

## 9.4.1

## Lesson 12

## Introduction

In this lesson, students begin to read “Bangladesh Factory Collapse: Who Really Pays for our Cheap Clothes?” the third of four supplemental texts of this module, which connect some of the issues and perspectives from *Sugar Changed the World* to contemporary times. “Bangladesh Factory Collapse: Who Really Pays for our Cheap Clothes?” is an opinion piece that considers the responsibility of companies in reforming the working conditions in garment factories in developing countries. Focused questions support student analysis of “Bangladesh Factory Collapse: Who Really Pays for our Cheap Clothes?” as a piece of argument writing. Students also build on their understanding of rhetoric from 9.4.1 Lesson 9. At the close of this lesson, students complete a Quick Write that prompts them to consider the author’s purpose and use of rhetoric in the text.

For homework, students preview the text for the next lesson’s reading and continue their AIR.

## Standards

Assessed Standard(s)	
RI.9-10.6	Determine an author’s point of view or purpose in a text and analyze how an author uses rhetoric to advance that point of view or purpose.
Addressed Standard(s)	
W.9-10.1.a	<p>Write arguments to support claims in an analysis of substantive topics or texts, using valid reasoning and relevant and sufficient evidence. Explore and inquire into areas of interest to formulate an argument.</p> <p>a. Introduce precise claim(s), distinguish the claim(s) from alternate or opposing claims, and create an organization that establishes clear relationships among claim(s), counterclaims, reasons, and evidence.</p>

## Assessment

Assessment(s)
<p>Student learning is assessed via a Quick Write at the end of the lesson. Students respond to the following prompt, citing textual evidence to support analysis and inferences drawn from the text.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>What is the author's purpose in this article? How does the author use rhetoric to advance their purpose?</li> </ul>
High Performance Response(s)
<p>A High Performance Response should:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Identify the author's purpose (e.g. to convince the reader that companies need to take responsibility for the working conditions in Bangladesh).</li> <li>Provide examples of rhetoric used in the article and explain how they advance the author's purpose (e.g., the appeal to authority through the invocation of the United Nations; the use of rhetorical questions).</li> </ul>

## Vocabulary

Vocabulary to provide directly (will not include extended instruction)
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>subsidence (n.) – the gradual sinking of landforms to a lower level as a result of earth movements, mining operations, etc.</li> <li>retail (adj.) – engaged in the sale of goods to consumers</li> <li>recession (n.) – a period of economic contraction</li> <li>endemic (adj.) – natural to or characteristic of</li> <li>audit (n.) – an official examination and verification of accounts and records</li> <li>sector (n.) – a distinct part, especially of a society or economy</li> <li>crucial (adj.) – involving an extremely important decision or result</li> <li>critical mass (n.) – the minimum amount required to start or maintain something</li> <li>CSR (acronym) – Corporate Social Responsibility</li> </ul>
Vocabulary to teach (may include direct word work and/or questions)
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>apathy (n.) – a lack of interest or concern</li> </ul>

## Lesson Agenda/Overview

Student-Facing Agenda	% of Lesson
<b>Standards &amp; Text:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Standards: RI.9–10.6, W.9–10.1.a</li> <li>Text: “Bangladesh Factory Collapse: Who Really Pays for our Cheap Clothes?” (<a href="http://www.cnn.com/">http://www.cnn.com/</a>)</li> </ul>	
<b>Learning Sequence:</b> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Introduction of Lesson Agenda</li> <li>Homework Accountability</li> <li>Masterful Reading</li> <li>Reading and Discussion</li> <li>Quick Write</li> <li>Closing</li> </ol>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>5%</li> <li>10%</li> <li>15%</li> <li>50%</li> <li>15%</li> <li>5%</li> </ol>

## Materials

- Student copies of the 9.4 Common Core Learning Standards Tool (refer to 9.4.1 Lesson 9)
- Student copies of the Short Response Rubric and Checklist

## Learning Sequence

How to Use the Learning Sequence	
Symbol	Type of Text & Interpretation of the Symbol
10%	Percentage indicates the percentage of lesson time each activity should take.
no symbol	Plain text indicates teacher action.
	<b>Bold text indicates questions for the teacher to ask students.</b>
	<i>Italicized text indicates a vocabulary word.</i>
►	Indicates student action(s).
☞	Indicates possible student response(s) to teacher questions.
ⓘ	Indicates instructional notes for the teacher.

## Activity 1: Introduction of Lesson Agenda

5%

Begin by reviewing the agenda and assessed standards for this lesson: RI.9–10.6. In this lesson, students begin to read a supplemental argument text “Bangladesh Factory Collapse: Who Really Pays for our Cheap Clothes?” and analyze the author’s point of view and purpose, as well as build on their understanding of rhetoric as it is used in argument writing. Inform students that the assessment for this lesson is a Quick Write that asks them to determine the author’s purpose in this article and her use of rhetoric to advance that purpose.

