

10.2.3

Lesson 3

Introduction

In this lesson, students read and analyze paragraphs 3–9 of Eleanor Roosevelt’s speech “On the Adoption of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights” (from “I feel bound to say that I think” to “economic, social and cultural rights set forth in these articles”) in which Roosevelt further develops her argument for adopting *The Universal Declaration of Human Rights* (UDHR). Through an evidence-based jigsaw discussion, students delineate and evaluate how Roosevelt supplements her claim about rejecting the Soviet delegation’s proposals without debate. Student learning is captured in a Quick Write at the end of the lesson, in response to the following prompt: How does Roosevelt use paragraphs 4–9 to develop her claim in paragraph 3?

For homework, students add to their Argument Delineation Tool, tracing Roosevelt’s claim and evidence in paragraphs 3–9. Students also read the remainder of the text (paragraphs 10–16), boxing any unfamiliar words and looking up their definitions.

Standards

Assessed Standard(s)	
RI.9-10.5	Analyze in detail how an author’s ideas or claims are developed and refined by particular sentences, paragraphs, or larger portions of a text (e.g., a section or chapter).
Addressed Standard(s)	
SL.9-10.1.a-e	<p>Initiate and participate effectively in a range of collaborative discussions (one-on-one, in groups, and teacher-led) with diverse partners on <i>grades 9–10 topics, texts, and issues</i>, building on others’ ideas and expressing their own clearly and persuasively.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Come to discussions prepared, having read and researched material under study; explicitly draw on that preparation by referring to evidence from texts and other research on the topic or issue to stimulate a thoughtful, well-reasoned exchange of ideas. b. Work with peers to set rules for collegial discussions and decision-making (e.g., informal consensus, taking votes on key issues, presentation of alternate views), clear goals and deadlines, and individual roles as needed.

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> c. Propel conversations by posing and responding to questions that relate the current discussion to broader themes or larger ideas; actively incorporate others into the discussion; and clarify, verify, or challenge ideas and conclusions. d. Respond thoughtfully to diverse perspectives, summarize points of agreement and disagreement, and, when warranted, qualify or justify their own views and understanding and make new connections in light of the evidence and reasoning presented. e. Seek to understand other perspectives and cultures and communicate effectively with audiences or individuals from varied backgrounds.
--	--

Assessment

Assessment(s)

Student learning is assessed via a Quick Write at the end of the lesson. Students respond to the following prompt, citing textual evidence to support analysis and inferences drawn from the text.

- How does Roosevelt use paragraphs 4–9 to develop her claim in paragraph 3?

High Performance Response(s)

A High Performance Response should:

- Identify Roosevelt’s claim in paragraph 3 (e.g., the Soviet delegation’s amendments should be rejected, or the Soviet delegation’s amendments are likely to be rejected).
- Explain that Roosevelt uses evidence in paragraphs 4–9 to support her claim from paragraph 3 (e.g., “The first two paragraphs of the amendment to article 3 deal with the question of minorities, which committee 3 decided required further study” (par. 4); “The Soviet amendment to article 20 . . . sets up standards which would enable any state practically to deny all freedom of opinion and expression without violating the article” (par. 5); etc.).
- Explain how the evidence Roosevelt gives in paragraphs 4–9 develops her claim from paragraph 3 (e.g., Roosevelt’s evidence in this section is relevant, because each paragraph in this section directly addresses one of the Soviet delegation’s amendments or proposals. Roosevelt’s evidence is sufficient because she gives a reason to reject each amendment or proposal of the Soviet delegation, which is adequate for the purpose. For example, in paragraph 4, Roosevelt states that “committee 3 decided [the amendment] required further study,” which is adequate for explaining why it was rejected).

Vocabulary

Vocabulary to provide directly (will not include extended instruction)
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> liable (adj.) – subject or susceptible flagrant (adj.) – shockingly noticeable or evident subversive (adj.) – tending to or advocating secretly trying to ruin or destroy a government, political system, etc.
Vocabulary to teach (may include direct word work and/or questions)
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> None.

Lesson Agenda/Overview

Student-Facing Agenda	% of Lesson
Standards & Text: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Standards: RI.9-10.5, SL.9-10.1.a-e Text: “On the Adoption of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights” by Eleanor Roosevelt, paragraphs 3–9 	
Learning Sequence: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Introduction of Lesson Agenda Homework Accountability Masterful Reading Reading and Discussion Jigsaw Discussion Quick Write Closing 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 5% 10% 10% 10% 45% 15% 5%

Materials

- Copies of the Roosevelt Paragraphs 4–9 Jigsaw Tool for each student
- Student copies of the Short Response Rubric (refer to 10.2.1 Lesson 1)
- Student copies of the Argument Delineation Tool (refer to 10.2.1 Lesson 5)—Students may need blank copies of the tool if they have run out of space on their original tool.

