

11.2.2

Lesson 8

Introduction

In this lesson, students use the previous lessons' text analysis work to analyze "An Address by Elizabeth Cady Stanton" in its entirety to explore how Cady Stanton structures her argument, specifically noting the relationship between reasoning and evidence. Students discuss Cady Stanton's central claim and supporting claims and then analyze how reasoning and evidence support these claims.

For the lesson assessment, students complete a written response to the following prompt: Identify one of Stanton's supporting claims and analyze how she uses evidence and reasoning to support the claim. For homework, students continue to read their Accountable Independent Reading (AIR) through the lens of a focus standard of their choice.

Standards

| Assessed Standard(s) | |
|-----------------------|--|
| CCRA.R.8 | Delineate and evaluate the argument and specific claims in a text, including the validity of the reasoning as well as the relevance and sufficiency of the evidence. |
| Addressed Standard(s) | |
| W.11-12.9.b | <p>Draw evidence from literary or informational texts to support analysis, reflection, and research.</p> <p>b. Apply <i>grades 11–12 Reading standards</i> to literary nonfiction (e.g., "Delineate and evaluate the reasoning in seminal U.S. texts, including the application of constitutional principles and use of legal reasoning [e.g., in U.S. Supreme Court Case majority opinions and dissents] and the premises, purposes, and arguments in works of public advocacy [e.g., <i>The Federalist</i>, presidential addresses]").</p> |
| SL.11-12.1 | Initiate and participate effectively in a range of collaborative discussions (one-on-one, in groups, and teacher-led) with diverse partners on <i>grades 11–12 topics, texts, and issues</i> , building on others' ideas and expressing their own clearly and persuasively. |

Assessment

| Assessment(s) |
|---|
| <p>Student learning is assessed via a Quick Write at the end of the lesson. Students respond to the following prompt, citing textual evidence to support analysis and inferences drawn from the text.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Identify one of Cady Stanton's supporting claims and analyze how she uses evidence and reasoning to support the claim. |
| High Performance Response(s) |
| <p>A High Performance Response should:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Identify one of Cady Stanton's supporting claims (e.g., Government in the United States exists "without the consent of the governed" (par. 4); women do not necessarily need to be equal to men in order to secure the right to vote; men need women in order to fulfill their "destiny" (par. 9)). Analyze one or more examples of evidence that supports the identified supporting claim (e.g., Even "drunkards, idiots, horse-racing, rum-selling rowdies, ignorant foreigners, and silly boys" (par. 6) are able to vote.). Analyze one or more examples of reasoning that supports the identified supporting claim (e.g., Cady Stanton reasons that laws that harm women are immoral ("a disgrace to a Christian republic in the nineteenth century") and that women already have the right to vote based on the Declaration of Independence ("we now demand our right to vote according to the declaration of the government under which we live") (par. 4).). |

Vocabulary

| Vocabulary to provide directly (will not include extended instruction) |
|--|
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> None.* |
| Vocabulary to teach (may include direct word work and/or questions) |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> None.* |
| Additional vocabulary to support English Language Learners (to provide directly) |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> None.* |

*Because this is not a close reading lesson, there is no specified vocabulary. However, in the process of returning to the text, students may uncover unfamiliar words. Teachers can guide students to make meaning of these words by following the protocols described in 1e of this document: http://www.engageny.org/sites/default/files/resource/attachments/9-12_ela_prefatory_material.pdf.

Lesson Agenda/Overview

| Student-Facing Agenda | % of Lesson |
|--|---|
| Standards & Text: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Standards: CCRA.R.8, SL.11-12.1, W.11-12.9.b Text: “An Address by Elizabeth Cady Stanton” | |
| Learning Sequence: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Introduction of Lesson Agenda Homework Accountability Argument Terminology Review Central and Supporting Claims Discussion Reasoning and Evidence Activity Quick Write Closing | <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 5% 10% 10% 25% 30% 15% 5% |

Materials

- Student copies of the Argument Visual Handout (refer to 11.2.1 Lesson 24)
- Student copies of the Short Response Rubric and Checklist (refer to 11.2.1 Lesson 1)

