

## 9.4.1

## Lesson 18

## Introduction

In this lesson, students are introduced to the supplementary text “Where Sweatshops Are a Dream” by Nicholas D. Kristof. This article explores the idea that factory jobs in poor countries are actually a means of alleviating poverty. Students listen to a Masterful Reading of the text and focus their analysis on determining the author’s point of view and purpose, and understanding nuances in word relationships and meanings. Students are assessed on their ability to identify how the author uses figurative language to advance his purpose. This initial exploration of language and point of view provides students with the foundation necessary to delineate and evaluate the author’s argument by identifying claims and supporting evidence in 9.4.1 Lesson 19.

For homework, students write a paragraph identifying the central claim and counterclaim of the article and provide evidence from the text to demonstrate why they selected each claim. Additionally, students continue with their AIR.

## Standards

Assessed Standard(s)	
RI.9-10.6	Determine an author’s point of view or purpose in a text and analyze how an author uses rhetoric to advance that point of view or purpose.
L.9-10.5	Demonstrate understanding of figurative language, word relationships, and nuances in word meanings.
Addressed Standard(s)	
None.	

## Assessment

Assessment(s)
<p>Student learning is assessed via a Quick Write at the end of the lesson. Students answer the following prompt, citing textual evidence to support analysis and inferences drawn from the text.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>How does the author use figurative language to advance his purpose in this article?</li> </ul>

**High Performance Response(s)**

A High Performance Response should:

- Identify the author's purpose (e.g., convincing readers that although sweatshops may be harsh and oppressive places to work, they often present a better alternative for workers in poor countries than what is already available to them).
- Provide examples of figurative language used in the article and explain how they advance the author's purpose (e.g., the author uses disturbing imagery that evokes pictures of a "Dante-like vision of hell" such as "subterranean fires," "forlorn" rats, and "breezes" that "batter you with filth" to make Phnom Penh seem like a horrible situation. In contrast, the author uses pleasant imagery and positive figurative language like "cherished dream," "an escalator out of," and "gauzy ... ambitions" when discussing sweatshops. This contrast in imagery advances the author's purpose to convince readers that sweatshops are a better alternative for workers in poor countries).

**Vocabulary****Vocabulary to provide directly (will not include extended instruction)**

- festering (adj.) – putrefying or rotting
- refuse (n.) – anything thrown away; waste; rubbish
- subterranean (adj.) – existing below the earth; underground
- Dante-like (adj.) – referring to a famous Italian poet of the 14<sup>th</sup> century, and in this case his vivid descriptions of hell in the poem "Inferno" from the *The Divine Comedy*
- miasma (n.) – pollution in the atmosphere, esp. noxious vapors from decomposing organic matter
- forlorn (adj.) – expressive of hopelessness; despairing
- ambling (v.) – going at a slow, easy pace; strolling
- gauzy (adj.) – transparently thin and light
- rickshaw (n.) – a small two-wheeled passenger vehicle drawn by one or two men, used in parts of Asia

**Vocabulary to teach (may include direct word work and/or questions)**

- repulsed (v.) – produced a feeling of aversion or distaste
- distress (n.) – pain or hardship
- exploit (v.) – to use selfishly for one's own ends

## Lesson Agenda/Overview

Student-Facing Agenda	% of Lesson
<b>Standards &amp; Text:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Standards: RI.9-10.6, L.9-10.5</li> <li>Text: “Where Sweatshops Are a Dream” by Nicholas D. Kristof (<a href="http://www.nytimes.com/2009/01/15/opinion/15kristof.html?_r=">http://www.nytimes.com/2009/01/15/opinion/15kristof.html?_r=</a>)</li> </ul>	
<b>Learning Sequence:</b> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Introduction of Lesson Agenda</li> <li>Homework Accountability</li> <li>Masterful Reading</li> <li>Reading and Discussion</li> <li>Quick Write</li> <li>Closing</li> </ol>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>10%</li> <li>10%</li> <li>10%</li> <li>50%</li> <li>10%</li> <li>10%</li> </ol>

