoke, only man can prevent” (par. 29).

Counterclaim:

Wiesel presents the counterclaim that it is better for our daily lives if we forget. “And yet it is surely human to forget, even to want to forget” (par. 14).

Evidence:

“The Talmud tells us that without the ability to forget, man would soon cease to learn. Without the ability to forget, man would live in a permanent, paralyzing fear of death” (par. 14).

Reasoning:

The natural human instinct is to try and forget terrible events. “Is it not natural for a human being to repress what causes him pain, what causes him shame?” (par. 10)

Model Surfacing Issues Tool

Name :		Class :		Date :	
------------------	--	-------------------	--	------------------	--

Directions: As you read, look for issues that are suggested in the text. Remember that an issue is an important aspect of human society for which there are many different opinions about what to think or do. Many issues can be framed as a problem-based question. Summarize the issue succinctly, and note the paragraph number and what the text says about the issue in the correct columns.

Issue	Paragraph(s)	Key Information about the Issue from the Text
Coping with tragedy	28	Wiesel spends a lot of this lecture discussing the idea of coping with tragedy. In these final paragraphs, he says, “even as I struggle to invent a thousand and one reasons to hope.”
Humanitarian obligation	29	Wiesel claims “[n]one of us is in a position to eliminate war, but it is our obligation to denounce it and expose it in all its hideousness.”
Preventing genocide	29	Wiesel quotes the Talmud, “by saving a single human being, man can save the world.” This connects to the horror of the Holocaust, which was a genocide and something we should try to prevent.
Nuclear war	29	In the final paragraph, Wiesel warns of “the threat of nuclear war” and says that it is up to humanity to stop this danger and only man can prevent this catastrophe.

File: 11.3.1 Lesson 7 Date: 9/12/14 Classroom Use: Starting 9/2014

© 2014 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a

Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

From Odell Education's Research to Deepen Understanding Framework, by Odell Education, www.odelleducation.com. Copyright (2012-2013) by Odell Education. Adapted with permission under an Attribution-NonCommercial 3.0 Unported license: <http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/3.0/>.

File: 11.3.1 Lesson 7 **Date:** 9/12/14 **Classroom Use:** Starting 9/2014
© 2014 Public Consulting Group. This work is licensed under a
Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License

<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-sa/3.0/>

