

9.4.1**Lesson 10****Introduction**

In this lesson, students finish reading “How Your Addiction to Fast Fashion Kills” from “A host of complicated factors” through “because in the longer term it's better for everybody.” In this passage, the author argues that companies are responsible for producing ethically manufactured goods but that consumers must put pressure on them to do so. Students are assessed on their ability to delineate and evaluate the argument using a tool specific to this purpose.

For homework, students continue their AIR through the lens of their focus standard.

Standards

Assessed Standard(s)	
RI.9-10.8	Delineate and evaluate the argument and specific claims in a text, assessing whether the reasoning is valid and the evidence is relevant and sufficient; identify false statements and fallacious reasoning.
Addressed Standard(s)	
RI.9-10.6	Determine an author’s point of view or purpose in a text and analyze how an author uses rhetoric to advance that point of view or purpose.

Assessment

Assessment(s)
Student learning is assessed via completion of the Evaluating Argument and Evidence Tool at the end of the lesson.
High Performance Response(s)
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> See Model Evaluating Argument and Evidence Tool

Vocabulary

Vocabulary to provide directly (will not include extended instruction)
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> quotas (n.) - a part of a total amount or quantity.
Vocabulary to teach (may include direct word work and/or questions)
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> None.

Lesson Agenda/Overview

Student-Facing Agenda	% of Lesson
Standards & Text: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Standards: RI.9-10.8, RI.9-10.6 Text: “How Your Addiction to Fast Fashion Kills” by Amy Odell (http://law.fordham.edu) 	
Learning Sequence: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Introduction of Lesson Agenda Homework Accountability Reading and Discussion Evaluating Argument and Evidence Tool and Assessment Closing 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 25% 10% 45% 15% 5%

Materials

- Student copies of the 9.4 Common Core Learning Standards Tool (refer to 9.4.1 Lesson 9)
- Copies of the Evaluating Argument and Evidence Tool for each student

Learning Sequence

How to Use the Learning Sequence	
Symbol	Type of Text & Interpretation of the Symbol
10%	Percentage indicates the percentage of lesson time each activity should take.
no symbol	Plain text indicates teacher action.
	Bold text indicates questions for the teacher to ask students.
	<i>Italicized text indicates a vocabulary word.</i>
▶	Indicates student action(s).
💬	Indicates possible student response(s) to teacher questions.
❗	Indicates instructional notes for the teacher.

Activity 1: Introduction of Lesson Agenda

25%

Begin by reviewing the agenda and sharing the assessed standard for this lesson: RI.9-10.8. In this lesson, students finish reading “How Your Addiction to Fast Fashion Kills” and complete the Evaluating Argument and Evidence Tool, outlining the argument, claims, and supporting evidence in the text.

- ▶ Students look at the agenda.

Distribute or ask students to take out their copies of the 9.4 Common Core Learning Standards Tool. Ask students to read standard RI.9-10.8 and assess their familiarity with and mastery of it.

- ▶ Students read and assess their familiarity with standard RI.9-10.8.

Instruct students to box unfamiliar words.

💬 Student responses may include:

- *delineate*
- *valid*
- *relevant*
- *sufficient*

Instruct students to discuss their understanding and mastery of the standard.

💬 Student responses should include:

- The standard is about delineating and evaluating arguments.
- Claims, evidence, and reasoning are parts of an argument.

Inform students of the definitions for the following terms related to argument:

- *Argument*: the composition of precise claims about a topic, including relevant and sufficient evidence, and valid reasoning.
- ① The *argument* is the text as a whole; the argument cannot be summarized in one sentence, although a central claim can be.
- *Central claim*: an author or speaker's main point about an issue in an argument.
- ① The *central claim* of an argument also may be called a thesis or a position (the author or speaker's stance). The *central claim* also may imply the author or speaker's point of view or purpose (RI.9-10.6).
- *Supporting claim*: a smaller, related point that reinforces or advances the central claim.
- ① Students should be familiar with the term *claim* from previous modules; in Lesson 1 of this module, *claim* was defined as an assertion of something as a fact.
- *Evidence*: the topical and textual facts, events, and ideas from which the claims of an argument arise, and which are cited to support those claims.
- ① Students may be familiar with the definition of *evidence* from the previous lesson (Lesson 9).
- *Relevant*: relating to a subject in an appropriate way.
- *Sufficient*: adequate for the purpose; enough.
- ① *Sufficient* evidence thoroughly reinforces the claims in an argument (central and/or supporting claims). One piece of powerful evidence may be *sufficient* to support a claim, or several pieces of evidence may be collectively *sufficient* to support a claim.
- *Reasoning*: the logical relationships among ideas, including relationships among claims and relationships across evidence.
- *Valid*: sound; well-founded; logical.
- *Delineate*: to trace or outline an argument's central and supporting claims.
- ① Consider posting or projecting these definitions to support students' continued work with argument throughout the module.

