



EXPEDITIONARY
LEARNING

Grade 4: Module 2A: Unit 3: Lesson 7

Peer Critique: Historical Accuracy of Ideas and Vocabulary



This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License.
Exempt third-party content is indicated by the footer: © (name of copyright holder). Used by permission and not subject to Creative Commons license.



Long-Term Targets Addressed (Based on NYSP12 ELA CCLS)

I can use the writing process to produce clear and coherent writing (with support). (W.4.5)

I can effectively participate in a conversation with my peers and adults. (SL.4.1)

Supporting Learning Targets

- I can give kind, helpful, and specific feedback to my critique partner.
- I can critique the ideas of my writing partner's narrative for historical accuracy.

Ongoing Assessment

- Historical Narrative (annotated first draft)
- Narrative Feedback recording form



Agenda	Teaching Notes
<ol style="list-style-type: none">1. Opening<ol style="list-style-type: none">A. Reviewing Learning Target (5 minutes)2. Work Time<ol style="list-style-type: none">A. Reviewing Peer Critique Protocol (10 minutes)B. Peer Critique of Drafts for Ideas (25 minutes)C. Annotating Drafts for Revision (15 minutes)3. Closing and Assessment<ol style="list-style-type: none">A. Exit Ticket (5 minutes)4. Homework	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• For this lesson, students will need their draft narratives from the mid-unit assessment (Lesson 6). Be sure copies were made for assessment purposes before handing back students' original drafts.• In advance: Prepare on chart paper the Critique Protocol anchor chart (see supporting materials of this lesson or use the version created in Module 1, Unit 1, Lesson 7.)• In advance: Prepare on another sheet of chart paper the Steps for Revising My Narrative anchor chart (see supporting materials for steps to record).• Review: Peer Critique protocol (Appendix).• Beginning with Lesson 7, each day students edit their work using different colored pencils for different foci. See supporting materials below and Work Time, Part C.

Lesson Vocabulary	Materials
specific, revision, critique, feedback	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Equity sticks• Critique Protocol anchor chart (new; teacher-created; see Supporting materials for directions)• Historical Fiction Narrative Rubric anchor chart (from Lesson 2)• Historical Fiction Narrative (first drafts from Mid-Unit 3 Assessment)• Narrative Feedback recording form (one per student)• Green colored pencils (one per student)• Steps for Revising My Narrative anchor chart (new; teacher-created; see Supporting materials for directions)• Index cards (one per student)



Opening	Meeting Students' Needs
<p>A. Reviewing Learning Target (5 minutes)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Post and read aloud the following learning targets: “I can give kind, helpful, and specific feedback to my critique partner,” and “I can critique the ideas of my writing partner’s narrative for historical accuracy.”• Ask students what they know already about these targets. Give students a chance to talk with a partner about their thinking, then cold call students using the equity sticks. Students may recall the critique process from Module 1. Have them share what they recall.• Then ask students to identify parts of the learning targets that are unfamiliar or confusing. Pay particular attention to the meanings of the words <i>specific</i> and <i>critique</i> as you clarify the meaning of the targets with students.	



Work Time	Meeting Students' Needs
<p>A. Review Peer Critique Protocol (10 minutes)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">Review the main components of a successful critique on the Critique Protocol anchor chart (see teaching notes and supporting materials of this lesson for preparing this anchor chart).Set up nonnegotiables for the students before they begin this process. The following four points are crucial for success:<ul style="list-style-type: none">* Be kind: Always treat others with dignity and respect. This means we never use words that are hurtful, including sarcasm.* Be specific: Focus on particular strengths and weaknesses, rather than making general comments such as “It’s good” or “I like it.” Provide insight into why it is good or what, specifically, you like about it.* Be helpful: The goal is to contribute positively to the individual or the group, not simply to be heard. Echoing the thoughts of others or cleverly pointing out irrelevant details wastes time.* Participate: Peer critique is a process to support each other, and your feedback is valued!Tell students that today they are going to listen to their partners read their historical narrative drafts. Tell them they will focus their feedback using the Historical Fiction Narrative Rubric anchor chart. Explain that for today their feedback will focus only on the <i>Ideas</i> portion of the rubric. Review the criteria for Meets on the rubric. Students will focus mainly on the historical accuracy of characters and events. Remind students that in order for this feedback to be helpful they should only focus on this specific area. Pointing out misspelled words or incorrect punctuation will not be helpful at this point in the writing process. That will be saved for the final editing.	<ul style="list-style-type: none">Critiques simulate the experiences students will have in the workplace and help build a culture of achievement in your classroom.You may consider modeling with the model paragraph from the wheelwright narrative if you feel that your students need more practice with peer critique before working with a partner.



