

10.3.3

Lesson 5

Introduction


In this lesson, students focus on building cohesion and clarity as they continue to draft their research-based argument papers. Students work to improve the effectiveness of their writing by focusing on the use of transitional words and phrases and building strong relationships between evidence, claims, and counterclaims within their papers.

Students begin by examining model paragraphs that demonstrate mastery of cohesion and transitional words and phrases. Students then have an opportunity to draft additional body paragraphs to improve their use of transitional words and phrases. Students are assessed based on the coherence of their drafts. For homework, students utilize the Connecting Ideas Handout to annotate one of their sources, paying close attention to the use of words and phrases that link sections of the text together.

Standards

Assessed Standard(s)	
W.9-10.4	Produce clear and coherent writing in which the development, organization and style are appropriate to task, purpose, and audience. (Grade-specific expectations for writing types are defined in standards 1–3.)
Addressed Standard(s)	
W.9-10.1.c	Write arguments to support claims in the analysis of substantive topics or text, using valid reasoning and relevant and sufficient evidence. Explore and inquire into areas of interest to formulate an argument. c. Use words, phrases, and clauses to link the major sections of the text, create cohesion and clarify the relationships between claim(s) and reasons, between reasons and evidence, and between claim(s) and counterclaims.
L.9-10.1.a	Demonstrate command of the conventions of standard English grammar and usage when writing or speaking. a. Use parallel structure.

Assessment

Assessment(s)
Student learning in this lesson is assessed via students' use of transitional words and phrases to craft cohesion in two body paragraphs.
High Performance Response(s)
<p>A High Performance Response should:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Provide adequate and appropriate use of words, phrases and clauses to link sections of the text and create cohesion (e.g., patients cannot claim ownership of tissue removed during surgery because of hazardous waste laws, so patients cannot make a profit from their removed tissues. For example, a patient cannot legally take his or her appendix home after an appendectomy). • Clarify the relationships between reasons and evidence by using transitional words and phrases. (e.g., So, donated tissue is often sold through unofficial "fees" without any consequences. These examples demonstrate that the line between donation and sale can be complicated and often blurred for the purpose of making money. In order to both protect a patient's rights and ensure that choices are made with the advancement of medical understanding, it is better to prevent any sale or profit resulting from tissue donated during surgery or any medical situation). <p> For more examples, see the sample student research paper in 10.3.3 Lesson 11.</p>

Vocabulary

Vocabulary to provide directly (will not include extended instruction)
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • None.*
Vocabulary to teach (may include direct word work and/or questions)
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • None.*

*Students should be use their vocabulary journals to incorporate domain-specific vocabulary from Unit 10.3.2 into their argument research paper, as well as to record process-oriented vocabulary defined in the lesson.

Lesson Agenda/Overview

Student-Facing Agenda	% of Lesson
<p>Standards & Text:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Standards: W.9-10.4, W.9-10.1.c, L.9-10.1.a 	

Learning Sequence:	
1. Introduction of Lesson Agenda	1. 10%
2. Homework Accountability	2. 10%
3. Building Clear Sentences	3. 20%
4. Crafting Cohesion in Argument Writing	4. 20%
5. Drafting and Assessment	5. 35%
6. Closing	6. 5%

Materials

- Student copies of the 10.3 Common Core Learning Standards Tool (refer to 10.3.2 Lesson 1)
- Copies of the Connecting Ideas Handout for each student
- Student copies of the 10.3.3 Rubric and Checklist (refer to 10.3.3 Lesson 3)
- Students copies of the MLA Citation Handout (refer to 10.3.3 Lesson 3)

Learning Sequence

How to Use the Learning Sequence	
Symbol	Type of Text & Interpretation of the Symbol
10%	Percentage indicates the percentage of lesson time each activity should take.
no symbol	Plain text indicates teacher action.
	Bold text indicates questions for the teacher to ask students.
	<i>Italicized text indicates a vocabulary word.</i>
►	Indicates student action(s).
💬	Indicates possible student response(s) to teacher questions.
❗	Indicates instructional notes for the teacher.

