

## 10.2.2

## Lesson 7

## Introduction

In this lesson, students read and analyze paragraphs 20–22 of “A Genetics of Justice” (from “My mother, especially lived in terror of the consequences” to “I was a real thorn in my mother’s side”), in which Alvarez elaborates on her description of her mother’s enduring terror of the Trujillo regime and the “mandate of silence” she imposes on her family. After engaging in an evidence-based discussion of the ideas developed in paragraphs 20–22, students participate in small group discussions in which they determine how these ideas refine ideas from paragraphs 3–7.

The lesson closes with a Quick Write on the following prompt: In paragraphs 20–22, how does Alvarez further develop ideas she introduces in paragraphs 3–7? For homework, students write a paragraph analyzing how Alvarez develops her description of her mother in relation to Trujillo. Additionally, students continue to read their AIR text and prepare for a brief discussion on how they applied their chosen focus standard to their text.

## Standards

Assessed Standard(s)	
RI.9-10.5	Analyze in detail how an author’s ideas or claims are developed and refined by particular sentences, paragraphs, or longer portions of a text (e.g., a section or chapter).
Addressed Standard(s)	
W.9-10.9.b	<p>Draw evidence from literary or informational texts to support analysis, reflection, and research.</p> <p>b. Apply <i>grades 9–10 Reading standards</i> to literary nonfiction (e.g., “Delineate and evaluate the argument and specific claims in a text, assessing whether the reasoning is valid and the evidence is relevant and sufficient; identify false statements and fallacious reasoning”).</p>
SL.9-10.1.a-e	<p>Initiate and participate effectively in a range of collaborative discussions (one-on-one, in groups, and teacher-led) with diverse partners on <i>grades 9–10 topics, texts, and issues</i>, building on others’ ideas and expressing their own clearly and persuasively.</p> <p>a. Come to discussions prepared, having read and researched material under study; explicitly draw on that preparation by referring to evidence from texts and other</p>

	<p>research on the topic or issue to stimulate a thoughtful, well-reasoned exchange of ideas.</p> <p>b. Work with peers to set rules for collegial discussions and decision-making (e.g., informal consensus, taking votes on key issues, presentation of alternate views), clear goals and deadlines, and individual roles as needed.</p> <p>c. Propel conversations by posing and responding to questions that relate the current discussion to broader themes or larger ideas; actively incorporate others into the discussion; and clarify, verify, or challenge ideas and conclusions.</p> <p>d. Respond thoughtfully to diverse perspectives, summarize points of agreement and disagreement, and, when warranted, qualify or justify their own views and understanding and make new connections in the light of the evidence and reasoning presented.</p> <p>e. Seek to understand other perspectives and cultures and communicate effectively with audiences or individuals from varied backgrounds.</p>
--	--

## Assessment

Assessment(s)
<p>Student learning is assessed via a Quick Write at the end of the lesson. Students respond to the following prompt, citing textual evidence to support analysis and inferences drawn from the text.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>In paragraphs 20–22, how does Alvarez further develop ideas she introduces in paragraphs 3–7?</li> </ul>
High Performance Response(s)
<p>A High Performance Response should:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Identify ideas common to paragraphs 3–7 and paragraphs 20–22 (e.g., silence, trauma, etc.).</li> <li>Discuss how the ideas from paragraphs 20–22 develop the ideas from paragraphs 3–7 (e.g., in paragraphs 3–7 Alvarez describes the trauma of living under Trujillo: Alvarez’s mother loses family friends who turn out to have “been disappeared” (par. 5). The shock of finding out that Trujillo is a “cold-blooded monster” is all the greater for Alvarez’s mother because she had “innocently revered him” (par. 6). In paragraphs 20–22, Alvarez develops the idea that her parents, especially her mother, continue to be affected by the trauma of life under Trujillo even after his death: “My mother . . . lived in terror of the consequences of living as free citizens” (par. 20). She further refines this idea by showing how her parents not only live in silence as if they were still living under Trujillo, but also impose silence on their daughters as Trujillo did on them: her mother repeats the phrase “En boca cerrada no entran moscas,” which was scratched on the lintel of La Cuarenta, the SIM torture center (par. 21). Alvarez’s mother imposes a “mandate of silence” just as Trujillo did (par. 22)).</li> </ul>

