

10.1.1

Lesson 4

Introduction

In this lesson, students consider the full text of both “The Passionate Shepherd to His Love” and “The Nymph’s Reply to the Shepherd.” Students engage in an evidence-based discussion as they explore how Raleigh draws upon and transforms Marlowe’s poem. Students focus on parallel structures and mirror images, developing essential understandings of the conversant central ideas of these two poems. Student analysis of the relationship between Marlowe and Raleigh’s works encourage students to continue to build skills around making connections between two texts, in preparation for the End-of-Unit Assessment.

Students continue to work in the groups of four that were established in Lesson 3, building on their speaking and listening skills in small groups and with the whole class. Students complete a brief written response to the following prompt: How does Raleigh draw upon or transform Marlowe’s poem?

For homework, students briefly respond in writing to a prompt that asks students to reflect on the how the experience of comparing these poems has developed their understanding.

Standards

Assessed Standard(s)	
RL.9-10.9	Analyze how an author draws on and transforms source material in a specific work (e.g., how Shakespeare treats a theme or topic from Ovid or the Bible or how a later author draws on a play by Shakespeare).
Addressed Standard(s)	
CCRA.R.5	Analyze the structure of texts, including how specific sentences, paragraphs, and larger portions of the text (e.g., a section, chapter, scene, or stanza) relate to each other and the whole.
RL.9-10.2	Determine a theme or central idea of a text and analyze in detail its development over the course of the text, including how it emerges and is shaped and refined by specific details; provide an objective summary of the text.
RL.9-10.4	Determine the meaning of words and phrases as they are used in the text, including figurative and connotative meanings; analyze the cumulative impact of specific word choices on meaning and tone (e.g., how the language evokes a sense of time and place;

	how it sets a formal or informal tone).
SL.9-10.1	Initiate and participate effectively in a range of collaborative discussions (one-on-one, in groups, and teacher-led) with diverse partners on <i>grades 9–10 topics, texts, and issues</i> , building on others' ideas and expressing their own clearly and persuasively.

Assessment

Assessment(s)
<p>The learning in this lesson is captured through a Quick Write at the end of the lesson. Students answer the following prompt based on the reading (citing text evidence and analyzing key words and phrases) completed in the lesson. Student responses should be assessed using the Short Response Rubric and Checklist.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> How does Raleigh draw upon or transform Marlowe's poem?
High Performance Response(s)
<p>A High Performance Response should:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Explore how Raleigh draws upon and transforms Marlowe's poem. <p>For example, a student might analyze the transformation of a central idea or the use of similar objects and images that are transformed in Raleigh's poem.</p>

Vocabulary

Vocabulary to provide directly (will not include extended instruction)
<p>"The Passionate Shepherd to His Love":</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> kirtle (n.) – a woman's dress or outer petticoat (archaic) swains (n.) – country peasants or male admirers prove (v.) – to learn or find out by experience (archaic) steepy (adj.) – steep (archaic) yields (v.) – relinquishes one's possessions <p>"The Nymph's Reply to the Shepherd":</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> flocks (n.) – large groups of animals of one kind (i.e., sheep) philomel (n.) – mythical woman who was turned into a nightingale dumb (adj.) – silent wanton (adj.) – unrestrained, carelessly extravagant, lustful

- wayward (adj.) – changeable, unpredictable
- reckoning (n.) – judgment
- gall (n.) – bitterness of spirit
- kirtle (n.) – a woman’s dress or outer petticoat (archaic)
- folly (n.) – stupidity
- breed (v.) – to reproduce

Vocabulary to teach (may include direct word work and/or questions)

- romanticize (v.) – to think about or describe something as being better or more attractive or interesting than it really is

Lesson Agenda/Overview

Student-Facing Agenda	% of Lesson
Standards & Texts: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Standards: RL.9-10.9, CCRA.R.5, RL.9-10.2, RL.9-10.4, SL.9-10.1 • Texts: “The Passionate Shepherd to His Love” and “The Nymph’s Reply to the Shepherd” Learning Sequence: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Introduction to Lesson Agenda 2. Homework Accountability 3. Masterful Reading 4. Evidence-Based Discussion 5. Quick Write 6. Closing 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. 10% 2. 10% 3. 15% 4. 45% 5. 15% 6. 5%

Materials

- Student copies of the 10.1 Common Core Learning Standards Tool (refer to 10.1.1 Lesson 1)
- Copies of the Full Text Annotation Handout for each student
- Student copies of the Speaking and Listening Rubric (refer to 10.1.1 Lesson 3)
- Student copies of the Short Response Rubric and Checklist (refer to 10.1.1 Lesson 1)

Learning Sequence

How to Use the Learning Sequence	
Symbol	Type of Text & Interpretation of the Symbol
10%	Percentage indicates the percentage of lesson time each activity should take.
no symbol	Plain text indicates teacher action.
	Bold text indicates questions for the teacher to ask students.
	<i>Italicized text indicates a vocabulary word.</i>
►	Indicates student action(s).
💬	Indicates possible student response(s) to teacher questions.
❗	Indicates instructional notes for the teacher.