Display and distribute the Evaluating Argument and Evidence Tool and explain to students how this tool helps them to delineate arguments and apply the skills in standard RI.9-10.8.

- ① The texts in this module do not support instruction around *false statements* or *fallacious reasoning*.

Ask students how the terms on the tool are related to standards RI.9-10.8 and RI.9-10.6.

🗣 Student responses should include:

- Purpose and point of view are found in RI.9-10.6.

- The tool includes space to identify the central claim and supporting claims as well as a counterclaim, which are terms found in RI.9-10.8.
- The tool has spaces for evaluating the evidence an author provides to support his or her claim and to consider whether the evidence is relevant or sufficient.

Activity 2: Homework Accountability

10%

Instruct students to talk in pairs about how they applied their focus standard to their text. Lead a brief share out on the previous lesson's AIR homework assignment. Select several students (or student pairs) to explain how they applied their focus standard to their AIR text.

- ▶ Students (or student pairs) discuss and share how they applied their focus standard to their AIR homework.

Lead a brief share out on the assigned reading from the previous lesson, 9.4.1 Lesson 9, "All Men are Equal" and "All Men are Equal: America," from *Sugar Changed the World*, (pp. 71–77)

What might be the authors' purpose in sharing the story of Pauline?

- ☞ Pauline was brought to France by her mistress Madame Villeneuve and left in a convent while Villeneuve traveled to Paris. Pauline wanted to become a nun but Madame Villeneuve resisted and tried to force her out of the convent through the legal system. The judges agreed, however, that Pauline had a right to do as she chose once she landed on French soil. This showed how the French viewed slaves differently based on whether they were in France or on the island where they worked.

Why do the authors write that to say "all men are equal" in 1716 was like saying "there was a new sun in the sky" (p. 72)?

- ☞ Student responses should indicate an understanding that there were still slaves all over the world at this time and it was sixty years before the declaration of independence. The authors are saying that it is therefore as surprising or bizarre to say "all men are equal" as it would be to say "there was a new sun in the sky." Both statements would seem to be contrary to reality.

How did the molasses and sugar acts affect the colonists' ideas about what it meant to be free?

- ☞ Student responses should indicate an understanding that the acts imposed taxes on the American colonists without their say. The colonists compared their situation to that of slaves and argued that every free man should be able to have a say in their government.

Activity 3: Reading and Discussion

45%

Instruct students to form pairs. Post or project each set of questions below for students to discuss.

Instruct student pairs to read “How Your Addiction to Fast Fashion Kills” from “A host of complicated factors” through “because in the longer term it’s better for everybody” and answer the following questions before sharing out with the class.

- ① If necessary, to support comprehension and fluency, consider providing a masterful reading of the focus excerpt for the lesson.

What is the author’s claim in paragraph six?

- ☞ Many things are involved in the exploitation of cheap labor. The author writes: “A host of complicated factors have contributed to this disturbing, massive exploitation of the world’s cheapest labor.”

Provide students with the following definition: *quota* means “a part of a total amount or quantity,” in this case, a limit on imports.

What evidence does the author provide to support this claim?

- ☞ Student responses should include:
- The author writes that “First, labor costs in China ... have increased.”
 - The author also writes, “Also, in 2005 the U.S. government lifted quotas on imports, allowing U.S. companies to import as many clothes from impoverished nations as they wish...”

Identify two claims about companies in paragraph 8.

- ☞ Student responses should include:
- It is the companies’ job to ensure that goods are ethically produced.
 - The companies are not filled with bad guys.