Learning Sequence

| How to Use the Learning Sequence | |
|----------------------------------|---|
| Symbol | Type of Text & Interpretation of the Symbol |
| 10% | Percentage indicates the percentage of lesson time each activity should take. |
| no symbol | Plain text indicates teacher action. |
| | Bold text indicates questions for the teacher to ask students. |
| | <i>Italicized text indicates a vocabulary word.</i> |
| ► | Indicates student action(s). |
| 💬 | Indicates possible student response(s) to teacher questions. |
| ❗ | Indicates instructional notes for the teacher. |

Activity 1: Introduction of Lesson Agenda

5%

Begin by reviewing the agenda and the assessed standard for this lesson: CCRA.R.8. In this lesson, students revisit “An Address by Elizabeth Cady Stanton” in its entirety to analyze how reasoning and evidence are related and how they support Cady Stanton’s claims.

- ▶ Students look at the agenda.

Activity 2: Homework Accountability

10%

Instruct students to talk in pairs about how they applied their focus standard to their Accountable Independent Reading (AIR) text. Lead a brief share out on the previous lesson’s AIR homework assignment. Select several students (or student pairs) to explain how they applied their focus standard to their AIR text.

- ▶ Students (or student pairs) discuss and share how they applied their chosen focus standard to their AIR texts from the previous lesson’s homework.

Instruct student pairs to discuss their homework assignment from the previous lesson. (Add at least two new ideas to your copy of the Ideas Tracking Tool and identify one idea from your tool as a central idea.)

- ▶ Student pairs discuss the ideas they added to their Ideas Tracking Tools.
- 🗣 See the Model Ideas Tracking Tool for sample student responses.

Instruct student pairs to discuss the central idea they identified during their homework.

- 🗣 In paragraphs 13 and 14, Cady Stanton uses war and storm metaphors to develop and refine the central idea that rights for women will be gained through political and civil action.

Activity 3: Argument Terminology Review

10%

Ask students to take out their copies of the Argument Visual Handout from 11.2.1 Lesson 24. Remind students that they should use specific argument-related terms to analyze Cady Stanton’s argument.

- ▶ Students listen.

Draw students’ attention to the following terms from the handout:

- **Argument:** the composition of precise claims about a topic, including relevant and sufficient evidence, and valid reasoning
- **Central Claim:** an author or speaker's main point about an issue in an argument
- ① In order to support students' work with Cady Stanton's central claim, explain that an *issue* in argument means "an important aspect of human society for which there are many different opinions about what to think or do."
- **Supporting Claim:** smaller, related points that reinforce or advance the central claim
- **Reasoning:** the logical relationships among ideas, including relationships among claims and relationships across evidence
- **Evidence:** the topical and textual facts, events, and ideas from which the claims of an argument arise, and which are cited to support those claims
- ① Consider posting the Argument Visual Handout and terms in the classroom so that students can use these domain-specific terms in their discussions of the text.

Remind students that relevant evidence is evidence that directly supports one or more of the author's claims. Explain that evaluating reasoning includes determining how an author uses specific pieces of evidence to support claims and how an author relates supporting claims to the central claim.

- ▶ Students listen.

Explain that students explore the relationship between reasoning and evidence in a subsequent activity.

- ▶ Students listen.

Activity 4: Central and Supporting Claims Discussion

25%

Instruct students to form small groups and discuss the following questions. Post or project the questions for students to see.

What are the "issues" Cady Stanton discusses in her address?

- 🗣 Student responses should include:
 - Cady Stanton discusses issues such as women's "right to be free as man is free" and to be "represented in the government" (par. 4) the same way men are represented in government: with the right to vote.
 - Cady Stanton discusses the role of women in improving the human race.

What is Cady Stanton's central claim?

- 🗣️ Cady Stanton's central claim is that women deserve the same rights as men. Specifically, she argues that women should be able to vote, or "to be represented in the government which [they] are taxed to support" (par. 4).

① Consider reminding students of their work with central claims in 11.2.1 Lesson 25.

Lead a whole-class discussion of student responses.

Remind students that supporting claims are "smaller, related points that reinforce or advance the central claim."

- ▶ Students listen.

Instruct small groups to consider Cady Stanton's central claim and then identify and discuss smaller, related points from her address that support the central claim.