Activity 1: Introduction to Lesson Agenda

10%

Begin by introducing the agenda and assessed standard for this lesson: RL.9-10.9. In this lesson, students consider the full text of both “The Passionate Shepherd to His Love” and “The Nymph’s Reply to the Shepherd.”

- Students look at the agenda.

Instruct students to return to the Common Core Learning Standards Tool.

Instruct students to find RL.9-10.9 on their tool and to follow along as they are read aloud.

Pose the following questions for class discussion:

What do you notice about this standard?

What is it asking you to be able to do?

What questions does this standard raise for you?

Ask students to write down their ideas. Lead a brief class discussion about RL.9-10.9.

- 💬 Student responses may include the following:
 - RL.9-10.9 asks students to think about multiple texts in relationship to each other.
 - RL.9-10.9 asks students to make comparisons between texts.

Activity 2: Homework Accountability

10%

Instruct students to form pairs and briefly discuss their responses to the Lesson 3 reflective writing homework prompt: How might your understanding of the last two lines be different if “mind” was replaced with “heart”?

- ▶ Student pairs discuss their responses to the Lesson 3 reflective writing prompt.
- 💬 Student responses should reflect the understanding that if the line “then these delights my **mind** might move” (Raleigh line 23) was instead “then these delights my **heart** might move,” the poem would be about the Nymph’s lack of “love” for the Shepherd. But Raleigh’s use of “mind” leads to the inference that the Nymph is intellectually unconvinced, not only romantically unconvinced.

Activity 3: Masterful Reading

15%

Introduce the Quick Write assessment (How does Raleigh draw upon or transform Marlowe’s poem?). Explain to students that this is the lesson assessment and the focus for today’s reading.

- ▶ Students read the assessment prompt and listen.

① Display the Quick Write assessment prompt for students to see.

Distribute the Full Text Annotation Handout. Have students listen to a masterful reading of both poems, first the Marlowe, then the Raleigh.

- ▶ Students follow along on the Full Text Annotation Handout, reading silently.

① Audio resources:

- Marlowe:
http://ia700304.us.archive.org/25/items/romantic_poetry_001.poem/passionate_shepherd_marlowe_add_64kb.mp3
 - Raleigh: http://www.dailymotion.com/video/xewqnk_the-nymph-s-reply-to-the-shepherd-s_creation#.UeHk823klc8
-

Instruct students to re-establish the dedicated groups established in the previous lesson. Remind students that they will be staying in these groups of four for the duration of the unit, aside from independent writing activities.

Instruct students to reread both texts aloud in their groups, first the Marlowe, then the Raleigh, and annotate for structural similarities between the two texts, including words and phrases that are present in both texts.

① It may be helpful to review the structural elements students analyzed in previous lessons, including stanzas, rhyme scheme, and line length.

Remind students to use the following annotation codes during this activity:

- Put a question mark (?) next to a section you're questioning.
- Write in the margin or at the top or bottom of the page to record questions (and perhaps answers) that a passage raises in your mind.
- Use an exclamation point (!) for areas that remind you of another text, strike you in some way, or surprise you.
- Add an arrow (-->) to make connections between points.
- Box or circle words and phrases that you do not know or that you find confusing. Rewrite a word or phrase you might have figured out.
- Star (*) ideas that seem important, or may support your thesis writing later.

① Encourage students to alternate reading stanzas, to give each student an opportunity to read a portion of each of the texts aloud. Students read the entirety of both texts aloud immediately after hearing both texts read aloud, to promote fluency and to underscore the connection between the two texts.

► Students read aloud and annotate on their Full Text Annotation Handout.