Activity 1: Introduction of Lesson Agenda

10%

Begin by reviewing the agenda and the assessed standard for this lesson: W.9-10.4. Explain to students that in this lesson, they focus on improving their papers by deepening their understanding of how words and phrases can link together and reinforce the relationships between evidence, claims, and counterclaims within their papers. Students first participate in a class discussion about the use of transitional words and phrases. Students then have an opportunity to draft additional body paragraphs with attention to their use of transitional words and phrases.

- Students look at the agenda.

Distribute or ask students to take out their copies of the 10.3 Common Core Learning Standards Tool. Inform students that in this lesson they begin to work with a new standard: W.9-10.1.c. Ask students to individually read W.9-10.1.c on their tools and assess their familiarity with and mastery of the standard.

- ▶ Students read and assess their understanding of standard W.9-10.1.c.

Instruct students to talk in pairs about what they think the standard means. Lead a brief discussion about the standard.

💬 Student responses should include:

- Use words and phrases to connect sections of an essay.
- Use words and phrases to make sure ideas flow together.
- Use words and phrases to show the relationships between claims and reasons, reasons and evidence, and claims and counterclaims.

Explain to students that this lesson focuses on creating cohesion as students draft their argument-based research paper.

Activity 2: Homework Accountability

10%

Instruct students to take out their homework from the previous lesson: Draft the first body paragraph of your research-based argument paper. Be sure to clearly articulate the relevant information about your first supporting claim (as detailed in your Outline Tool) and include properly formatted in-text citations when referencing evidence.

Place students in pairs and instruct them to briefly look over one another's citations and supporting claims in the paragraphs they drafted for homework. Students should provide both positive and constructive feedback where appropriate and highlight any errors in citation. Students should reference the MLA Citation Handout they received in the previous lesson, comparing their peers' work to the examples in the handout.

- ▶ Students work in pairs to look over each other's paragraphs they drafted for homework, and provide feedback on the supporting claims and citation.

💬 Student responses will vary by individual research but may include the following language:

- The supporting claim you make in this paragraph is well supported by your evidence but your reasoning or explanation of how the evidence supports the claim is missing.
- MLA guidelines require that you name the author of the article but you forgot to add the author's name.
- You might want to consider improving the reasoning you use to connect these two claims. The evidence presented is not strong enough to support it.

- ① If students struggle, consider providing additional resources like Easybib.com to assist with citation formatting.

Activity 3: Building Clear Sentences

20%

Explain to students that in the practice of argument writing, the strength of the paper is based upon the strength of their sentences. The primary goal of a sentence in formal writing is to provide the reader with information in a clear and understandable way. To craft clear and concise sentences reliably, students should focus on using similar phrases and clauses to support their text.

Display the following two sentences for students:

- Doctors failed to tell patients about their legal rights when it comes to their tissues.
- Frequently, in the world of scientific advancement, patients can be put in danger because of the increasingly complicated state of older legal practices and laws.

Lead a class discussion on the sample sentences using the following questions:

Which of these sentences is clearer and why?

- 💬 The first sentence is clearer. It communicates the point directly in simpler terms.

How does the order of the first sentence help its clarity?

- 💬 It starts with “Doctors failed” so it is easy to see what the sentence is about.

Explain to students that this sentence is an example of writing in the “active voice.” In a sentence using active voice, the “active” subject of the sentence is placed at the beginning of the sentence. Active voice is useful in argument writing because it gives the reader the most important information first, and then goes on to describe what is happening to this important subject. The use of active voice provides greater clarity for the reader and makes the sentence more forceful.

- ▶ Students listen.

- ① Consider providing this example of a sentence in passive voice if students need a contrast to assist their understanding: “Patients were not told about their legal rights in relation to their tissues.”

What words in the second sentence weaken its claim?

- 💬 The word “somewhat” makes it seem like this claim might not always be true.

Inform students that they should keep sentence structure in mind as they progress with their argument writing. As they develop the introduction, body and conclusion paragraphs throughout this unit, they should pay special attention to how they use different clauses, words and phrases to support a

compelling argument. Encourage students to periodically look back over the writing that they have completed to find ways to make their writing clearer and more coherent.