## Vocabulary

Vocabulary to provide directly (will not include extended instruction)
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>lintel (n.) – horizontal architectural member supporting the weight above an opening, as a window or a door</li> <li>mandate (n.) – authoritative order or command</li> </ul>
Vocabulary to teach (may include direct word work and/or questions)
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>None.</li> </ul>

## Lesson Agenda/Overview

Student-Facing Agenda	% of Lesson
<b>Standards &amp; Text:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Standards: RI.9-10.5, W.9-10.9.b, SL.9-10.1.a–e</li> <li>Text: “A Genetics of Justice” by Julia Alvarez, paragraphs 20–22</li> </ul>	
<b>Learning Sequence:</b> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Introduction of Lesson Agenda</li> <li>Homework Accountability</li> <li>Masterful Reading</li> <li>Reading and Discussion</li> <li>Small Group Discussion</li> <li>Quick Write</li> <li>Closing</li> </ol>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>5%</li> <li>15%</li> <li>5%</li> <li>30%</li> <li>30%</li> <li>10%</li> <li>5%</li> </ol>

## Materials

- Copies of the Paragraphs 20–22 Discussion Tool for each student
- Student copies of the Short Response Rubric (refer to 10.2.1 Lesson 1)

## Learning Sequence

How to Use the Learning Sequence	
Symbol	Type of Text & Interpretation of the Symbol
10%	Percentage indicates the percentage of lesson time each activity should take.
no symbol	Plain text indicates teacher action.
	<b>Bold text indicates questions for the teacher to ask students.</b>
	<i>Italicized text indicates a vocabulary word.</i>
►	Indicates student action(s).
💬	Indicates possible student response(s) to teacher questions.
❗	Indicates instructional notes for the teacher.

### Activity 1: Introduction of Lesson Agenda

5%

Begin by reviewing the agenda and assessed standard for this lesson: RI.9-10.5. In this lesson, students explore how Alvarez develops ideas from paragraphs 3–7 in paragraphs 20–22. Students engage in evidence-based discussion as well as complete a brief writing assignment to close the lesson.

- Students look at the agenda.

### Activity 2: Homework Accountability

15%

Ask individual students to share the results of their investigations into the Mirabal sisters from the 10.2.2 Lesson 6 homework (Conduct a brief search into the Mirabal sisters and write a short paragraph explaining who they were and their significance in the history of the Dominican Republic.).

💬 Student responses should include:

- The Mirabal sisters were Patria, Dedé, Minerva, and Maria Teresa Mirabal.
- The Mirabal sisters were political dissidents who became involved in the movement against Trujillo.
- The underground resistance movement that the Mirabal sisters formed was called the Movement of the Fourteenth of June, after a massacre that Patria witnessed while on a religious retreat.
- The Movement of the Fourteenth of June distributed pamphlets about Trujillo's crimes and obtained materials to make guns and bombs for an armed revolt.
- The Mirabal sisters named themselves “Las Mariposas” or “The Butterflies” after Minerva's underground name.
- Trujillo had Minerva and Maria Teresa imprisoned and tortured on several occasions.

- On November 25, 1960, Minerva, Maria Teresa, Patria, and their driver were stopped by Trujillo's men and beaten to death. Their death was made to look like a car accident.
- Dedé created a museum in honor of her sisters called the *Museo Hermanas Mirabal*.
- Dedé died in February 2014.
- In 1994, Julia Alvarez published a novel called *In The Time of the Butterflies* about the sisters.

---

Instruct students to take out their paragraphs 20–22 annotations (Read and annotate paragraphs 20–22 for central ideas, using the annotation code “CI.”) and do a Turn-and-Talk in pairs about their annotations. Instruct student pairs to discuss, based on their annotation, the ideas Alvarez develops in these paragraphs.

🗣 Student responses may include:

- Trauma
- Silence

Remind students that annotating helps them keep track of evidence they use later in the End-of-Unit Assessment, which focuses on the development of central ideas.

① This focused annotation supports students' engagement with W.9-10.9.b, which addresses the use of textual evidence in writing.