## Materials

- Student copies of the Short Response Rubric and Checklist (refer to 9.4.1 Lesson 1)
- Student copies of the 9.4 Common Core Learning Standards Tool (refer to 9.4.1 Lesson 9)

## Learning Sequence

How to Use the Learning Sequence	
Symbol	Type of Text & Interpretation of the Symbol
10%	Percentage indicates the percentage of lesson time each activity should take.
no symbol	Plain text indicates teacher action.
	<b>Bold text indicates questions for the teacher to ask students.</b>
	<i>Italicized text indicates a vocabulary word.</i>
►	Indicates student action(s).
💬	Indicates possible student response(s) to teacher questions.
❗	Indicates instructional notes for the teacher.

### Activity 1: Introduction of Lesson Agenda

**10%**

Begin by reviewing the agenda and sharing the assessed standards for this lesson: RI.9-10.6 and L.9-10.5. Tell students that they are working with a supplementary text “Where Sweatshops Are a Dream,” which

adds a new perspective to the texts they have been reading about the garment industry and the ethical production of goods.

Review the meanings of the terms *point of view* and *purpose* to prepare students for their work with RI.9-10.6. *Point of view* means “the position of the narrator in relation to the story (first, second, third person point of view), or, in the case of informational texts, an author’s opinion, attitude, or judgment.” *Purpose* means “an author’s reason for writing (e.g., to introduce and develop a central idea, or to convince readers of a claim).” Explain to students that in this lesson they will be analyzing the text to determine both Kristof’s point of view and his purpose.

Explain to students that they will also examine how the author uses figurative language to advance his purpose in this text.

- ▶ Students look at the agenda.

Remind students of their work with L.9-10.5 in 9.2.1. Instruct students to talk in pairs about the meaning of *figurative language*.

- ▶ Students discuss their understanding of figurative language in pairs.
- 💬 Figurative language includes words that mean something different from their literal meaning. Figurative language can also be understood as language used by writers to produce images for readers, as with metaphors or personification.

Lead a brief discussion of student responses. Explain that students will apply their understanding of L.9-10.5 in their analyses of the text in this lesson.

- ① **Differentiation Consideration:** If students struggle with the concept of word nuances, explain to students that *nuances* are slight differences. For example, house and home have the same meaning (a place to live), but have nuanced connotations (an inanimate structure as opposed to a warm and inviting space).

## Activity 2: Homework Accountability

10%

Instruct students to form pairs and discuss the previous lesson’s homework, a reading of the “Crossing the Black Water” section (pp. 104–108) from *Sugar Changed the World*. Have students share their responses to the 9.4.1 Lesson 17 homework prompts with each other and ask for volunteers to share with the whole class.

- ① Explain to students that this part of the text discusses some of the reasons why Indians may have entered indentured servitude. Ensure students understand that people with limited opportunities may take advantage of work that is dangerous or subjugating because it may be better than many alternative options.

- ▶ Students discuss the following 9.4.1 Lesson 17 homework questions with each other and volunteers share answers with the class.

**“Why would any Indian risk going off to work in sugar?” (p. 104). Support your response with details from the text.**

- ☞ Many people risked finding work in other countries because there was widespread poverty in India; “famines and droughts had swept across the countryside” (p. 104). The people were “hungry, desperate” (p.106), and willing to risk a lot.

**What connections do the authors draw between Hindu society and the Age of Honey? Why was it difficult for Hindus to leave home and work on the plantations?**

- ☞ Student responses should include:
  - Because of the caste system, Hindus were “expected to do the work of his or her ancestors” (p. 106).
  - “Hindus in India had a very strong sense of their place in their community” (p. 106).
  - Because of the strong connections between family and community that defined Hindu life, if a person left the country for work they were stripped of their “role in society” and “could not come back” unless they went through a “special ceremony” (p. 106).

