

11.2.1

Lesson 25

Introduction

In this lesson, students continue to prepare for the End-of-Unit Assessment. Students begin the lesson by reviewing examples of argument terms using examples from Booker T. Washington’s “Atlanta Compromise Speech.” Next, students engage in a collaborative activity in which they identify Washington and Du Bois’s central and supporting claims. Students then form new groups to analyze the relationships between Du Bois’s and Washington’s claims. Students use their notes, annotations, texts, and tools for the evidence-based discussion. Student learning is assessed via a Quick Write at the end of the lesson: How does reading and analyzing Washington’s argument further inform your understanding of Du Bois’s argument?

For homework, students prepare for the End-of-Unit Assessment by reviewing Washington’s “Atlanta Compromise Speech” and Du Bois’s “Of Our Spiritual Strivings” from *The Souls of Black Folk* as well as related notes, annotations, and tools. Students also note two instances in which each author’s use of rhetoric contributes to the power or persuasiveness of the text and come prepared to discuss these examples in the following lesson.

Standards

Assessed Standard(s)	
CCRA.R.9	Analyze how two or more texts address similar themes or topics in order to build knowledge or to compare the approaches the authors take.
Addressed Standard(s)	
CCRA.R.8	Delineate and evaluate the argument and specific claims in a text, including the validity of the reasoning as well as the relevance and sufficiency of the evidence.
W.11-12.9.b	<p>Draw evidence from literary or informational texts to support analysis, reflection, and research.</p> <p>a. Apply <i>grades 11–12 Reading standards</i> to literary nonfiction (e.g., “Delineate and evaluate the reasoning in seminal U.S. texts, including the application of constitutional principles and use of legal reasoning [e.g., in U.S. Supreme Court Case majority opinions and dissents] and the premises, purposes, and arguments in works of public advocacy [e.g., <i>The Federalist</i>, presidential addresses]”).</p>

SL.11-12.1a, c	<p>Initiate and participate effectively in a range of collaborative discussions (one-on-one, in groups, and teacher-led) with diverse partners on <i>grades 11–12 topics, texts, and issues</i>, building on others’ ideas and expressing their own clearly and persuasively.</p> <p>a. Come to discussions prepared, having read and researched material under study; explicitly draw on that preparation by referring to evidence from texts and other research on the topic or issue to stimulate a thoughtful, well-reasoned exchange of ideas.</p> <p>c. Propel conversations by posing and responding to questions that probe reasoning and evidence; ensure a hearing for a full range of positions on a topic or issue; clarify, verify, or challenge ideas and conclusions; and promote divergent and creative perspectives.</p>
----------------	---

Assessment

Assessment(s)
<p>Student learning is assessed via a Quick Write at the end of the lesson. Students respond to the following prompt, citing textual evidence to support analysis and inferences drawn from the text.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> How does reading and analyzing Washington’s argument further inform your understanding of Du Bois’s argument?
High Performance Response(s)
<p>A High Performance Response should:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Explain how Washington’s argument contributes to an understanding of Du Bois’s argument (e.g., In his “Atlanta Compromise Speech,” Washington argues that African American and white Southerners should cooperate in economic matters in order for the South to prosper, but advocates against “social equality” as “the extremest folly” (Washington, par. 9). This argument highlights the ground-breaking nature of Du Bois’s argument that America’s future success is dependent upon African Americans and white Americans uniting, not only in industry, but in “human brotherhood” (Du Bois, par. 12). Du Bois’s vision that “some day on American soil two world-races may give each to each those characteristics both so sadly lack” (Du Bois, par. 12) requires mutual respect and equality in social life as well as economic and civic life, and therefore requires more extreme social change than Washington’s vision.). <p>① See Model Central and Supporting Claims Tool at the end of this lesson.</p>

Vocabulary

Vocabulary to provide directly (will not include extended instruction)
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> None.*
Vocabulary to teach (may include direct word work and/or questions)
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> None.*
Additional vocabulary to support English Language Learners (to provide directly)
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> None.*

*Because this is not a close reading lesson, there is no specified vocabulary. However, in the process of returning to the text(s), students may uncover unfamiliar words. Teachers can guide students to make meaning of these words by following the protocols described in 1E of this document http://www.engageny.org/sites/default/files/resource/attachments/9-12_ela_prefatory_material.pdf