- ▶ Students listen.

Inform students that parallel structure is a rhetorical strategy commonly used in writing. Parallel structure improves clarity by establishing a pattern of language. Parallel structure often uses repetition of the same part(s) of speech and verb tenses. Lead the class in a discussion about parallel structure using the following questions.

① Students were introduced to parallel structure as a rhetorical technique (RI.9-10.6) in 10.2.1.

What does the word *parallel* mean?

- ☞ Having the same direction, course, or tendency.

① **Differentiation Consideration:** Consider connecting the idea of parallel structure in writing with the concept of parallel objects in mathematics. The idea of parallel lines being lines that always share the same properties and distance might assist student understanding of how components of writing can be parallel.

What do you think the word *parallel* means in the context of writing?

- ☞ Having parts or components that align, take the same direction, or repeat each other.

Display the following simple examples of parallel structure:

- **Not Parallel:** Gabe likes to camp, sing and dancing in the moonlight.
- **Parallel:** Gabe likes camping, singing and dancing in the moonlight.
- **Parallel:** Gabe likes to camp, sing and dance in the moonlight.

Explain to students that parallel structure is built by providing sentence structure that uses the same components repetitively to enforce an idea. In these examples, the sentences using parallel structure treat their components in the same way. In the example set, the three common terms are grouped together either as verbs or present participles to create a feeling of cohesion and to enhance the rhythm of the sentence. Encourage students to look for places to improve their use of parallel structure while they are drafting and revising their papers.

- ▶ Students listen.

① To aid student understanding of parallel structure, consider reading these example sets aloud. This practice may support students' understanding of parallel structure by allowing them to hear the effect of structure on the rhythm of the sentence.

① **Differentiation Consideration:** Consider providing the examples of parallel structure before the discussion to allow students time to assess the sentences independently or in pairs.

- ① Parallel structure is part of standard L.9-10.1.a. Consider reminding students of their work with parallel structure in 10.3.1 Lesson 10.
- ① **Differentiation Consideration:** If necessary to support student work and understanding, consider spending additional time reviewing how to establish clarity through sentence structure. As 10.3.3 Lessons 4, 5, and 6 are focused on the technical crafting of the student research paper and feature extensive time for student drafting, this may be an ideal opportunity to pursue deeper instruction on crafting effective sentences.

Activity 4: Crafting Cohesion in Argument Writing

20%

Introduce students to the ideas of *cohesion* and *transitions*. Explain to students that *cohesion* in writing refers to how well the paragraphs and sentences link the claims and evidence of a text together into a coherent whole, which, in the case of argument writing, serves to inform and convince the reader. Explain to students that *cohesion* is achieved by carefully demonstrating links between ideas. Provide students with the following definition: *cohesion* means “the state of uniting or sticking together.” Explain to students that achieving *cohesion* in their writing is the result of careful revision and editing.

Provide students with the following definition: *transition* means “a passage in a piece of writing that clearly links two topics or sections to each other.”

- ▶ Students record the definitions of *cohesion* and *transition* in their vocabulary journals.

Distribute the Connecting Ideas Handout. Briefly explain the handout to the class.

- ▶ Students examine the Connecting Ideas Handout.

- ① A more in-depth examination of this handout appears after the examination of the two model paragraphs. Consider using this initial introduction to the handout as an opportunity to field any potential student questions.

Provide students with the following two examples, and ask them to consider which they think is more cohesive and logical.