Learning Sequence

How to Use the Learning Sequence	
Symbol	Type of Text & Interpretation of the Symbol
10%	Percentage indicates the percentage of lesson time each activity should take.
no symbol	Plain text indicates teacher action.
	Bold text indicates questions for the teacher to ask students.
	<i>Italicized text indicates a vocabulary word.</i>
▶	Indicates student action(s).
💬	Indicates possible student response(s) to teacher questions.
❗	Indicates instructional notes for the teacher.

Activity 1: Introduction of Lesson Agenda

5%

Begin by reviewing the agenda and the assessed standard for this lesson: RI.9-10.5. In this lesson, students briefly discuss how Roosevelt begins this section of text before engaging in a jigsaw discussion to explore how Roosevelt supplements her claim in paragraph 3. Students demonstrate their learning at the end of the lesson by completing a Quick Write.

- ▶ Students look at the agenda.

Activity 2: Homework Accountability

10%

Instruct students to talk in pairs about how they applied their focus standard to their Accountable Independent Reading text. Lead a brief share out on the previous lesson's AIR homework assignment. Select several students (or student pairs) to explain how they applied their focus standard to their AIR text.

- ▶ Students (or student pairs) discuss and share how they applied their focus standard to their AIR text from the previous lesson's homework.

Instruct students to take out their work paraphrasing each article from the UDHR that Roosevelt mentions in paragraphs 3–9. Direct students to form pairs to review and discuss each article.

💬 Student responses may include:

- Roosevelt mentions Article 3 in paragraph 4. Article 3 is a broad article addressing the rights to life, liberty, and security.
- Roosevelt mentions Article 20 in paragraph 5. Article 20 deals with the right to freedom of expression and association and not being forced to be a part of any particular association.

- Roosevelt mentions Article 22 in paragraph 6. Article 22 states that “economic, social and cultural rights” are necessary for each person to fully develop his personality.
- Roosevelt mentions Article 2 in paragraph 6. Article 2 states that everyone is entitled to the rights in the UDHR regardless of their personal attributes.
- Roosevelt mentions Article 30 in paragraph 8. Article 30 is the last article in the UDHR, emphasizing that no “state, group or person” can use the UDHR as a way to destroy other’s rights.
- Roosevelt mentions Article 23 in paragraph 9. Article 23 deals with labor rights and the right to economic security through work and social protection.

Activity 3: Masterful Reading

10%

Have students listen to a Masterful Reading of paragraphs 3–9 of “On the Adoption of the *Universal Declaration of Human Rights*” (from “I feel bound to say that I think” to “economic, social and cultural rights set forth in these articles”). Ask students to follow along and listen for Roosevelt’s claim.

- ▶ Students follow along, reading silently.

Activity 4: Reading and Discussion

10%

Read aloud paragraph 3 (from “I feel bound to say that I think” to “that they will be rejected without debate”). Post or project the following questions for students to answer in pairs before sharing out with the class.

In what does Roosevelt have confidence?

- 🗨️ Roosevelt is confident that the Assembly will reject the Soviet delegation’s proposals “without debate” (par. 3).

- ① **Differentiation Consideration:** If students struggle, explain to students that the verb *will* indicates the future tense. *Will* is used in three different ways: first, to express something that happens with regularity, as in “As usual, my boss will be late to work today”; second, to express the strong probability that something is about to happen in reference to the present time, as in “I hear footsteps in the hall, so that will be dad at the door”; and third, to give a command, as in “You will finish your dinner before you get dessert.”

How does Roosevelt use “will” in paragraph 3, and how does this influence the meaning of the sentence?

- 🗨️ Student responses may include:

- Since the amendments are “substantially the same” as ones that have already been rejected, Roosevelt uses “will” to emphasize her confidence and express the strong probability that the Soviet delegation’s proposals “will be rejected” (par. 3).
- Since the U.S. delegation “give[s] [the UDHR] [its] full support” (par. 1) and Roosevelt states “it is perhaps better tactics to try to cooperate” (par. 2), Roosevelt uses “will” to give an order to the Assembly, expressing that they should reject the Soviet delegation’s proposals so that they can adopt the UDHR.

What is Roosevelt’s claim in paragraph 3, and how does it develop the central claim of the speech?

🗨 Student responses may include:

- By using “will,” Roosevelt’s claim in paragraph 3 is that the Assembly is very likely to reject the Soviet delegation’s proposals: “I am confident that they will be rejected without debate” (par. 3). By stating this claim, Roosevelt is removing reasons for not adopting the UDHR. Roosevelt uses this claim to support her central claim that the Assembly should adopt the UDHR.
- By using “will,” Roosevelt’s claim in paragraph 3 is that the Assembly should reject the Soviet delegation’s proposals: “I am confident that they will be rejected without debate” (par. 3). Roosevelt is emphasizing what the Assembly needs to do in order to adopt the UDHR, and through this statement is supporting her central claim that the Assembly should adopt the UDHR.