Lesson Agenda/Overview

Student-Facing Agenda	% of Lesson
Standards & Text: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Standards: CCRA.R.9, CCRA.R.8, W.11-12.9.b, SL.11-12.1 a, c Text: <i>The Souls of Black Folk</i> by W.E.B. Du Bois, Chapter 1: “Of Our Spiritual Strivings”; “Atlanta Compromise Speech” by Booker T. Washington 	
Learning Sequence: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Introduction of Lesson Agenda Homework Accountability Central and Supporting Claims Activity Claims Relationship Discussion Quick Write Closing 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 5% 10% 30% 30% 20% 5%

Materials

- Student copies of the Argument Visual Handout (refer to 11.2.1 Lesson 24)
- Copies of the Central and Supporting Claims Tool for each student
- Student copies of the 11.2 Common Core Learning Standards Tool (refer to 11.2.1 Lesson 1)

- Student copies of the Short Response Rubric and Checklist (refer to 11.2.1 Lesson 1)

Learning Sequence

How to Use the Learning Sequence	
Symbol	Type of Text & Interpretation of the Symbol
10%	Percentage indicates the percentage of lesson time each activity should take.
no symbol	Plain text indicates teacher action.
	Bold text indicates questions for the teacher to ask students.
	<i>Italicized text indicates a vocabulary word.</i>
▶	Indicates student action(s).
💬	Indicates possible student response(s) to teacher questions.
❗	Indicates instructional notes for the teacher.

Activity 1: Introduction of Lesson Agenda

5%

Begin by reviewing the agenda and the assessed standard for this lesson: CCRA.R.9. In this lesson, students make connections between the two unit texts: “Of Our Spiritual Strivings” by W.E.B. Du Bois and Booker T. Washington’s “Atlanta Compromise Speech.” Students look closely at each author’s argument and examine the relationship between the two arguments. Students analyze Washington and Du Bois’s arguments independent of one another before transitioning into new groups to analyze the texts in relation to each other.

- ▶ Students look at the agenda.

Instruct students to take out their copies of the 11.2 Common Core Learning Standards Tool. Inform students that in this lesson they begin to work with a new standard: CCRA.R.8. Ask students to individually read this standard on their tools and assess their familiarity with and mastery of it.

- ▶ Students read and assess their familiarity with standard CCRA.R.8.

Instruct students to talk in pairs about what they think the standard means. Lead a brief discussion about this standard.

💬 Student responses should include:

- Identify the central claim of the author’s argument and analyze how the author supports the central claim
- Evaluate whether or not there is enough evidence to support the claim(s)
- Evaluate whether or not the evidence presented supports the claim(s)
- Evaluate whether or not the reasoning is sound

Activity 2: Homework Accountability

10%

Instruct students to take out their responses to Lesson 24’s homework assignment. (Find and record one example of each argument term (one central claim, one supporting claim, one piece of evidence, and one piece of reasoning) from Washington’s “Atlanta Compromise Speech.”) Instruct students to form pairs and talk about the examples they identified for the homework assignment.

🗨 Student responses may include:

- **Central Claim:** The South will experience prosperity when African Americans and white Southerners work together to achieve economic progress.
- **Supporting Claim:** Because millions of African Americans live in the South, Washington claims that they are a vital part of the population that will either benefit or burden their communities, depending on their progress. He states, “[n]early sixteen millions of hands will aid you in pulling the load upward, or they will pull against you the load downward” (par. 7).
- **Evidence:** “One-third of the population of the South is of the Negro Race” (par. 1). Washington uses the evidence to show that African Americans are a significant proportion of the South’s population.
- **Reasoning:** “We shall constitute one-third and more of the ignorance and crime of the South, or one-third [of] its intelligence and progress; we shall contribute one-third to the business and industrial prosperity of the South, or we shall prove a veritable body of death, stagnating, depressing, retarding every effort to advance the body politic” (par. 7). Since African Americans make up a large portion of the South’s population, they can either help or hinder the South’s efforts to become more prosperous.

Lead a brief whole-class discussion of student responses.

① Consider posting or projecting the Argument Visual Handout during whole-class discussion.

Activity 3: Central and Supporting Claims Activity

30%

Inform students that in the following activity they explore the central and supporting claims in Washington and Du Bois’s arguments. Students analyze each author’s claims separately in small groups and then form new groups to analyze the relationship between the two authors’ claims. The Central and Supporting Claims Tool supports students in identifying each author’s central and supporting claims and analyzing how the supporting claims relate to the central claims.

Instruct students to form small groups of 3–5. In the first part of this activity, student groups are assigned to analyze either Du Bois or Washington’s claims. Assign half of the groups Du Bois’s “Of Our Spiritual Strivings” and half of the groups Washington’s “Atlanta Compromise Speech.” Instruct students to take out their notes and annotated texts. Remind students to continue annotating as they recognize key connections between the texts.