- ▶ Students look at the agenda.
- ① Throughout this module, students pause at critical moments in *Sugar Changed the World* to explore short, supplementary texts. The goal of exploring these texts is to help students make connections between the central ideas of *Sugar Changed the World* and related contemporary issues. The supplementary texts also provide examples of argument writing, which model the components students use in their own argument writing pieces later in this module. Additionally, these texts scaffold the expectations of the Mid- and End-of-Unit Assessments in which students engage in cross-textual analysis of the ideas presented in *Sugar Changed the World* and in the supplementary texts.

## Activity 2: Homework Accountability

10%

Instruct students to talk in pairs about how they applied their focus standard to their text. Lead a brief share out on the AIR homework assignment from 9.4.1 Lesson 11. Select several students (or student pairs) to explain how they applied their focus standard to their AIR text.

- ▶ Students (or student pairs) discuss and share how they applied their focus standard to their AIR homework.

Ask students to talk in pairs about their responses to the Guiding Questions for Reading handout (pp. 80–82).

- ▶ Students discuss their responses to the homework.

**What is the quote from the National Assembly’s Declaration of the Rights of Man and the Citizen?  
How is it similar to quotes from other historical figures mentioned in the book?**

- 💬 “Men are born and remain free and equal in rights.” This is similar to quotes by Pierre Lemerre, Jefferson, and Clarkson. They were all declaring that men were free and equal in different contexts around the same time.

**Describe the conflict between human rights and property rights. What is the conflict about in the time that *Sugar Changed the World* describes? What is a modern example that the authors provide?**

- ☞ The idea that all men were equal and free was in conflict with property rights if people could also be property, as in the case of slaves. The authors ask what slaves were if they were human beings that belonged to their owners. In modern times, the authors compare it to regulating the coal industry, with the question about whether we should let owners of coal companies set the rules or have the government set the rules.

**How do the authors describe the differences among the United States, England, and France on page 82?**

- ☞ The differences were about each country's attitude towards slavery and freedom for its own citizens. In America, every white man became free, but they still had slaves. In England, there were abolitionists speaking up against slavery but the citizens were still subject to kings and lords. In France, they were "turning against their own nobles" but no one knew how this would affect slavery.

**Why was the chaos of the French Revolution seen as bad for the abolitionists?**

- ☞ Slave owners said that the chaos of the French Revolution showed what happened if you tried to interfere with property rights. They said that if you free slaves it would result in chaos and terror.

### Activity 3: Masterful Reading

**15%**

Inform students that in this supplementary text the author makes an argument about the responsibility of companies to improve conditions for the workers who make clothes in developing countries. With this text, students have the opportunity to look closely at what the author's purpose is and how her use of rhetoric advances that purpose.

Instruct students to listen to a masterful reading of "Bangladesh factory collapse: Who really pays for our cheap clothes?"

- ▶ Students follow along.

### Activity 4: Reading and Discussion

**50%**

Explain to students that the focus of this lesson is pages 1–2. Instruct students to form pairs and reread the text from the title through "the endemic problems that this industry faces" (pp. 1–2). Post or project each set of questions below for students to discuss.

**What rhetorical devices can you identify?**

💬 Student responses should include:

- Direct address to the audience: “our cheap clothes” (title), “they assure us” (p. 1), “as long as it is cheap we will buy it” (p. 1)
- Alliteration: “factory collapses and fires” (p. 1), “frankly further tragedies waiting to happen” (p. 1), “the prices they pay” (p. 1)
- Parallel structure: “It is common for fire extinguishers to be borrowed for inspection day, for workers to be schooled in what answers...” (p. 1), “protect, respect and remedy” (p. 2)
- Appeal to authority: “The responsibility for ensuring that a product was made with human rights in mind has to fall somewhere, and the United Nations’ guiding principles on business and human rights says that it falls jointly to states and mass corporate businesses” (p. 2)
- Rhetorical questions: “Who really pays for our cheap clothes?” (title) “Who cares about people who make clothing?” (p. 1)

① **Differentiation Consideration:** Consider reviewing the rhetorical techniques to which students were introduced in 9.4.1 Lesson 9: direct address to the audience, alliteration, parallel structure, appeal to authority, appeal to pathos, and rhetorical questions.

Provide students with the following definitions: *subsidence* means the gradual sinking of landforms to a lower level as a result of earth movements, mining operations, etc.; *retail* means engaged in the sale of goods to consumers; *recession* means a period of economic contraction; and *endemic* means natural to or characteristic of.

