



EXPEDITIONARY  
LEARNING

# Grade 7: Module 2A: Unit 3: Lesson 6

## Individual Research



This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License.  
Exempt third-party content is indicated by the footer: © (name of copyright holder). Used by permission and not subject to Creative Commons license.



Long-Term Targets Addressed (Based on NYSP12 ELA CCLS)	
I can generate additional questions for further research. (W.7.7) I can quote or paraphrase others' work while avoiding plagiarism. (W.7.8)	
Supporting Learning Targets	Ongoing Assessment
<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>I can read a source, identify and paraphrase information that helps answer a supporting research question ,and generate effective supporting research questions.</li></ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>Researcher's Notebook</li></ul>



Agenda	Teaching Notes
<p><b>1. Opening</b></p> <p>A. Entry Task: Return Mid-Unit 3 Assessment (5 minutes)</p> <p><b>2. Work Time</b></p> <p>A. Reading a Group Text (25 minutes)</p> <p>B. Synthesizing Your Findings—Teacher Modeling (10 minutes)</p> <p><b>3. Closing and Assessment</b></p> <p>A. Marking Your Text (5 minutes)</p> <p><b>4. Homework</b></p> <p>A. If needed, finish color-coding in the Researcher’s Notebook in preparation for writing the End of Unit 3 Assessment.</p> <p>B. Continue reading in your independent reading book for this unit.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Mid-Unit 3 Assessments (from Lesson 5, with teacher feedback)</li><li>• In this lesson, students work with Step 5 on the Researcher’s Roadmap. After they evaluate where they are in their research, they will have a chance to do some more independent research.</li><li>• Students may choose research texts from among the set listed in the supporting materials, or other sources that either the teacher finds on his/her own. The suggested texts listed in this lesson may be downloaded from: <a href="http://commoncoresuccess.elschools.org">http://commoncoresuccess.elschools.org</a> in Fall 2013. Feel free to gather more recent sources as well -- working conditions in the garment industry is a topic that has been in the news frequently in recent months.</li><li>• To make sure students have access to the source they need to best address their supporting research question, consider making a few extra copies of each source.</li><li>• In advance: Assess students’ Mid-Unit 3 Assessments; print out suggested texts.</li><li>• Familiarize yourself with the optional texts so you can best assist students with their reading and paraphrasing.</li></ul>



Lesson Vocabulary	Materials
synthesis	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Researcher's Notebook (students' own, from Lesson 1)</li><li>• Researcher's Roadmap anchor chart (from Lesson 2; one large copy to display and students' own copies)</li><li>• Suggested Texts chart (one to display)</li><li>• Document camera</li><li>• Copies of the suggested texts (at least one per student; see Teaching Note above)</li><li>• Model research synthesis (one per student and one to display)</li><li>• Colored pencils (three colors per student)</li><li>• Annotated model research synthesis (for teacher reference)</li><li>• Suggested texts for this lesson (for teacher reference) Exit ticket (one per student)</li></ul>

Opening	Meeting Students' Needs
<p><b>A. Entry Task: Return Mid-Unit 3 Assessment (5 minutes)</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• As students enter, hand back their corrected Mid-Unit 3 Assessments. As an entry task, ask students to look over the assessment and put a star next to something they did well. Then ask students to circle something they need to work on as they continue researching.</li><li>• Invite students to turn and talk with a partner about what they starred and circled.</li><li>• Remind students to keep these skills in mind as they continue their research.</li></ul>	