- ▶ Students form small groups and take out their materials.
- ① Student use of annotation supports engagement with W.11-12.9.b, which addresses the use of textual evidence in writing.
- ① Remind students to use the Argument Visual Handout from the previous lesson (11.2.1 Lesson 24) to support understanding of argument terminology. Students will work more deeply with argument in 11.2.2. Specifically, students will engage in further discussion of reasoning and evidence in 11.2.2 Lesson 8.

Instruct small groups to complete the Central and Supporting Claims Tool for their assigned text. Remind groups that although they gather evidence collaboratively, each student should fill out a copy of the tool independently to prepare for the next activity and future assessments.

- ▶ Small groups identify the claims in their assigned text and complete their Central and Supporting Claims Tools.
- 🗨 See Model Central and Supporting Claims Tools for sample student responses.
- ① **Differentiation Consideration:** If students or groups struggle to complete the tool, consider modeling one or more of the examples from the Model Central and Supporting Claims Tool.

Lead a brief whole-class discussion of student responses.

Activity 4: Claims Relationship Discussion

30%

Transition students into small-group discussions. In this activity, students discuss in new groups the relationship between Du Bois and Washington’s claims. Redistribute the groups so that each new group has one or more representatives from the Washington discussion group and one or more representatives from the Du Bois discussion group. Post or project the following question for students to discuss in their groups.

- ① Consider reminding students that this is an opportunity to apply standards SL.11-12.1.a and SL.11-12.1.c by participating effectively in a collaborative discussion, using textual evidence to express their ideas, and posing or responding to questions from peers.

What are the relationships between Du Bois and Washington’s claims?

- 🗨 Student responses may include:
 - Du Bois and Washington both discuss African American progress after Emancipation. Du Bois describes how African Americans have pursued different ideals separately, but argues that the ideals “must be melted and welded into one” (Du Bois, par. 12) if African Americans are to attain true self-consciousness. Du Bois believes that African Americans need a strong

- racial identity, one in which their “traits and talents” (Du Bois, par. 12) are developed, so that they can experience complete liberty. Washington encourages African Americans to look to occupations in “common labour” (Washington, par. 4) that they are already familiar with, in order to build self-reliance and stability. Washington does not address celebrating the unique aspects of African American identity or self-consciousness.
- Washington claims it is best for African Americans to focus on self-reliance and stability, excelling in jobs that are familiar such as “agriculture, mechanics ... commerce” (Washington, par. 4), while Du Bois claims it best for African Americans to focus on “work, culture, [and] liberty” (Du Bois, par. 12) all at once.
 - Du Bois advocates for education and self-knowledge while Washington mentions education but prioritizes labor and economic progress as the beginning of a gradual progression.

Lead a brief whole-class discussion of student responses.

Activity 5: Quick Write

20%

Instruct students to respond briefly in writing to the following prompt:

How does reading and analyzing Washington’s argument further inform your understanding of Du Bois’s argument?

Instruct students to review their unit texts as well as their notes and annotations to find evidence. Remind students to use the Short Response Rubric and Checklist to guide their written responses.

- ▶ Students listen and read the Quick Write prompt.

① Display the prompt for students to see, or provide the prompt in hard copy.

Transition to the independent Quick Write.

- ▶ Students independently answer the prompt using evidence from the text.
- 🗨 See the High Performance Response at the beginning of this lesson.

Activity 6: Closing

5%

Display the End-of-Unit Assessment prompt:

Consider Du Bois’s “Of Our Spiritual Strivings” and Washington’s “Atlanta Compromise Speech.” Compare how each author uses rhetoric to advance his point of view and analyze how each author’s use of rhetoric contributes to the power or persuasiveness of the text.

Inform students that in the following lesson they will write a multi-paragraph response to this assessment prompt.

- ▶ Students examine the End-of-Unit Assessment prompt.

① **Differentiation Consideration:** Consider clarifying that although this lesson focused on analyzing the texts as arguments, the End-of-Unit Assessment focuses on the authors' uses of rhetoric. Remind students of the definition of *rhetoric* as "the specific techniques that writers or speakers use to create meaning in a text, enhance a text or a speech, and in particular, persuade readers or listeners."

Display and distribute the homework assignment. For homework, instruct students to prepare for the End-of-Unit Assessment by reviewing Washington's "Atlanta Compromise Speech" and Du Bois's "Of Our Spiritual Strivings," as well as rewrite and expand related notes and annotations. Students should also note two instances in which each author's use of rhetoric contributes to the power or persuasiveness of the text and come prepared to discuss these examples in the following lesson.