### Activity 3: Masterful Reading

**5%**

Have students listen to a Masterful Reading of “A Genetics of Justice” paragraphs 20–22 (from “My mother, especially lived in terror of the consequences” to “I was a real thorn in my mother's side”). Instruct students to follow along and listen for details that develop ideas from earlier in the essay.

- ▶ Students follow along, reading silently.

### Activity 4: Reading and Discussion

**30%**

Instruct students to form pairs. Post or project each set of questions below for students to discuss.

Instruct student pairs to reread paragraph 20 from (“My mother, especially lived in terror of the consequences” to “The same thing could happen to us”) and answer the following questions before sharing out with the class.

**How does Alvarez's use of the word *especially* further develop an idea that she introduces in paragraphs 2–6?**

Student responses may include:

- Alvarez’s comment that her mother “especially” lived in terror of Trujillo even after his fall recalls her statement in paragraph 2 that “Especially, I imagine my mother’s life.”
- Alvarez explains in paragraphs 2 and 3 that her mother was sheltered from the truth about Trujillo for a long time because her grandparents were afraid to criticize the regime and because “families such as hers kept their daughters out of the public eye.”
- As a result, Alvarez suggests in paragraph 6 that the reality of the dictatorship had a greater impact on her mother than on her father: “Perhaps because she had innocently revered him, my mother was now doubly revolted by this cold-blooded monster.”
- The word “especially” in paragraph 20 develops this by suggesting that her mother was more deeply and more lastingly affected by living under Trujillo.

① **Differentiation Consideration:** If students struggle, consider posing the following questions:

**Whose life does Alvarez “especially” imagine in paragraph 2?**

Alvarez “especially” imagines her mother’s life in paragraph 2.

**Why does Alvarez suggest that her mother “knew nothing of the horrid crimes of the dictatorship” in paragraphs 2 and 3?**

Student responses may include:

- Alvarez notes that families like her mother’s “kept their daughters out of the public eye” (par. 2).
- Alvarez tells the reader that her grandparents were afraid to say anything against Trujillo, “even to their own children” (par. 3).

**What is the impact on Alvarez’s mother of her sheltered upbringing in paragraphs 3 to 6?**

Student responses may include:

- Alvarez suggests that her mother was “intrigued” by Trujillo and that he must have appeared to her as “a kind of movie star” (par. 3). She even suggests that her mother may have had romantic fantasies about “the handsome young dictator” (par. 4).
- In paragraph 6, Alvarez suggests that because of her previous admiration of Trujillo, it came as a great shock to her mother to learn of his crimes and that “[p]erhaps because she had innocently revered him, my mother was now doubly revolted by this cold-blooded monster.”

**What does the word *especially* imply about Alvarez’s mother in paragraph 20?**

It implies that she was more affected than Alvarez’s father by living under Trujillo’s rule.

**How do Alvarez’s specific word choices develop the idea of trauma in the first three sentences of paragraph 20?**

💬 Student responses may include:

- Alvarez refers to her mother’s “terror” of consequences: this is a very strong word, implying great fear.
- Alvarez states that her mother became “hysterical” when her father attended political meetings, suggesting a response beyond regular anxiety.

**What consequences does Alvarez’s mother fear as a result of her husband’s activities?**

💬 Student responses may include:

- Alvarez’s mother is afraid that the SIM will find out about Alvarez’s father’s activities.
- Alvarez’s mother is afraid that “family members remaining behind” in the Dominican Republic will be in danger.
- Alvarez’s mother fears that even in New York, the family “could suffer consequences.”
- Alvarez’s mother cites the example of Galíndez, an exiled anti-Trujillo activist who disappeared from the New York subway, and worries that the same could happen to one of her family.

Lead a brief, whole-class discussion of student responses. Distribute a Paragraphs 20–22 Discussion Tool to each student and ask them to write in the first column the central ideas as discussed here. Then in the third column, instruct students to write how the ideas have developed in paragraph 20.

---

Instruct student pairs to read and analyze paragraph 21 (from “I don’t know if my father complied” to “the entrance of the SIM’s torture center at La Cuarenta”) and answer the following questions before sharing out with the class.

**What is the impact of Alvarez’s choice to begin paragraph 21 with the words “I don’t know”?**

- 💬 By beginning the paragraph with the phrase “I don’t know,” Alvarez develops the idea of silence, highlighting the fact that she has been kept in the dark by her parents’ silence.