- ▶ Students write the definitions of *subsidence*, *retail*, *recession*, and *endemic* on their copy of the text or in a vocabulary journal.

**What effect does the word *really* create in the title?**

💬 *Really* creates an effect of doubt or questioning. It implies that the person (or people) who pay for “our cheap clothes” may not be who we think it is. *Really* implies that the reality of who “pays” is different from what might seem obvious (that we, the consumers, pay for our clothes when we buy them, or that our parents pay for our clothes, etc.).

**What does the “editor’s note” reveal about the author’s point of view and purpose in writing this article?**

💬 The editor’s note reveals that Anna McMullen is part of a group that works to “improve working conditions” for “garment workers” and her point of view is one of a “campaigner” – someone who works to achieve a social or political goal. The editor’s note also reveals that Anna

McMullen is opposed to current “working conditions” since she is working to change them. Her purpose in writing this article is likely to further her cause of “improving [garment workers’] working conditions” by informing people who read the article about what those conditions are.

Lead a brief full-class discussion of student responses.

---

Instruct student pairs to read from “The sad fact behind the building collapse” through “aside from the recently opened Myanmar industry, at \$37 a month” (p. 1) and answer the following questions before sharing out with the class.

**What connections does the author establish between the factory collapse and the other factories in “this same region” in Bangladesh?**

- ☞ The author is connecting all of the factories as “further tragedies waiting to happen.” The factories all have the same “limited building regulations” and are built on a “swampland” (p. 1). The author is establishing that all of the factories are equally unsafe and dangerous.

- ① Students were introduced to the events of the Bangladesh factory collapse during their close reading of “How Your Addiction to Fast Fashion Kills” in 9.4.1 Lessons 9 and 10. It may be helpful to review these events: Bangladesh is a country near India that produces much of the clothing that Americans buy, and Rana Plaza was an eight-story building that collapsed on April 24, 2013, killing 1,129 people and injuring 2,500 more. The building was home to several clothing factories and the operators were ordered to stop use of the factories the day before when cracks were detected in the building. They ignored these orders and the building collapsed the next day.

**How does the author’s inclusion of the exact amount of money Bangladeshi workers make each month advance her purpose?**

- ☞ The use of the exact number makes the wage a reality. To put a real number on how much the workers make considering the “horrific” (p. 1) conditions they work in makes the author’s purpose of informing people about the fact that these workers need better working conditions and wages seem more grounded in the reality of the situation.
- ① **Differentiation Consideration:** If students struggle to answer this question, ask students to consider what might have been different if the author had chosen to write “wages for Bangladeshi workers are the lowest in Asia,” but not include a number, or if the author had written “the lowest in Asia ... at almost nothing a month.”

- ① Some students may note that the use of US currency to frame the wages the worker receives also helps to bring this issue into a local perspective.

Lead a brief full-class discussion of student responses.

---

Instruct student pairs to read the third paragraph in this article and answer the following questions before sharing out with the class.

**Identify where the author uses two distinct types of punctuation in this paragraph: ellipsis and parentheses.**

💬 Students responses should include:

- “swampland (yes, swampland... )” in the third paragraph
- “building subsidence... ” in the seventh paragraph

Inform students that *ellipses* identify an omission, or that something is intentionally being left out of a phrase. *Parentheses* indicate an interjected explanatory or qualifying remark.

**What effect is created by the author’s use of ellipsis and parenthesis in the third paragraph?**

- 💬 The author’s use of ellipsis and parentheses in the third paragraph have a rhetorical effect, like direct address to the audience “(yes, swampland... )” is an aside to the reader that emphasizes how absurd it is that someone would build a factory on a swamp. It creates the effect that the author is speaking right to the person reading the article.

Lead a brief full-class discussion of student responses.

---

Instruct student pairs to read from “As the demand for cheap clothing grows” through “as long as it is cheap we will buy it” (p. 1) and answer the following questions before sharing out with the class.

**How does the author’s use of a rhetorical question advance her purpose?**

- 💬 The author’s purpose is to convince other people to care about working conditions for garment workers. The question “Who cares about people who make clothing?” (p. 1) advances her purpose because it makes the reader question whether or not they care, and implies that they should.
- ① **Differentiation Consideration:** It may be helpful to ask students what the tone of a question like “Who cares?” might be; it is likely students recognize this is a sarcastic question, or a question that is not looking for an answer.



**What words and phrases in the text can help you make meaning of *apathy*?**

- 🗨 The phrase “who cares” (p. 1) helps reveal the meaning of *apathy* as a lack of care or concern.

Lead a brief full-class discussion of student responses.

---

Instruct students to read from “Especially in a recession, cheap clothing” through “endemic problems the industry faces” (p. 2) and answer the following questions before sharing out with the class.