Work Time	Meeting Students' Needs
<p><b>A. Reading a Group Text (25 minutes)</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Ask students to take out their <b>Researcher's Notebook</b> and read the five supporting research questions from Part II. Invite students to think about what they have learned so far and what they would like to research further. Ask them to circle one question they will use to guide their research today.</li><li>• Ask a student to identify where on the <b>Researcher's Roadmap anchor chart</b> they think they are right now. Listen for students to identify "Evaluating Research," or Step 5. Remind them that periodically pausing to think about what they have learned so far and what else they need to research is an important step in the research process.</li><li>• Project the <b>Suggested Texts chart</b> on a <b>document camera</b>. Based on the guiding question they chose, have students select a text to read today. Tell them they will be working in pairs. Place <b>the suggested texts</b> on a central table and invite students to pick up their chosen text, move to sit with their partners, and await further instruction.</li><li>• Explain to students that they are now going to loop back on the Researcher's Roadmap. Remind them that this is an important part of the process and not a step backward. Ask a student to explain how reading a text for research is different from reading a novel. Listen for students to understand that when you read for research, you skim for the gist and identify the sentences that relate to your supporting research questions. You go back and read these parts more closely to thoroughly understand them and paraphrase them. Remind students that this sometimes means reading around those parts (i.e., the sentences that come before and come after them) to make sure students really understand.</li><li>• Direct students to write down the pertinent "works cited" information in the Researcher's Notebook Source 4 section. Instruct them to skim the articles and mark the text for details or facts they think are important enough to paraphrase into their own words. Assure students that they will have lots of time to talk through the facts they identified with their partner, but they must read silently on their own first for the next 10 minutes.</li><li>• As the students work, circulate to assist as needed. Consider joining a struggling reader or individually conferencing with a student.</li><li>• After 10 minutes, instruct the students to begin to share what they marked with their partners. Working together, they should paraphrase the pertinent information and write it in their Researcher's Notebook Source 4. Encourage them to paraphrase it orally first, as it will improve the coherence of their notes.</li><li>• If pairs finish early, they can read another article.</li></ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• If you have struggling readers, direct them to "Teens in Sweatshops." Consider assigning heterogeneous groups.</li><li>• Consider suggesting that pairs split the longer articles and each read a page during this time.</li></ul>



Work Time	Meeting Students' Needs
<p><b>B. Synthesizing Your Findings—Teacher Modeling (10 minutes)</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Direct students to Section III in the Researcher's Notebook. Ask a student to define <i>synthesize</i> (bring together different parts to make a whole). Explain that in Lesson 7 they will be writing paragraphs that sum up what they have learned from their research. This will be their end of unit assessment. The ideas they have been diligently paraphrasing will be the parts they will organize together. Praise them for diligently paraphrasing and avoiding plagiarism.</li><li>• Distribute the <b>model research synthesis</b> and display using the document camera. Ask students to read along silently as you read the synthesis aloud.</li><li>• Once you have read the whole synthesis aloud, reread the first sentence. Pause and point out that this sentence answers the overarching research question: “What are the working conditions like in the electronics industry?” Annotate the model by writing “answers overarching research question” above the first sentence, and ask students to do the same.</li><li>• Continue to annotate the model, focusing especially on how each paragraph answers a supporting research question. See annotated model research synthesis (for teacher reference). Also point out that the very same paraphrased sentences you modeled for them in Lesson 4 have been arranged in this paragraph. (They are underlined.) By paraphrasing what they have learned, they have already done much of the work in this paragraph.</li></ul>	



Closing and Assessment	Meeting Students' Needs
<p><b>A. Marking Your Text (5 minutes)</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Distribute three different <b>colored pencils</b> to each student. Instruct students to spend a few minutes reading back through their Researcher's Notebooks.</li><li>• Ask them choose one color of pencil to circle one supporting research question that they want to address in their research synthesis in the next lesson. Then ask them to use the same color to circle the paraphrased notes that they will use to help them address that question.</li><li>• Repeat this for two other supporting research questions, asking students to use a different color for each supporting research question and its relevant information.</li></ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• This is preparation for the End of Unit 3 Assessment in the next lesson. For students who struggle, consider asking them to answer one or two supporting questions in their research synthesis. For students who need a challenge, consider encouraging them to circle more than three supporting questions to answer in their synthesis.</li></ul>
Homework	Meeting Students' Needs
<p><b>A. If needed, finish color-coding in the Researcher's Notebook in preparation for writing the End of Unit 3 Assessment.</b></p> <p><b>B. Continue reading in your independent reading book for this unit.</b></p> <p><i>Note: Remind students that they need to be done with their books by Lesson 10, because they will write book reviews that day.</i></p>	



EXPEDITIONARY  
LEARNING

# Grade 7: Module 2A: Unit 3: Lesson 6

## Supporting Materials



This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License.  
Exempt third-party content is indicated by the footer: © (name of copyright holder). Used by permission and not subject to Creative Commons license.



## “It’s Incredibly Difficult to Prove That Clothing is ‘Ethically Made’”

by Anne D’Innocenzio

NEW YORK (AP) — You can recycle your waste, grow your own food and drive a fuel-efficient car. But being socially responsible isn’t so easy when it comes to the clothes on your back.