**How do the authors compare the situations of the “enslaved Africans” and the “Indian indentures” (p. 107)?**

- ☞ Student responses may include:
  - Both the Indian indentures and enslaved Africans were “no more than cheap labor to keep the plantations running” (p. 107).
  - The Indian indentures were “still individuals” as is evidenced by their “identification disk[s]” (p. 107), while the Africans “lost their names” and were “pure property” (p. 107).
  - Both Indians and Africans experienced a grueling journey on ships to the plantations.
  - The Indian indentures brought “hopes” with them on the ships, unlike the “newly enslaved Africans” (p. 108).

Inform students that they will analyze a text that will help to contemporize some of the issues explored in *Sugar Changed the World*. “Where Sweatshops Are a Dream” is an opinion piece by Nicholas Kristof that appeared in the *New York Times* on January 14, 2009. The opinion section of the newspaper is where writers make arguments about present day policy or cultural issues, often urging government officials or the public to take action or change their opinion on a particular subject. Kristof considers the debate around whether sweatshops can be a means by which to lift people out of poverty and offers his argument on the topic.

### Activity 3: Masterful Reading

**10%**

Have students listen to a Masterful Reading of Nicholas D. Kristof’s article “Where Sweatshops Are a Dream.”

- ▶ Students follow along, reading silently.

① **Differentiation Consideration:** Consider asking students to read the text aloud in groups or in pairs.

### Activity 4: Reading and Discussion

**50%**

Instruct students to form pairs. Post or project each set of questions below for students to discuss.

Instruct student pairs to read the title and recall their work with the word “sweatshop” in *Sugar Changed the World* (p. 79) and answer the following questions before sharing out with the class.

Remind students of the ideas about cheap factory labor they encountered in “How Your Addiction to Fast Fashion Kills.” Instruct students to discuss and share with each other associations and connotations of the word “sweatshop.”

💬 Student responses may include:

- Sweatshops imply hard work and long hours.
- They seem to be places where working conditions are poor.
- Workers are not paid well in sweatshops.

Instruct students to do a Turn-and-Talk to discuss the following question:

**Based on the connotations of the word “sweatshops,” what is the effect of using the word “dream” to describe them? What might the relationship between these two words reveal about the authors’ point of view?**

💬 The author uses an unexpected word—“dream”— to describe sweatshops. This provides a hint that what he is going to argue may be contrary to what people normally think or present a new or surprising take on the subject. While the word “sweatshops” has negative connotations, the word “dream” has mostly positive connotations. Therefore, the author might hold the point of view that sweatshops are a positive thing.

Lead a brief whole-class discussion of student responses.

Instruct student pairs to read paragraphs 1–4 of “Where Sweatshops Are a Dream” and answer the following questions before sharing out with the class.

Instruct students to annotate in the margins of their texts during the discussion for examples of rhetoric in the article.

- ① Consider providing students with the following definition: *labor standards* means “rules and laws regulating the treatment and rights of workers.”

**To whom does the author refer in the first paragraph? How does this develop your understanding of the author’s point of view?**

- The author says “Before Barack Obama and his team act...” He appears to define his argument in contrast to the president’s, which shows that he considers his point of view to be opposed to that of the president.

Provide students the following definitions: *Dante-like* means “referring to a famous Italian poet of the 14<sup>th</sup> century, Dante Alighieri, and in this case his vivid descriptions of hell in the section “Inferno” from his poem *The Divine Comedy*; *fester* means “putrefying or rotting”; *refuse* means “anything thrown away; waste; rubbish”; and *subterranean* means “existing below the earth; underground.”

- ▶ Students write the definitions of *Dante-like*, *fester*, *refuse*, and *subterranean* on their copy of the text or in a vocabulary journal.

Remind students that when figurative language provides a picture that evokes any of the senses (sight, smell, hearing, etc.), we call this imagery.