What evidence in paragraph 9 supports one of the claims in paragraph 8?

- ☞ Paragraph 9 supports the claim that companies are not filled with bad guys, by explaining that it is difficult for companies to keep track of where their goods are made and also that companies will “have a tough time” focusing on infrastructure.

- ① Explain that a monitoring company is a group that sends individuals to factories to make sure they are complying with rules and regulations.

Lead a brief whole-class discussion of student responses.

Instruct student pairs to read paragraphs 10–13 from “So, how can you tell” through “the last stop for rock bottom prices” and answer the following questions before sharing out with the class.

What rhetorical technique does the author use in paragraph 10? What is the effect of this technique?

- ☞ The author uses direct address, referring to “you” as the consumer and discusses how the consumer can figure out if something is ethically made. It shifts the focus of the paragraph to informing the consumer.

In paragraph 13 what does the author claim is necessary for the clothing industry to become more transparent?

- ☞ Consumers have to demand transparency.

Lead a brief whole-class discussion of student responses.

Instruct student pairs to read from paragraph 14 through the end of the article and answer the following questions before sharing out with the class.

What is the author’s claim about the consumer’s role in paragraph 14? How does she support this claim?

- ☞ The author suggests it is possible for consumers to demand more transparency and she supports her claim by citing experts. Cline says people have been asking about it, and both Scafidi and Cline think consumers “would pay a little bit more” for ethically produced goods.

Why is it hard for consumers to shop ethically, according to paragraph 15?

- ☞ The visual cues in the store distract consumers from thinking about how their clothes are made.

How does the solution posed in paragraph 16 integrate the claims made earlier in the article?

- ☞ Companies have changed the way we think about fashion and so they can change the way consumers shop for clothes in order to help consumers make ethical choices.

Lead a brief whole-class discussion of student responses.

Activity 4: Evaluating Argument and Evidence Tool and Assessment**15%**

Transition the class to a teacher-led discussion in order to summarize the article's central claim and its supporting claims. Display the Evaluating Argument and Evidence Tool and inform students that this is their assessment for this lesson. Ask for student volunteers to summarize the central claim made in the article.

🗣️ Student responses should include:

- The author's central claim is that consumers and stores are responsible for what happens to workers who make the clothing in the fashion industry.
 - "Clothing stores and consumer demand" lead to the use of "dirt cheap labor."
- ① Consider allowing time for students to complete a Turn-and-Talk with partners about possible responses to ensure that each student has the chance to think about possible responses.
- ① Although there is a space to evaluate "counterclaim" on the tool, no explicit counterclaim is made against the central claim in this particular article. It may be helpful to briefly ask students to suggest possible counterclaims that follow logically from the central claim they identified.
-

Instruct students to fill out the "Question" section of their Evaluating Argument and Evidence Tool with the following:

Who bears the most responsibility for ensuring that clothes are ethically manufactured?

Remind students that this question is also their Mid-Unit Assessment prompt. Inform students that for the Mid-Unit Assessment they are asked to make their own argument in response to this question; however, for the purpose of this tool they are to evaluate the argument made in "How Your Addiction to Fast Fashion Kills" as it relates to this question.

- ① Remind students of the definition of ethical to which they were introduced to in 9.4.1 Lesson 4: "an issue involving questions of right and wrong behavior; morally right and good." Remind students that in the context of this module the word ethical will be used to refer to products that have been manufactured in safe conditions where the workers are paid a fair wage.

Instruct students to fill in the "Text" section of this tool with the title of the supplementary article they read in this lesson: "How Your Addiction to Fast Fashion Kills" by Amy Odell. Ask students to fill in the "Central Claim" and "Author's Point of View or Purpose" portions of their tool based on the work they completed in this lesson.

Remind students that completion of the tool helps them keep track of evidence they use later in the Mid-Unit Assessment.

- ▶ Students follow along, filling in the portions of their Evaluating Argument and Evidence Tool as instructed.

Instruct students to complete the Evaluating Argument and Evidence Tool independently.

- ▶ Students complete the Evaluating Argument and Evidence Tool.
- 🗨 See Model Evaluating Argument and Evidence Tool for an example of a High Performance Response.

① The Evaluating Argument and Evidence Tool serves as the assessment for this lesson.