Take Jason and Alexandra Lawrence of Lyons, Colo. The couple eat locally grown food that doesn’t have to be transported from far-flung states. They fill up their diesel-powered Volkswagen and Dodge pickup with vegetable-based oil. They even bring silverware to a nearby coffeehouse to avoid using the shop’s plastic utensils.

But when it comes to making sure that their clothes are made in factories that are safe for workers, the couple fall short.

"Clothing is one of our more challenging practices," says Jason Lawrence, 35, who mostly buys secondhand. "I don't want to travel around the world to see where my pants come from."

Last week’s building collapse in Bangladesh that killed hundreds of clothing factory workers put a spotlight on the sobering fact that people in poor countries often risk their lives working in unsafe factories to make the cheap T-shirts and underwear that Westerners covet.

The disaster, which comes after a fire in another Bangladesh factory killed 112 people last November, also highlights something just as troubling for socially conscious shoppers: It’s nearly impossible to make sure the clothes you buy come from factories with safe working conditions.

Very few companies sell clothing that’s so-called "ethically made," or marketed as being made in factories that maintain safe working conditions. In fact, ethically made clothes make up a tiny fraction of 1 percent of the overall \$1 trillion global fashion industry. And with a few exceptions, such as the 250-store clothing chain American Apparel Inc., most aren’t national brands.

It’s even more difficult to figure out if your clothes are made in safe factories if you’re buying from retailers that don’t specifically market their clothes as ethically made. That’s because major chains typically use a complex web of suppliers in countries such as Bangladesh, which often contract business to other factories. That means the retailers themselves don’t always know the origin of clothes when they’re made overseas.

### **“It’s Incredibly Difficult to Prove That Clothing is ‘Ethically Made’”**

And even a "Made in USA" label only provides a small amount of assurance for a socially conscious shopper. For instance, maybe the tailors who assembled the skirt may have had good working conditions. But the fabric might have been woven overseas by people who do not work in a safe environment.

"For the consumer, it's virtually impossible to know whether the product was manufactured in safe conditions," says Craig Johnson, president of Customer Growth Partners, a retail consultancy. "For U.S.-made labels, you have good assurance, but the farther you get away from the U.S., the less confidence you have."

To be sure, most global retailers have standards for workplace safety in the factories that make their clothes. And the companies typically require that contractors and subcontractors follow these guidelines. But policing factories around the world is a costly, time-consuming process that's difficult to manage.

In fact, there were five factories alone in the building that collapsed in Bangladesh last week. They produced clothing for big name retailers including British retailer Primark, Children's Place and Canadian company Loblaw Inc., which markets the Joe Fresh clothing line.

"I have seen factories in (Bangladesh and other countries), and I know how difficult it is to monitor the factories to see they are safe," says Walter Loeb, a New York-based retail consultant.

And some experts say that retailers have little incentive to be more proactive and do more because the public isn't pushing them to do so.

America's Research Group, which interviews 10,000 to 15,000 consumers a week mostly on behalf of retailers, says that even in the aftermath of two deadly tragedies in Bangladesh, shoppers seem more concerned with fit and price than whether their clothes were made in factories where workers are safe and make reasonable wages.

C. Britt Beemer, chairman of the firm, says when he polls shoppers about their biggest concerns, they rarely mention "where something is made" or "abuses" in the factories in other countries.

"We have seen no consumer reaction to any charges about harmful working conditions," he says.

**“It’s Incredibly Difficult to Prove That Clothing is ‘Ethically Made’”**

Tom Burson, 49, certainly is focused more on price and quality when he's shopping. Burson says that if someone told him that a brand of jeans is made in "sweatshops by 8-year-olds," he wouldn't buy it. But he says, overall, there is no practical way for him to trace where his pants were made.

"I am looking for value," says Burson, a management consultant who lives in Ashburn, Va. "I am not callous and not unconcerned about the conditions of the workers. It's just that when I am standing in a clothing store and am comparing two pairs of pants, there's nothing I can do about it. I need the pants."

In light of the recent disasters, though, some experts and retailers say things are slowly changing. They say more shoppers are starting to pay attention to labels and where their clothes are made.

Swati Argade, a clothing designer who promotes her Bhoomki boutique in the Brooklyn borough of New York City as "ethically fashioned," says people have been more conscious about where their clothes come from.

The store, which means "of the earth" in Hindi, sells everything from \$18 organic cotton underwear to \$1,000 coats that are primarily made in factories that are owned by their workers in India or Peru or that are designed by local designers in New York City.

"After the November fire in Bangladesh, many customers says it made them more aware of the things they buy, and who makes them," Argade says.