Work Time (continued)	Meeting Students' Needs
<p>B. Peer Critique of Drafts for Ideas (25 minutes)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Partner students with a student with their same expert trade (blacksmiths with blacksmiths, shoemakers with shoemakers, etc.) if possible.• Return students' original copies of their Historical Fiction Narrative (first drafts) from the mid-unit assessment. Distribute the Narrative Feedback recording form. Explain to students that this is where they will record their partner's feedback on their work and their next steps.• Have students read the directions then restate in their own words to a partner:<ul style="list-style-type: none">* Author and Listener: Review area of critique focus from rubric* Author: Reads his or her piece* Listener: Gives feedback based on rubric criteria: "I like how you _____. You might consider _____."* Author: Records feedback* Author: Says: "Thank you for _____. My next step will be _____."* Switch roles and repeat.• Address any clarifying questions, and then have students begin.• Circulate to support students with the critique process, helping them to follow the protocol and focus their feedback using the Ideas portion of the rubric.	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• To help students keep their writing organized, consider keeping a class accordion folder labeled with names or individual writing folders to keep graphic organizers, drafts, and feedback recording forms.



Work Time (continued)	Meeting Students' Needs
<p>C. Annotating Drafts for Revision (15 minutes)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Have students thank their partners and move to their own workspace. Be sure that every student has a green colored pencil. Post the Steps for Revising My Narrative anchor chart:<ul style="list-style-type: none">* Choose the correct colored pencil. Today's color is _____.* Decide where you are going to add a revision note based on feedback or new learning.* Write your revision note in the space above the sentence you want to change.* Read through your entire narrative and continue to record your revision notes.* Review your revision notes to be sure they make sense.• Tell them that you would like them to add notes to their drafts using the green colored pencils today. (This step in the anchor chart will vary from day-to-day depending on the color used for revisions. See the teaching notes of each subsequent lesson.)• Explain to students that since they skipped lines when they wrote the drafts, you would like them to write notes telling what they will add or change in a given part of their narrative on these blank lines. When they have a sentence they would like to add to or change they can make a note on the above blank line. Explain that this will allow them to read and easily reread their drafts and note changes at the same time without erasing or crossing things out.• Give students 15 minutes to add revision notes to their drafts. Circulate to confer and support students as needed.• Once students have recorded their revisions, have them organize their writing materials. Explain that they will use these again and need to keep them with their draft and recording form as they continue to move through the writing process through the following week.	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• If students are using a computer to word process, they will still make revisions on a printed copy of their drafts until they are ready to complete a second draft in Lesson 10.• A different colored pencil will be used to annotate each revision of students' drafts in this unit. This will allow students to keep track of the focus of each revision. A different color will be used in subsequent lessons for each type of revision (e.g., ideas, organization).• To support visual learners, consider using a document camera with a few sentences written with skipped lines to demonstrate this note-taking technique for students.



Closing and Assessment	Meeting Students' Needs
<p>A. Exit Ticket (5 minutes)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Gather students. Ask them to assess themselves and the class on the learning targets: “I can give kind, helpful, and specific feedback to my critique partner,” and “I can critique the ideas of my writing partner’s narrative for historical accuracy.”• Distribute an index card and have them record their name and reflect and respond to the following:<ul style="list-style-type: none">* Front: “Did you meet the learning targets? What is your evidence?”* Back: “How do you think the class did with giving kind, helpful, and specific feedback? What is your evidence?”	
Homework	Meeting Students' Needs
<p>Continue reading in your independent reading book for this unit at home.</p> <p><i>Note: Collect exit tickets and review for formative assessment on the critique process for individuals and the class. Use this and your anecdotal notes and/or observations to help inform instruction for the next critique session later in this unit.</i></p>	



EXPEDITIONARY
LEARNING

Grade 4: Module 2A: Unit 3: Lesson 7

Supporting Materials



This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License.

Exempt third-party content is indicated by the footer: © (name of copyright holder). Used by permission and not subject to Creative Commons license.



Critique Protocol Anchor Chart

(Teacher directions: Copy the following text onto a large piece of chart paper for all students to see.)

Critique Protocol Norms:

- Be Kind: Treat others with dignity and respect.
- Be Specific: Focus on *why* something is good or what, particularly, needs improvement.
- Be Helpful: The goal is to help everyone improve their work.
- Participate: Support each other. Your feedback is valued!

Directions:

1. Author and Listener: Review area of critique focus from rubric
2. Author: Reads his or her piece
3. Listener: Gives feedback based on rubric criteria: "I like how you _____. You might consider _____."
4. Author: Records feedback
5. Author: Says: "Thank you for _____. My next step will be _____."
6. Switch roles and repeat.



Directions for Steps for Revising My Narrative Anchor Chart

(Teacher directions: Copy the following text onto a large piece of chart paper for all students to see.)

Steps for Revising My Narrative:

1. Choose the correct colored pencil. Today's color is _____.
2. Decide where you are going to add a revision note based on feedback or new learning.
3. Write your revision note in the space above the sentence you want to change.
4. Read through your entire narrative and continue to record your revision notes.
5. Review your revision notes to be sure they make sense.



Narrative Feedback Recording Form:
(Front)

.....
Name:
.....

Date:	Partner
Focus of Critique:	
My partner liked...	
My partner suggested...	
My next step(s)...	

Date:	Partner
Focus of Critique:	
My partner liked...	
My partner suggested...	
My next step(s)...	



Narrative Feedback Recording Form:
(Back)

.....
Name:
.....

Date:	Partner
Focus of Critique:	
My partner liked...	
My partner suggested...	
My next step(s)...	

Date:	Partner
Focus of Critique:	
My partner liked...	
My partner suggested...	
My next step(s)...	