Sample 1:

The current system does not provide adequate protection for the patient. The line between gift and sale can be complicated and often blurred to make money. The law prohibits trafficking in organs tissues, tissue banks regularly make a profit through the use of legal loopholes “tissue banking is big business and the law is readily side-stepped by invoking ‘processing and handling fees’ so that the tissue itself is not officially sold” (Josefson 303). People are paranoid about the use of their tissue according to Catalonia: “patients have grown increasingly worried that genetic information extracted from tissues could somehow be used against them.” Legal issues that deal with human tissue taken during surgery patients must be clearly defined because doctors and researchers can take advantage of the tissue removed during surgery. Patients cannot claim ownership of tissue removed during surgery due to laws

on hazardous waste. Patients cannot benefit from their tissues. Patients must give their consent for the residual tissue to be used in research (Truog, Kesselheim and Joffe 37–38). When a patient dies, tissue donation is set aside for medical or research purposes, or “processed and sold for profit and become such items as bone putty and collagen” (Josefson 303). If patients give their consent for their tissue to be used for research purposes, they probably do not realize they are also donating tissue to be sold for profit. We should prevent any sale resulting from donated tissues during surgery or any medical situation.

Sample 2:

The legal issues that deal with patients’ rights to tissue removed during surgery need to be clearly defined because doctors and researchers can profit from tissue taken during surgery. Patients cannot claim ownership of tissue removed during surgery because of hazardous waste laws, so patients cannot make a profit from their removed tissues. For example, a patient cannot legally take his or her appendix home after an appendectomy (Schmidt 1174). However, patients must grant consent for residual tissues to be used in research (Truog, Kesselheim, and Joffe 37–38). This current system does not offer enough protection for the patient, as when a patient passes away, donated tissues can be banked for medical use or research, or “processed and sold for profit and become such items as bone putty and collagen” (Josefson 303). So, even though dying patients donate or give consent for their tissues to be used in research, they probably do not realize they are also giving consent for donated tissues to be sold for profit. Additionally, although the National Organ Transplant Act of 1984 prohibits trafficking of organs tissue, tissue banks routinely make a profit through use of legal loopholes: “tissue banking is big business and the law is readily side-stepped by invoking ‘processing and handling fees’ so that the tissue itself is not officially sold” (Josefson 303). So, donated tissue is often sold through unofficial “fees” without any consequences. These examples demonstrate that the line between donation and sale can be complicated and often blurred for the purpose of making money. In order to both protect a patient’s rights and ensure that choices are made with the advancement of medical understanding, it is better to prevent any sale or profit resulting from tissue donated during surgery or any medical situation.

① This model body paragraph is located in the student sample research-based argument paper located in 10.3.3 Lesson 11.

After students have had time to consider the two paragraphs, lead a discussion on coherence and the differences between the two samples by using the following questions.

Which of these paragraphs is more cohesive and why?

- ☞ The second paragraph is more cohesive. The second paragraph provides only relevant information and presents it logically, so the reader can follow along without becoming confused.

Which of these paragraphs is less cohesive and why?

- ☞ The first paragraph is confusing to read. It jumps around and has unnecessary information. It seems like this information belongs in multiple paragraphs.

What specific words and phrases in the more cohesive paragraph contribute to its success?

- ☞ “These examples”
- ☞ “So,”
- ☞ “Additionally”
- ☞ “However”
- ☞ “For example”
- ☞ “Because”

- ① If students struggle to identify differences between the paragraphs, consider preparing a highlighted version of the paragraphs that annotates the changes and improvements and the transitional words and phrases.
- ① **Differentiation Consideration:** If necessary to support student understanding, consider spending additional time discussing these words and phrases.

Explain to students that cohesion should exist between paragraphs as well as between sentences. In both cases, transitional words and phrases can help link ideas and support the logic of the paper. Instruct students to look at the Connecting Ideas Handout. Explain that the Connecting Ideas Handout provides a variety of transitional words to use in specific cases. To show how ideas are similar, students might use phrases like “in the same way” or “similarly.” Instruct students that these words can be used within a paragraph but also to connect two different paragraphs. Words like “furthermore” and phrases like “in addition” can be used to continue a line of reasoning or sustain a thought between paragraphs.

- ▶ Students listen and examine the handout.

Instruct students to form pairs. Present student pairs with the following two paragraphs and instruct them to examine how the paragraphs cohere from sentence to sentence and between paragraphs.

