

10.4.3

Lesson 2

Introduction

In this lesson, students complete their reading of chapter 17 of *The Prince*: “Of cruelty and mercy, and whether it is better to be loved than to be feared or the contrary.” Students focus on chapter 17, paragraphs 3–6, in which Machiavelli concludes his argument regarding fear and love (from “A prince must nevertheless make himself feared” through “only he must seek to avoid being hated, as I have said”). Students determine Machiavelli’s point of view and analyze how he employs rhetoric—including the use of historical examples to build his argument, the use of comparison to prove a statement, and the use of absolute statements—and how the use of these rhetorical devices advance Machiavelli’s point of view. Student learning is assessed via a Quick Write at the end of the lesson: How does Machiavelli use rhetoric to advance his point of view in this chapter?

For homework, students preview chapter 18 and identify a central idea that is common to chapters 17 and 18 in preparation for their analysis of chapter 18 in following lessons.

Standards

Assessed Standard(s)	
RI.9-10.6	Determine an author’s point of view or purpose in a text and analyze how an author uses rhetoric to advance that point of view or purpose.
Addressed Standard(s)	
W.9-10.9.b	<p>Draw evidence from literary or informational texts to support analysis, reflection, and research.</p> <p>b. Apply <i>grades 9–10 Reading standards</i> to literary nonfiction (e.g., “Delineate and evaluate the argument and specific claims in a text, assessing whether the reasoning is valid and the evidence is relevant and sufficient; identify false statements and fallacious reasoning”).</p>
L.9-10.4.a	<p>Determine or clarify the meaning of unknown and multiple-meaning words and phrases based on <i>grades 9–10 reading and content</i>, choosing flexibly from a range of strategies.</p> <p>a. Use context (e.g., the overall meaning of a sentence, paragraph, or text; a word’s position or function in a sentence) as a clue to the meaning of a word or phrase.</p>

Assessment

Assessment(s)

Student learning is assessed via a Quick Write at the end of the lesson. Students respond to the following prompt, citing textual evidence to support analysis and inferences drawn from the text.

- How does Machiavelli use rhetoric to advance his point of view in this chapter?

High Performance Response(s)

A High Performance Response should:

- Identify Machiavelli's point of view (e.g., Machiavelli is a common man who is writing advice to a prince. His point of view is that princes should do whatever they need to do to get power and keep power, as well as "fame and glory" (chapter 17, paragraph 5).).
- Identify an example of rhetoric in this passage (e.g., In chapter 17 Machiavelli advances his point of view through the use of historical references, such as the contrasting the examples of Hannibal under whose rule "there never arose the slightest dissension" (chapter 17, paragraph 4) with Scipio under whose rule "armies in Spain rebelled against him" (chapter 17, paragraph 5).).
- Analyze how Machiavelli's use of rhetoric advances his point of view (e.g., The historical references show that things were better when princes followed the kinds of rule Machiavelli lays out, since Hannibal's armies did not rebel and Scipio's did.).

Vocabulary

Vocabulary to provide directly (will not include extended instruction)

- patrimony (n.) – property you receive from your father when he dies
- dissension (n.) – disagreement that causes people in a group to argue about something that is important to them
- venerable (adj.) – calling forth respect through age, character and attainments
- superficially (adv.) – not thoroughly or completely
- licence (n.) – freedom to act however one wants to
- censured (adj.) – officially criticized strongly and publicly

Vocabulary to teach (may include direct word work and/or questions)

- abstains (v.) – chooses not to do or have something
- virtues (n.) – good and moral qualities

Additional vocabulary to support English Language Learners (to provide directly)

- gift (n.) – something that is given to another person
- advice (n.) – an opinion or suggestion about what someone should do
- avoid (v.) – to stay away from someone or something
- acquire (v.) – get something; come to own something
- luck (n.) – the things that happen to a person because of chance
- condemn (v.) – say in a strong and definite way that someone or something is bad or wrong
- compassion (n.) – a feeling of wanting to help someone who is sick, hungry, in trouble, etc.
- at the pleasure of the prince (idiom) – because the prince wants it to be done

Lesson Agenda/Overview

Student-Facing Agenda	% of Lesson
Standards & Text: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Standards: RI.9-10.6, W.9-10.9.b, L.9-10.4.a • Text: <i>The Prince</i> by Niccolò Machiavelli, Chapter 17: “Of cruelty and mercy, and whether it is better to be loved than to be feared or the contrary” 	
Learning Sequence: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Introduction of Lesson Agenda 2. Homework Accountability 3. Reading and Discussion 4. Quick Write 5. Closing 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. 5% 2. 20% 3. 60% 4. 10% 5. 5%