- 🗣️ Small groups may identify the following supporting claims:
 - Government in the United States exists "without the consent of the governed" (par. 4). This means that the government has power over women, but women are unable to participate in the government.
 - Women do not have to be equal to men in order to be able to vote, because men are not equal to each other: "all white men in this country have the same rights, however they may differ in mind, body, or estate" (par. 5).
 - "The right is ours" (pp. 6–7). Cady Stanton claims that the right to vote already belongs to women, but that they must now figure out how to "get possession of what rightfully belongs to [them]" (par. 6).
 - America is in the "midst" of a "moral stagnation" (par. 8). Cady Stanton claims that the nation cannot protect itself against "sins" (par. 8).
 - "Man cannot fulfill his destiny alone" (par. 9); men need women to "redeem" (par. 9) the human race.

Lead a whole-class discussion of student responses.

Activity 5: Reasoning and Evidence Activity**30%**

Explain that reasoning and evidence are two closely related concepts; an important element of reasoning is effectively connecting pieces of evidence, and connecting evidence to claims.

- ▶ Students listen.

Using Cady Stanton’s claim from paragraph 4 that government in the United States exists “without the consent of the governed,” ask students to annotate paragraph 4 for examples of supporting evidence and reasoning.

💬 Student responses should include:

- **Evidence:** To support her claim that government in the United States exists “without the consent of the governed,” Cady Stanton cites facts about the “unjust laws” that harm women, who are governed without consent. For example, men have the right to “chastise and imprison [their wives]” and to take their wives’ “wages” and “property” away from them.
- **Reasoning:** Cady Stanton reasons that laws that harm women are immoral (“a disgrace to a Christian republic in the nineteenth century”) and that women already have the right to vote based on the Declaration of Independence (“we now demand our right to vote according to the declaration of the government under which we live”).

- ① This annotation supports students’ engagement with W.11-12.9.b, which addresses the use of textual evidence in writing.
- ① **Differentiation Consideration:** To support student comprehension, consider modeling the work of identifying and annotating evidence and reasoning in paragraph 4, prior to asking students to do so in pairs.

Lead a whole-class discussion of the reasoning and evidence from paragraph 4.

- ① Consider reminding students that as they build on others’ ideas and express their own ideas clearly and persuasively they are practicing the skills from SL.11-12.1.
- ① **Differentiation Consideration:** To support students’ understanding of the relationship among a claim, evidence, and reasoning, consider asking the following questions:

How does the evidence you identified support Cady Stanton’s claim?

💬 The evidence includes specific examples of “unjust laws” to which women did not “consent.”

How does the reasoning you identified connect the evidence to the claim?

💬 Student responses should include:

- The reasoning explains how the laws to which women did not “consent” are “unjust” (“a shame and a disgrace to a Christian republic”).

- The reasoning explains why the laws to which women did not “consent” are “unjust” (“our right to vote according to the declaration of the government under which we live”).
-

Instruct students to work in pairs to identify and discuss one additional example of the relationship among a claim, evidence, and reasoning in Cady Stanton’s address.

- ▶ Student pairs analyze reasoning and evidence in the address.

Lead a whole-class discussion of student responses.

💬 Student responses may include:

- **Paragraphs 5 and 6:**

Claim: Women do not have to be equal to men in order to be able to vote, because men are not equal to each other: “all white men in this country have the same rights, however they may differ in mind, body, or estate” (par. 5).

Evidence: Cady Stanton cites facts about the kinds of men who are able to vote. She uses the examples of “drunkards, idiots ... and silly boys” (par. 6) to illustrate that even men who are weak, flawed, and unintelligent are able to vote and have the same say as great, intelligent men.

Reasoning: Cady Stanton connects the evidence to her claim by noting that men do not have to prove their equality in order to vote: “we wish the question of equality kept distinct from the question of rights, for the proof of the one does not determine the truth of the other” (par. 5). She also connects the evidence to her claim by stating that being treated differently than men in this case is “grossly insulting” (par. 6).

- **Paragraph 7:**

Claim: “The right is ours.”

Evidence: The evidence Cady Stanton uses includes the fact that many women are “already pledged” to secure the right through writing (“the pens”), speaking (“the tongues”), money (“the fortunes”), and persistence (“the indomitable wills”).