Jennifer Galatioto, a 31-year-old fashion photographer from Brooklyn, is among the shoppers who have become thoughtful about where her clothes are made. Galatioto has been making trips to local shops in the Williamsburg, a section of Brooklyn that sells a lot of clothes made locally. She has also ventured to local shopping markets that feature handmade clothing.

"I am trying to learn the story behind the clothing and the people who are making it," she says.

Some retailers are beginning to do more to ease shoppers' consciences.

Wal-Mart Stores Inc., the world's largest retailer, said in January that it would cut ties with any factory that failed an inspection, instead of giving warnings first as had been its practice. The Gap Inc., which owns the Gap, Old Navy and Banana Republic chains, hired its own chief fire inspector to oversee factories that make its clothing in Bangladesh.

### **“It’s Incredibly Difficult to Prove That Clothing is ‘Ethically Made’”**

Still, Wal-Mart, Gap and many other global retailers continue to back off from a union-sponsored proposal to improve safety throughout Bangladesh's \$20 billion garment industry. As part of the legally binding agreement, retailers would be liable when there's a factory fire and would have to pay factory owners more to make repairs.

Fair Trade U.S.A., a nonprofit that was founded in 1998 to audit products to make sure workers overseas are paid fair wages and work in safe conditions, is hoping to appeal to shoppers who care about where their clothing is made. In 2010, it expanded the list of products that it certifies beyond coffee, sugar and spices to include clothing.

The organization, known for its black, green and white label with an image of a person holding a bowl in front of a globe, says it's working with small businesses like PrAna, which sells yoga pants and other sportswear items to merchants like REI and Zappos. It also says it's in discussions with other big-name brands that it declined to name.

To use the Fair Trade label on their products, companies have to follow certain safety and wage standards that are based on established industry auditing groups, including the International Labor Organization. They include such things as paying workers based on a formula that allows them to meet basic cost-of-living needs.

Local nongovernment groups train the retailers' workers on their rights. And workers are provided a grievance process to report problems directly to the Fair Trade organization.

Still, well under 1 percent of clothing sold in the U.S. is stamped with a Fair Trade label. And shoppers will find that Fair Trade certified clothing is typically about 5 percent more expensive than similar items that don't have the label.

Fair Indigo is an online retailer that sells clothes and accessories that are certified by Fair Trade U.S.A., including \$59.90 pima organic cotton dresses, \$45.90 faux wrap skirts and \$100 floral ballet flats.

Rob Behnke, Fair Indigo's co-founder and president, says some shoppers are calling in and citing the latest fatalities in Bangladesh. The retailer, which generates annual sales of just under \$10 million, had a 35 percent rise in revenue (compared with last year) following the disaster. That was in line with the 38 percent revenue surge it had during the November-December season, following the factory fire.

**“It’s Incredibly Difficult to Prove That Clothing is ‘Ethically Made’”**

Behnke says that the company's catalog and website that features some of the garment workers in countries including Peru are resonating with shoppers.

"We are connecting consumers with the garment workers on a personal level," he says. "We are showing that the garment workers are just like you and me."

While some retailers are working to improve safety overseas, others are making a "Made in USA" pitch.

Los Angeles-based American Apparel, which says it knits, dyes, cuts and sews all of its products in-house in California, touts on its website that the working conditions are "sweatshop free." The company highlights how it pays decent wages, offers subsidized lunches, free onsite massages and an onsite medical clinic.

American Apparel officials didn't return phone calls for this article, but in an interview in November with The Associated Press, the company's founder and CEO, Dov Charney, said that companies can control working conditions but they need to bring the production to the U.S.

"When the company knows the face of its worker, that's important," Charney said.

Used with permission of The Associated Press Copyright© 2013. All rights reserved.



Teens in Sweatshops

**USA**

# Teens in Sweatshop

## Who made the clothes you're wearing? Was it someone your age?

**By Victor Landauro**

**“R**ats were running all over the place. It was impossible not to step on them,” Erica C. remembers. When she complained, she says, her boss told her to “shut up, get back to work, or quit.”

In 2000, Erica, then 18 and an illegal immigrant from Mexico, had few options. So she stayed at her job as a seamstress. Erica worked in a **garment** (clothing) factory in Los Angeles, California, that supplied shirts to Forever 21, a teen-fashion company.

Earning \$250 dollars, or less, for a 50-hour workweek meant that survival was a struggle.

