

10.4.3

Lesson 4

Introduction

In this lesson, students complete their reading and analysis of “How a prince should keep his word,” chapter 18 from *The Prince* (from “I do not wish to remain silent” to “taken away from him many times over”), in which Machiavelli concludes his argument about the rules for princes regarding appearance versus reality. Students analyze through a collaborative quote collection activity how Machiavelli’s ideas and claims are developed and refined by particular sentences. Student learning is assessed via a Quick Write at the end of the lesson: Select a phrase from chapter 18. Explain how this phrase refines an idea from chapters 17 and 18.

For homework, students review their notes and annotations from *The Prince* and from *Macbeth* in order to gather evidence for a discussion in the following lesson around a prompt that asks them to consider connections between Machiavelli’s work and their analysis of *Macbeth* from the previous unit.

Standards

Assessed Standard(s)	
RI.9-10.5	Analyze in detail how an author’s ideas or claims are developed and refined by particular sentences, paragraphs, or larger portions of a text (e.g., a section or chapter).
Addressed Standard(s)	
SL.9-10.1.a-e	<p>Initiate and participate effectively in a range of collaborative discussions (one-on-one, in groups, and teacher-led) with diverse partners <i>on grades 9–10 topics, texts, and issues</i>, building on others’ ideas and expressing their own clearly and persuasively.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Come to discussions prepared, having read and researched material under study; explicitly draw on that preparation by referring to evidence from texts and other research on the topic or issue to stimulate a thoughtful, well-reasoned exchange of ideas. b. Work with peers to set rules for collegial discussions and decision-making (e.g., informal consensus, taking votes on key issues, presentation of alternate views), clear goals and deadlines, and individual roles as needed. c. Propel conversations by posing and responding to questions that relate the

	<p>current discussion to broader themes or larger ideas; actively incorporate others into the discussion; and clarify, verify, or challenge ideas and conclusions.</p> <p>d. Respond thoughtfully to diverse perspectives, summarize points of agreement and disagreement, and, when warranted, qualify or justify their own views and understanding and make new connections in light of the evidence and reasoning presented.</p> <p>e. Seek to understand other perspectives and cultures and communicate effectively with audiences or individuals from varied backgrounds.</p>
L.9-10.4.a	<p>Determine or clarify the meaning of unknown and multiple-meaning words and phrases based on <i>grades 9–10 reading and content</i>, choosing flexibly from a range of strategies.</p> <p>a. Use context (e.g., the overall meaning of a sentence, paragraph, or text; a word's position or function in a sentence) as a clue to the meaning of a word or phrase.</p>

Assessment

Assessment(s)

Student learning is assessed via a Quick Write at the end of the lesson. Students respond to the following prompt, citing textual evidence to support analysis and inferences drawn from the text.

- Select a phrase from chapter 18. Explain how this phrase refines an idea that is common to chapters 17 and 18.

High Performance Response(s)

A High Performance Response should:

- Choose a phrase from chapter 18 to analyze. The phrase identified by students may vary. This section of text is rich with examples of strong language and examples of phrases that refine an idea. Some examples include:
 - “the princes who have accomplished great deeds are those who have thought little about keeping faith and who have known how cunningly to manipulate men’s minds; and in the end they have surpassed those who laid their foundations upon sincerity” (chapter 18, paragraph 1).
 - “a prince must know how to employ the nature of the one and the other; for the one without the other is not lasting” (chapter 18, paragraph 2).
 - “A wise ruler, therefore, cannot and should not keep his word when such an observance would be to his disadvantage” (chapter 18, paragraph 3).

- “Nevertheless, his deceptions always succeeded to his heart’s desire, since he knew this aspect of the world very well” (chapter 18, paragraph 4).
- “as I have said above, he should not depart from the good if it is possible to do so, but he should know how to enter into evil when forced by necessity” (chapter 18, paragraph 5).
- “Therefore, let a prince conquer and maintain the state, and his methods will always be judged honourable and praised by all” (chapter 18, paragraph 6).
- Identify an idea common to chapters 17 and 18 (e.g., A central idea of both chapter 17 and chapter 18 is ambition, or how to be the most successful prince possible by following Machiavelli’s rules, which is shown in the phrase “[t]herefore, let a prince conquer and maintain the state, and his methods will always be judged honorable and praised by all” (chapter 18, paragraph 6).).
- Analyze how this phrase refines that idea (e.g., This phrase shows how it is acceptable for a prince to do whatever he needs to do in order to fulfill his ambition of “conquer[ing] and maintain[ing] the state”(chapter 18, paragraph 6). Whatever the prince does, if he is successful it will “always be judged honourable” (chapter 18, paragraph 6).).