Activity 5: Jigsaw Discussion

45%

Transition students to the jigsaw discussion and distribute copies of the Roosevelt Paragraphs 4–9 Jigsaw Tool to each student. Create groups of three students each; these are the “home” groups. Instruct student groups to decide among themselves which group member will be responsible for which two paragraphs in paragraphs 4–9 (from “The first two paragraphs of the amendment to article 3” to “economic, social, and cultural rights set forth in these articles”).

Direct students to leave their home groups to form “expert” groups, so that groups are now based on the pair of paragraphs students are responsible for (e.g., all students responsible for paragraphs 4 and 5 come together to form a group).

Instruct expert groups to read and analyze their paragraphs, identifying the idea of the Soviet delegation’s amendment or proposal, and Roosevelt’s reason(s) the amendment or proposal should be rejected. Remind students to take notes on their Jigsaw Tool during small group discussions.

- ① Consider reminding students that this is an opportunity to apply standard SL.9-10.1.a-e by participating effectively in a collaborative discussion, building on others’ ideas, and expressing their own ideas clearly and persuasively.

Provide students with the following definitions: *liable* means “subject or susceptible,” *flagrant* means “shockingly noticeable or evident,” and *subversive* means “tending to or advocating secretly trying to ruin or destroy a government, political system, etc.”

- ▶ Students write the definitions of *liable*, *flagrant*, and *subversive* on their copy of the text or in a vocabulary journal.

① Explain to the group that is analyzing paragraph 8 that the last Soviet proposal was an additional article after Article 30. This context is integral to understanding Roosevelt’s meaning in paragraph 8.

- ▶ In their expert groups, students read and analyze their particular paragraphs. Students begin to fill in their Roosevelt Paragraphs 4–9 Jigsaw Tool to prepare for a small group discussion when they return to their home groups.

🗨 See the Model Roosevelt Paragraphs 4–9 Jigsaw Tool for sample student responses.

When expert groups complete their analysis of their paragraphs, instruct students to return to their home group in which each member has explored two different paragraphs. Each student should present the analysis from the expert group to his or her home group members for discussion.

Post or project the following questions for students to answer in their home groups before sharing out with the class.

Is Roosevelt’s evidence in paragraphs 4–9 relevant to her claim in paragraph 3? Explain.

- 🗨 Roosevelt’s evidence in this section is relevant because each paragraph in this section directly addresses one of the Soviet delegation’s amendments or proposals.

① Consider reminding students that *relevant* means “relating to a subject in an appropriate way.”

Is Roosevelt’s evidence in this section sufficient to support her claim in paragraph 3? Why or why not?

- 🗨 Student responses may include:
 - Roosevelt’s evidence is sufficient because she gives a reason to reject each amendment or proposal of the Soviet delegation, which is adequate for the purpose. For example, in paragraph 4, Roosevelt states that “committee 3 decided [the amendment] required further study,” which is adequate for explaining why it was rejected.
 - Roosevelt’s evidence is not sufficient. Even though she addresses each point in the Soviet delegation’s proposal, she does not fully explain all of her reasons. For example, in paragraph 5, Roosevelt does not explain how the Soviet amendment “sets up standards which would enable any state practically to deny all freedom of opinion and expression without violating the article”; she only states that the amendment does set up these standards.

- ① Consider reminding students that *sufficient* means “adequate for the purpose; enough.” Sufficient evidence thoroughly reinforces the claims in an argument (central and/or supporting claims). One piece of powerful evidence may be sufficient to support a claim, or several pieces of evidence may be collectively sufficient to support a claim.

Lead a whole-class discussion of student responses.

Activity 6: Quick Write

10%

Instruct students to respond briefly in writing to the following prompt:

How does Roosevelt use paragraphs 4–9 to develop her claim in paragraph 3?

Instruct students to use their Roosevelt Paragraphs 4–9 Jigsaw Tool and annotations to find evidence. Ask students to use this lesson’s vocabulary whenever possible in their written responses. Remind students to use the Short Response Rubric and Checklist to guide their written responses.

- ▶ Students listen and read the Quick Write prompt.

- ① Display the prompt for students to see, or provide the prompt in hard copy.

Transition to the independent Quick Write.

- ▶ Students independently answer the prompt, using evidence from the text.
- ☞ See the High Performance Response at the beginning of this lesson.