- ▶ Students follow along.

Homework

Prepare for the End-of-Unit Assessment by reviewing Washington's "Atlanta Compromise Speech" and Du Bois's "Of Our Spiritual Strivings." Rewrite and expand your related notes and annotations. Also, note two instances in which each author's use of rhetoric contributes to the power or persuasiveness of the text and come prepared to discuss these examples in the following lesson.

Central and Supporting Claims Tool

Name:		Class:		Date:	
--------------	--	---------------	--	--------------	--

Directions: Identify the author's central and supporting claims and analyze how the supporting claims relate to the central claims.

Text:	
--------------	--

Identify the text's central claim(s)	
Identify one of the text's supporting claims	Identify one of the text's supporting claims
How does the supporting claim relate to or support a central claim?	How does the supporting claim relate to or support a central claim?

From Central and Supporting Claims Tool, by Odell Education, www.odelleducation.com. Copyright (2012–2013) by Odell Education. Modified in partnership with permission under an Attribution-NonCommercial 3.0 Unported license: <http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/3.0/>.

Model Central and Supporting Claims Tool: Du Bois

Name:		Class:		Date:	
--------------	--	---------------	--	--------------	--

Directions: Identify the author's central and supporting claims and analyze how the supporting claims relate to the central claims.

Text:	"Of Our Spiritual Strivings" by W.E.B. Du Bois
--------------	--

Identify the text's central claim(s)	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> African Americans need to seek the ideals of education, freedom, and political power simultaneously in order to achieve self-consciousness. Self-consciousness leads to a unified identity that will give African Americans complete liberty or equality. The "Negro Problem" (pars. 9, 13) is an American social problem. 	
Identify one of the text's supporting claims	Identify one of the text's supporting claims
The ideals of the past, "physical freedom, political power, the training of brains and the training of hands" (par. 12), were not enough for African Americans to achieve true self-consciousness because the ideals were not enough on their own.	"Work, culture, [and] liberty" are all needed together in order to achieve the ideal of "fostering and developing the traits and talents" (par. 12) of African Americans "in large conformity with the greater ideals of the American Republic" (par. 12).
How does the supporting claim relate to or support a central claim?	How does the supporting claim relate to or support a central claim?
This claim is about why the ideals of the past were not successful supports. Du Bois claims that African Americans need to seek the ideals of education, freedom, and political power at the same time in order to achieve self-consciousness.	This claim supports the central claim that self-consciousness will enable African Americans to develop a unified identity and give them complete liberty because "fostering and developing the traits and talents" (par. 12) of African Americans is an essential step towards self-consciousness or a unified identity that respects what African Americans have to contribute to America.

From Central and Supporting Claims Tool, by Odell Education, www.odelleducation.com. Copyright (2012–2013) by Odell Education. Modified in partnership with permission under an Attribution-NonCommercial 3.0 Unported license: <http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/3.0/>.

Model Central and Supporting Claims Tool: Washington

Name:		Class:		Date:	
--------------	--	---------------	--	--------------	--

Directions: Identify the author's central and supporting claims and analyze how the supporting claims relate to the central claims.

Text:	"Atlanta Compromise Speech" by Booker T. Washington
--------------	---

Identify the text's central claim(s)

- The South will experience prosperity when African Americans and white Southerners work together to achieve economic progress.
- African Americans need to develop self-reliance and stability in the South by pursuing occupations familiar to them such as "agriculture, mechanics ... commerce" (par. 4).

Identify one of the text's supporting claims

"There is no defense or security for any of us except in the highest intelligence and development of all" (par. 6). This claim suggests that white Southerners should help African Americans pursue opportunity and education so that both races can help the South advance rather than have African Americans "pull against [the South] the load downward" (par. 7).

Identify one of the text's supporting claims

"Nearly sixteen millions of hands will aid you in pulling the load upward, or they will pull against you the load downward." (par. 7)

How does the supporting claim relate to or support a central claim?

This claim that educating and developing African Americans is good for all people in the South relates to and directly supports the text's central claim that cooperation between races will lead to prosperity.

How does the supporting claim relate to or support a central claim?

Because millions of African Americans live in the South, Washington claims that they are a vital part of the population that will either benefit or burden their communities. This directly supports the text's central claim that the South will experience prosperity when African Americans and white Southerners work together to achieve economic progress.

From Central and Supporting Claims Tool, by Odell Education, www.odelleducation.com. Copyright (2012–2013) by Odell Education. Modified in partnership with permission under an Attribution-NonCommercial 3.0 Unported license: <http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/3.0/>.