Ask student pairs to identify the imagery in paragraph 2.

- Student responses may include:
- “a mountain of festering refuse”
  - “clouds of smoke”
  - “subterranean fires”

- ① Consider reminding students that imagery is an author’s use of vivid, descriptive language that appeals to the senses. Imagery is a type of figurative language.

**What is the effect of the author’s use of imagery in paragraph 2?**

- The author uses the imagery of “festering refuse” and “clouds of smoke” and “subterranean fires” to paint a vivid and disturbing picture of the dump as a “Dante-like vision of hell.”

Lead a brief whole-class discussion of student responses.

Instruct student pairs to read paragraph 3 and answer the following questions before sharing out with the class.

Provide students with the following definitions: *miasma* means “pollution in the atmosphere, esp. noxious vapors from decomposing organic matter,” *forlorn* means “expressive of hopelessness; despairing,” *ambling* means “going at a slow, easy pace; strolling.”

Ask student pairs to identify the author’s use of imagery in paragraph 3.

💬 Student responses may include:

- “miasma of toxic stink”
- “breezes batter you with filth”
- “rats look forlorn”
- “a child ambling barefoot”

**What effect does the author’s choice of words like *miasma* and *forlorn* have on the text?**

💬 The images of filthy breezes and sad rats further develop the filth and the desperation of the “Dante-like vision of hell” that the author describes in the second paragraph. The introduction of the child into this horrible environment creates the effect of shock and horror upon discovering that “families actually live” here, “in shacks on this smoking garbage.”

**According to paragraph, what are President Obama and the Democrats’ attitudes toward sweatshops?**

💬 Barack Obama and his party are against sweatshops. The author says they “favor labor standards in trade agreements” and “intend to fight back against oppressive sweatshops,” presumably for their low wages and poor working conditions.

**How does the author’s circling back to Barack Obama in paragraph 4 further inform your understanding of the author’s purpose?**

💬 The author mentions “labor standards” in the first paragraph and then circles back to it in paragraph four. He does this to suggest that labor standards—Obama and the Democrats’ favored means of reducing poverty abroad—are not necessarily the best solution for reducing poverty.

**How does the author’s use of the word “exploit” convey his point of view on sweatshops?**

💬 The negative connotations of the word exploit suggest that the author does not think sweatshops are necessarily a good thing. However, by stating that sweatshops “don’t exploit enough,” the author suggests that there should be more opportunities for people in poor countries to work and earn the wages offered by sweatshops.

① Consider providing students with the following definition: *exploit* means “to use selfishly for one’s own ends.”



Lead a brief whole-class discussion of student responses.

---

Instruct student pairs to read paragraphs 5–7 and answer the following questions before sharing out with the class.

Provide students the following definition: *gauzy* means “transparently thin and light.”

- ▶ Students write the definition of *gauzy* on their copy of the text or in a vocabulary journal.

**How does the author’s use of “dream” in paragraph 5 develop the author’s purpose?**

- 💬 The author states that for families who live in the dump, a job in a sweatshop is a “cherished dream.” This helps clarify the author’s purpose of convincing readers sweatshops are actually a better alternative for many workers in developing nations.

**What relationship is the author constructing between his point of view, and the point of view of the people he interviews?**

- 💬 The author interviews a 19-year-old woman who says she’d love to have a job in a factory: “‘I’d love to get a job in a factory,’ said Pim Srey Rath, a 19-year-old woman scavenging for plastic.” He also quotes a mother who says she wants her son to get a job in a factory: “Another woman, Vath Sam Oeun, hopes her 10-year-old boy, scavenging beside her, grows up to get a factory job.” The author is saying that his point of view is the same as the point of view of the people actually forced to work in the sweatshops. By using the point of view of people whose lives would be impacted by sweatshops he supports his point of view that sweatshops are a “dream” for many in poverty.