Reasoning: Cady Stanton connects the evidence to her claim by asserting that women will continue to fight for their rights until “the unjust judge” becomes “weary.”

- **Paragraph 8:**

Claim: America is in the midst of a “moral stagnation.”

Evidence: Cady Stanton supports her claim with specific facts about the institutions that are trying, but failing, to correct the problem. She states, “Churches ... missionary societies,

Sunday schools, and prayer meetings” exist, but the “battlements of righteousness are weak” against the “moral stagnation.”

Reasoning: Cady Stanton connects the evidence to her claim by explaining that society refuses to take action against “its sins”: “with idiotic laugh we hug those monsters to our breast and rush on to destruction.”

○ **Paragraphs 9 and 10:**

Claim: “Man cannot fulfill his destiny alone.” (par. 9)

Evidence: To support her claim, Cady Stanton cites the idea that “there are deep and tender chords of sympathy ... that woman can touch more skillfully than man” (par. 9).

Reasoning: Cady Stanton explains that the world needs “some spirit of mercy and love” (par. 9) to purify itself, but the world has not yet been purified because “the voice of woman has been silenced” (par. 9), without the right to vote. She also reasons that women, as mothers, are “the very fountains of life” (par. 10); this idea illustrates women’s importance in man’s destiny.

Activity 6: Quick Write

15%

Instruct students to respond briefly in writing to the following prompt:

Identify one of Cady Stanton’s supporting claims and analyze how she uses evidence and reasoning to support the claim.

- ① Instruct students to select a supporting claim for the Quick Write, other than the one they analyzed in Activity 5.

Instruct students to look at their annotations to find evidence. Remind students to use the Short Response Rubric and Checklist to guide their written responses.

- ▶ Students listen and read the Quick Write prompt.

- ① Display the prompt for students to see, or provide the prompt in hard copy.

Transition to the independent Quick Write.

- ▶ Students independently answer the prompt using evidence from the text.

- ☞ See the High Performance Response at the beginning of this lesson.

Activity 7: Closing

5%

Display and distribute the homework assignment. For homework, instruct students to continue to read their AIR texts through the lens of a focus standard of their choice and prepare for a 3–5 minute discussion of their text based on that standard.

- ▶ Students follow along.

Homework

Continue reading your Accountable Independent Reading text through the lens of a focus standard of your choice and prepare for a 3–5 minute discussion of your text based on that standard.

Model Ideas Tracking Tool

| | | | | | |
|--------------|--|---------------|--|--------------|--|
| Name: | | Class: | | Date: | |
|--------------|--|---------------|--|--------------|--|

Directions: Identify the ideas that you encounter throughout the text. Trace the development of those ideas by noting how the author introduces, develops, or refines these ideas in the text. Cite textual evidence to support your work.

| | |
|--------------|--|
| Text: | "An Address by Elizabeth Cady Stanton" |
|--------------|--|

| Paragraph # | Ideas | Notes and Connections |
|-------------|---|---|
| 13 | Women's struggle for equal rights is a battle. | Cady Stanton develops the idea with images and descriptions such as: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • "buckle on the armor" • "keenest weapons of the enemy" • references to Joan of Arc • "heroic action" These images and descriptions work together to develop the idea that securing rights is like a battle. |
| 14 | Women will face opposition when they struggle to obtain equal rights. | Cady Stanton begins paragraph 14 with the realization, "we do not expect our path will be strewn with the flowers of popular applause," to acknowledge the opposition women will face. |
| 14 | Even though it will be difficult, women will remain committed to their struggle for equal rights. | Cady Stanton develops images of women carrying a banner through storm clouds and opposition to illustrate women's determination. She states, "we will steadfastly abide the result. Unmoved, we will bear it aloft." |
| 13–14 | Women deserve equal rights whether or not they prove their equality to men. | Cady Stanton develops and refines the idea that women deserve rights whether or not they prove their equality to men. She describes women's work as "heroic" work similar to Joan of Arc's military leadership. She also describes women's determination and persistence to challenge "custom and authority," through images of women carrying a banner with the words "Equality of Rights" through a storm and past enemies. |