**How does Alvarez develop the idea of silence in paragraph 21?**

💬 Student responses may include:

- Alvarez refers to the fact that “[her father’s] silence deepened” after he abandoned his political activities.
- Alvarez highlights the “hushed voices” in which her parents speak about the Dominican Republic.

- Twice in the paragraph, Alvarez notes her own ignorance, saying that she “knew very little” about what was going on in the Dominican Republic.

**Who imposes silence on the Alvarez household? Provide an example from the text to support your response.**

💬 Student responses may include:

- Alvarez’s parents impose silence on their daughters.
- An example of this is when they confiscate the copy of *Time* magazine that reports the death of the Mirabal sisters.

① Students should be familiar with the Mirabal sisters from the 10.2.2 Lesson 6 homework.

**Paraphrase Alvarez’s mother’s saying, “No flies fly into a closed mouth” (paragraph 20).**

💬 Nothing bad happens if you keep silent.

① **Differentiation Consideration:** If students struggle, consider posing the following questions:

**To whom does Alvarez’s mother use the phrase “No flies fly into a closed mouth”?**

💬 She uses it to Alvarez and her sisters.

**When does Alvarez’s mother say, “No flies fly into a closed mouth”?**

💬 She says this when Alvarez and her sisters ask “our many questions.”

**Where else does Alvarez reveal that this saying was to be found?**

💬 The saying was on one of Trujillo’s torture centers.

**How does Alvarez’s description of her parents’ imposition of silence in paragraph 21 develop and refine the idea of trauma?**

💬 Student responses may include:

- In paragraph 17, Alvarez refers to “habits of repression, censorship, terror” which continued long after Trujillo fell from power. In paragraph 21, she shows how the trauma of living under dictatorship remains in her parents even in New York.
- In paragraph 21, Alvarez refines this idea of “habits” of trauma by showing that Alvarez’s parents not only continue to live as if under a dictatorship, but they also impose the same fear on others, forcing silence and censorship on their daughters, for example, by taking away the magazine.



Provide students with the following definition: *lintel* means “horizontal architectural member supporting the weight above an opening, as a window or a door.”

- ▶ Students write the definition of *lintel* on their copy of the text or in a vocabulary journal.

### How does Alvarez draw a connection between her mother’s response to questions and Trujillo?

💬 Student responses may include:

- By quoting the phrase “En boca cerrada no entran moscas” in Spanish first, Alvarez emphasizes its origins in the Dominican Republic.
- Alvarez adds the detail that the phrase was scratched on the lintel of one of Trujillo’s torture centers.

Lead a brief, whole-class discussion of student responses. Instruct students to use their Paragraphs 20–22 Discussion Tools to record how central ideas have developed in paragraph 21.

---

Provide students with the following definition: *mandate* means “authoritative order or command.”

- ▶ Students write the definition of *mandate* on their copy of the text or in a vocabulary journal.

Instruct student pairs to read and analyze paragraph 22, “Given this mandate of silence, I was a real thorn in my mother’s side,” and answer the following questions before sharing out with the class.

### What is the impact of Alvarez’s choice of the words “mandate of silence” in paragraph 22?

- 💬 By calling it a “mandate,” Alvarez implies that her mother was acting like a dictator, like Trujillo.

### What kind of relationship does Alvarez suggest between herself and her mother in paragraph 22?

- 💬 Alvarez states that she was “a real thorn in my mother’s side,” suggesting conflict.

Lead a brief, whole-class discussion of student responses. Instruct students to use their Paragraphs 20–22 Discussion Tools to record how central ideas have developed in paragraph 22.

## Activity 5: Small Group Discussion

**30%**

Direct students to form small groups. Explain to students that they are going to participate in a small-group discussion around the following prompt:

**Identify ideas common to paragraphs 3–7 and paragraphs 20–22. Support your responses with evidence from the text.**

Direct students to take out their Paragraphs 20–22 Discussion Tool. Instruct students to take notes on their tool during the small group discussions. Explain to students that throughout their reading and discussion in the previous activity, they have likely completed columns 1 and 3 of the tool and should use column 2 to write about connections to paragraphs 3–7.