Paragraph 1

In addition to the problems surrounding the sale of tissue, granting researchers legal ownership of others’ genes, cells, or tissues infringes on individuals’ rights to privacy and control over their unique genetic information, as “individuals can be identified by genetic sequences numbering just 75 base pairs of DNA” (Schmidt). Consequently, a large section of the population objects to the patenting of their genetic information: “In a study of potential tissue donors, 32 percent said they would be offended by the patenting of products of research with their DNA” (Andrews). Despite these objections, the possible financial incentives are enough to encourage many for-profit companies to patent genetic codes aggressively: “If a biotech company could identify the sequence of a gene from your body, as Myriad Genetics did with the BRCA1 and BRCA2 breast cancer genes, it then had a 20-year monopoly where it could charge whatever it wanted for anyone to look at the gene’s sequence” (Andrews). Researchers

from universities are also incentivized to misuse and exploit individuals' rights and privacy through their tissue and genetic information. Such is the case of the Havasupai Indian tribe from Arizona who are suing Arizona State University over a damaging misuse of their genetic information: "tissues they had donated to Arizona State University for diabetes research were also used in what they viewed as potentially stigmatizing studies of schizophrenia, inbreeding, and population migration" (Schmidt 1175). Profits and personal gain should not take precedent over an individual's right to privacy, especially in relation to the unique genetic make-up of one's own body.

Paragraph 2:

Furthermore, the sale or resale of human tissue is dehumanizing and exacts a psychological toll on the patient or the patient's family. In a similar situation to Henrietta Lacks, a patient named John Moore also had his tissue removed, and his doctor created a cell line, all the while lying to Moore about what he was doing with the tissue. Andrews states, "When Moore found out that he was Patent No. 4,438,032, he felt that his integrity had been violated, his body exploited and his tissue turned into a product." According to Catalona, "patients have grown increasingly worried that genetic information extracted from tissues could somehow be used against them." He states that, "insurance companies . . . might refuse coverage to the donors or their children on the basis of inherited disease susceptibility" (Schmidt 1175). Even when confronted with standard tissue donation practices, like donating the tissues of a deceased relative, the majority of the population is against the sale of these tissues: "73 percent of the U.S. families asked to donate tissue from deceased relatives say that it is "not acceptable for donated tissue to be bought and sold, for any purpose" (Andrews). Although it is important to support scientific advancement and provide viable tissues for research and to aid people who need transplants or other procedures, it is also important to recognize the rights and dignity of both the patient and the patient's families. It is clear that at the very least, the sale of tissue is harmful to the individual on a personal level.

① These model body paragraphs are located in the sample research-based argument paper located in 10.3.3 Lesson 11.

Ask student volunteers the following question, using the Connecting Ideas Handout as a reference.

What words support transition and cohesion?

- 💬 Student responses should include words like "furthermore," "In a similar situation," and "although."

Explain to students that the Connecting Ideas Handout is a resource to use as they write this research-based argument paper and beyond this unit as they continue to write formally. Instruct students to use the Categories column to direct their choice of transitional words and phrases as they write. For example, if they are looking to add more information about what they are talking about, they can look in the "Add Related Information" section and choose the word "furthermore" to help them connect their ideas.

- ▶ Students listen and examine the handout.

Explain to students that creating effective transitions is crucial to supporting their argument writing. Effective use of transitional words and phrases improves the logical presentation of information and is important to presenting a chain of reasoning in an understandable way. In addition to having concrete details and relevant examples to support a claim, the information has to be presented in a way that is appropriate to the audience's knowledge of the topic. Explain that writing a research-based argument paper requires careful use of transitional words and phrases to guide the reader. Students should use these words and phrases to connect their claims and evidence in a chain of reasoning that convinces the reader of their central claim. In order to achieve this, students must present their findings and claims in an accessible, clear and cohesive manner, with each statement flowing into the next to build a united research-based argument. Remind students that arriving at a point of cohesion is the result of a process that involves several rounds of revision and editing.

- ① Remind students of the work they have done with the identification of solid reasoning. Remind students of the definition of *reasoning* as it pertains to this module: “the logical relationships among ideas, including relationships among claims and relationships across evidence.”