“I’d work 12 hours a day without any break,” Erica told *JS*. “The bathrooms were disgusting and full of cockroaches. But I had to work. I needed money for rent, for food.”

Erica was later fired from her job after working 60-hour weeks during the Christmas shopping season. She says she was dismissed for complaining that she did not receive her overtime pay.

### What Is a Sweatshop?

U.S. laws protect worker safety and guarantee minimum hourly wages (currently set at \$5.15 an hour for most U.S. jobs). Still, many businesses operate “sweatshops” to increase company profits at laborers’ expense.

“A sweatshop is any business that uses child labor, pays **substandard** [below minimum] wages, or creates an unsafe workplace,” says Darlene Atkins of the National Consumers League, a nonprofit **advocacy** (support) group. “It involves a lot of different products, not just clothing. There are sweatshops for shoes, toys, jewelry, sporting goods, fruits and vegetables, and just about any kind of product.”

Today, most U.S. sweatshops employ adults and illegal immigrants. The increased **scrutiny** (attention) from U.S. authorities has deterred sweatshop owners from hiring child laborers. According to Atkins, young workers are used mostly in sweatshops in Asia and South America.

“Many of the countries in those areas do have child labor laws. But there’s not a lot of political will to enforce them,” says Atkins.

In recent years, several well-known clothing brands, including the Gap, have been accused either of operating or profiting from sweatshops in the U.S. and overseas.

PAGE 8: JAMIE RUEBLAND/WIDE WORLD PHOTOS

**8 JUNIOR SCHOLASTIC**





## Teens in Sweatshops

"No factory is perfect," admits Dan Henkle, a Gap Inc. executive.

In response to charges that the Gap profits from sweatshop labor, the company designed a "Code of Vendor Conduct" to ensure workers' rights. Should a manufacturer fail to comply with these principles over time, Henkle told *JS*, the Gap will cease to do business with that factory.

**"People Are Afraid"**  
Jeanne Zhuo's family immigrated to New York City from China in the 1980s. At age 13, she began to work at the same garment sweatshop as her mom, aunt, and other relatives.

"It was very crowded," Jeanne says. "In the summer, there was no [air conditioning]. A lot of machines gave off heat, [and] the windows were always closed. It got so hot, it was hard to breathe."

Today, Jeanne works as an inves-

tigator for the New York State Department of Labor. She inspects garment factories throughout New York City.

"I know how bad life can be [in a sweatshop]," she says. "People are afraid to speak up, to stand up for their rights."

According to the department, about 50 percent of the city's 4,000 garment factories **violate** (break) the minimum-wage laws. Last year, the department recovered more than \$3 million in back wages for sweatshop workers.

### The Struggle Continues

Today, Erica C. is 21 and continues to work as a seamstress, but for another company. She likes her new job and says that she is paid fairly. In 2002, Erica won part of a legal settlement from Forever 21.

But many other sweatshop workers are not as fortunate. In 2000, Antonio M. worked in a


garden-hose factory in Brooklyn, New York. An illegal immigrant, Antonio, 42, was earning about \$300 dollars a week for 50 hours of work.

One night, he went to the hospital with a bloody nose. Doctors told him that exposure to the factory's toxic chemicals had damaged his kidneys.

"No one ever warned me about the chemicals," says Antonio. "A friend I worked with is now dead [from the exposure]. Another is dying in a hospital. I need a new set of kidneys or the same will happen to me."

Make the Road by Walking, an advocacy group in New York City, has filed a lawsuit on behalf of Antonio. Any financial award or settlement he receives will go toward his urgently needed transplant.

"This is injustice," says Antonio. "What happened to me shouldn't happen to anyone. They didn't pay me much when I worked there [at the factory]. And now, I'm the one who's paying." *JS*

 **GLOBAL EXCHANGE**  
[www.globalexchange.org](http://www.globalexchange.org)



Workers sew at a *maquila*, or sweatshop, in Guatemala City, Guatemala.

### Your Turn

#### WORD MATCH

- |                |                  |
|----------------|------------------|
| 1. garment     | A. support       |
| 2. substandard | B. attention     |
| 3. advocacy    | C. break         |
| 4. scrutiny    | D. below minimum |
| 5. violate     | E. clothing      |

#### THINK ABOUT IT

Were the clothes, games, or sports equipment you brought recently made in a sweatshop? How could you find out?