Vocabulary

Vocabulary to provide directly (will not include extended instruction)

- Alexander VI (n.) – pope from 1592 to 1503
- asserted (v.) – stated in a strong and definite way
- disposed (adj.) – wanting to do something or likely to do something
- tribunal (n.) – a court of justice

Vocabulary to teach (may include direct word work and/or questions)

- affirmations (n.) – statements or propositions that are declared to be true

Additional vocabulary to support English Language Learners (to provide directly)

- pope (n.) – head of the Roman Catholic church
- whom (pron.) – objective case of who (formal)
- necessity (n.) – something that you must have or do

Lesson Agenda/Overview

Student-Facing Agenda	% of Lesson
Standards & Text: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Standards: RI.9-10.5, SL.9-10.1.a-e, L.9-10.4.a Text: <i>The Prince</i> by Niccolò Machiavelli, Chapter 18: “How a prince should keep his word” 	
Learning Sequence: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Introduction of Lesson Agenda 2. Homework Accountability 3. Reading and Discussion 4. Collaborative Quote Collection Activity 5. Quick Write 6. Closing 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. 5% 2. 10% 3. 30% 4. 35% 5. 15% 6. 5%

Materials

- Chart paper
- Student copies of the Short Response Rubric and Checklist (refer to 10.4.1 Lesson 1)

Learning Sequence

How to Use the Learning Sequence	
Symbol	Type of Text & Interpretation of the Symbol
10%	Percentage indicates the percentage of lesson time each activity should take.
no symbol	Plain text indicates teacher action.
	Bold text indicates questions for the teacher to ask students.
	<i>Italicized text indicates a vocabulary word.</i>
►	Indicates student action(s).
💬	Indicates possible student response(s) to teacher questions.
❗	Indicates instructional notes for the teacher.

Activity 1: Introduction of Lesson Agenda

5%

Begin by reviewing the agenda and the assessed standard for this lesson: RI.9-10.5. In this final lesson before the End-of-Unit Assessment, students complete their reading and analysis of chapter 18 from *The Prince* and consider the impact of specific sentences on the development of an idea in the text.

- ▶ Students look at the agenda.

Activity 2: Homework Accountability

10%

Instruct students to talk in pairs about how they applied their chosen focus standard to their AIR text. Lead a brief share out on the previous lesson's AIR homework assignment. Select several students (or student pairs) to explain how they applied their focus standard to their AIR text.

- ▶ Students (or student pairs) discuss and share how they applied their focus standard to their AIR text from the previous lesson's homework.

Instruct student pairs to share their responses to the homework questions.

What, according to Machiavelli, is “very necessary” (chapter 18, paragraph 5) for a prince?

- ☞ It is “very necessary” to “appear to” have qualities such as appearing “merciful, faithful, humane, trustworthy [and] religious,” but not to necessarily actually have those qualities.

According to Machiavelli, what must a prince do “in order to maintain the state” (chapter 18, paragraph 5)?

- ☞ A prince must “often act against his faith, against charity, against humanity, and against religion” (chapter 18, paragraph 5), or be willing to go against his beliefs for the good of the state. A successful prince will “know how to enter into evil when forced by necessity” (chapter 18, paragraph 5).

Lead a brief whole-class discussion of student responses.

Activity 3: Reading and Discussion

30%

Instruct students to form the groups they established in 10.4.3 Lesson 1. Post or project each set of questions for students to discuss.

Instruct student groups to read paragraphs 4 and 5 (from “I do not wish to remain silent” through “how to enter into evil when forced by necessity”) and answer the following questions before sharing out with the class.

- ① Students have listened to a masterful reading of the full chapter, however, if necessary to support comprehension and fluency, consider having students listen to a masterful reading of the excerpt for the lesson.

Provide students with the following definitions: *Alexander VI* was “a controversial pope from the 14th century,” *assert* means “state with confidence,” and *disposed* means “having a certain inclination.”