Activity 5: Drafting and Assessment

35%

Inform students that in this activity they will draft the rest of the body paragraphs for their papers, paying specific attention to the use of transitional words and phrases to build cohesion between and among the paragraphs. For the lesson assessment, students will submit two of these paragraphs. Inform students that they will be assessed on their use of transitional words and phrases to craft cohesion in two body paragraphs.

Direct students to turn to the Coherence, Organization, and Style portion of the 10.3.3 Rubric and Checklist and look for substandard W.9-10.1.c. Inform students that this assessment will be evaluated using substandard W.9-10.1.c on the 10.3.3 Rubric and Checklist. Remind students to refer to the checklist as they are writing their body paragraphs.

- ▶ Students read substandard W.9-10.1.c on the 10.3.3 Rubric and Checklist.

- ① **Differentiation Consideration:** Consider instructing students to mark W.9-10.1.c on the 10.3.3 Rubric and Checklist to focus their attention on this standard only.

Instruct students to use the checklist as they are drafting, organizing, and adjusting their paragraphs for cohesion and development of central claims, supporting claims, counterclaims, reasoning, and evidence. Inform students that they will be assessed according to this document when they submit the final draft of the paper.

- ▶ Students listen.

Instruct students to organize their paragraphs and make any adjustments to what they have written to ensure:

- There is cohesion and logic to their paragraphs.
- The information is presented in a way that effectively reinforces a claim made by the writer. Remind students that they may need to add concrete details, transition words, or delete sentences/passages to polish their paper.

Transition students to the assessment.

- ▶ Students work independently on their drafts to ensure cohesion and logical reasoning.

① As students work, walk around the class and address individual concerns.

Instruct students to submit two of the paragraphs they worked on in class, and assess the paragraphs for the use of transitional words/phrases and logical presentation of information.

- ▶ Students submit two paragraphs they worked on in class.

① Use the W.9-10.1.c section of the 10.3.3 Rubric and Checklist to assess the submitted paragraphs.

Activity 6: Closing

5%

Display and distribute the homework assignment. For homework, instruct students to use the Connecting Ideas Handout to annotate one of the sources they have selected for their research-based argument paper, paying close attention to the use of words and phrases that link sections of the text together. Additionally students should briefly explain how the connecting ideas highlighted support the evidence and claims of the text.

Homework

For homework, select one of your sources and circle or highlight the transitional words and phrases that serve to link sections of the text together. Use the Connecting Ideas Handout to note where different words and phrases are used to support and clarify the use of evidence and link together claims. Additionally, prepare to explain how the connecting ideas highlighted support the evidence and claims of the text.

CONNECTING IDEAS

USING TRANSITIONAL WORDS AND PHRASES

Transitional words and phrases create links between your ideas when you are speaking and writing. They help your audience understand the logic of your thoughts. When using transitional words, make sure that it is the right match for what you want to express. And remember, transition words work best when they are connecting two or more strong ideas that are clearly stated. Here is a list of transitional words and phrases that you can use for different purposes:

ADD RELATED INFORMATION	GIVE AN EXAMPLE OR ILLUSTRATE AN IDEA	MAKE SURE YOUR THINKING IS CLEARLY UNDERSTOOD	COMPARE IDEAS OR SHOW HOW IDEAS ARE SIMILAR	CONTRAST IDEAS OR SHOW HOW THEY ARE DIFFERENT
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> furthermore moreover too also again in addition next further finally and, or, nor 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> to illustrate to demonstrate specifically for instance as an illustration for example 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> that is to say in other words to explain i.e., (that is) to clarify to rephrase it to put it another way 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> in the same way by the same token similarly in like manner likewise in similar fashion 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> nevertheless but however otherwise on the contrary in contrast on the other hand
EXPLAIN HOW ONE THING CAUSES ANOTHER	EXPLAIN THE EFFECT OR RESULT OF SOMETHING	EXPLAIN YOUR PURPOSE	LIST RELATED INFORMATION	QUALIFY SOMETHING
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> because since on account of for that reason 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> therefore consequently accordingly thus hence as a result 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> in order that so that to that end, to this end for this purpose for this reason 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> First, second, third... First, then, also, finally 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> almost nearly probably never always frequently perhaps maybe although