NOVEMBER 24, 2003 9

## Some Retailers Say More about Their Clothing Origins

By Stephanie Clifford

The revolution that has swept the food industry is expanding to retail: origins matter.

With fair-trade coffee and organic fruit now standard on grocery shelves, consumers concerned with working conditions, environmental issues and outsourcing are increasingly demanding similar accountability for their T-shirts. The issue has been brought to the forefront by the garment factory collapse in Bangladesh, which killed more than 800 people.

And some retailers are doing what was once unthinkable, handing over information about exactly how, and where, their products were made.

Everlane, an online boutique, last week added paragraphs to its Web site describing the factories where its products are made.

Nordstrom says it is considering adding information about clothes produced in humane working conditions.

An online boutique breaks down the number of workers involved in making each item and the cost of every component, while a textiles company intends to trumpet the fair-trade origins of its robes when Bed Bath & Beyond starts selling them this month.

And a group of major retailers and apparel companies, including some — like Nike and Walmart — with a history of controversial manufacturing practices overseas, says it is developing an index that will include labor, social and environmental measures.

New research indicates a growing consumer demand for information about how and where goods are produced. A study last year by professors at the Massachusetts Institute of Technology and Harvard showed that some consumers — even those who were focused on discount prices — were not only willing to pay more, but actually did pay more, for clothes that carried signs about fair-labor practices.

“There’s real demand for sweat-free products,” said Ian Robinson, a lecturer and research scientist at the University of Michigan who studies labor issues. Consumers “don’t have the information they need, and they do care.”



## Some Retailers Say More about Their Clothing Origins

By Stephanie Clifford

The garment factory collapse that killed more than 800 workers in Bangladesh last month has added urgency to the movement, as retailers have seen queries stream in from worried customers.

“In the clothing industry, everybody wears it every day, but we have no idea where it comes from,” said Michael Preysman, Everlane’s chief executive and founder. “People are starting to slowly clue in to this notion of where products are made.”

Major retailers have long balked at disclosing the full trail, saying that sourcing is inherently complex — a sweater made in Italy may have thread, wool and dye from elsewhere. Another reason: Workplace protections are expensive, and cheap clothes, no matter where or how they are manufactured, still sell, as H&M, Zara and Joe Fresh show through their rapid expansion.

But labor advocates note that consumers’ appetite for more information may put competitive pressure on retailers who are less than forthcoming. In recent weeks, government officials, including Chancellor Angela Merkel of Germany, and labor and consumer advocates have cited the Bangladesh collapse in calling for the adoption of fair-trade standards or labeling. In direct response to what happened in Bangladesh, Everlane added information to its Web site about the factories where its clothing is made. “This factory is located 10 minutes from our L.A. office,” one description for a T-shirt reads. “Mr. Kim, the owner, has been in the L.A. garment business for over 30 years.”

Everlane says it will soon add cost breakdowns for all of its clothing, along with photographs of factories where that clothing is made and information about the production.

Mr. Preysman says Everlane has long received questions from customers “around where the products are sourced from and how we can tell that the labor is good.” It is an inexact science, he said. But he added that he looks for factories certified by independent outside organizations and has executives spend time with a factory’s owner to see if he or she “is a decent human being.”

Honest By, a high-fashion site introduced last year, includes even more specific information about its products. Take a cotton shirt that costs about \$320: it took 33 minutes to cut, 145 minutes to assemble and 10 minutes to iron at a Belgian factory, then the trim took an additional 10 minutes at a Slovenian plant. The safety pin cost 4 cents, and transportation about \$10.50.

## Some Retailers Say More about Their Clothing Origins

By Stephanie Clifford

Bruno Pieters, the site's founder, said by e-mail that "as long as we keep paying companies to be unsustainable and unethical, they will be." But, he said, that may be changing. He cited a spike in sales that he asserted was in response to issues raised by recent overseas sourcing disasters.

Lush Cosmetics, a company based in Britain, has added video from its factories and photographs from buying trips to places like Kenya and Ghana to its Facebook page. Simon Constantine, head perfumer and ethical buyer, said he would like to add links to the factories Lush buys from, to encourage other cosmetics companies to support them.

Nordstrom said it had provided factory information in response to shoppers' calls, and was considering going a step further, said Tara Darrow, a spokeswoman. The Nordstrom Web site specifies eco-friendly products, "so how can we do the same with people-friendly?" Ms. Darrow asked. "Hearing from customers and knowing they care definitely compels us to want to do more."