Materials

- Student copies of the Short Response Rubric and Checklist (refer to 10.4.1 Lesson 1)

Learning Sequence

How to Use the Learning Sequence	
Symbol	Type of Text & Interpretation of the Symbol
10%	Percentage indicates the percentage of lesson time each activity should take.
no symbol	Plain text indicates teacher action.
	Bold text indicates questions for the teacher to ask students.
	<i>Italicized text indicates a vocabulary word.</i>
►	Indicates student action(s).
💬	Indicates possible student response(s) to teacher questions.
❗	Indicates instructional notes for the teacher.

Activity 1: Introduction of Lesson Agenda

5%

Begin by reviewing the agenda and the assessed standard for this lesson: RI.9-10.6. In this lesson, students complete their reading of chapter 17, determine Machiavelli's point of view, analyze how he employs rhetoric, and consider how the use of rhetoric advances Machiavelli's point of view.

- Students look at the agenda.

Activity 2: Homework Accountability

20%

Instruct students to Turn-and-Talk in pairs about how they responded to the homework prompt:

How does this letter reveal Machiavelli's point of view in *The Prince*?

- 💬 This letter reveals that Machiavelli is a man "of low and inferior social condition" who is writing this book as a valuable gift for a governing ruler. Machiavelli is sharing "the knowledge of the deeds of great men" and "rules for the governance of princes." Machiavelli knows the "rules" from "a long experience in modern affairs and a continuous study of antiquity" and believes there is a right and wrong way for princes to act (paragraph 1).

- ❗ **Differentiation Consideration:** If students struggle to determine Machiavelli's point of view, consider asking the following scaffolding questions:

To whom does Machiavelli address this letter?

- 💬 Machiavelli addresses this letter to "the Magnificent Lorenzo de' Medici," whom he calls "Your Magnificence" (paragraph 1). Lorenzo must be a prince or governing ruler.

How does Machiavelli describe himself as compared to this addressee?

- ☞ Machiavelli is a man “of the people.” He says he is “a man of low and inferior social condition.” Machiavelli is in a “low position” compared to Lorenzo, who is in a position of power, like the difference between “plains” and “mountains” (paragraph 1).

How does Machiavelli describe his book in this letter?

- ☞ Machiavelli calls *The Prince* a “gift,” a “thing[] which [he] value[s] most,” “little book,” “could not be a greater gift” (paragraph 1). He compares the book to many other valuable things like animals and money. Machiavelli thinks this book is very important and valuable.

What kind of information does Machiavelli state this book contains?

- ☞ Machiavelli states this book contains “knowledge of the deeds of great men” and “rules for the governance of princes” and information about “the nature of princes” (paragraph 1). This book is meant to show a prince the rules for being the most successful prince possible.
- ① **Differentiation Consideration:** Consider explaining to students that the author of this work wrote this book as a gift of advice for his prince. Ensure that students have an understanding of *gift*, *advice*, and *prince*.

Lead a brief whole-class discussion of student responses.

Activity 3: Reading and Discussion**60%**

Instruct students to form the small groups established in 10.4.3 Lesson 1. Post or project each set of questions below for students to discuss.

Instruct student groups to read paragraphs 3 through 6 of chapter 17 (from “A prince must nevertheless make himself feared” through “only he must seek to avoid being hated, as I have said”) and annotate for evidence of rhetoric.

- ① Students have listened to a masterful reading of this chapter; however, if necessary to support comprehension and fluency, consider having students listen to a masterful reading of the excerpt for the lesson.
- ① Consider reminding students of their work with rhetoric in Modules 10.2 and 10.3, and informing them that they will build upon this understanding throughout this unit. If necessary, remind students that rhetoric refers to the specific techniques that writers or speakers use to create meaning in a text, enhance a text or a speech, and in particular, persuade readers or listeners. Point out to students that they use rhetoric in everyday speech to persuade others to agree with a

particular point of view. It may be helpful to review several rhetorical techniques such as figurative language, rhetorical questions, and alliteration.