- ① Students may be familiar with some of these words. Consider asking students to volunteer definitions before providing them to the class.
 - ▶ Students write the definitions of *Alexander VI*, *assert*, and *disposed* on their copy of the text or in a vocabulary journal.
- ① **Differentiation Consideration:** Consider providing students with the following definitions: *whom* means “objective case of who (formal)” and *necessity* means “something that you must have or do.”
 - ▶ Students write the definitions of *whom* and *necessity* on their copy of the text or in a vocabulary journal.
- ① **Differentiation Consideration:** It may be helpful for students to clarify the meaning of *pope* as “the head of the Roman Catholic church”—a religious leader—and ask students about religious leaders in their home culture.

How should a prince “appear” (chapter 18, paragraph 5)? How should a prince “act” (chapter 18, paragraph 5)?

- ☞ According to Machiavelli, a prince should “appear,” or pretend, to be virtuous. He should “for instance, to appear merciful, faithful, humane, trustworthy, religious” (chapter 18, paragraph 5). A prince should be able to “act” against his beliefs, to be able to “know how to change to the opposite” (chapter 18, paragraph 5).

How does the example of Alexander VI (chapter 18, paragraph 4) develop or refine these ideas?

- ☞ The example of “Alexander VI” shows a ruler who did not keep his word but “his deceptions always succeeded” (chapter 18, paragraph 4) and he always got his “heart’s desire” (chapter 18, paragraph 4). This example illustrates that Machiavelli’s rules for “How a prince should keep his word” (the chapter’s title) actually work and make a ruler more successful.
- ① **Differentiation Consideration:** If students struggle to reach this understanding, consider asking the following scaffolding questions.

According to Machiavelli, how did Alexander VI treat his “affirmations” (chapter 18, paragraph 5)?

- Alexander VI “observed them less” than anyone. His promises were based on “greater oaths” and he spoke with “more effectiveness” than anyone else, too (chapter 18, paragraph 4). Even though he did not keep his promises, he still got everything he wanted.

How can this description of Alexander VI’s actions help you make meaning of “affirmations” (chapter 18, paragraph 4)?

- Machiavelli is writing about how princes should or should not keep their promises—“how a prince should keep his word.” Machiavelli says that Alexander VI’s “affirmations” were backed by “oaths” and an oath is like a promise, and his “affirmations” ended up being “deceptions” which are the opposite of truth (chapter 18, paragraph 4). Therefore “affirmations” must mean something someone says or promises is the truth.
- ① Consider drawing students’ attention to their application of L.9-10.4.a through the use of context to make meaning of unknown vocabulary.

How does Machiavelli refine the distinction between men and princes in paragraph 5?

- Since there are different rules for princes, the prince can choose to “enter into evil,” but ordinary men must do “all those things” for which they “are considered good” and “not depart” from the good.
- ① Consider reminding students of the distinction between men and princes from previous lessons, as well as chapter 18, paragraph 3 for evidence to support this understanding: “If all men were good, this precept would not be good.”

Lead a brief whole-class discussion of student responses.

Instruct student groups to read paragraph 6 (from “Therefore, a prince must be very careful” through “taken away from him many times over”) and answer the following questions before sharing out with the class.

Provide students with the following definition: *tribunal* means “a court of justice.”

- ① Students may be familiar with this word. Consider asking students to volunteer the definition before providing it to the class.
- ▶ Students write the definition of *tribunal* on their copy of the text or in a vocabulary journal.

What is the ultimate goal, or “final result,” for a prince?

- The ultimate goal for a prince is to “conquer and maintain the state” (chapter 18, paragraph 6) and also to have a strong “reputation” (chapter 18, paragraph 6).

How does Machiavelli further refine the distinction between men and princes in paragraph 6?

- In this paragraph, Machiavelli makes a distinction between “[m]en in general” and princes (chapter 18, paragraph 6). “Men” can “judge more by their eyes” and are “taken in by appearances” (chapter 18, paragraph 6), meaning that if a prince tells a convincing lie, “ordinary people” will just be able to see the convincing part, and not be able to tell the prince is lying.
- ① **Differentiation Consideration:** Consider asking students to annotate the text for reasons why it is acceptable for a prince to do something “evil” that it is not acceptable for an “ordinary [person]” to do, to scaffold their analysis of this understanding.