A variety of groups are working on new apparel industry labor standards.

The Sustainable Apparel Coalition, which includes big names like Nike, Walmart, Gap, J. C. Penney and Target, has been testing an index called the Higg Index. It started last year with environmental goals, but the new version due this fall will include social and labor measurements.

The coalition was formed in 2011 to create one industry standard for sustainability and labor practices, rather than a patchwork approach. Some of the companies supporting this index have had sourcing problems — Walmart subcontractors were using the Tazreen factory, the Bangladesh plant where a fire killed 112 workers last November. Gap, Target and Penney produced clothing at another Bangladesh factory, where a fire killed about 30 workers in 2010. Nike, which faced a global boycott over sweatshop conditions in its overseas factories, was among the first major apparel companies pressured to disclose the factories it uses.

For now, the index is just for companies' internal use. But Jason Kibbey, executive director of the coalition, said the goal was to give the information to shoppers, too, through a label or via the Web or apps. Labor advocates like Scott Nova, executive director of the Worker Rights Consortium, however, say that self-regulation may be ineffective.

## Some Retailers Say More about Their Clothing Origins

By Stephanie Clifford

Another certification, Fair Trade USA, began in coffee and only recently moved into apparel. PrAna, a yoga company that is among the first American apparel firms to be fair-trade certified, said the process included tours of its cut-and-sew plant in Liberia and other factories, a review of factory books and systems, and an assessment of workers' pay relative to local salaries. PrAna sold one fair-trade T-shirt in 2011, and now sells nine such products.

Those products are priced 10 percent more than a comparable item, said its chief executive, Scott Kerslake, and they have been selling well, but PrAna has to be careful not to “completely chase away consumers on it” given the more expensive process. Now, it is trying to do more to alert consumers to the certification: the logo is only on PrAna's tags, but it plans to put the certification logo on garments.

For some shoppers, the fair-trade pitch goes only so far. Marci Zaroff, founder of Under the Canopy, which is introducing a fair-trade certified bathrobe at Bed Bath & Beyond this month, said it could be hard to convey the message, and “that's why we sell on style, quality and price.”

Neeru Paharia, an assistant professor at the McDonough School of Business at Georgetown, recently completed a study on consumers' attitudes toward sweatshop labor. She found that the complex supply chain in retailing made it easier for consumers to justify poor labor practices.

“Most people probably would not hire a child, lock them in their basement, and have them make their clothes,” she said, “but this system is so abstracted.”

She also found that consumers were concerned with labor practices — as long as they were not that interested in buying a product like shoes. But “if the shoes are cute — if they like the shoes — they actually think sweatshop labor is less wrong,” she said.

The collapse in Bangladesh may be changing that. One look at the Facebook site of Joe Fresh, which produced clothing at that factory, suggests that customers are upset, and Joe Fresh's parent, Loblaw Companies, has vowed to audit factories more aggressively and compensate the victims' families. Shoppers like Lauri Langton, 62, of Seattle, plan to push retailers for more information. “You should be able to tell, right away, where the product is produced, so that you can walk away from the product and not buy it if you do not believe it was produced in a humane way,” she said. “That's where we have power as consumers.”

From The New York Times, May 8, 2013 © 2013 The New York Times. All rights reserved. Used by permission and protected by the Copyright Laws of the United States. The printing, copying, redistribution, or retransmission of this Content without express written permission is prohibited.



Suggested Texts Chart

Suggested Texts	Possible Supporting Research Questions
A. “It’s Incredibly Difficult to Prove That Clothing is ‘Ethically Made’”	Are there any examples of consumers doing anything to change the working conditions of garment factories?  What are some corporations that are trying to improve the working conditions in garment factories?
B. “Teens In Sweatshops”	
C. “Some Retailers Say More about Their Clothing Origins”	Who gives consumers like me information about working conditions?  What are some corporations that are trying to improve the working conditions in garment factories?