🗨 Student annotations may include:

- Historical references: “the remarkable deeds of Hannibal” (paragraph 4); “the case of Scipio,” “censured in the Senate by Fabius Maximus,” “when Locri was destroyed” (paragraph 5).
- Contrast: “men forget the death of their father more quickly than the loss of their patrimony” (paragraph 3); “that it is true that [Hannibal’s] other virtues would not have been sufficient can be seen from the case of Scipio” (paragraph 5).

① Consider reminding students of their work in Module 10.2 with the rhetorical use of historical references and contrast.

Remind students to annotate their texts for examples of rhetoric, using the code RD. Explain to students that annotating will help them keep track of evidence they will be using later in the lesson assessment.

① This focused annotation supports students’ engagement with W.9-10.9.b, which addresses the use of textual evidence in writing.

Instruct student groups to reread paragraph 3, from “A prince must nevertheless make himself feared” through “on the other hand, are rarer and more fleeting,” and answer the following questions before sharing out with the class.

Provide students with the following definition: *patrimony* means “property you receive from your father when he dies.”

① Students may be familiar with this word. Consider asking students to volunteer the definition before providing it to the class.

- ▶ Students write the definition of *patrimony* on their copy of the text or in a vocabulary journal.

① **Differentiation Consideration:** Consider providing students with the following definitions: *avoid* means “stay away from someone or something” and *acquire* means “get something; come to own something.”

- ▶ Students write the definitions of *avoid* and *acquire* on their copy of the text or in a vocabulary journal.

How does Machiavelli's use of "always" and "never" advance his point of view in paragraph 3?

- ☞ "Always" and "never" advance Machiavelli's point of view by making the things he is writing seem like they are definitely true.

① Consider drawing students' attention to Machiavelli's use of absolute words and phrases as an example of a rhetorical device in this text.

What reason does Machiavelli cite for advising that princes "abstain" from a certain type of behavior?

- ☞ It is safer for princes to "abstain from seizing the property of others" (paragraph 3) because it will make their subjects less upset and help the prince "avoid hatred" (paragraph 3). This allows princes to be "feared and yet not hated" (paragraph 3).

① **Differentiation Consideration:** If students struggle to make meaning of "abstain" in the context of this question, consider asking them the following scaffolding question:

How can the familiar word "avoid" help you make meaning of "abstain" in paragraph 3?

- ☞ "Avoid" means to stay away from something, so "abstain" probably means to stay away from some behavior or action.

① Consider drawing students' attention to the application of L.9-10.4.a through the process of using context to make meaning of unknown words.

How does this reasoning advance Machiavelli's point of view?

- ☞ Machiavelli believes princes should be trying to "make [themselves] feared" (paragraph 3) as a good way for them to maintain control, but that to be "hated" (paragraph 3) is a bad thing for princes, so it should be avoided. This reasoning advances Machiavelli's point of view by further explaining one of his rules for the best prince behavior.

Lead a brief whole-class discussion of student responses.

Instruct student groups to reread paragraphs 4 and 5 (from "But when the prince is with his armies" through "concealed but also contributed to his glory") and answer the following questions before sharing out with the class.

Provide students with the definitions: *dissension* means "disagreement that causes people in a group to argue about something that is important to them," *venerable* means "calling forth respect through age, character and attainments," *superficially* means "not thoroughly or completely," *licence* means "freedom to act however one wants to," *censured* means "a judgment involving condemnation; official strong criticism."

- ① Students may be familiar with some of these words. Consider asking students to volunteer definitions before providing them to the class.
 - ▶ Students write the definitions of *dissension*, *venerable*, *superficially*, *licence*, and *censured* on their copy of the text or in a vocabulary journal.
- ① **Differentiation Consideration:** Consider providing students with the following definitions: *luck* means “the things that happen to a person because of chance” and *condemn* means “say in a strong and definite way that someone or something is bad or wrong.”
 - ▶ Students write the definitions of *luck* and *condemn* on their copy of the text or in a vocabulary journal.
- ① Consider reminding students to use the Explanatory Notes and Glossary of Proper Names in the text to make meaning of the historical references in this section.

How does Machiavelli compare his own work to that of other “historians” (paragraph 4)?

- ☛ Machiavelli believes that other historians “considered this matter very superficially” (paragraph 4), meaning that they did not make deep and thoughtful observations about these historical examples. Machiavelli’s work, by comparison, is more than surface level.

How can this comparison refine your understanding of Machiavelli’s point of view?