① Students will need their completed tools for reference in Lesson 24.

Activity 5: Closing

5%

Display and distribute the homework assignment. For homework, instruct students to continue reading their AIR text through the lens of a focus standard of their choice and prepare for a 3–5 minute discussion of their text based on that standard.

- ▶ Students follow along.

Homework

Continue reading your AIR text through the lens of a focus standard of your choice and prepare for a 3–5 minute discussion of your text based on that standard.

Evaluating Argument and Evidence Tool

Name:		Class:		Date:	
--------------	--	---------------	--	--------------	--

Question	
Text	
Central Claim	
Author's Point of View or Purpose	

Supporting Claim	Supporting Claim	Supporting Claim	Counterclaim
Evidence	Evidence	Evidence	Supporting Evidence
Is it relevant and sufficient? What more do you need to know?	Is it relevant and sufficient? What more do you need to know?	Is it relevant and sufficient? What more do you need to know?	Is it relevant and sufficient? What more do you need to know?

From Delineating Arguments Tool, by Odell Education, www.odelleducation.com. Copyright (2012) by Odell Education. Adapted with permission under an Attribution-NonCommercial 3.0 Unported license: <http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/3.0/>.

Model Evaluating Argument and Evidence Tool

Name:		Class:		Date:	
--------------	--	---------------	--	--------------	--

Question	Who bears the most responsibility for ensuring that clothes are ethically manufactured?
Text	"How Your Addiction to Fast Fashion Kills" by Amy Odell
Central Claim	Companies are ultimately responsible for ethically manufactured clothes but consumers need to demand ethically manufactured clothes from them.
Author's Point of View or Purpose	The author wants to make people aware that they are partly responsible for the abuses suffered by the workers who make their clothes.

Supporting Claim	Supporting Claim	Supporting Claim	Counterclaim
Clothing stores and consumer demand leads to the use of "dirt cheap labor" which result in disasters like Rana Plaza.	It's the companies' responsibility to "ensure their goods are ethically produced" but it's a difficult thing to do.	"But ultimately, the industry won't be more transparent about its manufacturing processes as a whole unless consumers demand it."	There are many factors that contribute to the use of cheap labor. Corporations are motivated by profit and will tend to place their manufacturing centers where the lowest cost labor is available.
Evidence	Evidence	Evidence	Evidence
Quote from Elizabeth Cline supports that every major brand uses labor in Bangladesh. The problems at Rana Plaza were not limited to just that building. "Less than 10% of what we're	Companies use subcontractors, which makes it difficult for them to track what happens. They also have to use "third party monitoring" groups.	"Every interview I've done in the past few days, people are asking where we can shop instead." – Elizabeth Cline. "Scafidi and Cline believe consumers would pay a little bit more to shop	First, she describes how labor costs rose in China and so companies moved to Bangladesh to stay competitive. Then she describes how the government lifted quotas, allowing companies

wearing ... was made in factories where people were paid a living wage and working in safe and legal conditions."		somewhere with ethical manufacturing standards." Companies need to make it easier for consumers to make good choices.	to import as much as they wanted from Bangladesh.
<p>Is it relevant and sufficient? What more do you need to know?</p> <p>It seems relevant and sufficient as the author provides a percentage of workers making a living wage to show how common the problems are.</p>	<p>Is it relevant and sufficient? What more do you need to know?</p> <p>She supports the idea that it is difficult for companies to track production of goods but doesn't fully support the idea that companies are responsible. It would be good to see claims and counterclaims about who is most responsible.</p>	<p>Is it relevant and sufficient? What more do you need to know?</p> <p>She has relevant evidence that consumers may be willing to change but it does not seem sufficient. Also, she provides no proof that companies would change even if consumers demanded it.</p>	<p>Is it relevant and sufficient? What more do you need to know?</p> <p>The evidence is relevant to support the claim that there are other factors contributing to the use of cheap labor. It also seems sufficient for this purpose and suggests that the government, which lifted quotas, may have some responsibility as well.</p>

From Delineating Arguments Tool, by Odell Education, www.odelleducation.com. Copyright (2012) by Odell Education. Adapted with permission under an Attribution-NonCommercial 3.0 Unported license: <http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/3.0/>.