### Model Research Synthesis

Working conditions in the electronic industry are sometimes good, but often bad. For instance, there is some conflicting information about how Foxconn workers are treated. On one hand, the company says its workers are treated well. Steve Jobs, the former CEO of Apple, told *The New York Times* that even though Foxconn is a factory, “... they’ve got restaurants and movie theaters and hospitals and swimming pools, and I mean, for a factory, it’s a pretty nice factory.” (Duhigg) Workers say that compared to other factories, it is much cleaner and safer—and recently, Foxconn has limited the overtime hours workers must work without lessening their pay. (Huffington Post)

However, several incidents lately suggest that the working conditions are not safe. According *The New York Times*, there have been two separate deadly explosions at iPad factories. Before these blasts, an independent monitoring group in China had alerted Apple to the hazardous conditions. Mr. Duhigg also reports that two years ago, many workers were injured when they were forced to clean iPhones screens with a dangerous chemical. There have been riots at the factory, and *The New York Times* reports that this discontent is because “Employees work excessive overtime, in some cases seven days a week, and live in crowded dorms. Some say they stand so long that their legs swell until they can hardly walk.” But interestingly, some of the workers like these long hours. The Huffington post reported that Wu, a young employee, said she wants to work overtime. “We work less overtime, it would mean less money,” she said.

Investopedia.com reports that Foxconn workers get paid \$1.78 per hour. According to *Dateline*, the total cost of labor for each iPhone is between \$12.50 and \$30. That means that if Apple sells the phones for a few hundred dollars, it is making more than 90% profit. Clearly it can afford to pay the Foxconn workers more. Lois Woo, a Foxconn executive, told Bill Weir of *Dateline* that the company would be open to paying its employees more if Apple would facilitate that. Some people doubt that will ever happen. *The New York Times* quotes a former worker as saying, “Apple never cared about anything other than increasing product quality and decreasing production cost.... Workers’ welfare has nothing to do with [Apple’s] interests.”

Annotated Model Research Synthesis  
(for Teacher Reference)

	<i>First sentence answers overarching research question.</i>
Paragraph 1 Answers: How are workers treated at Foxconn	<b>Working conditions in the electronic industry are sometimes good, but often bad.</b> For instance, there is some conflicting information about how Foxconn workers are treated. On one hand, the company says its workers are treated well. <u>Steve Jobs, the former CEO of Apple, told <i>The New York Times</i> that even though Foxconn is a factory, “... they’ve got restaurants and movie theaters and hospitals and swimming pools, and I mean, for a factory, it’s a pretty nice factory.” (Duhigg)</u> Workers say that compared to other factories, it is much cleaner and safer—and recently, Foxconn has limited the overtime hours workers must work without lessening their pay. (Huffington Post)
Paragraph 2 Answers: Are working conditions in the electronics industry safe?	However, several incidents lately suggest that the working conditions are not safe. According <i>The New York Times</i> , there have been two separate deadly explosions at iPad factories. Before these blasts, an independent monitoring group in China had alerted Apple to the hazardous conditions. <u>Duhigg also reports that two years ago, many workers were injured when they were forced to clean iPhones screens with a dangerous chemical.</u> There have been riots at the factory, and <i>The New York Times</i> reports that this discontent is because “Employees work excessive overtime, in some cases seven days a week, and live in crowded dorms. Some say they stand so long that their legs swell until they can hardly walk.” But interestingly, some of the workers like these long hours. The Huffington post reported that Wu, a young employee, said she wants to work overtime. “We work less overtime, it would mean less money,” she said.
Paragraph 3 Answers: How much are workers at Foxconn paid?	Investopedia.com reports that Foxconn workers get paid \$1.78 per hour. According to <i>Dateline</i> , the total cost of labor for each iPhone is between \$12.50 and \$30. That means that if Apple sells the phones for a few hundred dollars, it is making more than 90% profit. Clearly it can afford to pay the Foxconn workers more. Lois Woo, a Foxconn executive, told Bill Weir of <i>Dateline</i> that the company would be open to paying its employees more if Apple would facilitate that. Some people doubt that will ever happen. <i>The New York Times</i> quotes a former worker as saying, “Apple never cared about anything other than increasing product quality and decreasing production cost.... Workers’ welfare has nothing to do with [Apple’s] interests.”



### Suggested Texts for this Lesson

As described in the Teaching Notes for this lesson, students may choose research texts from among the set listed on the Suggested Texts page, or other sources that either the teacher finds on his/her own.

Clifford, Stephanie. “Some Retailers Say More about Their Clothing Origins.” *The New York Times*. The New York Times, 09 May 2013. Web. 29 May 2013.

“It’s Incredibly Difficult to Prove That Clothing Is ‘Ethically Made.’” *Business Insider*. N.p., n.d. Web. 29 May 2013.

Landauro, Victor. “Teens In Sweatshops.” *Junior Scholastic* 106.8 (2003): 8. *Middle Search Plus*. Web. 29 May 2013.