- ☛ Machiavelli advances his point of view by making himself seem the most knowledgeable since the other historians did not do an in-depth analysis of the historic examples Machiavelli identifies.

How does Machiavelli’s description of “inhuman cruelty” as a “virtue” advance his point of view in paragraph 4?

- ☛ Hannibal’s “virtues” include “inhuman cruelty” and “many other virtues” (paragraph 4). Since “inhuman cruelty” is the only virtue that Machiavelli is specific about it seems to be the most important. While cruelty is not typically considered a positive quality, it was valuable for Hannibal. The idea that cruelty can be a virtue reinforces Machiavelli’s point of view that there are different rules for princes than there are for the common people.
- ① **Differentiation Consideration:** If students struggle to make meaning of “virtues” in the context of this question, consider asking them the following scaffolding question:

How can the familiar word “quality” help you make meaning of “virtues” in paragraph 4?

“Quality” sometimes means how good or bad something is and sometimes means a characteristic or feature of something, and “virtues” are being described by Machiavelli as something that princes want, so “virtues” are probably positive features of a person.

- ① Consider drawing students’ attention to the application of L.9-10.4.a through the process of using context to make meaning of unknown words.

What comparison does Machiavelli make between Scipio and Hannibal?

Hannibal’s main virtue was “inhuman cruelty” (paragraph 4) and Scipio’s main problem was his “excessive compassion” (paragraph 5). Everyone was afraid of Hannibal and no one was afraid of Scipio.

How does this comparison advance Machiavelli’s point of view?

Since Scipio had the common quality that is considered positive (“compassion”) but he failed, and Hannibal had a quality that is commonly considered negative (“cruelty”) but he succeeded, this advances Machiavelli’s point of view that there are different rules for princes than there are for common men.

Lead a brief whole-class discussion of student responses.

Instruct student groups to reread paragraph 6 (from “Let me conclude, then—returning to the issue of being feared and loved” through “only he must seek to avoid being hated, as I have said”) and answer the following questions before sharing out with the class.

- ① **Differentiation Consideration:** Consider provide students with the following definitions: *compassion* means “a feeling of wanting to help someone who is sick, hungry, in trouble, etc.,” and *at the pleasure of the prince* means “because the prince wants it to be done.”
- ▶ Students write the definitions of *compassion* and *at the pleasure of the prince* on their copy of the text or in a vocabulary journal.

In your own words, summarize Machiavelli’s conclusion.

- Machiavelli comes to the conclusion that it is acceptable to be both feared and loved, but it is never acceptable to be hated.
- ① Encourage students to recall their understanding from 10.4.3, Lesson 1. Ask students to consider how their understanding of this conclusion has developed throughout reading chapter 17.

- ① **Differentiation Consideration:** If students struggle, consider asking the following question in place of the above:

Does Machiavelli think it is better for princes to have people love them or have people be afraid of them?

- 💬 Machiavelli thinks it is better for princes to be “feared and loved” and that they should not ever be “hated” (paragraph 6).

How does the use of rhetoric in paragraphs 3–6 support his conclusion?

- 💬 Machiavelli’s historical examples of Hannibal and Scipio and absolute statements—“always” (paragraph 3), “never” (paragraph 3)—in these paragraphs support his conclusion by making it seem true in this context. Machiavelli makes it seem as though his conclusion is the only conclusion possible after considering these examples.

Lead a brief whole-class discussion of student responses.

Activity 4: Quick Write

10%

Instruct students to respond briefly in writing to the following prompt:

How does Machiavelli use rhetoric to advance his point of view in this chapter?

Instruct students to look at their annotations to find evidence. Ask students to use this lesson’s vocabulary wherever possible in their written responses, and to practice using specific language and domain-specific vocabulary. Also, remind students to use the Short Response Rubric and Checklist to guide their written responses.

- ▶ Students listen and read the Quick Write prompt.

- ① Display the prompt for students to see, or provide the prompt in hard copy.

Transition to the independent Quick Write.

- ▶ Students independently answer the prompt, using evidence from the text.
- 💬 See the High Performance Response at the beginning of this lesson.

Activity 5: Closing

5%

Display and distribute the homework assignment. For homework, instruct students to review their notes and annotations from chapter 17, preview chapter 18, and identify a central idea that is common to chapters 17 and 18.

- ▶ Students follow along.

Homework

Review your notes and annotations from chapter 17 of *The Prince*, preview chapter 18, and identify a central idea that is common to chapters 17 and 18.