Ask student pairs to identify the author’s use of imagery in paragraph 5.

- 💬 Student responses may include:
  - “escalator out of poverty”
  - “gauzy...ambition”

**How does this use of figurative language compare to the author’s use of imagery in paragraphs 2 and 3? How does the cumulative effect of the figurative language in all three paragraphs advance the author’s purpose?**

- 💬 Student responses may include:
  - The author uses language like “cherished dream,” “escalator out of poverty,” and “gauzy” to provide a dreamlike association to sweatshop work. This stands in contrast to the author’s use of imagery in paragraphs 2 and 3, in which he uses images of “festering refuse” and

“subterranean fires” to paint the picture of Phnom Penh as a “Dante-like vision of hell.” The author uses figurative language to create a picture of something horrible and a picture of something better, which reinforces the author’s purpose of showing that people who live in poverty would much prefer to work in a sweatshop.

Lead a brief whole-class discussion of student responses.

---

Instruct student pairs to read paragraphs 8–10 and answer the following questions before sharing out with the class.

**In paragraph 8, what words and phrases in the text can help you make meaning of the word *repulsed*? What synonyms might be used instead of *repulsed*?**

- ☞ The writer is “glad” that Americans are “repulsed” by buying things made in “barely legal” and “dangerous” situations. That means they are “repulsed” by something negative. Synonyms that might be used for “repulsed” are “disgusted” or “upset by.”

**What comparison is the author constructing in his description of sweatshops as a “symptom” of poverty? How does this metaphor advance his purpose?**

- ☞ The author is comparing poverty to a disease, and sweatshops to a symptom of that disease. This metaphor advances his purpose because it supports the idea that sweatshops do not cause people to be poor but exist rather as an effect of poverty. Factories that pay low wages exist in poor countries that have few well-paying labor options.

Provide students the following definition: *rickshaw* means “a small two-wheeled passenger vehicle drawn by one or two men, used throughout certain parts of Asia.”

- ▶ Students write the definition of *rickshaw* on their copy of the text or in a vocabulary journal.

**What does the author reveal about his point of view in paragraphs 9 and 10?**

- The author reveals that his point of view is shaped from personal experience: “My views on sweatshops are shaped by years living in East Asia, watching as living standards soared—including those in my wife’s ancestral village in southern China—because of sweatshop jobs.”

**How does the author’s reflection on his own personal experiences advance his purpose?**

- ☞ He uses his personal experience to say he has seen sweatshops raise the living standards of people in his wife’s country. This personal evidence demonstrates how committed and knowledgeable the author is to his purpose of showing that sweatshops are a better alternative to many other jobs in poor countries.

Lead a brief whole-class discussion of student responses.

### Activity 5: Quick Write

**10%**

Instruct students to respond briefly in writing to the following prompt:

**How does the author use figurative language to advance his purpose in this article?**

Instruct students to look at their annotations to find evidence. Ask students to use this lesson's vocabulary wherever possible in their written responses. Remind students to use the Short Response Rubric and Checklist to guide their written responses.

① Display the prompt for students to see, or provide the prompt in hard copy.

- ▶ Students independently answer the prompt, using evidence from the text.
- 🗨 See the High Performance Response at the beginning of this lesson.

### Activity 6: Closing

**10%**

Display and distribute the homework assignment. For homework, instruct students to identify the central claim and counterclaim of “Where Sweatshops Are a Dream.” Students should provide evidence from the text to support their responses.

- ▶ Students follow along.

Additionally, instruct students to continue to read their AIR text through the lens of the focus standard of their choice. Students should be prepared for a 3–5 minute discussion of their text based on that standard.

## Homework

Identify the central claim and counterclaim of “Where Sweatshops are a Dream.” Provide evidence from the text to support your response.

Additionally, continue to read your AIR text through the lens of a focus standard of your choice and prepare for a 3–5 minute discussion of your text based on that standard.