💬 Student annotations should include some or all of the following observations:

- Both poems have six stanzas (connected with the code → and/or highlighted with the code *).
- Both poems have four-line stanzas (connected with the code → and/or highlighted with the code *).
- Both poems use rhyming couplets (connected with the code → and/or highlighted with the code *).
- The repeating phrase “live with [me/thee] and be [my/thy] love” in both poems (connected with the code → and/or highlighted with the code *).
 - The words or phrases present in both poems (connected with the code →):
 - “live with me/thee and be my/thy love” (Marlowe line 1 and line Raleigh 4)
 - “mind may/might move” (Marlowe line 27 and Raleigh line 23)
 - “flocks” (Marlowe line 6 and Raleigh line 5)
 - “fields” (Marlowe line 3 and Raleigh line 5)
 - “rocks” (Marlowe line 5 and Raleigh line 6)
 - “rivers” (Marlowe line 7 and Raleigh line 6)

- “Philomel/birds” (Marlowe line 8 and Raleigh 7)
- “bed of roses” (Marlowe line 9 and Raleigh line 13)
- “belt of straw” (Marlowe line 17 and Raleigh line 17)
- “amber studs” (Marlowe line 18 and Raleigh line 18)
- “ivy buds” (Marlowe line 17 and Raleigh line 17)
- “coral clasps” (Marlowe line 18 and Raleigh line 18)
- “cap” (Marlowe line 11 and Raleigh line 14)
- “kirtle” (Marlowe line 11 and Raleigh line 14)
- “posies” (Marlowe line 10 and Raleigh line 14)

① Students will be using these annotations during the evidence-based discussion to follow. It is not necessary for students to share out these annotations at this point.

Activity 4: Evidence-Based Discussion

45%

Transition students from the annotation activity to an evidence-based discussion. Students remain in their dedicated groups.

① Consider displaying and reviewing the Speaking and Listening Rubric and Checklist (refer to 10.1.1 Lesson 3). Remind students to practice using these speaking and listening skills during discussion.

Display or distribute the following questions for students to work through in their groups. Students should be individually noting their analysis.

What words or phrases that are present in both texts repeat in both texts?

- 💬 Student responses should identify words and phrases including:
 - “live with me/thee and be my/thy love” (Marlowe lines 1, 20, 28 and Raleigh lines 4, 24)
 - “live” (Marlowe lines 1, 20, 28 and Raleigh lines 4, 24)
 - “move” (Marlowe lines 19, 27 and Raleigh lines 3, 19, 23)
 - “love” (Marlowe lines 1, 20, 28 and Raleigh lines 1, 4, 20, 21, 24)

What words or phrases are used in “The Passionate Shepherd to His Love” to describe the natural world; what words or phrases are used in “The Nymph’s Reply to the Shepherd”?

- 💬 Student responses should identify that:
 - Marlowe uses words including: “steepy,” “melodious,” “fragrant,” “finest,” “fair,” “purest,” “pleasures,” and “delights.”
 - Raleigh uses words like: “rage,” “cold,” “dumb,” “complain,” “wayward,” “wanton,” “gall,” “sorrow,” “break,” “wither,” “forgotten,” and “rotten.”

How do the cumulative effects on tone created by these descriptions compare?

- ☞ The cumulative effect in Marlowe's poem is one of beauty and happiness. The cumulative effect in Raleigh's poem is one of decay and despair. Marlowe's descriptions describe a perfect, beautiful natural world; Raleigh's descriptions are the opposite, describing a dying one.

What key details or images does Raleigh use that are first established by Marlowe, and how does Raleigh's description of these images compare?

- ☞ Raleigh uses key details like: the image of the fields, the "rocks," the "rivers," birds ("Philomel"), the "beds of roses," the clothing ("cap," "kirtle," "gown," etc.), "the posies" and "flowers," etc. Raleigh dismisses the images saying they will all "break," "wither," and be "forgotten."

What central idea does Raleigh develop that is not a central idea in Marlowe's poem?

- ☞ Raleigh writes about "time" in the second stanza. "Time" is what "drives the flocks;" "time" is what makes the "rocks grow cold."
- ① Students explored the development of central ideas in these two poems separately, so it may be helpful to refer students back to their notes and annotations from 10.1.1 Lessons 1–3 to support understanding of this question.

What is the Nymph's reply to the Shepherd's invitation?

- ☞ The Nymph rejects the Shepherd's offers of love and life in the country. The Nymph states "all these in me no means can move / To come to thee and be thy love" (19–20). This means that the Shepherd's invitation to come live in the country has not convinced the Nymph, and she says no.

Ask students to offer a definition of "romanticize." If students struggle, offer students the definition for use in this conversation in order to allow students to use this domain-specific vocabulary to have a more rigorous and targeted conversation around these two poems.

How does the term "romanticize" apply to the conversation happening between these two texts?

- ☞ The Nymph's response reveals just how "romanticized" the Shepherd's invitation really is.

Circulate and assist as needed. After students have had time to discuss, lead a brief share out of student observations.

Transition students from group work into a full-class discussion. Pose the following question and allow a minute for students to jot down initial thoughts and reactions. Then, lead a full-class discussion. Remind students of their work with the Speaking and Listening Rubric in 10.1.1 Lesson 3, and instruct them to continue to practice the skills outlined on the rubric.