- ▶ Students in small groups discuss the prompt and take notes using the Paragraphs 20–22 Discussion Tool.
- 🗨 See the Model Paragraphs 20–22 Discussion Tool for sample student responses.

Conduct a brief whole-class discussion, asking groups to discuss how Alvarez further develops ideas from paragraphs 3–7 in paragraphs 20–22.

- ① Consider reminding students of their previous work with standard SL.9-10.1.a–e, which requires that students participate in collaborative discussions, drawing on reading and research, and probing reasoning while remaining respectful of diverse perspectives.

## Activity 6: Quick Write

**10%**

Instruct students to respond briefly in writing to the following prompt:

**In paragraphs 20–22, how does Alvarez further develop ideas she introduces in paragraphs 3–7?**

Instruct students to look at their annotations and tools to find evidence. Ask students to use this lesson’s vocabulary wherever possible in their written responses and to practice using specific language and domain-specific vocabulary. Remind students to use the Short Response Rubric and Checklist to guide their written responses.

- ① Display the prompt for students to see, or provide the prompt in hard copy.
- ▶ Students independently answer the prompt using evidence from the text.
- 🗨 See the High Performance Response at the beginning of this lesson.

## Activity 7: Closing

**5%**

Display and distribute the homework assignment. For homework, instruct students to reread paragraphs 1–22 and write a paragraph in response to the following prompt:

**Analyze how Alvarez develops her description of her mother in relation to Trujillo in paragraphs 1–22.**

Ask students to use this lesson’s vocabulary wherever possible in their written responses. Remind students to use the Short Response Rubric and Checklist to guide their written responses.

Additionally, students should continue to read their AIR text through the lens of a focus standard of their choice and prepare for a 3–5 minute discussion of their text based on that standard.

- ▶ Students follow along.

## Homework

Reread paragraphs 1–22 and write a paragraph in response to the following prompt:

**Analyze how Alvarez develops her description of her mother in relation to Trujillo in paragraphs 1–22.**

Use the Short Response Rubric and Checklist to guide your written responses and use this lesson’s vocabulary wherever possible.

Additionally, continue reading your AIR text through the lens of a focus standard of your choice and prepare for a 3–5 minute discussion of your text based on that standard.

## Paragraphs 20–22 Discussion Tool

<b>Name:</b>		<b>Class:</b>		<b>Date:</b>	
--------------	--	---------------	--	--------------	--

Idea	Introduction in Paragraphs 3–7 (with textual evidence)	Development in Paragraphs 20–22 (with textual evidence)

## Model Paragraphs 20–22 Discussion Tool

<b>Name:</b>		<b>Class:</b>		<b>Date:</b>	
--------------	--	---------------	--	--------------	--

Idea	Introduction in Paragraphs 3–7 (with textual evidence)	Development in Paragraphs 20–22 (with textual evidence)
Trauma	<p>Alvarez’s mother loses friends to Trujillo’s regime: “Thousands had lost their lives in failed attempts to return the country to democracy” (par. 5).</p> <p>The discovery of the true nature of Trujillo’s regime is all the more devastating for Alvarez’s mother because she had admired him: “Perhaps because she had innocently revered him, my mother was now doubly revolted by this cold-blooded monster” (par. 6). He becomes an “obsession” (par. 6).</p>	<p>Alvarez develops the idea of trauma by showing how the habits of terror continue to influence her parents even after their escape: “My mother . . . lived in terror of the consequences of living as free citizens” (par. 20).</p> <p>She further refines the idea of trauma by showing how Alvarez’s parents, especially her mother, act like a dictator to their own daughters: her mother repeats the phrase “En boca cerrada no entran moscas,” which was scratched on the lintel of La Cuarenta, the SIM torture center (par. 21). She imposes a “mandate of silence” (par. 22).</p>
Silence	<p>Alvarez’s grandparents are afraid to speak against Trujillo in paragraph 3: “her [mother’s] parents were afraid to say anything—even to their own children—against the regime.”</p>	<p>Alvarez emphasizes the silence that surrounds the Dominican Republic in her family. After her father stops going to meetings “his silence deepened” (par. 21); her mother imposes a “mandate of silence” (par. 22) and reminds her daughters that, “No flies fly into a closed mouth,” meaning that safety lies in silence (par. 21).</p>