Activity 7: Closing

5%

Display and distribute the homework assignment. For homework, instruct students to add to their Argument Delineation Tool, tracing Roosevelt’s claim and evidence in paragraphs 3–9.

- ① Consider reminding students that for some claims, there may not be reasoning. Students can note this on their tools and assess whether this affects the claim.

Also for homework, instruct students to read the remainder of Roosevelt’s speech “On the Adoption of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights” paragraphs 10–16 (from “In giving our approval to the Declaration today” to “join our effort in good faith to live up to this high standard”). Direct students to box any unfamiliar words and look up their definitions. Instruct them to choose the definition that makes the most sense in the context and write a brief definition above or near the word in the text.

- ▶ Students follow along.

Homework

Add to your Argument Delineation Tool, tracing Roosevelt’s claim and evidence in paragraphs 3–9.

Read the remainder of Roosevelt’s speech “On the Adoption of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights,” paragraphs 10–16 (from “In giving our approval to the Declaration today” to “join our effort in good faith to live up to this high standard”). Box any unfamiliar words and look up their definitions. Choose the definition that makes the most sense in the context and write a brief definition above or near the word in the text.

Roosevelt Paragraphs 4–9 Jigsaw Tool

Name:		Class:		Date:	
--------------	--	---------------	--	--------------	--

Directions: Read your pair of paragraphs. Identify and record the Soviet delegation's amendment or proposal from each paragraph. Identify and record the article from the UDHR that is related to the Soviet delegation's amendment or proposal. Identify and record Roosevelt's reasons for rejecting the Soviet delegation's amendment or proposal.

Text	Soviet delegation's amendment or proposal	Related Article in UDHR	Roosevelt's reasons for rejection
Paragraph 4			
Paragraph 5			
Paragraph 6			
Paragraph 7			
Paragraph 8			
Paragraph 9			

Model Roosevelt Paragraphs 4–9 Jigsaw Tool

Name:		Class:		Date:	
--------------	--	---------------	--	--------------	--

Directions: Read your pair of paragraphs. Identify and record the Soviet delegation’s amendment or proposal from each paragraph. Identify and record the article from the UDHR that is related to the Soviet delegation’s amendment or proposal. Identify and record Roosevelt’s reasons for rejecting the Soviet delegation’s amendment or proposal.

Text	Soviet delegation’s amendment or proposal	Related Article in UDHR	Roosevelt’s reasons for rejection
Paragraph 4	Adds issue of “minorities.”	Article 3: broad, simple article, which states, “Everyone has the right to life, liberty and security of person.”	Committee 3 already dealt with this issue and decided that it “required further study,” so it is being referred to the Economic and Social Council on Human Rights.
Paragraph 5	Modifies existing article to include the adjectives “democratic” and the idea of “fascism.”	Article 20: deals with the right to freedom of expression and association. “Everyone has the right to peaceful assembly and association” and “No one may be compelled to belong to an association.”	This modification would actually restrict freedom of expression by qualifying what counts as freedom of expression. Adding the particular modifiers of “democratic” and “fascism” is dangerous, because—as the Assembly knows from experience—states can easily interpret these terms differently and abuse them.
Paragraph 6	Adds “specific reference to ‘discrimination’.”	Article 22: states that everyone deserves “economic, social and cultural rights indispensable for his dignity and the free development of his personality.” Article 2: states that everyone is entitled to the rights in the UDHR regardless of their personal attributes.	Committee 3 already determined that “the question of discrimination is comprehensively covered in Article 2,” so it does not need to be added again. In fact, adding it in Article 22 would weaken the comprehensiveness intended in Article 2. Also, the Soviet proposal to Article 22 adds “State obligation,” which would change the character of the UDHR.

Text	Soviet delegation's amendment or proposal	Related Article in UDHR	Roosevelt's reasons for rejection
Paragraph 7	The Soviets proposed delaying voting on the UDHR until the next session.	Related to the UDHR as a whole.	Roosevelt states that the Soviets have already presented an identical proposal, and it was already soundly rejected in Committee 3.
Paragraph 8	Added new article after Article 30.	Article 30: the last article in the UDHR emphasizing that no "State, group or person" can use the UDHR as a way to destroy other's rights.	The new article would erase the effect of Article 30. Article 30 is necessary as is, because it provides limits for the broad nature of the UDHR. These limits are based on morality, public order, and general welfare.
Paragraph 9	The Soviet proposal includes "an obligation on governments to assure the enjoyment of these rights by direct governmental action."	Article 23: deals with labor rights and the right to economic security through work and social protection.	Although Article 23 does not include an obligation for governments to protect economic and social rights, and Article 23 does not directly reference the articles that follow, the "umbrella" nature of Article 23 still supports "basic principles of economic, social, and cultural rights."