- ① If necessary, consider displaying and reviewing the Speaking and Listening Rubric and Checklist before students begin this discussion.

- Students briefly write responses to the following question then engage in full-class discussion.

What might the Nymph's response reveal about the nature of the Shepherd's invitation?

- 💬 The Nymph's response reveals the commanding nature of the Shepherd's request. The Nymph's rejection shows that the Shepherd wasn't asking so much as commanding or bribing the Nymph in the first poem. Student responses may call upon textual details including: The Nymph describes the Shepherd in terms of his "tongue." In the first stanza, the Nymph wonders "if" there could be "truth in every shepherd's tongue," and then in the third stanza the Nymph refers to the Shepherd's "honey tongue" in conjunction with a "heart of gall." The inference is that there is "not" truth in the Shepherd's "tongue" or promises. The Nymph does not trust what the Shepherd is saying, the sweet honey tongue of the Shepherd only covers up the truth of time and aging and decay.

- ① **Differentiation Consideration:** If students have made these understandings quickly, consider offering the following question as an extension to this discussion:

What does the Nymph find to be problematic about the Shepherd's invitation?

- 💬 The Nymph finds the Shepherd's lack of consideration for the passage of time to be a problem. Raleigh invokes "winter" and "fall," describing the two seasons that Marlowe leaves out of his eternal springtime.
- ① **Differentiation Consideration:** Depending on the strength and interest of students, consider having a conversation around how Raleigh's poem can also be read as a criticism of pastoral poetry in general. "The Nymph's Reply to the Shepherd" can be read both literally and figuratively: in one sense the Nymph is actually rejecting the offers of love from a Shepherd; in another sense, the Shepherd is representative of the conventions of pastoral poetry, and the Nymph is a vessel through which Raleigh can respond to and critique the problems of pastoral poetry.

Activity 5: Quick Write

15%

Instruct students to respond briefly in writing to the following prompt:

How does Raleigh draw upon or transform Marlowe's poem?

Instruct students to look at their text and notes to find evidence. Remind students to use the Short Response Rubric and Checklist to guide their written responses.

- ▶ Students listen and read the Quick Write prompt.

① Display the prompt for students to see, or provide the prompt in hard copy.

Transition students to the independent Quick Write.

- ▶ Students independently answer the prompt, using evidence from the text.
- 🗣 See the High Performance Response at the beginning of this lesson.

Activity 6: Closing

5%

Display and distribute the homework assignment. For homework, instruct students to respond briefly in writing to the following prompt:

How has your understanding of Marlowe and Raleigh's poems developed through comparison of the two poems?

① It is important to make time for this reflection, particularly because of the brevity of this unit, to allow students the time to consider the course of their analysis.

Homework

Reflect on how your understanding of Marlowe and Raleigh's poems has developed through comparison of the two poems.

Full Text Annotation Handout

“The Passionate Shepherd to His Love” Marlowe (1599)	“The Nymph’s Reply to the Shepherd” Raleigh (1600)
<p>Come live with me and be my love, And we will all the pleasures prove That hills and valleys, dale and field, And all the craggy mountains yield.</p> <p>There will we sit upon the rocks And see the shepherds feed their flocks, By shallow rivers, to whose falls Melodious birds sing madrigals.</p> <p>There will I make thee beds of roses And a thousand fragrant posies, A cap of flowers, and a kirtle Embroidered all with leaves of myrtle.</p> <p>A gown made of the finest wool Which from our pretty lambs we pull, Fair lined slippers for the cold, With buckles of the purest gold.</p> <p>A belt of straw and ivy buds With coral clasps and amber studs: And if these pleasures may thee move, Come live with me and be my love.</p> <p>The shepherd swains shall dance and sing For thy delight each May morning: If these delights thy mind may move, Then live with me and be my love.</p>	<p>If all the world and love were young, And truth in every Shepherd’s tongue, These pretty pleasures might me move, To live with thee, and be thy love.</p> <p>Time drives the flocks from field to fold, When rivers rage and rocks grow cold, And Philomel becometh dumb, The rest complains of cares to come.</p> <p>The flowers do fade, and wanton fields, To wayward winter reckoning yields, A honey tongue, a heart of gall, Is fancy’s spring, but sorrow’s fall.</p> <p>Thy gowns, thy shoes, thy beds of roses, Thy cap, thy kirtle, and thy posies Soon break, soon wither, soon forgotten: In folly ripe, in reason rotten.</p> <p>Thy belt of straw and ivy buds, The coral clasps and amber studs, All these in me no means can move To come to thee and be thy love.</p> <p>But could youth last, and love still breed, Had joys no date, nor age no need, Then these delights my mind might move To live with thee, and be thy love.</p>