**Who does the author consider responsible for the problems she identifies?**

- 🗨 The author places an emphasis on “business” as being at fault for these conditions, and her statement that “it isn’t the responsibility of the consumer” (p. 2). The author sees “the brands” as “the ones who must take responsibility” (p. 2).

**How does the author use rhetoric to advance this point of view?**

- 🗨 The author uses alliteration—“holding up its hands”—and appeal to authority—“the United Nations guiding principles”—to advance the point of view that businesses are the ones responsible for changing the conditions of garment labor. The “United Nations’ guiding principles” also name “states” as being “jointly” responsible for these issues, but the author does not include this in her summary in the following paragraph.

Lead a brief full-class discussion of student responses.

---

Instruct student pairs to return to their Common Core Learning Standards Tool and review W.9–10.1.a. Remind students that they are working toward writing their own arguments and that part of being able to write arguments well is being able to identify what is happening in the argument writing of other texts.

- ① **Differentiation Consideration:** Consider providing students the following definitions: *argument* means the composition of precise claims about a topic, including relevant and sufficient evidence and valid reasoning; *central claim* means an author or speaker’s main point about an issue in an argument; *supporting claim* means smaller, related points that reinforce or advance the central claim; *evidence* means the topical and textual facts, events, and ideas from which the claims of an argument arise and which are cited to support those claims; and *reasoning* means the logical relationships among ideas, including relationships among claims and relationships across evidence.

- ▶ Students write the definitions of *argument*, *central claim*, *supporting claim*, *evidence*, and *reasoning* on their copy of the text or in a vocabulary journal.

Instruct students to answer the following questions before sharing out with the class.

**What is a central claim of the text thus far?**

- 💬 Businesses are responsible for making garment factories safer, “the brands, not the consumer, are the ones who must take responsibility” (p. 2).

**What supporting claims can you identify?**

- 💬 Student responses should include:
  - Brands are putting workers at risk by cutting costs when it comes to safety in garment factories, “sadly this involves cutting corners on health and safety” (p. 1).
  - Businesses are named by the “United Nations’ guiding principles” (p. 2) as one of the parties responsible for these issues.

**What are the counterclaims that correspond with the central claim you identified?**

- 💬 Student responses should include:
  - Businesses already pay workers enough, “the prices that they pay, they assure us, are enough to pay workers to live on and keep factories in tip-top condition” (p. 2)
  - Consumers are the ones responsible, not businesses “It is not our fault—they bought it” (p. 2)

**How does the author distinguish the supporting claims from the counterclaims?**

- 💬 The author makes it seem like the counterclaims are statements that are being made by “businesses”—in the first example the author identifies the counterclaim with the statement “they assure us” (p. 1) that attributes the counterclaim to businesses, and in the second example puts quotations around the counterclaim to make it seem like something a business actually said.

Lead a brief full-class discussion of student responses.

## Activity 5: Quick Write

15%

Instruct students to respond briefly in writing to the following prompt:

**What is the author’s purpose in this article? How does the author use rhetoric to advance their purpose?**

Instruct students to look at their annotations to find evidence. Ask students to use this lesson’s vocabulary wherever possible in their written responses. Remind students to use the Short Response Checklist and Rubric to guide their written responses.

① Display the prompt for students to see, or provide the prompt in hard copy.

► Students independently answer the prompt using evidence from the text.

☞ See the High Performance Response at the beginning of this lesson.

**Activity 6: Closing****5%**

Display and distribute the homework assignment. For homework, instruct students to read “Bangladesh Factory Collapse: Who Really Pays for our Cheap Clothes” from “So what can be done?” through “The opinions expressed in this commentary are solely those of Anna McMullen” (pp. 2–3). Direct students to box any unfamiliar words and look up their definitions. Instruct them to choose the definition that makes the most sense in the context, and write a brief definition above or near the word in the text.

Additionally, students should continue to read their AIR text through the lens of a focus standard of their choice and prepare for a 3–5 minute discussion of that text based on that standard.

► Students follow along.

① **Differentiation Consideration:** Consider providing students the following definitions: *audit* means an official examination and verification of accounts and records; *sector* means a distinct part, especially of a society or economy; *crucial* means an extremely important decision or result; *critical mass* means the minimum amount required to start or maintain something; and *CSR* stands for Corporate Social Responsibility.

**Homework**

For homework, read pages 2–3 of “Bangladesh Factory Collapse: Who Really Pays for our Cheap Clothes” from “So what can be done?” through “The opinions expressed in this commentary are solely those of Anna McMullen.” Box any unfamiliar words and look up their definitions. Choose the definition that makes the most sense in the context, and write a brief definition above or near the word in the text.

Continue your AIR through the lens of your focus standard of choice.