Lead a brief whole-class discussion of student responses.

Activity 4: Collaborative Quote Collection Activity

35%

Assign each group a paragraph from chapter 18 and give each group a sheet of chart paper labeled with the assigned paragraph:

- Group One: chapter 18, paragraph 1, from “How praiseworthy it is for a prince” through “those who laid their foundations upon sincerity”
 - Group Two: chapter 18, paragraph 2, from “Therefore, you must know that there are two modes” through “for the one without the other is not lasting”
 - Group Three: chapter 18, paragraph 3, from “Since, then, a prince must know how” through “find someone who will let himself be deceived”
 - Group Four: chapter 18, paragraph 4, from “I do not wish to remain silent” through “this aspect of the world very well”
 - Group Five: chapter 18, paragraph 5, from “Therefore, it is not necessary for a prince” through “enter into evil when forced by necessity”
 - Group Six: chapter 18, paragraph 6, “Therefore, a prince must be very careful” through “taken away from him many times over”
- ① Consider preparing the chart paper with reading assignments recorded on the top before class.
- ① If there are more than six groups, multiple groups may consider the same passage but should have their own chart paper with the assigned reading for this activity.

Instruct student groups to identify and record phrases from their assigned portion of the text that refine an idea that is common to both chapters 17 and 18.

- ▶ Students work in groups to identify and record phrases that refine an idea common to chapter 17 and chapter 18.
- 💬 Student responses may vary. See assessment box at the beginning of this lesson for examples of phrases students may identify.
- ① Consider reminding students of their previous work with standard SL.9-10.1.a-e, which requires that students participate in collaborative discussions, building on each other's ideas and expressing their own clearly and persuasively.
- ① Consider reminding students to review their notes and annotation from chapter 17, as well as their homework from 10.4.3 Lesson 2 in order to identify a central idea common to both chapters.

After students have had time to find and record phrases that refine an idea in chapter 18, instruct students to move clockwise around the room to the next group's chart paper, read the phrases, and identify one of those phrases that best refines an idea in chapter 18. Students may vote individually for their choice of phrase by placing a dot on the chart paper, or make a group decision and vote together.

- ▶ Students move clockwise in their groups, working to identify the phrase that best refines an idea that is common to chapter 17 and chapter 18.
- ① Depending on time, consider stopping this activity after two or three rotations.

After students have had time to read the phrases and identify one that they feel best refines an idea that is common to chapter 17 and chapter 18, instruct student groups to share out with the full class which phrase they chose and why.

- ▶ Students share the phrase they chose, as well as their reasoning behind that choice.
- 💬 Student responses may vary. See the High Performance Response at the beginning of this lesson for an example of student reasoning.

Record and display the phrases identified by student groups. Instruct students to choose from and analyze one of these phrases for their Quick Write.

Activity 5: Quick Write

15%

Instruct students to respond briefly in writing to the following prompt:

Select a phrase from chapter 18. Explain how this phrase refines an idea that is common to chapters 17 and 18.

Instruct students to look at their annotations to find evidence. Ask students to use this lesson's vocabulary wherever possible in their written responses, and to practice using specific language and domain-specific vocabulary. Also, remind students to use the Short Response Rubric and Checklist to guide their written responses.

- ▶ Students listen and read the Quick Write prompt.

① Display the prompt for students to see, or provide the prompt in hard copy.

Transition to the independent Quick Write.

- ▶ Students independently answer the prompt, using evidence from the text.

🗨 See the High Performance Response at the beginning of this lesson.

Activity 6: Closing

5%

Display and distribute the homework assignment. For homework, instruct students to review their notes and annotations from *The Prince* and from *Macbeth* and gather evidence in response to the following prompt:

Would Macbeth be considered a successful prince under Machiavelli's rules? Why or why not? Use evidence from both *The Prince* and *Macbeth* to support your answer.

Students should be prepared for a group discussion in response to this prompt in the following lesson.

- ▶ Students follow along.

Homework

Review your notes and annotations from *The Prince* and from *Macbeth* and gather evidence in response to the following prompt:

Would Macbeth be considered a successful prince under Machiavelli's rules? Why or why not? Use evidence from both *The Prince* and *Macbeth* to support your answer.

Be prepared for a group discussion of your responses in the following lesson.